

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

A CRITICAL EXPLORATION OF GENDER ANALYSIS:

*Exploring the Value and Practice of Gender Analysis
Through Engaging in Gender Analysis with Communities and
Development Staff in Vanuatu.*

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the

Master of Philosophy

in

Development Studies

at Massey University, Palmerston North,

New Zealand.

Joanna Kangisher

2007

ABSTRACT

This research critically examines development project and programme Gender Analysis (GA) frameworks, trialing them with World Vision Vanuatu (WVV) staff and project communities. A Women's Equality and Empowerment Framework (WEEF) analysis of the WVV country programme provided a visual overview of the programme, demonstrating that the organisation has a strong concern for women's issues and were encouraging women's empowerment. The programme could be improved by engaging in more conscientisation around gender issues. The Harvard Analytical Framework collected rich data on men and women in the communities and helped project staff to get to know the communities better. It also questioned the effectiveness of projects in dealing with gender issues, WVV need to provide equal opportunities for women at the project management level. The Gender Analysis Matrix (GAM) clearly showed project impacts for both men and women. One of the literacy projects had greatly benefited women, but could be improved by running separate classes for the men. The GAM results are not restricted to gender issues; the tool shows potential as a general monitoring framework. Experienced facilitators are needed to get the most out of the frameworks, however anyone can greatly benefit from utilising these tools. No GA framework can replace an awareness of gender issues and the will to work towards a fairer society. GA frameworks that are designed to empower the participants can deliberately or inadvertently be used in an extractive way, while frameworks that are labelled as extractive can be used creatively to empower those who take part. GA sessions provide rich data on gender in a relatively short period of time. While they risk not collecting enough information, the systematic collection and use of some information should help move development work forward.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the staff of World Vision Vanuatu for their help with my fieldwork in Vanuatu. I presented training to the staff on gender and GA. Then we engaged in GA in World Vision Vanuatu project communities. The GA results produced during these sessions formed the raw data that I analysed in this thesis.

Table of Contents

ABSTRACT	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Table of Contents	iv
Table of Tables and Figures.....	v
List of Acronyms	vii
Chapter One: Introduction.....	1
Chapter Two: Gender And Development and Gender Analysis: A Critical Overview ..	18
Chapter Three: Gender in Vanuatu	49
Chapter Four: Vanuatu Fieldwork Methodology	84
Chapter Five: Effectiveness of World Vision Vanuatu in Dealing With Gender Issues	94
Chapter Six: Lessons Regarding the Effective Application of Gender Analysis Frameworks.....	118
Chapter Seven: Conclusion.....	146
APPENDIX I: Gender Analysis Framework Instructions	150
APPENDIX II: Schedule in Vanuatu.....	161
APPENDIX III: Participant Information Sheets and Participant Consent Forms in English and Bislama.....	162
APPENDIX IV: Gender Analysis Session Results	170
Bibliography.....	195

Table of Tables and Figures

Table 1.1 Uses of Gender Analysis Frameworks.....	11
Table 1.2 World Vision History of Gender And Development	16
Table 2.1 Comparison of Women in Development with Gender And Development	22
Table 2.2 Basic Women's Equality and Empowerment Framework.....	24
Table 2.3 Basic Gender Analysis Matrix	25
Table 2.4 Completing the Harvard Analytical Framework using Participatory Rural Appraisal tools	37
Figure 3.1 Map of Vanuatu	49
Table 3.1 Population Breakdown of Vanuatu in 2005.....	50
Table 3.2 Improvements in Vanuatu Development Indicators	51
Table 4.1 Gender Analysis Sessions Conducted in Each Village in Vanuatu	89
Table A1.1 Women's Equality and Empowerment Framework.....	150
Table A1.2 Women's Empowerment Framework Categories	150
Table A1.3 Levels of Recognition of Women's Issues in Project Design.....	151
Table A1.4 Gender Analysis Matrix	151
Table A1.5 Explanation of the 'Levels' of Society.....	152
Table A1.6 Gender Analysis Matrix: Four Kinds of Impact	153
Table A1.7 Harvard Tool 1: Activity Profile	155
Table A1.8 Harvard Tool 2: Access and Control Profile.....	156
Table A1.9 Harvard Tool 3: Influencing Factors.....	157
Table A1.10 Harvard Tool 4: Women's Dimension in Project Implementation Checklist.....	159
Table A4.1 World Vision Vanuatu Country Programme Women's Equality and Empowerment Framework.....	171
Table A4.2 Beverly Hills Village Children's Education Begins At Home Gender Analysis Matrix	173
Table A4.3 Pango Village Education Starts At Home Women's Group Activity Profile.....	175
Table A4.4 Pango Village Education Starts At Home Men's Group Activity Profile .	176
Table A4.5 Pango Village Education Starts At Home Women's Group Access and Control Profile.....	177

Table A4.6 Pango Village Education Starts At Home Men's Group Access and Control Profile.....	178
Table A4.7 Pango Village Education Starts At Home Women's Group Influencing Factors.....	179
Table A4.8 Pango Village Education Starts At Home Men's Group Influencing Factors.....	180
Table A4.9 Pango Village Education Starts At Home Women's Dimension in Project Implementation Checklist	181
Table A4.10 Letaopam Village Literacy Project Gender Analysis Matrix.....	184
Table A4.11 Ikurup Village Literacy Project Gender Analysis Matrix	185
Table A4.12 Letaopam Village Pre-school Project Gender Analysis Matrix	186
Table A4.14 Iemsene Village Water Project Women's Group Activity Profile.....	189
Table A4.15 Iemsene Village Water Project Men's Group Activity Profile	190
Table A4.16 Iemsene Village Water Project Women's Group Access and Control Profile.....	191
Table A4.17 Iemsene Village Water Project Men's Group Access and Control Profile.....	192
Table A4.18 Iemsene Village Water Project Women's Group Influencing Factors....	192
Table A4.19 Iemsene Village Water Project Men's Group Influencing Factors.....	193
Table A4.20 Iemsene Village Water Project Women's Dimension in Project Implementation Checklist	193

List of Acronyms

ADB	Asian Development Bank
ADP	Area Development Programme
AIDS	Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
CDP	Community Development Programme
CEDAW	United Nations Convention to Eliminate All Forms of Discrimination Against Women
DWA	Department of Women's Affairs
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organisation
GA	Gender Analysis
GAD	Gender And Development
GAM	Gender Analysis Matrix
HAF	Harvard Analytical Framework
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
ILO	International Labour Organisation
INSTRAW	United Nations International Research and Training Institute for the Advancement of Women
MU	Massey University
NGO	Non Governmental Organisation
NZAID	New Zealand's International Aid and Development Organisation
PLA	Participatory Learning and Action
PNG	Papua New Guinea
PRA	Participatory Rural Appraisal
SEAGA	Socio-Economic and Gender Analysis Programme
SMART	Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Realistic, Time-bound
SPC	South Pacific Commission
SWOT	Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, Threats
WatSan	Water and Sanitation
WEEF	Women's Equality and Empowerment Framework
WID	Women In Development
WV	World Vision
WVI	World Vision International

WVNZ	World Vision New Zealand
WVPDG	World Vision Pacific Development Group
WVV	World Vision Vanuatu
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNICEF	United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund
UNIFEM	United Nations International Fund for Women
USAID	United States International Aid and Development Organisation
USD	United States Dollar
VCC	Vanuatu Cultural Centre
VNCW	Vanuatu National Council of Women
VWC	Vanuatu Women's Centre

Chapter One: Introduction

Without an analysis of gender relations and attention to making them more equal, you get bad development. Development without a gender perspective is only half of development: if one gender is left behind, there cannot be real development even for the dominant gender.
(MacDonald, 1999:12)

This thesis provides a critical exploration of development project GA frameworks. GA frameworks facilitate the collection and processing of information about the roles, activities, needs and relationships of males and females (WVI, 2005:83). This can help ensure that all community members benefit from development initiatives and is important in turning a concern for gender issues into concrete action. The researcher explored the value and practice of GA through engaging in GA with WVV staff and communities in which they work. Issues considered include: does GA really deliver all the benefits it promises? What are the pitfalls of GA and how can they be minimised? How can the GA frameworks promoted by the World Vision (WV) Partnership be best utilised to meet the needs of the WVV office? This study is valuable in encouraging the use of GA tools in aid and development organisations.

This introductory chapter familiarises the reader with the terms Gender And Development (GAD) and GA and their importance. Common objections to intervening in gender issues will be addressed and the need to critically examine GA frameworks explained. The final section introduces the work and GAD orientation of WV.

Gender And Development

This section introduces the reader to the concept of Gender And Development and provides an in-depth explanation of the term ‘gender’.

GAD is an approach to development that shifts the focus from women as a group, to the socially determined relations between women and men. GAD focuses on the social, economic, political and cultural forces that determine how men and women can

participate in, benefit from and control project resources and activities (WVI¹, 2005:184).

In order to understand GAD it is helpful to have a clear understanding of what people mean when they talk about ‘gender.’ Gender differs from biological sex. Individuals are born either male or female, however the way in which people become masculine or feminine is a combination of these basic biological building blocks and the interpretation of their biology by their culture (Mosse, 1993:2). Gender is the socially constructed roles, responsibilities and opportunities assigned to women, men, boys and girls, as well as the relations between women and those between men at a given time and in a particular culture or location (WVI, 2005:184 and NZAID², 2006:15). Gender is the sum total of all the norms, values, customs and practices by which the biological difference males and females is transformed and exaggerated into a very much wider social difference (Kabeer & Subrahmanian, 1999:5). Gender determines what is expected, allowed and valued in a woman or a man and in a girl or a boy in a given socio-cultural context (NZAID, 2006:15). Gender roles are learned through socialisation processes and are context and time specific and changeable (NZAID, 2006:15). The tendency to conflate sexual difference, which is biological, with gender difference, which is social, gives rise to a view that all observed differences in the roles, capacities and aptitudes attributed to men and women within a given context are rooted in their biology and hence cannot be changed (Kabeer & Subrahmanian, 1999:5).

Importance of Gender And Development

This section introduces the reader to the importance of taking a GAD approach to development.

“Poverty and marginalisation are gendered phenomena.... There is no country in the world where women and men enjoy equal rights, protection, or opportunities.” (MacDonald, 1999:7&146)

¹ WVI stands for World Vision International.

² NZAID is New Zealand’s international aid and development organisation.

Gender relations almost universally favour men and disadvantage women (MacDonald, 1999:11). Sen and Grown (1988:26) noted that gender-based subordination is deeply ingrained in the consciousness of both men and women and is usually viewed as a natural result of the biological differences between them. It is reinforced through religious beliefs, cultural practices and educational systems (both traditional and modern) that assign to women lesser status and power.

This has resulted in what has been termed the ‘feminisation of poverty’ whereby, ‘women are disproportionately represented among the poor and powerless of the world’ (Mosse, 1993:116). From birth, girl children in certain contexts face risks such as female infanticide, female genital mutilation, forced prostitution and early marriage (WVI, 2005:31). In areas where son preference predominates, from the moment of birth, a girl is treated not just differently from a boy, but less favourably. This shows up in country statistics with marked gender differentials in nutrition, food allocation, health status and health expenditure, education, mortality rates and life expectancy (Kabeer & Subrahmanian, 1999:16). WVI (2005:6) estimated that 70% of the 1.3 billion people living in poverty are females and UNIFEM (2005) reported that 75% of the world’s illiterates were women³. Momsen and Townsend (1987) stated that women tend to have far less access to all forms of social, economic and political power and this is reflected in women holding only 16% of parliamentary seats worldwide (WVI, 2005:30).

In addition, development work has often not served the needs and interests of women and has even made the situation worse for them and their children. Women often have primary responsibility for housework, regardless of what other forms of work they undertake (Kabeer & Subrahmanian, 1999:22) and when their cash incomes are insufficient to meet their most basic needs, they must rely heavily on their own labour to secure whatever food, fuel and water they can from the surrounding environment. Yet Jacobsen (1992) noted that many development programmes have actually shifted such resources away from women. Cash crops have replaced gardens for home consumption, leaving women to farm less productive land that is often further away. Forests have been sold for a quick profit, eliminating an important source of products that women

³ UNIFEM is the United Nations development fund for women.

used. Interventions have depleted or polluted water sources that women depended upon (ADB⁴, 1994:1).

Development planners have also been guilty of ignoring and undervaluing the work of women (Jacobsen, 1992). One illustration is provided by the Food and Agriculture Organisation worldwide survey in 1997 that showed that women received only five percent of all agricultural extension services worldwide (Verwooy, 2006:159) despite women being significantly involved in agriculture. Development projects have failed because women's contributions to the economy have been overlooked and their workloads have been increased (Williams, 1994:16). Such poor planning marginalises women's needs and interests (Jacobsen, 1992).

Development activities have sometimes reinforced existing gender inequalities, or generated and promoted new forms and patterns of discrimination against women (ADB, 1994:1). Examples include denying women access to resources or areas of decision making in which they previously had control (Wallace, 1998:162) and decreasing women's control over traditionally inherited land (ADB, 1994:1).

Much development work has been targeted at male family heads, with the aim of improving the well being of the whole family unit. However, it is not possible to assume that the interests of everyone in a family are the same. The interests or needs of the women in the family may be quite different from the interests of the men (Mosse, 1993:7). Jacobsen (1992:12) reported that women effectively provide the largest share of the family's basic needs and the incomes of men are often siphoned off by the purchase of alcohol, tobacco, or other consumer products. Likewise Rao (1991:5) reported 'A growing body of research indicates that women spend all or a greater portion of their income than do men on family subsistence and nutrition'⁵.

In summary, the negative effects of ignoring gender issues in development work are now widely acknowledged (Williams, 1994:16). The rewards and benefits of development have not always been distributed and shared equally by males and females.

4 ADB stands for Asian Development Bank.

5 Studies in every region of the Third World confirm that it is the mother's rather than the father's income or food production – and the degree of control she maintains over that income – that determines the relative nutrition of children (Jacobsen, 1992:16).

Development projects in some instances have either ignored women altogether or marginalised them, while in other instances, projects may have even resulted in negative consequences for women (ADB, 1994:1). The need to identify and address gender issues by utilising a GAD approach to development cannot be overstated.

Objections to Gender And Development

The next section will examine some of the common objections people raise over the ‘right’ of outsiders to intervene in the internal gender politics of another society. Issues considered include accusations of interfering with culture, charges of interfering with religion and claims that third world women are already content and do not wish to change gender relations.

Interfering with Culture

Resistance to any form of change in gender relations has increasingly taken on the rationale of the ‘sanctity of culture’ (Kabeer & Subrahmanian, 1999:7).

Most societies have particular rituals, such as those marking puberty, marriage and childbirth and these practices hold communities together and enrich the social fabric of people’s lives. Tension arises when these actions discriminate against women, or infringe their human rights (Mosse, 1993:65). Sen and Grown (1988:76) claimed ‘Traditions have always been a double-edged sword for women. Subordinate economic and social status and restrictions on women’s activity and mobility are embedded in most traditional cultures.’

Culture appears to be the way things have always been done. As Bumangari Kaon of Bunlap, Vanuatu said in 1972 ‘Our kastom has been here like a banyan tree since the world broke open⁶. It was here at the start’ (Jolly, 1994:21). Yet on closer observation, some ‘traditions’ have a relatively short history and all cultures are always changing. As Jolly (2002:151) stated ‘Tradition is not a static burden of the past but something created for the present. Kastom is created and recreated by women and by men’. GAD

⁶ ‘Kastom’ is the Bislama word for ‘custom’ in Vanuatu.

initiatives seek to speed up constructive changes that are already underway and initiate positive change in culture where necessary. As Parker (1993:viii) wrote:

"Gender analysis and sensitisation will challenge tradition and culture. This does not mean that a society loses its roots and its history. The fact is that we live in a world that is changing, whether development programmes recognise it or not. If change is inevitable, then it can be useful to develop skills to direct that change. Culture and tradition have evolved over time. A participatory gender analysis can protect the positive aspects of tradition and culture and eliminate the harmful."

Longwe (1995:50) noted that any development project is, by its very nature, a social and economic intervention. A development intervention cannot leave traditional social practice untouched, nor ignore the existence of customary practice that stands in the way of development. Longwe recommended that where existing social and customary practices stand in the way of development, then it should be among the objectives of the development agency (along with the Third World Government) to modify the social practice so that it supports development instead of standing in the way.

An ADB (1994:8) report stated ‘The politics of convenience that invoke or discard the culture argument to suit different situations and circumstances is increasingly used to justify gender inequalities.’ The author reported that invoking the ‘culturally inappropriate’ or ‘it is against our tradition’ argument to deny women opportunities is no longer plausible. They demonstrated that there is ample evidence that cultural norms are ignored and discarded when women’s labour is required. The report cited the example of the female dominated, export-oriented factories in Malaysia and Bangladesh, which are largely Islamic countries where there is strict adherence to sex-segregation and the physical confinement of women, noting ‘Men, in pursuit of economic gains, are not constrained by the dictates of their culture. Yet, culture is often invoked to deny women access to and a share in the benefits of development’. Sen and Grown (1988:76) concluded ‘The call to cultural purity is often a thinly veiled attempt to continue women’s subjugation in a rapidly changing society.’

Southern women themselves insist that traditional culture should not be allowed to excuse failures of gender sensitivity (MacDonald, 1999:28). Narayan (2002) refuted the claim that feminism was simply a western import. She reflected on her Indian upbringing and the complaints of her female relatives regarding their oppressive marriages. Her earliest memory was of her mother crying over mistreatment by her mother in law. She claimed that her feminist leaning began long before her schooling started and any western ideas had chance to take root. Many of the issues Third World Feminists attempt to deal with are in fact commonly complained about by women who do not consider themselves to be feminists. One of the key differences is that feminists politicise the issues rather than seeing them as purely a personal issue to be dealt with on a personal level. Longwe (1995:50) noted that the existence of the United Nations (UN) Convention indicated that equality for women is part of a *worldwide* concern with women's rights, as a major component in the concern with fundamental human rights and is not restricted to western culture.

Cathy Rarua (2006), the Gender Planner from the Vanuatu Government Department of Women's Affairs advised 'Culture should be how we care and share with each other.'

Interfering with Religion

Another complaint sometimes faced by GAD advocates is the claim that they are interfering with religious beliefs.

Mosse (1993:66-7) noted that religion is a foundation stone of gender difference and that nearly all of the world's religious traditions have given women a secondary and subordinate role. However, most religious traditions have, in the last three decades, attracted feminist scholars who have argued that it is not the texts of religions which have caused the problems but their interpretation.

"Christian, Jewish and Muslim feminists have re-examined their scriptures and come to the conclusion that their religions offered the possibility of liberation and improvement in the position of women, but that tradition and history have subverted this potential and used religion to repress women."

The WV Gender Training Toolkit concurred, stating:

“We believe that female and male are created equally in the image of God. Jesus’ life and works underscored this reality as he challenged the constraints and cultural restrictions women faced in New Testament times in order to honour and empower them.” (WVI, 2005:6)

While religion has been used to repress women, women the world over have used religion as an opportunity to come together and as a source of solidarity. Mosse (1993:66&68) quoted Rigoberta Menshu, an Indian Guatemalan peasant woman who fought for social justice against the oppressive military regime in her country.

“We feel it is the duty of Christians to create the kingdom of God on earth.... This kingdom will exist only when we all have enough to eat, when our children, brothers, parents don’t have to die from hunger and malnutrition.”

Randell and Bolenga (2003:vii) noted that most ni-Vanuatu women who had taken on non-traditional careers had a very strong religious faith and their spirituality sustained them through the challenges they faced in this undertaking.

Third World Women are Content

Some contend that women in the Third World are quite content with their position in society and do not want equality with men. However, the worldwide women’s movement has been growing steadily and much of the vitality of the movement and much of its cutting edge, comes from women in the south (Mosse, 1993:169-70).

Mosse (1993:170) pointed out that many women in developing countries have never actually had the opportunity to question their lot in life in the first place. In her experience, given the opportunity and the support and sensitive ways of working which respected culture and women’s pace, women readily questioned the reasons that their

lives were as they were and, far from being content, sought ways of challenging and changing their situation.

Kabeer (1995a:264) made an interesting observation:

“Northern aid agencies and development banks demonstrate greatest resistance to approaches that stress gender as a power relation and the need for change at the personal level; national development agencies, particularly those working with grassroots constituencies, appear more open to this transformatory agenda.”

In addition, Jackson (1996:499) reported that researchers blinded by populist sympathy for the poor easily overlook gender relations of inequality. ‘There seems to be a strong connection between the view of mutual solidarity among the poor and the absence of gender analysis in work which claims to report the perceptions of the poor.’

