Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Management in Communication Management at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand.

Janine Margaret Burgess

2014
Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Abstract

The digital revolution has had far-reaching implications for the news media. The Internet has influenced how, where, and when citizens get news. It has added another element of competition between news providers, one that is not restricted by geographical boundaries. The ensuing attempts by news producers to increase, establish, and maintain a loyal readership online have been linked to an increase in tabloid and sensationalist news content (Fox & Gangl, 2011). Further, the fragmentation of the media landscape as a result of online news requires the media both to reconsider its position as the stalwart upholder of objectivity and to rethink its democratic watchdog role (Mancini, 2013).

Additionally, studies have shown that readers of news online are increasingly selecting soft news stories (Tewksbury 2002; van Heekeren 2005; Mitchelstein & Boczkowski, 2010). Several authors (Iyengar & Hahn, 2011; Sunstein, 2002; Mitchelstein & Boczkowski, 2010) have expressed concern that this trend will lead to a poorly informed public unless news providers embrace the participatory potential of the Internet to foster meaningful debate on issues of importance. The concerns raised by previous research formed the background of this study.

This mixed method inquiry considered three New Zealand news websites operated by newspaper organisation – the Otago Daily Times and the Timaru Herald, which are regionally based, and Stuff a national provider. Content analysis was used to find out what stories website readers were interested in and what story topics were being...
promoted to online readers. Interviews were also conducted with the editors responsible for the websites’ online coverage to canvas their views on the New Zealand digital news sphere.

This thesis found that lead news online was dominated by crime and softer news topics, particularly on the Stuff site. It also found readers “top five” news choices were similarly dominated by crime and softer news topics. However, analysis of the geographic sources of the stories also indicates the value and demand for local news focussed on local issues, particularly from regional websites.

Interviews with the editors of the three websites point to the difficulties faced by news organisations, particularly as regards resourcing the web and the ability to provide a true participatory news environment within financial constraints. Ultimately, because news providers and readers more often select news topics related to entertainment rather than to information, the online news environment, as it is currently heading, is unlikely to fulfil the hopes of democratic engagement. While the provision and uptake of local news is an encouraging sign, the news choices citizens make suggest a full reliance on online content is unlikely to produce the informed citizenry envisaged by internet optimists.
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisors, Dr Margie Comrie and Dr Susan Fountaine for their support. Their guidance and knowledge was invaluable.

A sincere thank you to my supportive colleagues who shared this journey. In particular, I would like to thank Frances Walker for being my assistant during the data collection phase and for help with the transcription of the interviews, Alister Macgregor for creating my database and demystifying data analysis, and Sandra Warwood for her formatting expertise.

I would also like to thank the editors who participated in the interviews for this study, Sinead Boucher, Murray Kirkness and Fleur Cogle. Their insight and honesty helped ensure this study was truly reflective of the New Zealand news environment.

Finally, my fiancé deserves special mention for his patience, his encouragement and his never failing faith in my ability to achieve this degree even when I occasionally misplaced that faith.
## Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................... i
Acknowledgements ............................................................................................................................ iii
List of Tables ....................................................................................................................................... viii
List of Figures ....................................................................................................................................... ix

### Chapter One Introduction
1.1 Theoretical Background ................................................................................................................. 1
1.2 The New Zealand Media Landscape ............................................................................................... 4
1.3 Research Questions ......................................................................................................................... 6

### Chapter Two Literature Review
2.1 The Media and Democracy in the Digital Age ................................................................................. 9
   2.1.1 Social responsibility theory .................................................................................................. 10
   2.1.2 Digital technology and democracy ..................................................................................... 13
   2.1.3 Media ownership and competition ..................................................................................... 16
   2.1.4 Tabloidisation of the media ............................................................................................... 22
   2.1.5 The agenda-setting theory and the online environment .................................................... 24
   2.1.6 The value of keeping the news local .................................................................................... 26

2.2 Online News Selections .................................................................................................................. 28
   2.2.1 The distinction between “soft” and “hard” news ................................................................. 29
   2.2.2 Online reader news selections ........................................................................................... 30
   2.2.3 Meeting the needs and expectations of online audiences ................................................... 33
   2.2.4 Print news reader preference compared with that of online readers ................................. 38

2.3 Online News and Democracy ........................................................................................................ 39
   2.3.1 What online news could mean for democratic engagement .............................................. 40

2.4 Conclusion ....................................................................................................................................... 43

### Chapter Three Research Design
3.1 Mixed Method Research .................................................................................................................. 47
3.2 Content Analysis as a Method .......................................................................................................... 49
   3.2.1 Strengths of content analysis ................................................................................................. 50
   3.2.2 Limitations of content analysis ............................................................................................ 51
3.3 Content Analysis Procedure for this Study .................................................................................. 52
   3.3.1 Media selection .................................................................................................................... 53
   3.3.2 Sample .................................................................................................................................. 54
   3.3.3 Development of news content categories ............................................................................ 58
   3.3.4 Geographic origin categories ............................................................................................. 62
   3.3.5 Coding procedure ................................................................................................................ 63
   3.3.6 Coding decisions .................................................................................................................. 66
   3.3.6.1 Geographic coding decisions .......................................................................................... 68
   3.3.7 Inter-coder and intra-coder reliability testing ...................................................................... 69

3.4 Interviewing as a Method .............................................................................................................. 71
   3.4.1 Limitations and strengths of interviewing and semi-structured interviews ........................ 73

3.5 Interview Procedure ....................................................................................................................... 75
   3.5.1 Interview sample .................................................................................................................. 75
   3.5.2 Interview questions .............................................................................................................. 75
   3.5.3 Conducting the interviews .................................................................................................... 76
   3.5.4 Interviewing ethical considerations ...................................................................................... 77