Finally, development practitioners need to remember that women’s equality is not simply a development issue, it is a human rights issue. Many developing countries have committed themselves to United Nations initiatives such as the Nairobi Forward-Looking Strategies, which state that they will ‘take the relevant steps to ensure that men and women enjoy equal rights, opportunities and responsibilities’ (Mosse, 1993:169). GAD initiatives are simply converting the rhetoric into reality.

Gender Analysis

The preceding section introduced the concept and importance of GAD. GAD initiatives are based on the findings of GA. The section below introduces the reader to the practise of GA.

GA tools facilitate the collection and processing of information about the roles, activities, needs and relationships of males and females (WVI, 2005:83). GA explores and highlights the relationships of women and men in society and the inequalities in those relationships. GA asks: Who does what? Who has what? Who decides? How? Who gains? Who loses? Which men? Which women? (March, 1999:18). GA thus helps

to identify disadvantaged members in a population, the nature of their disadvantage, structural causes of their disadvantage and the resources, institutional changes and strategies needed to solve these problems and minimise their disadvantages (WVI, 2005:83).

GA breaks down the divide between the private sphere and the public sphere. It looks at how power relations within the household inter-relate with those at the international, state, market and community level (March, 1999:18).

“Gender analysis, once confined to the margins of development theory, has over the last ten years penetrated both the thinking and the operations of international development institutions, transforming not only the practice but the objectives of development planning and programmes.” (Miller & Razavi, 1998:1)

GA frameworks started to emerge in the late 1980s. While they have only been packaged together as ‘frameworks’ relatively recently, a number of the components that make up the GA frameworks (for example time use charts) have been in common usage by researchers for some time (MU⁷, 2003: Topic Eight, 2).

GA ‘frameworks’ range from a few theoretical concepts that guide GA to actual tables that development practitioners complete. The process of GA can involve:

- Working through purpose designed GA frameworks with a group from the community.
- Various Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) tools such as focus group discussions, seasonal calendars, activity profiles, semi-structured interviews, key informants and on-site observation, oral testimonies (Verwooy, 2006:50).
- Traditional information gathering techniques such as interviews and questionnaires.

Both men and women from the beneficiary community need to be involved in GA because ‘Women and men have different life experiences, knowledge, perspectives and priorities. One cannot necessarily represent the interests of the other and neither alone

⁷ MU stands for Massey University.

can fully represent their community' (Williams, 1994:234). Consequently, project staff should guide the analysis, ideally with the full participation of men and women at the project site (WVI, 2005:83).

GA frameworks have been designed for different purposes, ranging from helping carry out initial research, planning and monitoring an intervention, to evaluating what it has achieved. March (1999:27) listed a number of uses in the table below:

Table 1.1 Uses of Gender Analysis Frameworks

Use	Explanation
Context Analysis	GA frameworks provide a way of thinking about the context, which shapes the relationships and dynamics of any situation or group.
Visualisation and Planning	GA tools help represent key points in a simple manner, aiding decision making.
Communication	GA frameworks help to share information, train people or sensitise them to gender issues.
Monitoring and Evaluation	GA tools can highlight the strengths and weaknesses of a particular development intervention.

World Vision International (WVI) (2005:83) recommended that GA be conducted at all stages of development projects.

Organisations do not necessarily need a formal framework in order to work well or innovatively on gender issues, to reduce gender inequality, or to support women's empowerment. However, if an organisation is committed to bringing about change, using a framework may take them one step further towards understanding the issues, facts and relationships, which affect women's and men's lives in a given society (March, 1999:22).

Importance of Gender Analysis

A gender analysis and strategy should be an integral part of any work undertaken by an organisation (MacDonald, 1999:13). The use of non-gendered generic categories, such as 'the poor' and 'the landless', in the analysis of development problems has long helped to obscure the degree of internal differentiation and inequality within these

groups. Gender-neutral analysis is frequently extremely gender-biased in its assumptions and its implications (Kabeer & Subrahmanian, 1999:210). In contrast, GA frameworks aim to devise and implement policies and programmes which do not exclude or harm women, which take their needs and perspectives into account and which may help redress some of the existing gender imbalances (March, 1999:14).

Any development initiative will affect the lives of both women and men, regardless of whether it be the building of a large dam or the provision of small-scale credit to poor male farmers (Mosse, 1993:7). Development initiatives generally affect men and women in different ways. The GA tools identify the positive and negative effects of development projects on each gender and help to design projects that bring positive results for both men and women (WVI, 2005:83).

Interventions can either exclude women, or include them in a meaningful way, provided systematic gender-aware analysis of the situation and problems is carried out prior to planning (Kabeer & Subrahmanian, 1999:229). Gibb (2001:43) reported:

“GA... would help to ensure that workshops, meetings, training and extension programmes are organised in such a way that women can participate. Good practices would include: training and extension programmes that recognise women’s time use, household responsibilities, literacy levels and daily chores and involving women in technology development and technological design to help ensure that these are suited to women’s needs and physical capacity.”

GA findings can also help to redress some of the existing gender imbalances in communities (March, 1999:14). Vernooy (2006:24) reported:

“Integrating GA into research is important in creating space for social actors (women and men) to manoeuvre and to enhance the bargaining and negotiating power of marginalised and discriminated groups, leading to empowerment and transformation where they have more access to, control over and benefits from natural resources.”

There is no universal position that all women occupy in all societies and even within most societies it is not possible to speak of women as a group sharing common interests. The class or ethnic background of women might be as important in deciding their position in society as their gender (Mosse, 1993:7). However, Feldstein (1994:3) observed that an explicit focus on gender and the application of GA tools, frequently helped to reveal the sources of variation that were of importance in a particular location.

GA can provide information that can be integrated into formal calls for project proposals and ensure the inclusion of line items for gender-related activities in budgets and contracts. A GA at the outset of the project can establish baseline data on women's participation against which progress can be measured (Gibb, 2001:11).

In conclusion, GA gathers information that contributes to the design of projects that do not harm women and can aid the design of projects that advance the position of women relative to men to achieve a fairer society.

Importance of Critically Examining Gender Analysis Frameworks

If GA has such a positive contribution to make to development practice, why should this thesis be based on a *critical examination* of GA?

One reason is that there are different GA frameworks and each has its strengths and weaknesses. GA includes several different approaches that share specific features, such as sex-disaggregated data and the analysis of women and men's roles and access to and control over resources. However, the approaches differ in the degree to which analysis is extended beyond the sphere of production and the degree to which they consider other social relations (class, ethnicity, age, sexuality). They also differ in the extent to which they are based on gender equity principles (INSTRAW⁸, 2004). Critically examining GA frameworks helps to reveal such features. This information is then of use in aiding development workers in their choice of framework and in interpreting the results generated.

⁸ INSTRAW is the United Nations International Research and Training Institute for the Advancement of Women.

GA frameworks have also undergone changes over time. The institutional focus of gender training frameworks has widened from the household to other institutions through which gender inequality is reproduced. The type of development interventions the frameworks target has moved from the project level to sectoral and macro-economic policies and the extent to which the frameworks view development institutions themselves as ‘gendered’ has changed over time, raising issues of organisational change for each of them (Miller & Razavi, 1998:3). Critically examining GA frameworks can help to highlight the latest findings on GA and can assist development practitioners to learn from the best practices of others.

The frameworks also differ in which factors in women’s and men’s lives they consider. This chosen focus reflects the values and assumptions of the framework’s designers. When development workers use a certain framework, these values and assumptions ultimately influence the type of development interventions they select. Consequently, March (1999:25) urges users to be aware of the thinking behind frameworks. Critically examining the frameworks helps to highlight these underlying values and assumptions, explore their consequences and seek ways to minimise negative impacts.

In conclusion, GA frameworks need to be understood and applied appropriately. This thesis is an attempt by the researcher to really understand and practise using GA frameworks, while considering how they can apply the findings to the betterment of development work.

World Vision

As noted earlier, data collection for this thesis took place with World Vision Vanuatu staff. The section below gives an introduction to the wider international organisation and their approach to GAD.

WV is an international Christian humanitarian aid and development organisation. In 1950 Bob Pierce founded WV to provide emergency care for war orphans in Korea. WV’s work has progressed from an exclusive focus on child welfare to developing the long-term self-sufficiency of entire communities. The partnership works in over 100 countries and impacts upon an estimated 85 million people worldwide. WV works with

communities around the world to build hope, to provide sustainable access to food and clean water and to provide education and basic health necessities for a better future (WVI, 2005:4). WV operates in three main areas: Emergency Relief, Rehabilitation and Community Development. Almost 80% of funds are from private sources with the remainder coming from governments and multilateral agencies. Approximately half of WV's programmes are funded through child sponsorship and support Area Development Programmes. Interventions covered include health care, agriculture, water, education, micro-enterprise development and advocacy. Non-sponsorship projects generally supplement the Area Development Programmes (WVNZ, 2007).

World Vision and Gender

WV recognises GAD as a critical component of its ministry. The Director of Gender and Development wrote 'GAD theory shares much in common with Christian ideas of reconciliation, justice and the notion of being co-stewards of God's resources and co-heirs of God's grace' (WVI, 2005:4).

The WVI Vice-President, Development and Food Resources reported that over the years the organisation had struggled with culture and theology. However, WV had made incremental progress and increasing numbers of men were joining and supporting this organisational transformation towards greater gender awareness. 'There is much progress; there is still a ways to go. It is clear, however, that this foundational shift in culture is firmly underway and has gathered welcome momentum' (WVI, 2005:3-4). The table below outlines some of the milestones in the history of gender initiatives in WV.

Table 1.2 World Vision History of Gender And Development

1980s	Declared commitment to the first gender approach called ‘Women In Development’ (WID).
1985	Sent a delegation to the UN Conference on Women in Nairobi.
1986	Formed a commission to assess the situation of women within the organisation.
1992	WVI Board adopted a WID policy for the entire partnership. Started the WVI Girl Child Initiative, whose purpose was to promote the rights of girl child.
1995	Sent a delegation to the UN Conference on Women in Beijing.
1997	Created the position of Gender and Development Director to implement and support the WV gender policy.
1999	Revised the WID policy and created a WVI GAD policy.
2000	Sent a delegation to the UN General Assembly Special Session on “Beijing + 5” in New York.
2001	WVI Gender Network was established.
From	
2003	Carrying out Gender Self-Assessment of each National Office.
2005	WVI Gender Training Tool Kit released.

Source: (WVI, 2005:3,4&32)

World Vision Vanuatu

WV first established an office in Vanuatu in 1982. The main office for WVV is in Port Vila on Efate Island. At the time of the fieldwork WVV was one of three field offices under World Vision Pacific Development Group (WVPDG), which had a Field Director, based in Papua New Guinea (PNG) and also had offices in PNG and the Solomon Islands.

WVV works in the north and south of Vanuatu and in the capital city Port Vila. The programmes provided are in education, health and the environment. Due to the high illiteracy rate among the rural people, WVV’s education programme covers functional literacy in the vernacular for adults. WVV supplies pre-schools with building materials as well as providing assistance and training to pre-school teachers. WVV primary health work supports the construction of some community aid posts and provides and finances training for community aid post workers. It assists with medical service delivery in the communities including proper sanitation facilities. It conducts training for capacity building, especially in leadership, environmental awareness and other community based

activities. WVV focuses on teaching communities how to mobilise their resources for economic and social development (Sanga, 2004:184).

At the training sessions the researcher took, most of the staff had not received any form of gender training. There was a need to start right from the beginning regarding GAD theory before looking at GA frameworks. The researcher utilised the WVI Gender Training Toolkit as the basis for the training provided.

This introductory chapter familiarised the reader with the terms GAD and GA and their importance in conducting constructive development initiatives. It responded to charges of interfering with culture, religion and content third world women and found them to be baseless. In addition, development workers did have a mandate to promote the basic human rights of women. The chapter explained that critically examining GA frameworks would help development practitioners utilise the most beneficial tool for their work and help them to compensate for the pitfalls of each. The final section introduced WV, their history of dealing with gender issues and described the work of WVV.

The next chapter provides a brief overview of the emergence of GAD and then critically examines GA frameworks. This is followed by an outline of the context of the fieldwork (Vanuatu) and gender relations and issues in this Pacific nation. The fourth chapter locates the researcher and describes the methodology of the fieldwork. The subsequent chapter details the fieldwork project results from the GA sessions and explores what they mean in regards to WVV effectiveness in dealing with gender issues. Chapter six reviews the GA process lessons from the GA sessions and compares these with the claims of the GA authors and critics. The final chapter concludes the thesis and encourages development workers to utilise GA frameworks.

Chapter Two: Gender And Development and Gender Analysis: A Critical Overview

This chapter reviews the literature on GAD and GA. The first section helps locate the reader in the history and theory of GAD, preparing them to engage in-depth with the critique of GA frameworks in the second section.

Gender And Development

GAD evolved out of and in response to an earlier approach called Women In Development. The following section introduces WID and then contrasts it with GAD.

Women In Development

WID is...

“The integration of women into the global processes of economic, political and social growth and change.” (Rathgeber, 1990:489).

“An approach to development that focuses on women and their specific situation as a strategic group. WID projects frequently involved only women as participants and beneficiaries and failed to have a policy impact.” (WVI, 2005:185)

Esther Boserup authored the book ‘Women’s Role in Economic Development’ in 1970. Unlike other authors of her day, Boserup did not assume that women were confined only to their reproductive roles, but instead looked at their productivity and emphasised the vital role of women in agricultural economies (Mosse, 1993:153). Boserup and other feminist scholars challenged the harmful effects of the development process on women, the capitalist system and existing development research, which ignored or misrepresented women. They challenged the existing liberal assumptions regarding the gender division of labour and that technology liberates women.

The Women's Committee of the Washington DC Chapter of the Society for International Development coined WID in the early 1970s as part of a deliberate strategy to bring the new thinking by Boserup and others to the attention of American policy makers (Mosse, 1993:158). Since then WID has been used as shorthand for approaches to the issues of women and development largely based on the modernisation paradigm (Mosse, 1993:158).

The first task of WID was to make women visible. The original development interventions assumed a gender division of labour, with men being the household heads and productive agents and gaining the development resources versus women being the mothers and receiving welfare. WID questioned the stereotypes and highlighted biological and cultural reasoning and led to the gathering of sex-disaggregated statistics. The WID approach assumed that if women's plight was visible then development planners would come up with better development interventions and women would no longer be marginalised. WID arose out of a pro-liberal and pro-modernisation worldview whereby the problem was not the mainstream model of development, the problem was that some women had not benefited from it (Kabeer, 1995:xl&20). Therefore the answer lay in improving women's access to the market and the public sphere.

There were a number of problems with WID and its implementation. WID focussed on women in isolation and therefore the problem and solution focussed only on women. The response of development organisations to WID was generally symbolic and was unsupported by the necessary material resources or political commitment. WID was unable to really challenge gender inequality, firstly because it excluded categories such as class from the analysis and secondly because it was seriously hampered by the impact of the mainstream development theories such as the liberal equilibrium worldview. WID tended to over-emphasise the productive side of women's work and labour, particularly income generation and ignored their reproductive side⁹ (Mosse, 1993:158).

⁹ This shows its origins in the liberal preoccupations of the North in the 1970s and 1980s (Mosse, 1993:158).

Gender And Development

GAD focuses on social, economic, political and cultural forces that determine how men and women can participate in, benefit from and control project resources and activities (WVI, 2005:184).

The GAD approach can be traced back to origins in 1975. Women's poverty was attributed to women's subordination in their relationships with men and the impact of colonial and neo-colonial oppression (Mosse, 1993:165-6). Mainstream GAD writers and theorists are third world feminists and those with grassroots organisational experience with third world women (Sweetman, 2002:8).

One of the key assumptions underlying GAD analysis is that women and men, because they have different gender roles and power, also have different gender interests. If those who plan projects and programmes were better able to understand women's gender interests, they should be in a much better position to ensure that their gender needs were met (Mosse, 1993:165-6). GAD seeks to understand the relationship between men and women and how it changes over time and varies with class, caste, ethnicity, religion and age and what part power relationships and conflicting gender interests play. GAD projects conscientise communities to gender inequalities and issues and take them into account in project design in order that they might contribute to equality between the sexes and the empowerment of women (Bruyn, 1995:12). GAD development efforts include both men and women, as women's lives are strongly shaped by men and women's empowerment results from addressing gender relations and re-thinking development practice (Gujt & Shah, 1998:35).

While WID projects tended to increase women's productive roles while neglecting their reproductive roles, GAD projects recognise both roles. Mosse (1993:161) went as far as to say that GAD is the only approach to women and development that looks at all aspects of women's lives and all the work that women do (productive and reproductive, private and public) and rejects any attempt to undervalue family and household maintenance work. GAD proposes a distinction between daily 'practical' gender needs

and longer term, or ‘strategic’ change, suggesting ways of tackling not just immediate problems, but their underlying causes^{10 11} (Mosse, 1993:165-6).

The transformatory potential of GAD interventions lie as much in the means through which needs are satisfied and opportunities created as it does in the precise ends of each intervention (Kabeer & Subrahmanian, 1999:33). GAD entails empowering women to take control over their own lives economically and culturally through the redistribution of power¹². The empowerment approach intends to reach strategic goals indirectly through women’s triple roles, via bottom-up mobilisation around practical needs as a means to confront oppression. The growth of women’s organisations, leading to political mobilisation, consciousness raising and popular education is the necessary condition for lasting change (Mosse, 1993:162).

Several problems have arisen with GAD. For some agencies the shift from WID to GAD represented an excuse to abandon projects specifically aimed at women. There was also some confusion with the terminology utilised in the GAD discourse, oversimplification of issues and gender transformation being mistaken for being equivalent to women’s economic empowerment (El-Bushra 2000:56). Since gender refers to both women and men, it has been easy to misconstrue gender as a neutral concept, obscuring or denying the fact that, in the world as it is at present, gender relations are a hierarchy with men at the top (MacDonald, 1999:11). In some organisations the terminology changed but not the development practice. Some continued with WID-like interventions that excluded men and led to their resistance to the development programmes. Some

10 Practical gender needs are the needs that are formulated from the concrete conditions women experience, in their engendered position within the sexual division of labour and deriving out of this their practical gender interests for human survival. Practical gender needs are usually a response to an immediate perceived necessity, which is identified by women within a specific context (Moser 1989:1803).

11 Strategic gender needs are those needs which are formulated from the analysis of women’s subordination to men and deriving out of this the strategic gender interest identified for an alternative, more equal and satisfactory organisation of society, in terms of both the structure and nature of relationships between men and women (Moser 1989:1803).

12 Empowerment is defined as increasing women’s dignity and power and enabling them to have control over their own body, labour and forces affecting their lives. This requires: challenging oppressive structures and situations, simultaneously at different levels and harnessing women’s knowledge: collective action by women to attain a stronger political voice and provide support to one another: personal growth of individual women to build their sense of dignity and self-reliance.

preferred to simply avoid the conflict that arises when long held cultural values and practices are challenged¹³.

In conclusion, the table below summarises the two approaches to development:

Table 2.1 Comparison of Women in Development with Gender And Development

Characteristic	Women In Development	Gender And Development
Focus	Women and their exclusion from development initiatives.	The socially constructed relations between men and women and the subordination of women.
Perceived core problem	Women's exclusion.	Unequal power relationships.
Goal	Women's inclusion and more effective development.	Equitable and sustainable development, appropriate participation and decision making.
Solution	Full integration of women in development process.	Empowerment and social change.
Main strategies	Women's projects; increasing women's productivity and income; increasing women's ability to look after the household.	Re-conceptualising the development process taking gender and other inequalities into account; identifying and addressing practical needs of women and men; addressing women's strategic interests; addressing strategic interests of the poor and marginalised.

Source: (Verwooy, 2006:29)

GAD is an approach to development that has been shaped over more than 30 years of attention to gender issues in development. It seeks to learn from the mistakes of earlier approaches and Third World Feminists are key to its development. While GAD continues to have its challenges, one would expect it to continue to evolve with improved relevance and effectiveness in dealing with gender issues.

The above section grounded readers in a strong understanding of GAD, the next section explores GA.

13 Some similar criticisms have emerged surrounding GA frameworks as will be seen in the second section of the chapter.

Gender Analysis Literature Review

The first section below overviews the GA tools used in the fieldwork. The following passage engages in a critique of project GA frameworks and notes how the fieldwork tools measure up.

The majority of GA material available used, rather than critiqued GA and provided detailed findings for a particular time and location. There was less material available on project GA frameworks and fewer documents again that evaluated these tools. The majority of material critiquing GA came out in the 1990s. Little by way of new critique has been produced since 2000.

Project Gender Analysis Frameworks Utilised

The WEEF, GAM and Harvard Analytical Framework (HAF) were utilised in the fieldwork. The section below describes each of these tools. Detailed instructions regarding how to use each of them can be found in the appendices.

The Women's Empowerment and Equality Framework

The WEEF was developed by Sara Hlupekile Longwe¹⁴. Instead of focusing on economic objectives, such as enabling women to be more productive or use their labour time more effectively in order to reap the benefits of development, the WEEF views women's equality and women's empowerment as central development objectives in their own right (Miller & Razavi, 1998:28). The approach recognises that gender inequities do not merely arise from differences in gender roles, but from the gendered division of labour and the allocation of benefits and resources (INSTRAW, 2004).

The aims of the WEEF include:

- Helping development practitioners question what women's empowerment means in practice.
- Critically assessing to what extent a project or programme is supporting that empowerment (March, 1999:92).

¹⁴ Longwe is a consultant on gender and development based in Lusaka, Zambia (March, 1999:92).

The WEEF encourages a ‘bottom up’ approach to planning. Longwe believed that when development planners conducted a baseline survey and gender role analysis they only identified practical needs, not strategic interests. Hence, she sought to provide a systemic and analytical understanding of the grassroots empowerment process by which communities recognise and pursue their strategic interests (Miller & Razavi, 1998:28).

The WEEF was designed for use during project and programme design, implementation and evaluation. It can be used to assess the different objectives within a project or to assess the projects within a programme.

The WEEF methodology is described in detail in Appendix 1. A basic programme level WEEF matrix can be seen below with one project entered.

Table 2.2 Basic Women’s Equality and Empowerment Framework

Sector	Project	Level of Equality					Recognition of women’s issues
		Welfare	Access	Conscientisation	Participation	Control	
Education	Functional Literacy		x		x	x	x

The Gender Analysis Matrix

Rani Parker designed the GAM in collaboration with development practitioners working for a Middle Eastern Non Governmental Organisation (NGO). The GAM was developed to assist with planning, designing, monitoring and evaluating projects at community level. It is a community based technique that identifies and analyses gender differences and determines the different impact development interventions have on women and men (March, 1999:68&74).

Participatory planning and the reality of grassroots work influenced Parker’s group. They designed the GAM to be a transformative tool that initiates a learning process and starts a process of analysis by community members (March, 1999:68&74).

Consequently the GAM shifts the focus of information gathering and analysis away from the development planner to the people who are the subjects of the analysis (Miller & Razavi, 1998:29). The tool identifies and constructively challenges assumptions about gender roles and helps raise awareness of women's subordination as a result of unequal gender relations (March, 1999:68&74).

Some of the underlying principles include:

- People have all the knowledge they need to do GA in their own community.
- They only need technical experts to help as facilitators to get them started.
- GA will only promote transformation if it is done by the people themselves (March, 1999:68).

The GAM method is described in detail in Appendix 1. A partially completed GAM can be viewed below using a functional literacy project as an example.

Table 2.3 Basic Gender Analysis Matrix

	Labour	Time	Resources	Culture
Women	+ Domestic duties easier - can read the instructions on things bought from the store.	+ More time with friends and family that attend the classes. - Less time at home and in the garden.	+ Access to education. + Able to get a job or a new job. + Increased income and can save money.	+ Increased self esteem. - Domestic problems as not able to complete all housework due to classes.
Men				
Household				
Community				

The Harvard Analytical Framework

The HAF was developed by researchers at the Harvard Institute for International Development in the United States of America, working in collaboration with the WID office of USAID¹⁵ ¹⁶. It was published in 1985 and was one of the first frameworks designed for GA. At this time the 'efficiency approach' to integrating women in

15 The HAF is also known as the Gender Roles Framework or Gender Analysis Framework.

16 USAID is the United States of America's International Aid and Development Agency.

development work was gaining prominence in development circles (March, 1999:32). The framework has been widely used in mainstream development institutions.

The HAF is based on the assumption that women were unable to benefit fully from the development process because planning efforts did not recognise women's actual and potential contribution to development (INSTRAW, 2004).

The HAF aims include:

- Demonstrating that there is an economic case for allocating resources to women as well as men.
- Helping planners design more efficient projects and improve overall productivity.
- Trying to get more women involved in development projects (March, 1999:35).

The HAF collects micro-level data at the community and household level. It maps the work and resources of men and women in a community and highlights the main differences (March, 1999:32-33). The tool also addresses the definition of project objectives and assesses how these objectives relate to women and men's involvement within a project and the effect of the project on gender (WVI, 2005:87).

The framework takes as its starting point the view that the household is not an undifferentiated unit with a common production and consumption function. Households are seen as systems of resource allocation themselves. Gender equity is defined in terms of individual access to and control over resources (Miller & Razavi, 1998:4).

The framework looks at access to and control over income and resources, highlighting the incentives and constraints under which men and women work in order to anticipate how projects will impact their productive and reproductive activities as well as the responsibilities of other household members. The information from the HAF is used for tailoring planned interventions in such a way as to improve overall productivity (Miller & Razavi, 1998:2&5).

The HAF can be used during project identification, design, implementation and evaluation. It can also be used to collect baseline data (ILO¹⁷, 1998). The HAF method is described in detail in Appendix 1.

Critique of Project Gender Analysis Frameworks

The following discussion explores issues raised by GA authors and users. A range of topics are covered, from practical matters such as allowing sufficient resources, to theoretical concerns such as the underlying understanding of development of those who devised a particular GA framework. General criticisms are discussed, but particular attention is paid to each of the three GA frameworks used in this study.

Efficiency Versus Empowerment

The different GA tools have different goals. Some focus on efficiency while others seek to empower the beneficiaries. The efficiency approach is based on the understanding that it is inefficient to ignore women in planning the distribution of resources. It aims to create projects and programmes with the most efficient allocation of resources. However, there are times when this can come into conflict with wider issues of justice or women's empowerment and hence the approach has been heavily criticised. The efficiency approach does not challenge existing gender relations. Because resources, not power, are seen as central, it can further tip the balance of power in the favour of men. Resources will be allocated to men if it is judged efficient, ignoring issues of justice. The efficiency approach can be particularly problematic in countries where women are not involved in production outside the house (March, 1999:24).

In contrast to the efficiency frameworks, some GA tools explicitly have the aim of empowerment. These emphasise the transformation of gender relations, through women's self-empowerment (March, 1999:25). The empowerment approach focuses as much on the process of development as on the ends achieved. 'Empowerment will not emerge from the information or 'data', but from the process around the generation and analysis of the information.' Hence the Socio-Economic and Gender Analysis

¹⁷ ILO stands for International Labour Organisation.

Programme (SEAGA) manual encourages community participation, development workers acting as facilitators and the use of PRA tools (Wilde, 2001:40).

The HAF is based on the efficiency approach while the WEEF and GAM were designed to empower beneficiaries. Each will be discussed below.

The HAF project cycle analysis helps to identify the extent to which project objectives address women's goals, needs and issues in dynamic, transformational and relevant ways (WVI, 2005:98). However, overall the tool is based on the WID efficiency approach, as INSTRAW (2004) reported 'Women's productive contributions, both actual and possible, provide the rational for allocating resources to women and including them in the development process.' The HAF does not make issues of power explicit, nor does it ask how and why gender relations are unequal and the underlying causes of women's subordination are often not tackled (March, 1999:49&51). Consequently, the HAF often leads to gender neutral interventions rather than those that can transform existing gender relations (INSTRAW, 2004).

In contrast, the WEEF emphasises the empowerment of women. It questions whether an intervention has transformative potential and strengthens the translation of a commitment to women's empowerment into actual plans and policy. The tool identifies areas where empowerment has been achieved and highlights what remains to be done. The WEEF demonstrates that development interventions contain both strategic and practical gender elements and shows practical and strategic gender needs as a progression. The WEEF is strongly ideological; development means overcoming women's inequality compared to men in every respect (March, 1999:99).

The GAM was designed to be a transformative tool that empowers project beneficiaries with a means to analyse their situation. Project staff merely acted as facilitators in this process.

Miller and Razavi (1998) expanded the 'efficiency' versus 'empowerment' debate and talked about 'integrationist' versus 'agenda setting,' or transformative approaches to development. They reported that some GA framework authors saw market led growth as a process that was essentially benign, while others saw it as polarising and socially

unsustainable. The integrationist approach highlighted the ‘constraints’ that need to be removed in order to ensure women’s active participation in the process of growth initiated by liberalisation policies and was less concerned about changing the content of those policies. The agenda setting approach emphasised the need to re-think economic policies and to restructure resource allocations along lines that placed human well being before production and monetary targets¹⁸. Miller and Razavi noted that development has often disenfranchised some groups of men; hence integrating women into the status quo is unlikely to be sufficient. The HAF views development as a process that is inherently benign; one from which everyone can benefit (Miller & Razavi, 1998:3&6), hence it falls in the integrationist camp.

Social Roles Versus Social Relations

Some GA frameworks focus on analysing social roles and pay little attention to social relations. GA frameworks which focus primarily on roles, take as their starting point the gender division of labour and the gendered distribution of resources. A gender-roles analysis therefore sees a community mainly in terms of who does what and who has what. Gender-roles analysis does not directly examine how power is structured and negotiated (March, 1999:23-4).

An analysis of social relations considers how members of a community relate to each other: what bargains they make, what bargaining power they have and what they get in return. They are context specific and vary considerably depending on the setting. Other aspects of relationships between people, including economic status, race, ethnicity and disability, also shape social relations. All these social categories play a part in determining an individual’s power and status in their particular community (March, 1999:23).

March (1999:23-4) warned that an exclusive focus on social roles could encourage users to think of men and women as separate groups, as if they could be isolated from each other. This may result in dissecting gender relations rather than creating a picture of the different ways in which everything, conflicts as well as co-operation between men and women, fit together. Miller and Razavi (1998) reported:

18 Such as growth, profits, accumulation of wealth.

“While the gender division of labour involves men and women undertaking different activities, it also entails an intricate and changing system of co-operation and exchange.... Responsibilities tend to oscillate according to each sex’s ability to cope with its own sphere and its ability either to tap into the other or to shift the responsibilities.” (Miller & Razavi, 1998:5)

They also warned ‘Women’s enhanced earning capacity very often means that they will end up making a more significant contribution to the household budget as men’s contributions are re-directed to other uses’ (Miller & Razavi, 1998:5)

Out of the three fieldwork GA tools, the GAM was the only one that really considered gender relations. The WEEF is limited to assessing equality and the HAF can be categorised as a method of gender-roles analysis (March, 1999). The WEEF and the HAF are discussed further below.

The WEEF can encourage a misleading view of women as a homogeneous group. It looks at the relationship between men and women in terms of equality only and does not consider the systems of rights, claims and responsibilities (March, 1999:100). The WEEF literature makes little reference to gender relations and to the way in which gender is embedded in other social relations such as class, ethnicity, age and religion (Miller & Razavi, 1998:28).

The HAF focus on gender roles encourages appreciation of the variety of activities engaged in by household members and highlights some of their logical interconnections (Kabeer, 1995b:272). It also gives a clear picture of the gender division of labour and this helps avoid issues like underestimating women’s workloads, giving out resources at inappropriate times (March, 1999:48) and failing to recognise women’s roles as producers and concentrating on men’s activities alone. The HAF focuses on both resources and benefits via the access and control profile, giving a more accurate assessment of the relative power of members of a society or economy. This knowledge can be utilised to analyse the probable interactions of women and men with a project and its likely effect on both genders (WVI, 2005:89&93).

On the down side, the HAF compares ‘women’ and ‘men’ as two separate, homogeneous groups, yet communities include different classes and races, different households and intra-household differences (i.e. between mothers-in-law and daughters-in-law, or first wife and second wife) (March, 1999:51). While there are a large number of issues on which women’s interests may converge (for example child custody; sexual harassment), there are enough points of divergence to make the task of the planner using HAF a difficult one. Miller and Razavi (1998:6) reported that there is very little in the HAF literature which prepares the planner for such conflicts of interest. Decision making processes may also be much more complicated than those represented by the HAF access and control matrix. This table does not draw out power dynamics, show the relationships between different people, or how people bargain, negotiate interests and make decisions (March, 1999:49-50). In neglecting the concrete relations between men and women, the HAF fails to raise questions about how change is brought about in men’s and women’s roles in production and in the division of responsibilities between them (Miller & Razavi, 1998:5).

Looking Beyond the Household

GA frameworks differ in the extent to which they can offer insights into different institutions such as households, communities, markets, states and civil society. Much of the early GAD literature focussed on the household, where gender relations are most visible. However, more recent feminist scholarship highlighted the extent to which gender hierarchies are reproduced through the workings of other institutions. Markets, firms and state institutions are some of the more critical sites. It is therefore important that GA extends beyond households (Miller & Razavi, 1998:4).

Miller and Razavi (1998:23) commented that while the literature on households provided useful analytical tools for practitioners to adopt and use, such as bargaining models and the ‘co-operative-conflict’ framework, the work on state and market institutions had not produced user-friendly tools that could be incorporated within gender training modules.

In regards to the fieldwork GA tools, the WEEF does not examine the macro environment or the institutions and organisations involved and the GAM does not analyse external forces beyond the community (March, 1999:76&100). The HAF begins to explore different institutions, however INSTRAW (2004) reported that the HAF was too focussed on the household. Miller and Razavi (1998:6-7) reported that planning and policy-making institutions (governments, international agencies) remain outside the HAF framework and no reference is made to the complex ways in which male bias has become institutionalised within these organisations. Nor is any emphasis placed on the need to change the working procedures and organisational goals and mandates of these institutions to make them more gender equitable. The policy process is explained as a rational, technical exercise executed by ‘essentially benign and neutral agents.’ HAF proponents made brief reference to ‘distinct male and female segments’ in wage labour markets, but no explanation was offered as to how these distinct segments were created and maintained. Miller and Razavi commented that issues of power and control which were drawn upon to explain the intra-household inequalities did not seem to enter the domain of ‘impersonal’ markets.

Incorporating Time in the Analysis

Over time, gender roles and relations change naturally in any community. Specific events such as conflict or economic crisis can cause certain aspects to change rapidly and/or dramatically. Development workers must be able to recognise both actual and potential changes in gender relations in order to identify opportunities and constraints for working towards greater gender equity (March, 1999:23).

The WEEF and HAF act as a ‘snap-shot’ and do not portray change over time. In contrast, the GAM is designed to capture and accommodate changes over time. Development practitioners are instructed to carefully repeat the GAM over time to ensure that negative perceptions and stereotypes about gender roles are challenged (March, 1999:52-76&100).

Tangible and Intangible Resources

Tangible resources include land and income. Intangible resources include: time, skills, self-confidence, status and respect, political or social resources, rights and claims on people, friendships and membership of networks. Intangible resources are particularly important to people with few tangible resources, however the extent to which the different frameworks include and value intangible resources varies (March, 1999:24-5).

The fieldwork GA tools consider intangible resources to different degrees. The GAM includes intangible resources like time and socio-political issues. It also moves from practical issues to cultural change, which helps participants make the link between practical impact and intangible changes at a cultural and ideological level. The WEEF considers intangible resources, however the hierarchy of levels does not assess the relative importance of different resources (March, 1999:74&100). The HAF restricts its analysis of power to tangible resources such as land, credit and cash.

Addressing Male Identity and Roles

Attention to men and masculinities is an important area for GA. The inclusion of men in activities targeted at women can help reduce male resistance. There is also a need to develop awareness of gender issues amongst men as well as women and there are social justice issues for some men. Attention to masculinities can help development workers to better understand the relational contexts within which women live their lives (Jackson, 1999:89). Such work can also aid understanding of unhelpful male identities and roles and assist communities in developing positive norms. GA that considers men can also be used to analyse projects that target men. Lastly, development workers need to ensure that men are not marginalised.

However, Jackson (1999:89) reported ‘Gender analysis with an explicit focus on men and masculinities has yet to be applied to many developing country contexts or to issues of gender divisions of labour.’ Morrell (1998:605) agreed, ‘The dominance of men in the public record has obscured the fact that little is known about masculinity.’ Large (1997:25) claimed that development practice had taken the concept of ‘gender’ and applied it with a focus only on women. ‘That women’s positions interests and choices

are influenced by their gender is recognised; the fact that men's situations are similarly affected by gender is not.'

Jackson (2000:4) explored the gender division of labour from a focus on men. She complained that too much emphasis had been placed on separation, rather than interdependence. This reduced the relational to assumptions that women's work was imposed rather than desired and excessive by comparison to ethnographically thin sketches of male work. It suggested that nothing was elective about work when applied to women and by contrast, that everything was elective about male work. Jackson recommended that:

"Consideration of gender divisions of labour with a focus on men might move gender analysis in a direction which delivers greater attention to the relational, a more animated and agentic approach to those processes which produce divisions of labour and a broadening of temporal frames and notions of reciprocity, as the context within which perceptions of gender equity are embedded" (Jackson, 2000:1).

Morrell (1998:608-9&630) encouraged studying men through the lens of masculinity. He felt that this would assist the move away from essentialism and sex-role theory which together promote analyses which rest on unproblematised and naturalised equations of men with particular traits or characteristics. In addition this would extend understanding of how gender is a feature of all social relationships. This in turn would aid understanding of how inequalities develop and are sustained and how power is wielded.

There is an urgent need to understand masculinity in the context of disintegration conflicts. 'In situations of conflict, the failure to address men's gender interests and identities is potentially lethal. The socialisation of young men must be the next stage in gender analysis.' Large (1997:26-9) explored theory regarding the development of male identity, highlighting the place of conflict and contests in constructing masculinity, the historic focus on warrior images and the emphasis on bravery and physical skill. Large used case studies to demonstrate that it is possible to harness the processes that socialise

boys into ‘warriors,’ and capitalise on the positive aspects of male socialisation while subverting those aspects of male socialisation that are harmful to society.

The fieldwork GA frameworks ranged from addressing men's needs to not considering them at all. The GAM was the best framework for considering men's and women's needs and can be used for projects which target men. The inclusion of men as a category in the GAM has been found to gain the confidence of male participants, as in the past some facilitators have fallen into the trap of talking about gender, but focussing only on women. The GAM also helps anticipate resistance from men and encourages consideration of what support should be offered for those at risk¹⁹.

In comparison, the HAF paid some attention to men. The first three HAF tools collected information on both men and women, however the final tool on the project cycle analysis only sought to promote women's needs. The WEEF performed the worst in regards to incorporating men as it does not consider or explore men's needs and interests at all (March, 1999:75&100).

Resources Required

GA frameworks need to be applied in a serious, systematic way. Adequate resources, including time, skills and suitable preparation are all essential (March, 1999:14). There are some differences in the time required to carry out the different frameworks. Development practitioners need to weigh up the costs and benefits of the different GA tools in light of their goals and available resources. Opportunities to develop the skills abound, different organisations have put together a range of GA training kits and short training courses are also available.

In regards to suitable preparation, Vernooy (2006) stated that the diversity of cultures and languages reinforced the need to prepare locally relevant approaches. They felt that most GA methods and concepts were grounded in ‘western’ thought and were not always applicable in the social and cultural contexts in which their partners were working. March (1999:14) recommended that key terms used in the GA frameworks be

19 Resistance often originates from the men in a community, however groups of women have also hindered various initiatives.

translated and when GA tools are used for training purposes, the trainer should find examples and case studies that reflect the realities of the individual location. This will help make the frameworks pertinent and effective, but more importantly will avoid confusing and/or offending project beneficiaries or GA trainees.

Regarding the fieldwork GA frameworks, most GA training courses and toolkits cover the GAM, HAF and WEEF. The GAM is accessible, systematic and simple. It uses familiar categories and concepts and accommodates constraints such as funding, time, illiteracy and insufficient or non-existent quantitative data on gender roles. Practitioners are instructed to allow two to four hours to conduct the GAM with a community group, providing a relatively quick way of gathering complex and rich data. The HAF is practical and hands on and provides complex information. Practitioners can delve into more or less detail depending on their needs (March, 1999:33,48,68,76).

Creative Approaches

Different components of separate GA frameworks can be adapted and combined to create a hybrid version and users can add their own ideas (March, 1999:23).

The fieldwork GA frameworks presented a range of degrees of flexibility. The WEEF was the least flexible. This framework deals in broad generalities only, it is not a ‘complete’ framework and should be used as a part of a GAD ‘tool kit’. The GAM has a degree of flexibility, in that users can add different levels of society to the analysis such as additional age groups, classes and ethnic groups (March, 1999:69&100). The HAF was the most flexible and can be adapted to many situations. Further categories of analysis can be added depending on the need, including age (elderly, adults, children), time allocation (percentage, season) and location (March, 1999:33&48). Percy (1999:401) described a case study where the HAF was completed using PRA tools. The PRA tools used at each stage are listed below.