3.6 Conclusion ....................................................................................................................................... 78
4.7.5 Timaru Herald sample geographic origin .............................................................. 133
4.7.6 Comparison of geographic origin of lead stories ............................................... 133
4.7.7 Geographic origin of readers’ most popular sample ............................................ 134
4.7.8 Overall geographic origin of readers’ most popular ............................................ 136
4.7.9 Otago Daily Times readers’ most popular geographic origin ................................ 136
4.7.10 Stuff readers’ most popular geographic origin ................................................ 136
4.7.11 Timaru Herald readers’ most popular geographic origin .................................. 137
4.7.12 Comparison of readers’ most popular geographic origin .................................. 137

4.8 Chapter Summary .................................................................................................................. 138
4.8.1 Story topics overall ........................................................................................................ 138
4.8.2 Lead story topics ........................................................................................................... 139
4.8.3 Lead picture story topics Stuff and Timaru Herald .................................................. 139
4.8.4 Editors’ Pick story topics Stuff and Timaru Herald .................................................. 140
4.8.5 Readers’ most popular story topics .............................................................................. 140
4.8.6 Lead stories appearing in readers’ most popular ...................................................... 141
4.8.7 Lead story geographic origin ...................................................................................... 141
4.8.8 Geographic origin of readers’ most popular ............................................................. 141
4.8.9 Conclusion ..................................................................................................................... 142

Chapter Five Interview Findings .............................................................................................. 143
5.1 Background and history of the websites .......................................................................... 144
5.2 The Selection of News for the Otago Daily Times, Stuff and Timaru Herald
   Websites ................................................................................................................................. 146
   5.2.1 Selection of News for the Editors’ Pick Section ...................................................... 150
   5.2.2 The Newsworthiness Elements of Good Web News .............................................. 151
5.3 Identifying and Meeting Audience Needs ....................................................................... 152
5.4 The Value of News Websites and Reader Participation ................................................. 155
5.5 The News Choices of Online Readers ............................................................................. 158
5.6 Competitiveness and Commercial Viability .................................................................... 160
5.7 Resourcing of News Websites ......................................................................................... 163
5.8 Democratic Engagement in the Online Environment ..................................................... 165
5.9 Summary and Conclusion ............................................................................................... 168
   5.9.1 Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 170

Chapter Six Discussion ............................................................................................................. 172
6.1 What People Read Online .................................................................................................. 173
   6.1.1 Summary of reader choices ...................................................................................... 174
   6.1.2 Soft news choices ....................................................................................................... 176
   6.1.3 Crime news .................................................................................................................. 177
6.2 News Provider Selections .................................................................................................. 178
   6.2.1 Provider story topic choices ...................................................................................... 179
   6.2.1.1 Local and national government news coverage .................................................. 182
   6.2.1.2 Local news for local people .................................................................................. 183
   6.2.2 Comparisons with previous research of online news choices ......................... 185
   6.2.3 What makes news online? .......................................................................................... 186
   6.2.4 Geographical coverage and localness ...................................................................... 189
6.3 Is There a Choice Gap Between Online News Providers and Readers? ....................... 191
6.4 Commercialism and Tabloidisation ............................................................................... 194
   6.4.1 Competition and commercialism in the New Zealand online news environment ................................................................. 196
   6.4.2 The financial challenges of online news provision ................................................. 198
List of Tables

Table 1
Story Topic Categories ........................................................................................................... 59
Table 2
Geographic origin coding definitions .................................................................................. 62
Table 3
Total Stories Analysed from the ODT, Timaru Herald and Stuff ......................................... 81
Table 4
Total Stories Gathered from the Otago Daily Times, Stuff and Timaru Herald by Story Topic .................................................................................................................................................. 84
Table 5
Readers’ Most Popular Comparison of Findings from the Otago Daily Times, Stuff and Timaru Herald Websites .................................................................................................................................................. 92
Table 6
Lead Story Comparison from the Otago Daily Times, Stuff and Timaru Herald by Story Topic .................................................................................................................................................. 101
Table 7
Lead Picture Story Comparison from the Stuff and Timaru Herald Websites by Story Topic .................................................................................................................................................. 109
Table 8
Editors’ Pick Story Comparison from the Stuff and Timaru Herald Websites by Story Topic .................................................................................................................................................. 115
Table 9
Lead Stories from the Otago Daily Times, Stuff and Timaru Herald Websites Appearing in Readers’ Most Popular by Story Topic ............................................................................................................................................ 123
Table 10
Geographic Origin of Lead Stories from the Otago Daily Times, Timaru Herald and Stuff .................................................................................................................................................. 131
Table 11
Geographic Origin of Readers’ Most Popular Stories from the Otago Daily Times, Stuff and Timaru Herald Websites .................................................................................................................................................. 135
List of Figures

Figure 1
Stuff and Timaru Herald stories selected ................................................................. 65

Figure 2
Otago Daily Times stories selected ............................................................................. 65

Figure 3
Database ....................................................................................................................... 66

Figure 4
Comparisons of Story Topics across the Otago Daily Times, Stuff, and Timaru Herald Websites ............................................................................................................. 85

Figure 5
Readers Most Popular by Story Topic from the Otago Daily Times, Stuff, and Timaru Herald Websites ................................................................................................................ 93

Figure 6
Lead Story Choices by Story Topic from the Otago Daily Times, Stuff, and Timaru Herald ...................................................................................................................... 102

Figure 7
Comparison of Lead Picture Stories by Topic from the Timaru Herald and Stuff Website ......................................................................................................................... 110

Figure 8
Comparison of Editors’ Pick Stories by Topic from the Timaru Herald and Stuff Websites ............................................................................................................................... 116