Table 2.4 Completing the Harvard Analytical Framework using Participatory Rural Appraisal tools

Stage	PRA Tool
Overview of the community, its resources and constraints.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Venn diagramming – Transect walks – Resource/social maps – Historical profiles
Activities of client groups.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Wealth ranking – Daily routines – Seasonal calendars
Resources of client groups including relative access to and control over, resources.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Proportionate piling
Group/community prioritisation of constraints.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Voting – Ranking

The use of these PRA tools helped overcome many of the criticisms associated with the HAF. In addition, the HAF is often used in conjunction with the Moser Framework, which includes the concept of strategic gender interests (March, 1999:48).

Participatory Methodologies

Participatory methodologies can be used in GA. Percy (1999:395&402) stated that the use of PRA and GA were complementary in that they put the clients first, engender respect, provide equal opportunities and are flexible. In addition, PRA is critical by design and in intention and that reflexivity and process-orientation are key principles of PRA, all of which are supportive to GA.

However, a number of authors have critiqued the use of PRA in GA and have raised some concerns. Percy outlined the debate, identifying six major areas of concern:

- The complex nature of communities: differentiation beyond gender.
- The role of development workers: the danger of directed participation.
- Raised expectations.
- Scaling-up.
- Lack of women's empowerment.
- Conflict.

These will be elaborated on below.

The Complex Nature of Communities: Differentiation Beyond Gender

Critiques claim that PRA tools do not sufficiently differentiate beyond gender and hence the results do not reflect the complex nature of communities. Miller and Razavi (1998:29) asked; whose perceptions and representations are being taken as ‘women’s voices’? How far can the women participants claim to represent all the women of their community? How far are women constrained by cultural norms and patterns of behaviour from articulating their concerns or interests?

In response, the SEAGA and other PRA approaches emphasise the importance of seeking to hear a variety of opinions within the beneficiary communities. ‘We must remember that each group has its own story to tell, that often these stories are partly conflicting, but that each is important to helping us understand the development situation.’ The SEAGA manual directed practitioners to listen to women and men, the poorest and most marginalised and all the different ethnic groups, castes and races in a community (Wilde, 2001:17). Percy’s case study combined the HAF with PRA tools and this did allow for differentiation beyond gender²⁰.

Jackson (1996:499) also noted that there are often large discrepancies between the subjective perceptions of well being generated by PRA techniques and well being as measured by traditional poverty indicators. Jackson warned ‘We need measures of poverty as a counterpoint to perceptions which reflect the biases and prejudices inherent in all cultures.’

The Role of Development Workers: The Danger of Directed Participation

PRA tools can be used to extract information for the benefit of others, in contrast to participation, which truly builds the capacity of local people to set priorities and manage their own research and development. This is particularly relevant when looking at gender issues. There can also be facilitator bias, due to lack of gender-awareness amongst the facilitators themselves (Percy, 1999:404). As Kabeer stated ‘Participatory

20 The roles and resource profiles of wives and female heads of households were examined separately and in some cases sub-groups of men and women were analysed according to age, wealth or type of marriage. Wealth ranking helped to identify low, middle and high-income level groups (Percy, 1999:401&403).

methods are as gender-blind or as gender-aware as the practitioner using them' (Miller & Razavi, 1998:28). Facilitators also have different skills and this also influences the type of information gained. There can be misinterpretation of information due to different knowledge systems. Some PRA tools are more presentable than others leading to women's views being side-lined. One critic called for new methods to access women's knowledge. The process of participation is often compromised by outsider control over the direction of work and tools used. The choice of GA framework can influence both the amount of control over the participatory and gender analytical processes that communities have, as well as their level of understanding of this process. In addition, there is often tension between trying to achieve targets on time and trying to involve communities, which can be a slow process (Percy, 1999:404).

Percy's case study (1999:404) initially used PRA in a rather controlled and extractive way. Information was gained from communities for extension teams to carry out GA so that they could make extension more client-orientated. However, during the course of the project the GA framework was adapted to enable greater client participation in identifying and taking responsibility for development activities.

Raised Expectations

The use of PRA risks community disappointment for a number of reasons. The active involvement of villagers in explaining and analysing their constraints and opportunities within the PRA process often unavoidably leads to raised expectations on their part that some of the constraints will be fulfilled. Villagers also present a holistic picture of their livelihoods, but development workers are regularly constrained to a specific mandate. Major constraints raised by villagers may be beyond the ability of the project team to deal with. Where gender-disaggregated data is gathered, then lost during a community ranking exercise, it is often women's expectations that are less likely to be fulfilled (Percy, 1999:404). There are also limitations to how far planned interventions can be expected to overcome effectively the existing power relations (such as class or gender) in any given context. (Miller & Razavi, 1998:29).

Percy (1999:404) suggested setting clear and limited objectives for PRA work and only helping villagers to plan for those activities that can be sustained locally without outside

assistance. Putting villages in touch with agencies that can provide further assistance is also an option.

Scaling-up

Risks during PRA scaling-up include routinisation of the PRA process, duplication, abuse or misuse of PRA and seeing the community as a homogenous group.

Percy (1999:405) suggested pre-service and in-service training in PRA and GA for facilitators and developing stronger links between PRA research and project planning so the location specific findings can be utilised. Making budgetary and programme changes in hierarchical organisations would also enable them to respond to grassroots initiatives and requests.

Lack of Women's Empowerment

Using the methodology of PRA to ensure the implementation of projects which do not marginalise women is one thing, but using it to fundamentally challenge and change power relations between men and women is quite another (Percy, 1999:406).

Percy (1999:401&406) stated that PRA will only lead to empowerment if it challenges women's oppression and subordinate position. His case study identified women's strategic gender needs. The development constraints profile identified who was most involved and affected and what could be done about it. Distinction was made between interventions that fulfilled practical gender needs, strategic gender needs or both. However, women's strategic gender needs and the transformative aspects of PRA were neither planned for nor achieved. The emphasis of the project was on the mechanistic use of participatory approaches and tools, plus GA, for a specific result: more client-orientated extension.

"Being aware of a situation of unequal power relations, as could be realised with gender-responsive PRA methods, does not automatically

guarantee change through a gender-responsive development strategy”
(Percy, 1999:406).

PRA use in GA therefore must be followed by interventions to empower women.

Conflict

Participatory approaches may expose deep differences and conflict among various groups. Percy (1999:406) claimed that conflict is inseparable from empowerment.²¹

“Any PRA which is seeking to identify women’s and men’s relative decision making powers and control over resources is going to reveal strategic gender needs. Fulfilling these needs requires a change in the status quo naturally resisted by those with power.”

Working with conflict is critical if interventions are to be meaningful and empowering. When conflict arises development workers need to use negotiation and conflict resolution methods to explicitly acknowledge and work through the conflict (Percy, 1999:406). Inexperienced facilitators may be unwise to intervene, the SEAGA manual recommends that only those with highly specialised skills and expertise undertake this work. Wilde (2001:29) warned that ‘Issues of conflict must be handled very carefully as they can lead to violence.’ Wilde included a case study where some project beneficiaries were murdered in retaliation.

However, Percy (1999:406) reported that the issue of conflict is noticeably absent from PRA literature and conflict management is lacking within much PRA training. Further research, experimentation and training are needed in the application of conflict management within PRA.

Jackson (1996:500) also raised a troubling point regarding conflict. Women themselves have been implicated in female foeticide and infanticide, in food and health biases within households, in dowry deaths and in exploitative relations with other women.

21 The Ethiopian case study did not attempt to meet strategic gender needs or to empower women, hence there was little conflict (Percy, 1999:406).

Consequently ‘Gender interests cannot be entirely equated with the articulated views of women.’ When examining such issues, Miller and Razavi (1998:28) reported that if participatory approaches are informed by an understanding of the different forms that gender power and inequality takes in different contexts and are critical in challenging assumptions about gender, they can help development workers to analyse the meanings of women’s ‘choices’.

“When women’s choices or behaviour seem to reflect a denial of ‘agency’, participatory methods facilitate an understanding of this lack of agency as a product of ‘internalised ideologies’ or ‘external constraints’ and hence provide clues as to how development interventions should be prioritised.”

The fieldwork GA frameworks ranged from fully participatory sessions to no input from community members. The WEEF was conducted without interaction with project beneficiaries. The HAF can be completed without any community workshops, however three of the four HAF tools were filled out using sessions with groups from the project target villages during the fieldwork. The GAM was the only fully participatory tool utilised. Issues surrounding participation with the GAM are discussed further below.

The GAM values community knowledge. It draws on the diverse strengths and perspectives of community groups and does not rely on individual expertise. The GAM challenges tradition and culture, hence tension and conflict is inevitable. However, because the approach takes a dynamic view of gender (that gender roles and relations have been and are constantly changing) it does not shy away from this process (Miller & Razavi, 1998:29). On the downside, as the PRA critiques warn, community members may not discuss all issues freely when using the GAM and its use can lead to false consensus. March (1999:74&77) suggests that in some cases development workers may need to conduct the GAM separately for men and women or different groups of women. However she also notes that when women’s views have previously been silenced, the GAM may not be sufficient to draw out their views and help them to work out solutions.

The GAM needs a good facilitator, the categories of labour, time, resources and socio-cultural factors have many aspects and facilitators must take care to capture the

important factors. In addition, the GAM does not explicitly seek out the most vulnerable community members. A crucial part of the facilitators role is to ask ‘which men’ and ‘which women’ to identify who is likely to experience the most negative or positive impacts. Initially an outside facilitator is required; if there is no literate local facilitator available then the community will remain dependent on an outside facilitator (March, 1999:76).

Interpreting Gender Analysis Results

Each framework selects a limited number of factors as important, out of the huge numbers of issues that actually influence any situation. Consequently each framework can only produce a crude model of reality (March, 1999:22).

Kabeer and Subrahmanian (1999:45&221) discouraged setting up a ‘hierarchy of needs’ in which the ‘strategic’ takes precedence over the ‘practical.’ The key question about ‘access’ to resources is not ‘control’ but about the difference it makes to shifting gender inequalities. Moving from practical needs to strategic gender interests is not a linear progression, but a mutually reinforcing process where moving between needs and interests is dynamic. Development practitioners should ask how practical daily needs can be met in a way that can start to shift structural inequalities.

Contradictory Information

By asking questions of men and women, then comparing those answers with each other and with prior information and field observations, contradictions and mysteries appear. There are a number of reasons for this. Often initial responses during an informal or formal survey reflect cultural stereotypes or norms rather than actual practice²². Researchers need to be careful to listen and observe whether actual practice matches the answers given to questions (Feldstein, 1994:71&237). Gender relations are not uniform in all households of a community and they differ between communities. They vary depending on individual men and women and how they react and behave in various situations. The lives and activities of individual women express how they selectively embrace, tolerate, oppose or ignore gender ideologies. ‘The importance of individual

22 This is frequently true when people describe women’s roles.

choice and action is frequently overlooked when highly abstracted views of society assume a homogeneous and unchanging social order' (Vernooy, 2006:43&62).

Apparent contradictions should not be overlooked. They are a useful point of departure for distinguishing between reported norms and expectations and actual behaviour and intentions. Asking the people to help explain the contradictions can quickly reconcile the information and provide valuable information about gender and other social relations that may impact the project (Feldstein, 1994:71). The SEAGA manual also incorporated 'triangulation' as a means of cross checking information for accuracy. This involved looking at any problem from as many perspectives as possible, but at least three²³ (Wilde, 2001:18).

The fieldwork GA frameworks presented different challenges in interpreting their results. The WEEF is based on a hierarchy of needs and was particularly prone to Kabeer and Subrahmanian's complaint of overlooking the potential of an intervention in shifting gender inequalities. The HAF tends to oversimplify, based on a somewhat superficial, tick-the-boxes approach to data collection, ignoring complexities in the community (ILO, 1998). Both the GAM and the HAF gathered much contradictory information, emphasising the importance of Feldstein's call to investigate contradictions.

Issues Regarding the Development Worker

Some GA frameworks utilise the development worker as a facilitator. Others encourage them to act as top down planners.

Many of the traditional methods of development planning placed development workers in a privileged position as question-asker, solution-provider and all round expert. Local people were assumed to need advice and direction. The information exchanges were one-way: either in terms of the questions set or the directions given.

23 Triangulation is achieved by using different tools to gather information on the same issue (for example creating maps, transects and trend lines) and listening to different people with different points of view about the same topic (such as women/men, young/old, wealthy/poor) (Wilde, 2001:18).

In contrast the SEAGA fieldwork handbook encourages development practitioners to take the role of listeners and facilitators, to become catalysts and providers of occasions for local people to analyse their own problems. The approach makes full use of local knowledge and experience, limiting the imposition of outsiders' preconceptions on local conditions (Wilde, 2001:14-5).

Gender-awareness

No set of methods are in themselves sensitive to differences and inequalities between men and women; each method is only as good as its practitioner (Kabeer, 1995a:112).

MacDonald (1999:70) reported that how GA tools are used depends on factors such as the underlying values of the organisation employing them, the knowledge, skills and sensitivity of the people using them and the political will to use them to the most beneficial effect. Kabeer and Subrahmanian (1999:358) agreed, noting that gender-awareness relates more to the theoretical perspectives and political stance of the analyst than it does to the superiority of one set of methodological tools over another. Hence GA frameworks can be used to good or bad effect, depending on the motivation for their use and the skill with which they are used (MacDonald, 1999:70).

Understanding of Gender

MacDonald (1999:80) suggested that perhaps the most fundamental GA tool of all is a basic understanding of what 'gender' means:

"Outside of departments specifically concerned with gender, there still seems to be a generally imperfect understanding and internalisation of information on what gender is about, even in agencies that claim good performance on gender."

INSTRAW (2004) reported that in practice and especially in the realm of policy, the focus on gender is often confused with an exclusive focus of women. There is tension

over the interpretation of gender by researchers and practitioners in the development field and some have accused development organisations of ‘co-opting’ gender.

The role of the facilitator differed for the three fieldwork GA tools. Users of the GAM are instructed to act as facilitators in guiding the community's analysis of their own issues. Analysis of the HAF and WEEF results is conducted by project staff, thus resulting in top down planning. None of the three of the fieldwork GA frameworks investigated the gender awareness of the facilitator.

'Gendered' Development Organisations

All institutions are made up of rules and norms, practices and procedures which determine which categories of people are likely to be included in – and excluded from – its various operations. (Kabeer, 1995a:114)

Organisations involved in development work reflect the biases of their own cultures. This ‘gendered’ nature of organisations has a profound impact on the success or failure of any development intervention (March, 1999:26). Some GA frameworks analyse how development organisations are gendered. Many however pay no attention to this important issue.

Development workers also need to consider what the reactions of people within their development organisation will be to using certain frameworks and to the conclusions that it enables them to reach. Different approaches can be used in introducing organisations to new ideas and challenging unhelpful ideas. Some are more explicit in empowering women than others (March, 1999:26-7).

None of the three fieldwork GA frameworks analyse the implementing agency. Development practitioners should also note that the WEEF framework could be too confrontational to be used with those who are not committed to women's empowerment. In contrast, the HAF provides a gender-neutral entry point, as it is based on fact not fiction. This can aid discussion with those who are resistant to thinking about power dynamics between women and men (March, 1999:48).

Over Reliance on ‘Tools’

MacDonald (1999: 44,68&70) felt that the cry for GA tools reflects a rather static perception of gender inequality in development as a technical issue that can be addressed by means of technical solutions. It does not take sufficient account of the extent to which gender inequality is an emotional and psychological issue. The search for emotionally neutral, technical solutions to problems can also be a retreat from the more emotionally demanding and less clear-cut questions of personal attitudinal change and dealing with ideology, attitude and organisational culture. Technical tools can be used to change behaviour and practice, but a longer, more transformative, more diffuse and therefore less easily measurable process is necessary to achieve the changes in individual attitude and organisational culture.

March (1999:14&22) also noted ‘GA frameworks are not a simple way of ‘doing gender.’’ She warned ‘No framework will do the work for you. It may help you plan the work that can be done to confront women’s subordination. Afterwards, the work must still be done’.

The ‘Project Trap’

The use of GA frameworks could encourage an exclusive focus on gender issues in development projects. This could lead to practitioners ignoring the fact that gender equality must be fought for at other levels and by other means such as advocacy and the collective action of women (March, 1999:15).

INSTRAW (2004) reported that one of the main criticisms of GA was the prioritisation of short-term problem solving and immediate action over in-depth analytical thinking and political insight that could produce longer term, more transformative change. Lewis (2004) lamented that in Africa:

“The broad and wide-ranging field of gender analysis has easily been reduced to clear-cut ‘gender issues’, technical points that can be

easily identified and resolved in line with transformation driven by structural adjustment and conservative postcolonial state-building.”

Molyneux (2004:115) reported that while GA is an indispensable part of programme and policy development processes, it needs to be accompanied by some strategy for achieving gender justice as part of a broader commitment to greater social and economic equality. She felt that this is unlikely to happen without the political will, vision and strategy provided by collective action. Kabeer (1995a) explored the experiences of NGOs that had successfully incorporated gender-awareness into the formulation of their anti-poverty interventions. She showed that increasing poor women’s organisational experience was critical to ensuring that their needs and views informed the planning process.

This chapter reviewed the literature on GAD and GA. The first half located the reader in the history and theory of GAD. The second half presented a critique of GA frameworks. Development practitioners need to be aware of the benefits and pitfalls of the different GA frameworks so that they may be able to avoid some issues and compensate for others. They should also be aware of the different issues surrounding the practise of GA, such as their own gender awareness and the gendered nature of the organisation they work for. Most important of all is the notion that the job is not finished when the GA report is handed in, GA simply helps identify constructive ways of dealing with gender issues. Those initiatives still need to be implemented to build fairer gender relations.

Chapter Three: Gender in Vanuatu

Vanuatu

This chapter includes a brief overview of background information on Vanuatu, the country where the fieldwork was conducted. It then quickly moves into ni-Vanuatu gender relations and gender issues. The chapter closes with a description of the different institutions and organisations affecting or seeking to influence gender relations in Vanuatu. This will help the reader put the research findings in chapter five in context.

Figure 3.1 Map of Vanuatu

Source: (MacClancy, 1981:2)

Vanuatu has a total landmass of 12,200 square kilometres (World Fact Book, 2006). The islands are mainly mountain ranges rising from the deep ocean floor. The climate ranges from wet tropical in the north to subtropical in the south. Vanuatu has very fertile volcanic soil. Generally the steeper country is covered with lush forest and secondary growth, while coconut plantations and other agriculture dominate the narrow coastal plains (Bennett & Harewood, 2003:16&20).

The people of Vanuatu are mostly Melanesian²⁴. Indigenous Vanuatu society was based on root crop horticulture, pig breeding and exchange (Jolly, 2002:148). In 1774 James Cook explored the islands and named them the New Hebrides. British and French settlers arrived in Vanuatu in the 19th century, including traders, missionaries and blackbirders²⁵. An Anglo-French Condominium was established in 1906 and administered the islands until independence in 1980 (World Fact Book, 2006). The Republic of Vanuatu is now a sovereign democratic state.

Ni-Vanuatu constitute 98.5% of the total populace (World Fact Book, 2006). The fertility rate is 4.2 children born per woman and the population growth rate is 1.49%²⁶ (UNDP²⁷, 2005b). The mean age is 17 years (Randell, 2002:4) and the dependency ratio is 85%²⁸ (DWA²⁹, 2001:9).

Table 3.1 Population Breakdown of Vanuatu in 2005

	% of population	Male	Female
<i>0-14 years</i>	32.6%	34,804	33,331
<i>15-64 years</i>	63.7%	67,919	65,138
<i>65 years and over</i>	3.7%	4,027	3,650

Source: (World Fact Book, 2006)

24 Although there is significant Polynesian influence in many islands in terms of language, physical appearance and social structure (Griffiths, 2005:137).

25 Blackbirders recruited ni-Vanuatu (mainly men) as cheap labour for the sugar plantations in Queensland. Many were 'involuntarily recruited' or coerced or cheated into this work (Miles, 1998:17).

26 However, it is believed that 30% of births go unreported (Mackenzie-Reur, 1996:25).

27 UNDP stands for United Nations Development Programme.

28 This means that 85% of the population depend on the working age population (DWA, 2001:9).

29 DWA stands for Department of Women's Affairs.

Today Vanuatu has at least 105 different local languages (Griffiths, 2005:137). Bislama is the national language and French, English and Bislama are the official languages. Most societies are patrilineal, but there are matrilineal societies in some northern and central Islands³⁰ (Netine, 2000:46). Approximately 10% of the population practice kastom beliefs while 83% practice Christianity (Piau-Lynch, 2004b:14). Eighty percent of ni-Vanuatu live in rural areas and 70% of the working population aged 15 and over, work in subsistence agriculture (Randell, 2002:8).

Agriculture earns around 85% of the country's export income (Bennett & Harewood, 2003:20-21) and tourism is the second biggest foreign exchange earner³¹. The Gross Domestic Product per capita is \$2,900 USD and external debt is over \$80 million USD (World Fact Book, 2006). Vanuatu received \$32.4 million USD in economic aid in 2003 (UNDP, 2005b).

Vanuatu has made significant progress since independence. The table below compares some of the development indicators over this period.

Table 3.2 Improvements in Vanuatu Development Indicators³²

	Year		Year	
Life expectancy at Birth				
Males	1979	56	2006	61
Females	1979	54	2006	64
Infant Mortality Rate/1000	1979	94	2004	58
Under Five Mortality Rate/1,000	1989	58	2003	38
Maternal Mortality Rate/10,000 live births	1991	20	2002	7

The location of communities in small numbers and in quite isolated areas, means that reaching or providing services to all communities is costly (UNICEF³³, 1998:3). The majority of the population does not have access to a reliable supply of potable water (World Fact Book, 2006) and many of the remote rural areas have no health facilities.

30 In the North hierarchy is based on grade taking. Leadership in south Vanuatu is often based on personal achievement but some societies are hierarchical, with hereditary leaders (Netine, 2000:46).

31 Approximately 50,000 people visited Vanuatu in 2004.

32 Data Source: 2006 Life Expectancy (World Fact Book, 2006), The 2004 Infant Mortality Rate (NZAID, 2004), The 2000 Maternal Mortality Rate (Grace & Vurobaravu, 2004), 2003 Under Five Mortality Rate (UNDP, 2005b) and others (UNICEF, 1998:23).

33 UNICEF stands for United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund.

Roading is poor and electricity is only provided in the cities of Port Vila and Luganville and in some towns. Cyclones are Vanuatu's worst hazard, it has been estimated that any given location is devastated by a cyclone every 30 years or so (Bennett & Harewood, 2003:17,34&76). Rapid urbanisation and a high birth rate have led to a depletion of government resources and negative social changes (Hughes, 2005:10). Randell (2002:8) reported that 30% of Port Vila's population live in squatter settlements³⁴.

Many claim that there is hardship rather than poverty in Vanuatu. However, in 2003 the ADB claimed that 40% of all ni-Vanuatu and 51% of those living in the rural areas had an income below the poverty line of US\$1 per day (Piau-Lynch, 2004b:25). The Human Poverty Index in 2003 was 24.7 (UNDP, 2005a), ranking Vanuatu third to last out of the Least Developed Countries in this region³⁵ (Randell, 2002:6).

Economic growth is hindered by dependence on relatively few commodity exports, vulnerability to natural disasters and long distances from main markets and between constituent islands (World Fact Book, 2006). Vanuatu also suffers from a high inflation rate, high population growth rate, poor policy choices and political instability (UNICEF, 1998:7). Piau-Lynch (2004b:17) noted a general lack of application of good governance principles and reports of corruption by both politicians and senior civil servants.

From the above passage one can see that Vanuatu is a developing country with many pressing general development problems. However, Piau-Lynch (2004b:20) noted that ni-Vanuatu have made advances in nearly all fields, particularly in education and health. She concluded that what Vanuatu has been able to achieve in the past 25 years has taken most western countries over 200 years to achieve. One would hope that this rapid rate of development continues.

34 A similar situation exists in Luganville, the next largest urban centre. Living conditions in these areas is overcrowded, with no water supply and poor sanitation (Randell, 2002:8).

35 The Human Poverty Index focuses on the proportion of people below a threshold level in basic dimensions of human development – living a long and healthy life, having access to education and a decent standard of living (UNDP, 2005a).

Gender in Vanuatu

Vanuatu is:

<i>FREE</i>	<i>Men are free, Women are owned by men</i>
<i>SELF-DETERMINED</i>	<i>Men determine, Women go along</i>
<i>SELF-GOVERNING</i>	<i>Men govern women</i>
<i>INDEPENDENT</i>	<i>Women depend on men</i>
<i>ENJOYING THE FRUITS OF THE STRUGGLE</i>	<i>For men only</i>

Source: Grace Mera Molisa (cited in Randell, 2002:31)

The following passage seeks to describe ni-Vanuatu gender relations, overview gender issues in Vanuatu and introduce some of the organisations and institutions influencing or seeking to influence gender relations in Vanuatu.

Ni-Vanuatu Gender Relations

This section explores the status of women in ni-Vanuatu society and some ideas regarding masculinity in Vanuatu. It then looks at family decision making and the division of labour in more detail.

Status of Ni-Vanuatu Women

While different authors debate whether ni-Vanuatu women were historically oppressed or empowered, or at least more empowered than women today, most agree that the current status of women is lower than that of ni-Vanuatu men. Grace Mera Molisa, a ni-Vanuatu women's activist wrote:

“In traditional societies, women carry the world on their shoulders – mothers, teachers, growers, breeders, gatherers, weavers, they carry out 1,001 onerous tasks which facilitate the functioning of the social

system. Expected to be industrious, obedient, loyal, submissive, their investment in life and the future is having children, raising a family and striving to give them a reasonable standard of welfare and prosperity. Constantly burdened, each woman hopes to create the best that is possible for her own social unit.” (Cited in UNICEF, 1998:6).

This disadvantage is further highlighted by Hilda Lini, one of the first female Ministers of the Vanuatu Government:

“Although women are respected, they are treated as inferior to men. In childhood, a boy is allowed to assert himself while a girl is taught subservience. Her very existence is treated as an economic asset or commodity for her family. She is very well looked after and guarded jealously as a valuable asset. She is a means of economic production, exchange, access to land use, sexual gratification and childbearing.”

(Cited in Osteria, 1991:70)

According to Mackenzie-Reur (1996:3), female children are generally regarded as an asset because of their potential contribution to family labour and as a source of income through bride price. However, upon marriage the woman takes up residence in her husband's household and assists him in improving his social position, thus decreasing her value to her natal family. UNICEF (1998:61) stated that ni-Vanuatu women generally gain status by marrying and having children and a woman with many children gains higher status than women with few or no children.

A survey of young ni-Vanuatu women's opinions in 2002 reported that they had no chance to speak on their own behalf on issues that affected them, or that when they did speak up, they were not listened to or their concerns were not taken seriously. Young women felt they were blamed for changes to traditional gender relations and society as a whole (Cummings, 2002:1&17). One young woman reported:

“Women don't have equality in Vanuatu. Anytime a woman tries to do something, someone will put her down, or tell her she doesn't know what she's talking about, or argue with her or even hit her instead of

listening to her ideas – even if it's a good idea that could really change Vanuatu for the better.” (Cummings, 2002:17)

The behaviour of ni-Vanuatu women is hotly contested in the public domain. One example is that the increasing popularity of trousers among young women is widely perceived as a growing ‘problem’ in Vanuatu, which needs to be addressed by chiefs, church and community leaders and husbands. The Council of Chiefs recently attempted to ban women from wearing trousers and women who ‘wore trousers in the wrong place at the wrong time’ reported receiving verbal reprimands, fines, beatings and were the subject of malicious gossip (Cummings, 2002:3-11).

Piau-Lynch (2004b:20) reported that a number of indicators attest to the low status of women in Vanuatu. She highlighted the endemic nature of gender-based violence and the limited presence of women in decision making arenas. These areas will be covered in more depth under the section on strategic gender needs.

Masculinity

Hughes (2005:20) conducted a literature search for information on masculinity in Vanuatu and reported that he could not find any research on this topic. What can be gleaned from the materials available tends to emphasise the negative characteristics of ni-Vanuatu masculinity. The section below provides some insight into these issues.

Violence has been linked to notions of masculinity, with men showing strength and physical toughness (Hughes, 2005:9). The Department of Women’s Affairs (2001:7) noted that men in Vanuatu are landowners and protect their village against external intrusion. They raise their boys to be strong and to guard their village against harm. Hughes (2005:17-25) surveyed male youths about why men fought and 39% of respondents in Santo and 48% in Vila said men fight to show off, show strength or be popular. Ni-Vanuatu men also use violence to overcome anger and resolve conflict related to arguments, land disputes and jealousy. Males who are sensitive and avoid violence are often viewed as having something wrong with them and are labelled as

‘geligeli’ or ‘pufta.’ In addition, many ni-Vanuatu men are unaware that violent behaviours are wrong until they had been charged and committed for a crime³⁶.

Ni-Vanuatu young males experience many sources of stress, including limited openings for further education, unemployment, the unavailability of counselling services, civil unrest, lack of good governance and a general shortage of opportunities to ensure a decent future. Hughes (2005:8-17) stated that ‘It has been recognised that there is a growing trend in the Pacific for youth to use violence (against themselves or others) as a response to stresses in their daily lives’. In addition many ni-Vanuatu urban youth are trying to cope with having little power and dominance stemming from living with poverty, unemployment, lack of adequate finances, uncertainty about their future, land inheritance disputes, black magic and not having a ‘voice’. Hughes noted that powerless young males often use violence in order to make themselves appear more powerful.

From the above section we can see that masculinity is associated with violence in Vanuatu, to the extent that men are surprised about being convicted for violent acts. In addition, male youth stress levels are rising and they are feeling increasingly disempowered, leading to yet more violence.

Family Decision Making

The basic social unit of ni-Vanuatu society is the extended family. A ‘household’ in Vanuatu means the parents, children and grandparents, all living together under the same roof (UNICEF, 1998:4&13). The family provides social and cultural security and livelihood for all its members. The strong family ties have helped to control social problems such as poverty and hunger³⁷ (Mackenzie-Reur, 1996:22).

UNICEF (1998:60) reported that within ni-Vanuatu families it is the husband or uncle that makes decisions and women have little if any decision making role. Mackenzie-Reur (1996:3) stated that in many of the islands, women play very important economic roles in subsistence agriculture and non-agricultural household production. Yet, rights

36 Rape is often viewed by the men involved as legitimate and not a crime. They use it to discourage or punish perceived immoral behaviour, such as wearing short skirts and drinking alcohol or kava (Hughes, 2005:21-2).

37 The Vanuatu Government does not have a social security scheme (Mackenzie-Reur, 1996:22).

over the resources used and the products of the work generally rest with men³⁸. Even if land is inherited through the women's lineage, it is typically the men within the family who make the final determination on the use of this key resource within the subsistence and cash-cropping sector of the economy³⁹. In addition, in urban areas men commonly make the final decision on how the family income will be spent, even if this income was earned by his wife (UNICEF, 1998:61). A WVV evaluation report of work in the northern islands concurred, noting 'Women and men both work in the gardens and in harvesting but men decide 'who does what'.... Both jointly make decisions about using the money. If there is a dispute usually the man decides' (Sitai, 2006:29). UNICEF (1998:61) summed up the situation, 'Women in Vanuatu are largely still in a state of economic dependency.'

Randell (2003:9) reported that significant progress is being made and increasing numbers of husbands and wives are making decisions together. Boe (2006) reported that the chiefs are starting to understand how important gender is and the benefits of fairly distributing resources. WVV staff take great care in explaining gender, so that communities understand that it entails helping people to work together better and complement one another in the way they make decisions⁴⁰.

Clearly male heads of households have dominated family decision making in Vanuatu, but changes are occurring and some men and women are now making decisions together.

Division of Labour

The section below explores ni-Vanuatu men's and women's roles, looking at the rural areas, where the majority of the population resides and then moving on to discuss some of the changes occurring across the country.

38 Mackenzie-Reur (1996:3) noted that in matrilineal societies women have more influence.

39 Lini reported that in Northern Pentecost land is passed from mother to daughter but is managed by the mother's brother (management passes to her son when her brother dies). Her husband has no say in her custom land (cited in Osteria, 1991:70).

40 Boe (2006) felt that talking about rights had been overused and misunderstood as promoting women to control men.

In the rural areas ni-Vanuatu women's roles are looking after the children, collecting and preparing the family food, maintaining the household, collecting water, working in the gardens, feeding the family's animals and weaving⁴¹. Women spend up to 10 hours a day in the family garden alone. At the community level, women's roles include cleaning the village boundary and preparing food for public events. Men spend up to 10 hours a day in cash cropping, fishing, hunting, boat building, artefact carving and discussing council matters. While the women prepare the evening meal, the men talk in the nakamal and drink kava⁴² (UNICEF, 1998:6, Bennett & Harewood, 2006:23-6).

In traditional communities responsibility for each child rests with the whole community and no child is left alone to get in trouble⁴³ (UNICEF, 1998:4). Mothers and grandmothers train girls in their gender roles. This includes weaving baskets and mats for family, ceremonial use and food preparation. They are advised on their responsibilities at home, respect for family members, relationships with other families and the rules of the village enforced by the chiefs. Boys are trained by their fathers, grandfathers and chiefs and are exposed to more kastom training than the girls (UNICEF, 1998:5).

The general consensus is that women work longer hours (Bennett & Harewood, 2003:24) and have less free time than men (UNICEF, 1998:6). The 1983-4 Agricultural Census revealed that ni-Vanuatu women had 25% less leisure time than men (cited in Mackenzie-Reur, 1996:26). A 2006 WVV evaluation report of work in the northern islands noted 'Women and men work in the garden in the mornings.... After the garden work, women continue working in the home, cooking and caring for the children. The men do not do much work in the house and in the evening they go to the 'kava bar' and drink' (Sitai, 2006:29). UNICEF (1998:6&20) reported that men typically work set hours (for example from 7am until 4pm) while women's work extends over a much longer period⁴⁴. Women regularly start housework at 5am and go on late into the night with food preparation, childcare and cleaning responsibilities. UNICEF acknowledged claims that women do light work, while men do heavy work, but questioned whether

41 Women do most of the weaving and make shopping baskets, mats, fish, bird and shellfish traps, furniture and hats.

42 The nakamal is the men's clubhouse, it is taboo for women to enter.

43 The support of the extended family has been of major assistance to women moving into non-traditional careers (Randell, 2003:7).

44 This is in agreement with verbal reports given to the researcher in Vanuatu.

carrying loads of firewood, washing, preparing food and digging gardens really constituted light work. UNICEF concluded that the poor health of ni-Vanuatu women could be attributed to their heavy workload and unhygienic environment.

UNICEF (1998:6) reported that the division of labour is very strong. The Department of Women's Affairs (2001:7) noted that ni-Vanuatu men are not expected to do womanly roles, to participate in such activities is seen as an indication of weakness. Boe (2006) reported that traditions are changing, however some people still see sharing roles as a threat to culture.

Ni-Vanuatu women have increased their participation in employment and around 35% were employed in 2006. There is high unemployment of women and youth as these groups are often unskilled. Women tend to be employed in stereotypical jobs and 'let men take the lead' (Rarua, 2006). Randell and Bolenga (2003:v-xii) interviewed over 40 ni-Vanuatu women working in a variety of non-traditional occupations, from magistrates to scientists and physiotherapists to electricians. Many of the young women taking up jobs in the trades praised their teachers and fellow students and their co-workers in industry for their encouragement, advice and assistance. However, the women also experienced many challenges. Girls that originated from islands where women are not used to talking in public found talking in class or at team meetings a major challenge. Several of the women had been subject to sexual discrimination including teasing, bad language and sexual harassment. Female public servants complained about favouritism towards male staff for both promotion and overseas studies, although some organisations, such as the Police had made significant improvements in recent years.

The section above demonstrates that gender roles in the rural areas of Vanuatu are still quite rigid and place an unfair burden on the majority of ni-Vanuatu women. However, progress has been made and ni-Vanuatu women are starting to move into non-traditional occupations.

Overview of Practical and Strategic Gender Needs in Vanuatu

Now that readers have a feel for Vanuatu and ni-Vanuatu gender relations, the following section moves on to overview practical gender needs and strategic gender needs in Vanuatu. This will help readers to understand the importance of considering gender issues and using GA frameworks in development interventions in Vanuatu.

Practical Gender Needs

Significant improvements have occurred in the provision of practical gender needs since Independence, however some gendered issues remain. Issues regarding health, water and sanitation and nutrition are briefly introduced below.

Mackenzie-Reur (1996:4&16) noted that the maternal mortality rate was relatively high and diseases of the reproductive system and complications of birth or pregnancy were common causes of hospital admission. Causes of the high maternal mortality rate include lack of proper antenatal care, poor nutrition, cancers of the breast and uterus and violent assaults. UNICEF (1998:28) implicated the insufficient numbers of trained personnel available to attend births and provide pre and post-natal mother and child health care. By 2002 93% of pregnant ni-Vanuatu women were reported to receive some prenatal services, however only 75% of births were attended⁴⁵ (Randell, 2002:6).

Luen (2006) noted that where kastom is influential, it is taboo for women to expose their body to men other than their husbands. The prevalence of male doctors means that ni-Vanuatu women are afraid of going to the hospital and women are dying rather than going to a doctor⁴⁶. In addition, the Department of Women's Affairs (2001:13) reported that ni-Vanuatu women's access to health care is not only related to the availability of health care facilities but is also related to women's under valuation of self and the belief that they are not entitled to it. Unequal access to resources and control over time, money and transport also hinder women's access to services.

45 This is despite Piau-Lynch's (2004:109) report that antenatal visits in most areas are free and dietary supplements of iron are also provided to expecting mothers.

46 Luen (2006) stated that there were no female doctors in Vanuatu.

Randell (2002:5) reported that 53% of the rural population and 86% of the urban population had access to safe drinking water, still leaving many without this essential resource. Lack of water exacerbates hygiene conditions and UNICEF (1998:20) described sanitation as being generally poor in most villages. Livestock were allowed to wander and defecate at will. Food was exposed to airborne contaminants, insects and rats. Open pits were used and they attracted insects and rats and were normally located at a distance from the house, discouraging their use. Piau-Lynch (2004b) quoted a 1999 figure that claimed that 95% of the population had access to improved sanitation facilities. However the researcher shared UNICEF's observations.

Ni-Vanuatu maintain extensive gardens, hence UNICEF (1998:31-33,36-7&76) reported that food shortages are not a problem in Vanuatu most of the time. However, the nutritional status of families and communities is a major concern. The report indicted limited knowledge about nutrition. They suggested that Vanuatu babies generally thrive for the first six months, because they are breastfed well. But then Protein Energy Malnutrition increases after the first nine months and into the second year because breastfeeding is stopped or reduced and insufficient or inappropriate complementary foods are introduced. In addition, UNICEF reported that traditional beliefs and restrictions concerning certain foods had adversely affected pregnant and lactating ni-Vanuatu women⁴⁷. Traditional taboos prevented pregnant women from consuming a number of sources of protein, including chicken, eggs, meat and pork. They were also unable to eat some carbohydrates including certain types of yam, taro and banana⁴⁸. Piau-Lynch (2004b:109) claimed that over the past 20 years diets have changed and the health practices of the 1980s are seldom practiced, however nutritional issues persist. A 1999 National Nutrition Survey indicated that 55% of women were affected by anaemia (Randell, 2002:5).

The section above demonstrates that ni-Vanuatu women face pressing practical gender needs. Modern healthcare in Vanuatu has significantly improved, however the maternal mortality rate remains high. Many communities do not have sufficient access to safe drinking water and sanitary practices need to be encouraged throughout the country.

47 Pregnant women suffering from anaemia are at risk of developing complications that lead to increased morbidity and mortality.

48 The traditional intent of the taboos was to avoid a difficult birth and sickness in the baby and mother after birth (UNICEF, 1998:76).

Food shortages are generally not a problem, however nutrition levels of infants and pregnant and lactating women are of concern.

Strategic Gender Needs

While practical gender needs are usually a response to an immediate perceived necessity by one gender, strategic gender needs refer more to those needs that are formulated from the analysis of one genders' subordination to the other and provide a means of creating a fairer society. In the past it has been common for strategic gender needs to be overlooked by development agencies. The strategic gender needs covered below include control of land, access to education, participation in leadership, domestic violence and bride price.

Land

The affinity of Melanesians with their land is a fundamental relationship underpinning all aspects of daily life⁴⁹ (Lindstrom & White, 1994:115). In patrilineal societies in Vanuatu land rights are passed from fathers to sons and women are not usually regarded as holding major propriety rights. They have 'rights' whilst they are single, mainly to use and take produce from the land of their parents without asking the permission of their male relatives. In matrilineal societies, women are the source of rights rather than the exercisers of the rights. Their mother's brothers or their own brothers are in charge of the rights (Kenneth & Silas, 1986:69-84).

This state of affairs is enshrined in law, the Constitution of Vanuatu testifies 'All land in the Republic of Vanuatu belongs to the indigenous custom owners and their descendants.... The rules of custom shall form the basis of ownership and use of land in the Republic of Vanuatu' (Paterson, 2000:477). Sections from the 1994 Custom Policy of the Malvatumauri National Council of Custom Chiefs of Vanuatu below elaborate on what is meant by 'custom owners,' this severely disadvantages ni-Vanuatu women.

49 Land is an important source of livelihood for every ni-Vanuatu (UNICEF, 1998:57). Land was the uniting force behind the achievement of independence for Vanuatu (Cromcombe, 1995:27) and today provides security, independence, power, authority and status (SPC, 1995:22).

“Article 1: True Custom Landowners

Section 1: A man who is a true custom landowner is one whose blood originates directly from the nakamal [men’s house], varea [village], or nasara [dancing grounds, public square, ritual clearing or place] associated with that land....

...Section 4: If all landowning, long-term resident and adopted men are dead, then land rights and rights to the dancing ground and village may pass to a sister who has married into another village. But if any of her father’s brothers are alive, she may not assume land rights.” (Lindstrom & White, 1994:229-30)

In 1995 Molisa stated ‘The root cause of the social, economic and political power imbalance between men and women in Melanesia is land: land ownership, land use, land administration’. She felt that without land, the woman herself became a commodity on the male market, available to be sold, bought and owned as a movable asset. Molisa concluded ‘If the status of Melanesian women is to change for the better, Melanesian women need to examine the land tenure systems and land-use behaviour patterns to ensure that they meaningfully cater for their needs’ (SPC⁵⁰, 1995:22).

Education

A gender analysis of the Vanuatu education sector in 2002 identified 13 areas of critical disparity and unfairness. Highlighted issues included the under representation of women in senior positions and the lack of girls completing senior school and tertiary education. There was a need to increase community awareness about the value of educating girls. Furthermore girls needed a safe learning environment, more scholarships and a curriculum that was gender inclusive (Waikato News, 2005).

⁵⁰ SPC stands for South Pacific Commission.

Families in Vanuatu have traditionally given males preferential access to formal education⁵¹. Females have been discouraged from furthering their education as their families have seen it as a poor investment. One reason for this has been because ni-Vanuatu women generally join their husband's family after marriage (UNICEF, 1998:38). Some girls have also been kept at home to help their mothers with their heavy workloads and to baby-sit younger siblings (Sanga, 2004:110).

The Vanuatu Government established an 'Education for All' Policy and National Plan of Action. In addition, the Vanuatu Education Master Plan addresses eliminating gender disparities in primary and secondary school to achieve gender equality in education (Sachs Robertson, 2004:9). Over the years, the difference in the proportion of girls and boys attending school in Vanuatu has been narrowing with a higher proportion of girls going to school and staying longer in the school system⁵² (UNICEF, 1998:39).

UNICEF (1998:45) reported that access to tertiary institutions was extremely limited and enrolment was predominately male at this level. In 2002 there were over 600 ni-Vanuatu university graduates and 238 of these were women (Randell, 2002:7). Piau-Lynch (2004b:91) reported that in 2003 the government adopted a policy of awarding tertiary scholarships in proportion to the percentage of females and males applying for scholarships⁵³.

UNICEF (1998:44) noted that some non-formal higher education was available. Most institutions provided carpentry, woodwork and agriculture for males and nutrition, cooking and sewing for females. UNICEF reported that the training centres were male dominated and there was a shortage of facilities to accommodate women. In 2002 there were over twice as many male as female enrolments in the rural development training centres (Randell, 2002:10). The courses offered to women in household management

51 Votausi MacKenzie-Reur recalled 'When I passed the exams at the age of 10 years to go to Onesua High School, all the men in my family sat around to have a meeting and decided I could not go'. Lucky for her, her mother resisted the status quo and found a job so she could pay for Votausi to continue her schooling and she went on to become a successful business owner and manager. She noted 'My three sisters never went past grade six because they were suppressed so much, they just gave up' (Randell, 2003:46).

52 In 1990 there were 89 girls for 100 boys enrolled in primary school and 75 girls for every 100 boys in secondary school (UNICEF, 1998:39). By 2002 girls constituted 48% of all primary school enrolments and 50% of all secondary school enrolments (Sanga, 2004:284).

53 This resulted in 41% of scholarships being awarded to women. The lower rate of female applications will continue to see a lower number of scholarships being awarded to females (Piau-Lynch, 2004b:91).

reinforced the belief that ni-Vanuatu women belonged in the home, however some women did enrol in the male dominated courses like carpentry and mechanics (UNICEF, 1998:44-5). Randell and Bolenga (2003:vi) expressed appreciation for the Equity Program at the Vanuatu Institute of Technology, which provided scholarships to girls in non-traditional areas from 1998-2002. Girls were able to train as electricians, builders, mechanics and technicians through this scheme and the majority of them graduated and found employment in these areas.

NZAID (2004) reported that the adult literacy rate in Vanuatu was 34% ⁵⁴. Boe (2006) noted women were reluctant to take part in development projects if they were illiterate and/or did not speak the national language Bislama. The lack of Bislama also inhibited the way they looked at things, because it restricted their understanding to their own small community. Boe reported that teaching literacy was one of the best ways to help ni-Vanuatu women. Once women were literate projects could build on this with basic income generating skills through to higher-level training⁵⁵.

Participation in Leadership

The first ni-Vanuatu woman was elected to parliament in 1987 ⁵⁶ (UNDP, 2005b). To date, four women have been elected to parliament⁵⁷. This constitutes four percent of the parliamentary seats in Vanuatu and is one of the lowest rates in the world. Molisa reported:

“Women were closely involved in the struggle for independence in Vanuatu. The population as a whole, men and women, moved together for independence. However, since independence, women have had little say in setting the agenda for Vanuatu’s development or in planning our country’s future.” (Cited in Randell, 2002:5)

UNICEF (1998:61-4) reported that the situation has improved since independence. There had been an increase in the number women in political parties and movements

54 NZAID is New Zealand’s International Aid and Development Agency.

55 Such as teaching management skills.

56 Ni-Vanuatu women received the right to vote in 1975 and the right to stand for election in 1980.

57 Only two women have been elected at any one time.

and in 1996 some political organisations and movements were headed by women for the first time. At the municipal council level, in urban areas, women succeeded in securing seats. Women were elected to be mayors and deputy mayors and there were a number of women's organisations where some women held positions of considerable authority⁵⁸. However, the same report also noted that the involvement of women in the administrative, executive and judicial sectors was low. The participation of females in organisations such as trade unions, co-operatives and professional organisations was also limited at this time.

Donald (2002:50-2) reflected on the reasons why women in Vanuatu were so under-represented in the national, provincial and municipal governments. Some ni-Vanuatu men and women were reluctant and in some cases directly opposed the involvement of women. These attitudes were deeply embedded in traditional custom and Christianity and were difficult to change and attempts to do so in the past had been ad hoc. The reluctance of political parties to nominate women was the single biggest barrier to women being elected to parliament in Vanuatu. The 'first past the post' electoral system was also a significant barrier⁵⁹. Many ni-Vanuatu women did not understand the election system. Donald described a workshop that Wan Smol Bag ran on voter education for women. Many women who attended the workshops did not realise they could vote independently of their husband's and chief's direction, or that their vote was secret. Many were also unaware of the importance of having women's representation in parliament and the power their vote carried to influence who was elected.

Molisa warned 'when men are by themselves in the political arena they end up seeing and thinking only of themselves.' She recommended 'in order for women to advance towards equality, sustainable development and peace, they must participate fully in all areas of decision making particularly in politics and in the Church' (SPC, 1995:12).

58 These were mostly social organisations.

59 Donald claimed that the ten countries in the world with the highest women's representation in parliament all have proportional representation elections (Donald, 2002:51).

Domestic Violence⁶⁰

The most dangerous place for women, the world over, is at home.
(Mosse, 1993:59)

Rarua (2006) stated that women had no status in traditional Vanuatu communities and they were subject to physical, mental, psychological and sexual violence. Tor and Toka (2004:43) noted that no accurate statistics on domestic violence exist. However, indications from interviews conducted in the provinces, eyewitness accounts, the media, records from organisations such as the Police, Vanuatu Women's Centre and others, conclude that wife beating is a major problem in Vanuatu. Estimates suggest that one in four ni-Vanuatu women are beaten by their partners (Moldofsky, 2001). Randell (2003:7) lamented 'domestic violence is a significant deterrent to the progress of a huge percentage of women in this country and survival after or freedom from violent situations is a key factor in the success of ni-Vanuatu women.'

Hughes' (2005:26) study asked male youth why men hit women. The most common answers were related to lack of trust between a man and women (the woman flirts, is unfaithful, goes to night clubs, swears, lies or drinks) and a woman not taking her traditional role and attending to her household duties. This was followed by the woman did not obey or respect her husband or refuses sex. UNICEF (1998) also sited alcohol as a causal factor in domestic violence. In 2004 public debate continued concerning not just the prevalence of domestic violence and strategies for addressing it, but also whether or not it was justifiable behaviour, tolerated and sometimes condoned as a man's right to discipline his wife or partner (Piau-Lynch, 2004b:26).

Toa (2005) quoted sources that claimed that in most pre-colonial Vanuatu societies, domestic violence was abhorred and dealt with severely in the community. However, today domestic violence is considered and treated as a private affair between the

60 Domestic violence is violence that takes place in the home and is a crime. It is an assault or a threat against a person by someone else. It could be a husband, boyfriend, de facto or another member of the family. Domestic violence can be physical or sexual. It can be emotional or social abuse, such as constant criticism of the spouse or separating her from friends. It can be deprivation of liberty or financial resources (Toa, 2005).

husband and wife. Even the police and judicial services and government in general, the churches and international communities seem to maintain the same principle of privacy.

In general, domestic assault is treated as a matter less likely to require outside intervention and when intervention is undertaken, the punishment tends to be less severe than if it had not been domestic violence (Piau-Lynch, 2004b:27).

The Vanuatu Women's Centre has focussed on working on issues of domestic violence⁶¹. The co-ordinator of the centre, Marilyn Tahi said 'the roots of [domestic] violence are cultural, but so are the means of digging up those roots'. She recommended that social norms that legitimate violence, be transformed by women and by men acting in concert. Tahi envisaged a newly created tradition and renewed collective values in accord with the values of non-violence and human rights (cited in Jolly, 2002:151). Rarua (2006) recommended inspecting power structures and working to facilitate a freer environment. The Vanuatu Women's Centre started a 'Men Against Violence' programme in 2001 and this has been quite successful in raising awareness amongst men. Tor and Toka (2004:64) recommended more pre-marital counselling, with training for couples in communication and conflict resolution.

Bride Price

Bride price is a system whereby men pay their new brides' parents and other members of their extended family a specified sum of money, number of mats or pigs⁶² (UNICEF, 1998:59).

Moldofsky (2001) reported that women's value to men is embodied in the custom of bride price, the goods exchanged providing some compensation to her family for the loss of her labour. Tor and Toka (2004:29) reported that the concept of bride price is 'meant as a token of appreciation from the bridegroom's parents and relatives to the bride's family to strengthen the relationship between the two clans.' However, Jolly (1994:133) investigated bride price in South Pentecost in the 1970s and noted that the

61 This work is described later in this chapter.

62 In the past men paid up to 100 pigs for a wife. Today the maximum bride price for the entire country has been set by the Council of Chiefs at 80,000 vatu, which is just over \$1,000 NZD (Bennett & Harewood, 2003:26).

bride price tended to be lower if a woman was old or unhealthy, if she was not a virgin, if she had been married already and had children and especially if she was post-menopausal. Jolly concluded that the bride price was an exchange not just for a woman's labour, but also her sexuality and her fertility.

UNICEF (1998:6&59) reported that due to the payment of bride price by the family and extended family, women not only have to serve their husbands, but his family as well. UNICEF also drew a link between domestic violence and the bride price. The report stated that the most common reasons for wife beating in the rural areas were 'food not ready,' 'jealousy' and 'poor worker,' reflecting the expectation that women should be subservient to men. UNICEF suggested that this expectation stems from the bride price. Mosse (1993:59) also linked violence against women with women being seen as objects to be owned and exchanged by men, rather than as individuals with rights over their bodies and lives. The Vanuatu Women's Centre Director Marilyn Tahi said 'We see a lot of cases where a man says, 'I have the right to beat her because I bought her'' (Moldofsky, 2001).

The above passage on strategic gender needs in Vanuatu demonstrates that steps forward have been taken, but much more needs to be done. Land is a key resource and women continue to be discriminated against in rights to land. Much progress has been made in the primary and secondary education sectors, however females are still finding it difficult to access higher education. Women are getting more involved in leadership, but participation at the highest levels remains very low. Domestic violence is widespread and Vanuatu society is still debating whether men have the right to use violence to discipline their wives. Despite the original good intentions of bride price, many see this practise as devaluing women and there is evidence that it contributes to the prevalence and tolerance of domestic violence.

Organisations and Institutions Influencing Gender Relations in Vanuatu

The section above has shown that significant gender barriers still remain in Vanuatu. The section below describes key organisations and institutions that influence gender relations and deal with gender issues in Vanuatu. This will help the reader better appreciate the context of Vanuatu and the different influences acting on ni-Vanuatu men and women.

Kastom

Jolly (2002:148) loosely defined kastom as 'Recuperation of the local, the indigenous, 'traditional' values and practices of life prior to European incursion'⁶³. The National Constitution of Vanuatu states that 'Customary law shall continue to have effect as part of the law of the Republic of Vanuatu' (Paterson, 2000:481) and all social and cultural practices in Vanuatu are ruled by kastom⁶⁴. However, kastom differs considerably between individual groups of islanders and even between neighbouring villages (Bennett & Harewood, 2003:21). The Custom Policy of the National Council of Chiefs alludes to this and recommends 'Every Island must write down its custom law' (Lindstrom & White, 1994:242). Kenneth and Silas (1986:68) wrote that 'Custom is a set of rules observed within a particular group. It does not have the same rigidity as law. Rather, custom is a way of life and much of its strength lies in its flexibility. As life and circumstances change, so do the rules.' Jolly (2002:148) noted 'Kastom... evokes not so much the totality of ancestral practices as a particular selection of such practices for the present.'

Some authors claim that kastom historically disempowered ni-Vanuatu females; while others believe that it empowered women. The passage below outlines the claims of both.

63 Miles (1998:81) elaborates; 'For all its ambiguity and contradictions, kastom in Vanuatu has come to signify the proper, or indigenously authentic, way of living, acting and behaving in society. Such a general understanding of kastom is analogous to the way morality is used in the west. Everyone claims to be moral, even if reaching a consensus on what constitutes moral behaviour is well-nigh impossible.'

64 This includes choosing local leaders, determining how land should be cultivated and how it should be passed on, how marriages are arranged and the lines of responsibility for the rearing and the development of children (UNICEF, 1998:4).

Molisa wrote:

*“Custom”
misapplied
bastardised
murdered
a Frankenstein
corpse
conveniently
recalled
to intimidate
women*

(Cited in Jolly, 1994:247)

UNICEF (1998:xi) reported that some ni-Vanuatu traditional practices and beliefs inhibit the full participation of ni-Vanuatu women in society and limit their access to family planning, health services and education. Moldofsky (2001) stated that kastom was used to justify discrimination and violence against women in the village and the home. Successive Vanuatu governments stalled on endorsing CEDAW⁶⁵, with male politicians consistently expressing reservations related to kastom⁶⁶ (Jolly, 2002:149). Miles (1998:102&170) suggested:

“Kastom has evolved more as an idiosyncratic reaction to westernisation than as an orthodox preserver of indigenous belief.... Kastom, as an anti-colonial mechanism, has had the perverse effect of intensifying indigenous male control and ‘immobilising women in time and in space.’ ”

McLeod (2004:19) noted that while customs had changed for the benefit of men, they had rarely changed for the benefit of women.

65 Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women.

66 In contrast, the Vanuatu government speedily ratified the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, despite the many ways that kastom was equally at odds with the terms of that convention (Jolly, 2002:153).

UNICEF (1998:6&61) acknowledged that in customary ceremonies women have important roles to play, but prefaced this comment with the suggestion that women only assist men. The report mentioned that there were a few societies like Ambae and Pentecost where women perform pig-killing ceremonies on a limited scale to gain status and titles. However they suggested that the status of such women will not be equal to that of men and they will not participate in decision making. Mackenzie-Reur (1996:3) reported that ni-Vanuatu women's rights and rituals are generally considered inferior to those of men.

One or more chiefs are appointed in each village in Vanuatu. The chief is the most important person in the village and community⁶⁷. The chiefs are predominantly male. In some areas of Vanuatu a woman can become a chief, but UNICEF claimed that her authority will not be equal to a man's (UNICEF, 1998:5&60). Piau-Lynch (2004b:15) noted that these women do not normally play the role of administrator or talking chief in her clan, this role is delegated to her brother instead. Kastom laws are implemented through the chiefly system and village and island courts⁶⁸. UNICEF (1998:56) reported that they generally reinforce the traditional roles of women in ni-Vanuatu society.

Jolly (1994:2) reported that men dominated women in the kastom village of Bunlap in South Pentecost in the 1970s. She described differential access to and control of the means of production, particularly land and a hierarchical sexual division of labour where women's labour was considered inferior⁶⁹. She also mentioned unequal attachment to and control over the major products for distribution and exchange, including yams, pigs and mats. However, other articles that Jolly published before and after 1994 espoused a different view. These materials sought to identify the ways in which kastom empowered women and implicated western views and actions in disempowering ni-Vanuatu women.

Jolly juxtaposed early missionary writings and development reports from the 1980s and 1990s with ethnographic writings from the 1980s and 1990s. She demonstrated that the

67 Within the village, chiefs have full authority over daily activities and make all decisions for the community, which everyone must abide by.

68 These institutions are more influential in rural than urban areas though.

69 Jolly (1994:7) noted 'kastom, perhaps even more than skul [Bislama for Christianity and introduced ways of living] was predicated on a strenuous separation of male and female and the celebration of their hierarchical difference'.

former tended to view women as victims of a male-dominated culture and the later as authors and empowered agents in creating culture (cited in Lukere & Jolly, 2002:175).

Several authors described the ‘spirit power’ that traditional kastom ascribed to women. Jolly (2002:148) reported that in most places males and females were believed to embody differentiated and even opposing sacred powers. Kenneth noted that women were considered to some degree dangerous and contaminating, not only to men but also to various things such as crops, tools, weapons and various activities, especially during menstruation and after childbirth (Kenneth & Silas, 1986:69). Jolly stated that women’s work was given spiritual significance and held in esteem:

“The most central and public institutions revolved around the sacralisation of domestic life. Growing crops, herding pigs, nurturing children and perpetuating the cycles of kinship linking ancestors and descendants was the stuff of public as well as private life. And this process meant sacralising what appear to us as mundane domestic routines.” (Jolly & Macintyre, 1989:222)

Jolly also claimed that traditionally ni-Vanuatu women were not restricted to the private sphere:

“Although women are excluded from the men’s house and from particular phases of political and ritual activity, women are not therefore absent from public life. Women are actors and not just spectators in the public rituals of circumcision, marriage, death and grade taking” (Jolly & Macintyre, 1989:222)

Jolly reported that traditionally South Pentecost men were as much a part of households and of daily domestic activity as women. While not doing as much housework as women, they cooked and nurtured as well as played with the children⁷⁰. Routinely, men cooked on and ate from, their own fire, while women prepared meals for themselves and their children on another fire. Jolly’s article discussed how missionaries had

70 They preferred not to carry wood and water for daily use.

actively sought to change this gender division of labour and homes (Jolly & Macintyre, 1989:219&221).

Tor and Toka (2004:9-64) made a distinction between traditional Vanuatu kastom and contemporary kastom and countered claims that ni-Vanuatu women were oppressed by the former. Tor and Toka emphasised the empowering aspects of pre-contact kastom such as women's ranking systems that gave them status, the sharing of domestic responsibilities, women's freedom of movement and the ownership of property and possessions by both men and women. They stated that the roles of men and women in Vanuatu were complimentary, claiming 'In traditional societies, men and women were relatively equal'. Tor and Toka suggested that it was due to the influence of Europeans that these practices were brought to an end, the status of men was raised, women's freedom was curtailed and their workloads raised.

The above section demonstrates that different views are held regarding the historical impact of kastom on ni-Vanuatu women. Some feel that it disempowered them, while others believed that it was a source of empowerment. It seems fair to say that some aspects of contemporary kastom do discriminate against women.

Piau-Lynch (2006) offered some helpful suggestions for moving forward. She stated that the key to improving ni-Vanuatu women's status lay in recognising and highlighting how women were already contributing to and perpetuating kastom within their communities. She noted that for traditional events women make mats and paint them. This knowledge is held and practised by women, giving them an important role to play in continuing these customs. Piau-Lynch also mentioned the famous three-day Toka dance on Tanna Island, the first day of which is devoted to women. She interpreted this as one of the ways that kastom values women.

In 1991 the Vanuatu Cultural Centre initiated the Vanuatu Women's Culture Project and set out to document and revive women's mat weaving on the island of Ambae. On this island, only women make mats and they spend a significant proportion of their lives preparing pandanus, weaving and dyeing. The project recognised the women's activities as kastom, emphasising that women have their own kastom and contribute to the kastom life of the community. This gave the women a new perspective on their activities. Many

of the women involved reported they had not formerly recognised that these things were important (Lindstrom & White, 1994:152-60). The report author felt that identification of women's activities as kastom will create a means by which women's status in Vanuatu can change:

"It was suggested that the metaphor for this relationship is that women's kastom is to men's kastom as an outrigger is to a canoe – absolutely necessary, balancing, enabling. The status of women in Vanuatu can be altered by the recognition that women's contribution has always provided the essential balance to what men do" (Lindstrom & White, 1994:160).

Christianity

Jolly (2002:148) claimed that the pre-colonial practices were probably most changed by the arrival from the 1840s of Christian missionaries. Opinion on the impact of the missionaries and Christianity on gender relations is mixed. Some feel that the new religion and the new order they introduced disenfranchised ni-Vanuatu women and elevated men. Others claim that the missionaries were responsible for raising the status and improving the treatment of ni-Vanuatu women. The section below briefly touches on both points of view.

The Christian missionaries actively engaged in promoting reform of the existing gender relations. One missionary in the 1880's wrote 'Family life has become purer by the abolition of polygamy and more happy by the residence of man and wife together, which did not characterise their heathen state'. The missionaries changed the eating and sleeping arrangements and cultivated a new model of women's domesticity where women were celebrated as mothers and wives. They created new divisions between the lives of women and men and also introduced a division between public and domestic and sacred and secular aspects of ni-Vanuatu life (Jolly & Macintyre, 1989:213-34).

Jolly (1989:223) pointed out that traditional gender relations were attacked, often on the grounds that they were demeaning of women. However, the Christian churches were themselves male dominated and these new models did not necessarily grant women the

powers they enjoyed in the ancestral religion. Jolly stated 'The ancestral religion was male dominated. But in so far as its central values entailed the sacralisation of domestic life and of human kinship, women's working and reproductive capacities were crucial.'

Miles (1998:169) was somewhat disparaging of the impact of the missionaries on ni-Vanuatu culture⁷¹. However he wrote:

"Acknowledging women as full human beings rather than reproductive chattels and food producers represents a fundamental shift in the Melanesian worldview. This mental transformation, placing women on the same side of humanity as men, was largely accomplished under missionary (albeit matronising) tutelage and consisted of teaching rudimentary literacy and housekeeping skills along with Christian values."

The missionaries also helped bring about a range of positive changes in ni-Vanuatu culture:

"Widows are no longer strangled in Melanesia.... Wife stealing is over.... Harsh punishment is not visited upon females who transgress the males' nakamal or witness taboo rituals.... Female infanticide has virtually disappeared.... And wives invariably possess, as was not previously the case, personal names." ⁷² (Miles, 1998:170)

Piau-Lynch (2004b:14) noted that from very early on the churches were heavily influential in organising and establishing women's groups who then became the first women's groups to have extensive networks throughout the country. The church groups formed a strong forum for empowering and strengthening women through networking and support and later became the building blocks upon which the Vanuatu National Council of Women was formed. Mackenzie-Reur (1996:9) reported that churches in Vanuatu were playing an important role in the development of women, especially in

71 Miles (1998:103) reported that 'missionisation heralded the death knell of much of traditional Melanesian culture.'

72 Miles notes that not all of these customs were observed everywhere throughout Vanuatu and some were quite localized (Miles, 1998:170).

education. They suggested that the formation of various church support groups had assisted in the promotion of women's social status in Vanuatu and they continued to do this.

Misinterpretation of scripture is a major impediment to women's progress in Vanuatu. Both lay and religious leaders quote the Biblical reference of Ephesians 5:22, 'Wives, submit to your husbands as to the Lord' to indicate where women's position should be, but overlook the previous verse 'Submit to one another out of reverence for Christ'⁷³ (Piau-Lynch, 2004b:14). Hence Biblical scriptures are subverted to justify male domination.

From the above discussion we can see that views regarding the impact of Christianity are mixed. However, some are positive regarding the formation of the network of grassroots Christian women's groups that extend across the country and the actions they have taken to mobilise and aid ni-Vanuatu women.

Vanuatu Government

The section below examines the impact of Vanuatu Laws, Vanuatu National Development Plans and the Vanuatu Department of Women's Affairs on gender relations in Vanuatu.

Vanuatu Laws

Since independence the principle of equality of men and women and the legal protection of their rights has been embodied in the National Constitution⁷⁴. The constitution also allows parliament to introduce new legislation to advance the welfare and protection of women⁷⁵ (UNICEF, 1998:56).

73 This was also experienced by the researcher, while conducting GAD and GA training.

74 'All persons are entitled to the following fundamental rights and freedoms of the individual without discrimination on the grounds of... sex' (cited in Paterson, 2000:462).

75 'The law or administrative action... makes provision for the special benefit, welfare, protection or advancement of females' (cited in Paterson, 2000:462).

Some of the general laws that provide for the protection of women include the Penal Code, the Employment Act, Matrimonial Clauses, Maintenance of Children, Control of Marriage and the Divorce Bill, (Mackenzie-Reur, 1996:3). However, UNICEF (1998:16&56) reported that in both urban and rural areas, most women have little knowledge of their legal status. In addition, some women have a faulty and destructive understanding of ni-Vanuatu rights, a mother of six stated 'Its my husband's right to hit me when I don't do something he asks' (Moldofsky, 2001).

Molisa listed four sources of Vanuatu law: The Constitution, Written Law (passed by Parliament), Common Law (Court judgements) and Custom Law. The Constitution states that where laws and kastom did not agree, formal or written law should be followed. However, Molisa observed that in 2001 this provision had not been applied, 'Custom is presented as an excuse frequently to discriminate against and oppress women' (cited in Randell, 2002:14). Piau-Lynch (2004b:41) noted that while the formal legal system in Vanuatu offers significant protection to women, it often fails to enforce women's rights.

In 2000, 208 Vanuatu law Acts were reviewed and 12 of them were deemed to contain discriminatory provisions⁷⁶. The report authors stated 'Although the Constitution clearly states that there is equal treatment under the law, this does not show in the Acts that are passed by Parliament'⁷⁷. Piau-Lynch reported that Vanuatu did not have a Law Reform Commission to assist in the required revision of legislation (Piau-Lynch, 2004b:42-3).

Vanuatu National Development Plans

Efforts to improve the status of women have been included in the National Development Plans. In the first plan, one of the objectives was 'to promote a change in the role of women in the ni-Vanuatu society and to work towards their full and equal participation in domestic, local and national affairs'. The responsibility for implementing this objective was delegated to the Office of Women's Affairs. In the

⁷⁶ The study was commissioned by the NGO 'Vanuatu Women in Politics' to review all Vanuatu legislation for gender equality, so that laws which contained gender discrimination could be changed or reformed.

⁷⁷ The majority of the discriminatory acts concerned marriage and families, citizenship and nationality, employment and labour and sexual offences.

Second National Development Plan (1987-1991), one the objectives was 'to realise the potential of women as partners and beneficiaries of the development process in Vanuatu'. The Third National Development Plan (1992-1996) maintained these development aims but included some additional objectives such as to 'incorporate women's issues in main stream development planning; increase the participation of women in economic activities and improve the status of women and their families' (UNICEF, 1998:6).

Piau-Lynch (2004b:22) reported that since Independence and particularly with the development of the national development plans, participation by women in national development had been emphasised in policies, without the necessary mechanisms to implement them. Reasons included the lack of input from women in devising plans of action and the need for more co-ordinated approaches for women's groups to implement these development programmes. In addition, there was a need for government institution building and policies promoting the advancement of women.

The Comprehensive Reform Programme superseded the system of national plans in 1997. A Gender Equity Policy was developed under the programme in the same year. The policy directed national machineries to incorporate issues affecting the non-participation of women in the development process. It specifically highlighted the need to include gender perspectives in all planning processes, programmes, implementation, reporting and monitoring of the reform (Piau-Lynch, 2004a:6).

The programme developed the following targets:

- “*Incorporation of gender awareness and gender analysis into policy-making at all levels.*
- *Introduction of a strong gender dimension into the collection and analysis of statistics.*
- *Review of all legislation to ensure gender neutrality.*
- *Incorporation of gender awareness education into government and donor sponsored community activities on natural resources management and human resource development at the government training centre.*
- *Development of a working group to co-ordinate and monitor the above.*

- *Appointment of a planner with specific responsibility for gender policies and programmes*” (Piau-Lynch, 2004a:7).

An Equity Task Force was formed which included representatives from both government and NGOs, but it only operated for a short time in the early stages of the reform. A Gender Planner was appointed in 2000, however they were placed in the Department of Women’s Affairs without the necessary budgetary allocation for their salary⁷⁸ (Piau-Lynch, 2004a:7-8).

Piau-Lynch (2004b:22) reported that while awareness raising and development of action plans are in place to implement both national and international commitments there continues to be inadequate mechanisms to bring about these plans. There is limited awareness and knowledge on how to implement these policies, which have to compete with demands from the health, education and economic sectors. Piau-Lynch recommended the establishment of a National Women’s Co-ordinating and Advisory Committee, with representatives from Government and NGOs, to co-ordinate and monitor the implementation of national and international commitments.

Department of Women’s Affairs

The DWA is the Vanuatu Government’s primary provider of gender and women specific policy advice. The strategic focus of the department is aligned with the government’s obligations under the Vanuatu Constitution, the Comprehensive Reform Programme, CEDAW and the Convention on the Rights of the Child. The department has adopted the philosophy of working in partnership for equality and seeks to forge strategic alliances with other sectors of society that are also working to advance the status of ni-Vanuatu women. The DWA uses both the WID and GAD approaches to development, claiming that neither approach alone can achieve their objectives⁷⁹ (DWA, 2004:2-6).

78 Despite the fact that gender concerns both men and women.

79 In justification of this approach they site women’s only projects that are already in place and are operating successfully and raise concerns that if some projects are not specifically targeted at women, custom practice will prevail and men’s needs dominate (DWA, 2004:6).

At the time of the fieldwork visit in 2006, the 2001- 2003 Gender Policy was in the process of being revised. The existing version stated that the purpose of the policy was to have in place effective systems and strategies for the achievement of gender equity in all aspects of Vanuatu life. The main strategy was gender mainstreaming via a gender management system⁸⁰ ⁸¹. This system consisted of a Social Equity Taskforce, the appointment of Gender Focal Point People in all government departments and ministries, running a Public Service Senior Women's Network and appointment of a Gender Planner in the Department of Women's Affairs (DWA, 2001:4). While the taskforce did not appear to be in place, the gender planner was appointed to mainstream gender into policy development, planning and implementation in the national and local government sectors (DWA, 2004:6). Piau-Lynch (2004b:24) reported that gender focal points had been established in all government ministries, a 'Women in the Public Service Committee' had been established to advance women in the Public Service, gender sensitisation workshops and awareness training had been conducted throughout government (and some NGOs) and a number of working papers incorporating gender issues had been developed as a basis for future policies.

Rarua (2006) reported that most of the Vanuatu Government departments understand gender, but there had been little action taken due to the general lack of resources available⁸². The Department of Women's Affairs has the second lowest budget out of all the government departments (Piau-Lynch, 2006). The DWA Statement of Intent for 2004 to 2007 stated that the present funding was not adequate and little if any progress would be made within the existing funding allocations⁸³ (DWA, 2004:3). Rarua expressed a desire for more women's desk officers and for gender point people in each different government department⁸⁴.

80 Gender mainstreaming is a broad strategy that cuts across government sectors and involves the inclusion and consideration of gender into most aspects of policy development, planning and implementation (DWA, 2001:4).

81 A Gender Management System is a network of structures, mechanisms and processes put in place within an existing organisational framework, to guide, plan and monitor the process of gender mainstreaming (DWA, 2001:4).

82 The Education Department had made the most progress (Rarua, 2006).

83 In short 'Donor funded projects will be essential to help meet the Department's objectives' (DWA, 2004:3).

84 Rarua (2006) noted that there used to be a women's desk in each of the six provincial governments. However, during government downsizing these positions were cut and only one women's desk remained, which is based in Sangma Province.

From the above section one can see that the Vanuatu Government have taken a range of steps to aid women. However, most of their efforts have not resulted in concrete improvements in the daily experiences of women in Vanuatu.

Non-Government Organisations

NGOs are quite active in Vanuatu. A few of the NGOs dealing with gender issues are briefly described below.

In 1980 the Vanuatu National Council of Women (VNCW) was established to unite and represent all the existing women's groups and women in general in Vanuatu (VNCW, 2006:3&9). The council provides a forum for women's issues and serves in an advisory capacity to the Vanuatu Government and provides specific services for women (UNICEF, 1998:6). The Vanuatu Women's Centre was set up in Port Vila in 1992 'to provide support and counselling to the victims of violence,' and to 'empower our women with information and training'. It is run by a collective of volunteers, including activists, researchers and counsellors (Jolly, 2002:145). Wan Smol Bag is a theatre company that operates around the islands and in schools. It utilises drama to raise awareness and provide education on various issues including gender and domestic violence (Sanga, 2004:180).

While many groups are influencing ni-Vanuatu gender relations for the better, Luen (2006) reported that few were dealing with women's issues, there was not enough resources and there was often duplication of work, which confused communities. She recommended that the different groups work together. McLeod (2004:28) reported a lack of cohesiveness among the institutions of government and between NGOs in Vanuatu. They noted that the constant struggle for funding appeared to have led to pervasive competition and reluctance to share information, rather than collaborative efforts to achieve shared goals. Women's groups in particular were highly fractured. McLeod pointed to the potential of umbrella organisations such as the Vanuatu National Council of Women to play a pivotal role in the development of coherent and co-operative approaches to social development in Vanuatu.

Summary

This chapter provided a brief overview of background information on Vanuatu, demonstrating that this Pacific nation is a developing country with a range of pressing developmental issues. This passage was followed by a description of ni-Vanuatu gender relations. While changes are occurring, male domination can be seen throughout Vanuatu. Some of the practical and strategic gender needs facing ni-Vanuatu were introduced. Instituting fair land laws and practices, dealing with domestic violence and promoting a sufficient proportion of women to the top decision making roles in the country were some of the most important issues. The chapter closed with a description of the historic and contemporary influences affecting ni-Vanuatu gender relations. While the debate continues regarding whether kastom and Christianity have historically empowered or disempowered ni-Vanuatu women, both have the potential to raise their status today.

Chapter Four: Vanuatu Fieldwork Methodology

This chapter overviews the methodology utilised during the thesis fieldwork and helps the reader to understand the approach used and some of the factors influencing the interpretation of the findings. The first section introduces myself, the researcher. Then there is an explanation of why I chose the fieldwork site and the WEEF, GAM and HAF GA frameworks. Questions regarding the research ethics are reviewed. This flows into the detailed methodology and refers the reader to the overall schedule in Vanuatu in Appendix II. This is followed by a section describing the GAD and GA training I provided to the WVV staff. A general introduction to the GA sessions follows; with portions dedicated to running the WEEF, HAF and GAM. The chapter wraps up with a reflection on the strengths and weaknesses of the methodology.

Comments on how everything went can be found in each section, however the many lessons learnt regarding using GA frameworks are expounded in chapter six.

Locating the Researcher

Scholarship in recent years has demonstrated that researchers are not impartial observers. What they observe (and what they fail to notice) and how they interpret their observations are greatly influenced by factors such as their background, experiences and training. The prescribed course of action to date is to acknowledge those influences. Hence the passage below seeks to provide some background information on myself and the factors that may be of importance in my treatment of GAD, my examination of GA frameworks and my experience in Vanuatu.

I am a female in my early thirties, raised in New Zealand by English parents. I have lived the majority of my life in New Zealand, with occasional trips to developed and developing countries. I have postgraduate diplomas in Development and Biblical Studies. I have been a Christian for nearly twenty years, attending churches of various denominations over this time⁸⁵.

⁸⁵ As such I have appreciated materials reflecting on the empowering actions of Jesus and shedding light on various Biblical passages from a gender perspective.

During the thesis gestation period I made a number of transitions:

- When I started the thesis I worked for World Vision New Zealand (WVNZ) as a Programme Support Officer in the International Programmes Department based in Auckland. After six months I became a fulltime student, completing nearly four years work for WVNZ.
- I was also single and lived independently during the fieldwork preparation phase, got engaged immediately after returning from Vanuatu and married several months before the thesis was due⁸⁶.

My interest in GAD was sparked by the Massey University paper by this name, which I completed in 2003. GAD appeared to be the most obvious way of implementing development interventions that benefited everyone in communities and avoided much wasted time and effort. After completing the GAD course I was concerned to see how WVNZ was performing in this area. Consequently I utilised the WEEF to assess a random sample of their projects as part of a Massey University research paper the following year. My interest grew and I continued to be an advocate for GAD within the organisation during their employment there.

My experience as an NGO worker greatly influenced my approach to the critique of GA frameworks. I initially chose this topic in a search for ways to convert a concern for gender into concrete action⁸⁷. The reality of being constantly time pressured led to a very pragmatic approach to GA frameworks.

Choosing the Fieldwork Site

Prior to the fieldwork I had never been to a Pacific island and felt that as a New Zealand development worker, such a trip was long overdue. Being a WVNZ employee at the start of the research, I wished to work with a WV partner in the Pacific. At the time this narrowed the choice of countries to Vanuatu, Papua New Guinea and Solomon Islands.

86 This provided food for thought while studying readings on the gender division of labour and theories regarding the subordination of women. I was very aware of the need to ‘walk the talk’ in my own marriage first.

87 All development workers know how to ‘jump through the hoops’ when writing funding applications and reports and cover off all the issues like participation, sustainability, the environment and of course gender. But do the ‘right words’ really translate into disadvantaged women and disadvantaged men benefiting from development projects? GA frameworks appeared to offer the way forward.

I was advised that Vanuatu portrayed gender issues common to all three countries, while being the safest option for a woman travelling alone.

Choosing the Gender Analysis Frameworks to Trial

I wished to utilise and build upon the GAD momentum established within the WV Partnership. In 2005 World Vision International released the World Vision Gender Training Toolkit. This training resource included instructions on how to use the HAF, GAM, WEEF and various Participatory Learning and Action (PLA) techniques for conducting GA. I chose to use the WEEF due to my past experience with this tool. I also chose the GAM and HAF because they are some of the most widely used GA frameworks.

Ethics

In order to conduct the research I had to get the permission of WVNZ, WV, Massey University, the Vanuatu Cultural Centre (VCC) and the GA session community participants. I prepared a two-page thesis concept note and shared this with WVNZ. When they gave the go-ahead, the concept note was forwarded on to the WVPDG Director, who shared and discussed it with the WV Country Manager. They were also happy for the research to proceed so I prepared a full research proposal with their help. Massey University representatives approved the research proposal and I made a low-risk ethics notification to their ethics committee and they accepted it. I then sent the research proposal to the VCC and compiled a research agreement with them.

I ensured that GA session participants understood what the research was about and what their participation would involve, using their preferred language. Before arriving in Vanuatu, I prepared a participant information sheet and consent form following the Massey University Ethics Guidelines and had them translated into Bislama. Copies of these documents can be viewed in Appendix III. WV staff shared them with the project beneficiaries before my arrival and then at each GA session a WV staff member or a community leader reviewed the participant information sheet with the participants and collected their signatures of consent. In some cases the information was read out in Bislama and then explained in the local language as well. The information

sheet was two pages long and took at least 30 minutes to cover in two languages. Participants started looking somewhat bored and disinterested and no one asked any questions. It may have been better to limit the information sheet to one page.

I sought to understand and observe the culture and traditions of Vanuatu by seeking advice from the WVNZ Vanuatu Programme Officer, WV staff and a recent travel book on Vanuatu. I considered potential sources of stress, fatigue, emotional distress and embarrassment. I did not interview alone and consulted others about local safety considerations. While the purpose of the research was to critically reflect on GA tools (not WV), there was the potential for unwise reporting to reflect poorly on WV. I gave WV staff the opportunity to check and correct the draft thesis and allowed them to remove sensitive findings from the final thesis.

Participation in the research was voluntary. The participants may have risked feeling like they were in a dependent relationship as some of the projects were run using WVNZ funding and I was associated with WVNZ. However, WV had been working in the communities and the members were cognisant that they were free to participate or not participate in any WV work. I also emphasised that the GA exercises were part of a Masters Degree and that their participation or non-participation would not impact the desire of WV to operate in their community.

The GA exercises entailed group work. The benefits of the analysis were first and foremost for the community and the results were compiled and analysed by the community members. The exercises and the findings from these exercises were approached in a sensitive and respectful manner. I considered reporting sensitive findings separately to the communities and not including them in the final thesis, however this did not appear to be necessary.

The research produced mutual benefits for the research participants and their wider community as it helped to inform current and future development work in the area and introduce the practise of GA to WV staff.

Gender And Development and Gender Analysis Training

I started my work in Vanuatu by providing a GAD training workshop for WVV staff from the northern Islands of Vanuatu and Efate Island based staff using the WV Gender Training Toolkit. I also provided a second course for the staff on Tanna Island in the third week of my time in Vanuatu. The courses were necessary because most of the WVV staff had not received training in these areas.

The first session looked at how GAD relates to WV's mission statement and values. This assured staff that GAD was not in contradiction to WV's mandate, but at the core of the organisations work. The following two sessions investigated how GAD relates to gender messages found in the Bible. These sessions evoked the greatest interest and debate. Staff felt that they needed a strong understanding of the Bible passages that portrayed the equality of men and women so that they could engage with the communities on these issues and adequately answer their concerns⁸⁸. By the end of these sessions I ended up feeling like they needed to be both researcher and theologian. In the afternoon session I focussed on basic GAD theory. On the following days I trained staff on a GA framework in the morning and then carried out a practical session with them in a community in the afternoon.

The second training course, run on Tanna Island, followed the same schedule for the morning, but in the afternoon we had to go straight to the GAM training. This was due to the many kastom ceremonies being held that week. We had to complete all the community sessions on Tanna Island in the mornings in order to catch the villagers before they departed for their kastom preparations and ceremonies. I taught the remaining GAD theory on the Friday afternoon at the end of the week. This was a little unfortunate as the theory flows into the practice of the GAs.

I set the order of the training schedule using the order given in the WV Gender Training Toolkit. However the staff really wanted a clear definition of gender before they started the first sessions. At the Efate training I responded to such questions with a verbal definition of gender and explained that it would be elaborated in more detail during the

⁸⁸ It is critical to constructively deal with issues of faith when pursuing GAD initiatives. Communities are likely to resist change if they feel that it undermines or contradicts aspects of their faith system.

first afternoon session. When the same question was raised at the beginning of the Tanna training course we took a detour to this session and then returned to the standard programme. Covering the gender session first seemed to aid participant's enthusiasm for taking part in the course and helped them feel more confident about engaging in the sessions.

Gender Analysis Sessions

The fieldwork schedule is outlined in Appendix II.

The field research involved conducting a WEEF with the WVV staff and a number of GAM and HAF sessions to evaluate projects as described in the table below.

Table 4.1 Gender Analysis Sessions Conducted in Each Village in Vanuatu

GA	Island	Village	Area	Project	Sector	Project Phase
GAM	Efate	Beverly Hills	Semi-urban	Education starts at home	Education	First year
HAF	Efate	Pango	Urban	Education starts at home	Education	First year
GAM	Tanna	Letaopam	Rural	Tafea CDP ⁸⁹ – literacy	Literacy	Completed
GAM	Tanna	Letaopam	Rural	Tafea CDP – pre-school	Pre-school	Completed
GAM	Tanna	Ikurup	Rural	Tafea CDP – literacy	Literacy	Fourth year of project
GAM	Tanna	Ikurup	Rural	Tafea CDP – water	Water	Fourth year of project
HAF	Tanna	Iemsene	Rural	Emaemsene Water	Water	Implementation

We chose projects on two different islands, in rural, urban and semi-urban locations, covering a range of different sectors and at different stages in the project cycle. This variety allowed me to test the usefulness of the GAs as a general development project tool. Communities with projects in the early stages of the project cycle investigated whether gender considerations should change the design of the project. Those with projects in the monitoring and evaluation stages investigated and addressed broader programme impacts (March, 1999:69). We conducted a GAM with Beverly Hills Village beneficiaries and a HAF with Pango Village. Both of these villages were based on Efate Island and were engaged in conducting the 'Education starts at home' project. This allowed a useful comparison of the GAM and HAF GAs.

⁸⁹ CDP stands for Community Development Programme.

A group from each community gathered to participate in each GA exercise. This was arranged by the WVV staff member in charge of the project communicating with their contact in the community and inviting them to take part in the session. This community member then contacted and invited other community members to attend who had been involved in the project. It would have been helpful to have asked at each GA session whether the group contained a representative sample of project beneficiaries and participants and who was missing from the group.

WVV staff members facilitated the GA sessions in Bislama or one of the local languages as appropriate. In much of Vanuatu women are not encouraged to speak in front of men. Hence the men and women were placed in separate groups to try and help the women feel more comfortable to speak. The GA tables were mainly filled out in English. I observed the GA sessions and took notes on numbers, gender and approximate age of those attending, participation of group members and factors that helped or hindered the sessions. On some occasions an additional staff member was present and was able to translate some of the discussion involved in the sessions for me. We made a number of mistakes and many of the learnings on the GA process were quite basic in nature, because the staff and I were still learning how to carry out GA.

On Efate Island an afternoon tea was shared with each group after the GA session to thank the participants. On Tanna Island the communities preferred to be given some rice and they combined the rice with local ingredients for a shared lunch after the GA session. After each session I debriefed the WVV staff back at the WVV office and clarified and discussed the results with them. The staff also did a SWOT analysis on the GA tool used; their comments have been included in the discussion in chapter six⁹⁰.

Women's Equality and Empowerment Framework

Detailed instructions on how to conduct the WEEF can be found in Appendix One.

90 SWOT stands for Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats.

The WEEF was the first GA framework utilised. I started the WEEF training by covering the Gender Training Toolkit session on empowerment theory and understanding the different types of power. A key point of discussion from this session was ‘How far should women be empowered?’ One of the male staff shared how he seeks to involve his wife in decision making, but in the end in his village he is the head of his household. Other participants raised the Bible verse ‘Wives should submit to their husbands.’ I recommended that they consider the Bible as a whole. The verse ‘Wives should submit to their husbands’ in Ephesians 5:24 should be taken in context with the following verse which says ‘Husbands, love your wives, just as Christ loved the church and gave himself up for her’ As The New International Version Study Bible footnotes say ‘To give oneself up to death for the beloved is a more extreme expression of devotion than the wife is called on to make’ (Barker, 1995:1800). Combining this with an understanding of power as not being limited to ‘power-over’ but encompassing ‘power-to’ and ‘power-with’ means that a husband can still be the head of the household, but an empowering, servant-leader and certainly not a tyrant. I also shared that in New Zealand women had taken on many leadership positions and they had capably undertaken these roles.

Then I covered the WEEF theory, explaining the different ‘levels of equality’ and the ‘levels of recognition’ of women’s issues involved in the GA. In the following session I led the group in conducting a WEEF on the WVV Country Programme. The WVV staff member responsible for each project explained to the group what their project entailed and what part of the project cycle it was up to. They suggested which levels of equality and what level of recognition their project had achieved. I asked questions to ensure that all projects deserved the ratings given by the staff. When we finished filling out the WEEF I led the staff in a discussion regarding the overall results.

Gender Analysis Matrix

A detailed description of the GAM methodology can be found in Appendix One.

The WVV staff facilitator started by explaining to the group the four different ‘levels’ of society and the four kinds of impact that were to be analysed. The GAM Matrix was filled in by considering the project driven changes in the lives of participants.

Harvard Analytical Framework

A detailed description of the HAF methodology can be found in Appendix One.

The facilitator started the session by giving an overview of the different tools involved in the HAF and the purpose of each tool. Then they explained the first tool in more depth and filled the matrix in with the groups comments. The facilitator repeated this process with the second and third tools. Completing the three tools with the community groups took one to one and a half hours. In hindsight, it would have been better to have completed the HAF by using PLA⁹¹ techniques to gather some of the information required as this would have elicited more accurate and complete data.

The fourth and final HAF tool considered a variety of questions regarding project implementation. The researcher worked with the project staff and led them in a discussion to elicit these results.

Strengths and Weaknesses of the Methodology

The WVV facilitators and myself were all learning how to do GAs for the first time. This could have misrepresented the potential of the GAs. However learning from mistakes is a potent form of learning and it helped to highlight things that the instruction guides did not think to mention or emphasise. The strengths of the frameworks were all the more apparent in that they did produce useful, rich information despite the inexperience and mistakes of the users.

The results and discussion relate mainly to the notes produced during the GA sessions. These discussions were carried out in Bislama or the local language. The notes are a summarised version of what was shared and they were mainly written in English, which is the second or third language of the facilitators, so the facilitators were translating as they went. Consequently the staff facilitating the sessions would have a much deeper understanding of the issues raised than was reflected in the notes analysed in this thesis.

⁹¹ PLA stands for Participatory Learning and Action.

Summary

This chapter overviewed the methodology utilised during the thesis fieldwork. My experience as a development worker opened the door to working with WVV and greatly influenced my perspective in critiquing the GA frameworks. I was able to utilise the WV Gender Training Toolkit, adding to the momentum of this initiative. The classroom training I provided along with the GA sessions in the communities resulted in a win-win situation for WVV and myself. I came away with the results for my thesis and they were trained in GAD and GA and explored their projects from a gender angle. The methodology had its strengths and weaknesses, however even the weaknesses added to the approach, emphasising lessons that GA authors do not think to include.

Chapter Five: Effectiveness of World Vision Vanuatu in Dealing With Gender Issues

The following chapter provides the project results from the fieldwork GA sessions and outlines the effectiveness of WVV in dealing with gender issues. The first section provides the WEEF results, which give the reader a feel for the WVV Country Programme and orientation towards empowering women. This is followed by the individual project results that examine a selection of projects in more detail using the GAM and HAF.

World Vision Vanuatu's Country Programme Women's Equality and Empowerment Framework Results

The WEEF table and details regarding the session participants can be viewed in Appendix IV, Table 1.

At the time of the fieldwork the main focus of the WVV Country Programme was education, followed by health. Additional areas included livelihoods, water supply and staff development.

Sixty percent of the country programme had a welfare component. The WatSan project built water sources close to settlements; decreasing the time it took for women to collect water and improving the quality of the water⁹². The project also provided sanitation training, which helped reduce the prevalence of disease, decreasing the number of sick children and adults that the women had to care for. The farm-processing project taught women how to process and preserve food to avoid waste and add value to their produce.

Ninety percent of the country programme addressed women's access issues. The Education Starts at Home project targeted mothers and fathers who had children from zero (during pregnancy) through to three years old. The functional literacy project targeted women, seeking to correct the traditional preference for educating Vanuatu

92 WatSan is short for Water and Sanitation.

males. The staff capacity building project provided training to both male and female staff on the basis of need.

Only 30% of the country programme addressed conscientisation on gender issues. Typically women bare the burden for raising small children in Vanuatu with limited help from the men. The Education Starts at Home project encouraged both fathers and mothers to take responsibility for raising small children. The HIV AIDS project raised awareness on gender issues surrounding infection⁹³. The staff capacity building project provided training on GAD and GA⁹⁴.

The whole WVV country programme consciously sought to encourage women's participation. Women leaders were involved in the project needs assessment and design of the National Literacy Project. Both of the literacy projects used predominantly female teachers and encouraged the participation of women on the Literacy Committees. The farm-processing project was developed from the feedback from a previous project and women provided most of the feedback for that project. Women were involved in choosing the location of the water supply for the WatSan project. Women staff were involved in the project needs analysis conducted for the capacity building project.

Ninety percent of the country programme addressed issues of women's control. Women are on the Water Committees for the WatSan project⁹⁵. The staff reported that usually men control funds in Vanuatu and spend it on their own needs first, the farm-processing project trained women how to budget and manage family funds and be part of family decision making. Culturally men make decisions in Vanuatu, the functional literacy project sought to empower women by helping them to develop their confidence through learning to read. Staff observed that this has led to women starting to speak in meetings. The functional literacy project has women and men on the Literacy Committees and one community has a Literacy Committee Chairwoman.

⁹³ HIV stands for Human Immunodeficiency Virus, AIDS stands for Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome.

⁹⁴ This was provided by the researcher.

⁹⁵ Water Committees generally have three women and five men serving on them.

The majority of the projects had objectives that explicitly addressed women's issues. The National Literacy Project stated that literacy is a felt need expressed by women and illiteracy is mainly a women's issue as males have been prioritised for education in Vanuatu. The farm-processing project reported that food processing is a women's issue and increases their income. The Education Starts at Home project deals with women's issues because pregnancy and childcare are predominantly women's issues in Vanuatu. The three 0s were given to projects whose objectives met general community needs rather than explicitly focussing on women's issues.

A male staff member protested that the WVV Country Programme entailed more recognition of women than men and a female staff member agreed with them. WV want to be a needs based organisation and if ni-Vanuatu women are in greater need than the men, then the majority of the WVV programme should be aimed at them. However, the organisation needs to ensure that men do not start to fall behind in the process.

Gender Impact

The gender impact of the WVV country programme is likely to be positive. All of the projects sought to empower women in some way and many of the projects sought to address the higher levels of women's empowerment. The majority of the projects had objectives that explicitly addressed women's issues.

Recommendations

The WVV Country Programme may be enhanced by:

- Engaging in more conscientisation regarding gender issues.
- Looking for opportunities to address domestic violence as this is a major gender issue in Vanuatu.

The programme could be improved in general by ensuring that all project objectives are SMART and numerical targets are sex disaggregated⁹⁶.

96 SMART stands for Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Realistic and Time-bound.

Project Results

This section overviews the fieldwork project results for seven sessions run in five villages and considers five different projects. GAM sessions were run in Beverly Hills on Efate Island and Letaopam Village and Ikurup Village on Tanna Island. The projects evaluated included the Children's Education Begins at Home Project, Ridim Laef – Functional Literacy Project and the Pre-School Education Project and Water Supply Project within the Tafea Community Development Programme. HAF sessions were run in Pango Village on Efate Island and Iemsene Village on Tanna Island. The projects evaluated included the Children's Education Begins at Home Project and the Iemsene Water Supply Project.

Project:	Children's Education Begins at Home Project
Duration:	June 2005 to May 2008.
Location:	Shefa Province in Vanuatu.
Beneficiaries:	12 villages including urban, semi-urban and rural areas. Approximately 192 direct beneficiaries (50% female). Approximately 15,900 indirect beneficiaries (50% female).
Project goal:	To contribute to the reduction of the number of school drop outs/push outs as well as the rate of under-performance and poor attendance in Vanuatu schools in the long term.
Project purpose:	Increased parent, caregiver and community responsibility for early childhood development by the end of the project.
Project components:	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Data collection within target communities.2. Preparation for workshops in target communities.3. Workshops held on key areas in relation to early child hood development.4. Community discussion groups on community governance and the education system.

Beverly Hills Village Gender Analysis Matrix Results

The GAM and details regarding the session can be viewed in Appendix IV, Table 2.

Most of the effects were desirable. Both parents were learning the importance of early childhood development and men and women were working together more. Children were benefiting from the application of the project lessons. Men were also helping more with childcare and housework, challenging the gender division of labour. The project goal was to contribute to a reduction in the number of school drop outs/push outs as well as the rate of under-performance and poor attendance in Vanuatu schools in the

long term. One would expect that the majority of impacts identified above would help to achieve this goal.

Those attending the awareness raising sessions have been sharing the information with others, hence those who do not participate can still benefit.

A number of the GAM results were unexpected. The majority of the GAM participants were youth who did not have children. The project staff reported that in many of the other project communities only mothers turned up for the project activities and in some communities a mixture of youth and mothers attended. However in Beverly Hills it was mainly youth who had attended the project. This could imply that there were high youth unemployment rates and a lack of alternative opportunities for this age group in this community.

Some GAM participants claimed that the time project activities were held was not suitable for many in the community. The project staff noted that the project was aimed at the significant number of mothers who were at home with their children during the day. In addition, they had tried visiting the community during the evening and people still did not attend. When designing the project the staff interviewed people with children under three years of age. Yet these people had not been attending the project sessions. They noted that Beverley Hills was a semi-urban area, hence it was more transient, there were more job opportunities and it was harder to get people together. In the rural areas people were less mobile, more accessible for project activities and more organised. Some of the people interviewed had moved out of the area. Others were busy with other things and some were unmotivated. The outcomes of the Education Starts at Home Project were also less tangible than other development initiatives, for example water projects provide immediate results. The people were money minded and would turn up for income generating projects. Some did not see the importance of early childhood development. Some NGOs working in the area had also said bad things about WVV and that made it hard to work there afterwards.

One woman reported that the project had created tension in some homes. When women returned home from the project awareness sessions and dinner was not cooked, some husband's were tired and hungry and got cross that dinner was not ready. Consequently

they ordered their wives around, creating tension and discouraging other mothers from attending.

Project staff were surprised to hear that young men had started gathering groups to visit newborns. Usually when babies are born in Vanuatu people do not take much notice. The project has helped to ascribe greater value to young children.

Gender Impact

The gender impact of the Education Starts at Home Project is likely to be positive on the whole. Men and women were working together more overall and some men were helping more with childcare and housework, challenging gender division of labour.

Recommendations⁹⁷

The project may be enhanced by:

- Partnering with the local church. The Education Starts at Home Project is holistic (incorporating spirituality and nutrition) and would be suitable to do through churches. Churches have resource people which the project could train and supply with the necessary resources. Staff could supplement this with a community workshop for those who do not attend a church. The project staff felt that people would be more likely to turn up to a course run by their church.
- Finding an alternative venue. Some community members did not feel comfortable attending a meeting in a church.
- Checking that the project was working through the right channels and contact people.
- Continuing awareness raising with the men in the community to help them appreciate the importance of the women attending.
- Continuing to encourage the men to help with the household chores in the absence of their wives.
- Considering how many people have been participating versus how many change agents are needed to positively affect the community. This may lead to the

⁹⁷ Many of the recommendations for the different projects were devised by the WVV staff members during the group debriefs.

conclusion that there is no need to encourage higher numbers of participants or change the time activities are run.

Pango Village Harvard Analytical Framework Results

The HAF results and details regarding the sessions can be viewed in Appendix IV, Tables Three to Nine.

Wider Pango includes many different cultural groups, expatriates and tourism activities. The Pango community involved in this project included only one chief and one cultural group who were the traditional owners of the land they lived on. Pango had one of the first schools in Vanuatu and there were reported to be a lot of educated people in the community.

Harvard Analytical Framework Tool One: Activity Profile

Pango is an urban area with a variety of job opportunities. The men's group listed 13 productive activities, while the women listed six. This is over twice as many and may be indicative of men having primary responsibility for productive work in the community. However, the men's list may include some reproductive activities and needs to be checked. There was some gender division of productive labour, but both males and females conducted the majority of activities. There were 11 activities that everyone was involved in, versus six that only men or only women were involved in. Only women engaged in sewing and only men worked as mechanics, electricians and carpenters and building constructors.

The men's group listed eight reproductive activities and the women's group listed nine. Unlike the productive activities lists the two lists were very similar. According to the women, weaving, cleaning the house and sewing were the only activities subject to a gender division of labour and women conducted them all at home. The men said that washing clothes was the only activity undertaken by women alone. The women said that most people undertook 'washing' but did not specify whether that was washing clothes or children or dishes. Both sexes and all age groups undertook all of the rest of the reproductive activities.

Most of the community were engaged in the majority of the community activities. Community members who were not engaged in paid labour had to put aside Wednesday's as a community workday. Sometimes church activities were also run on this day. The few activities that did not engage everyone were segregated by age rather than sex. For example older people did not engage in sport and children did not attend the parent/teacher meetings. All men were involved with the Council of Chiefs. Sometimes women attended if the topic was considered relevant to them. Boys and girls only attended the general meetings.

Women discussed the issues with their husbands at home and in theory this meant that their husbands spoke on their behalf in the meetings. However it was mentioned that they were not always reliable spokesmen. Women did not get the opportunity to develop confidence and leadership skills in the Council of Chiefs forum. In the absence of women the Council will probably err towards men's perspectives and dealing with men's issues.

Women from Pango Village appeared to be reasonably mobile.

UNICEF (1998:6) reported that the gender division of labour in Vanuatu was very strong. The HAF results gathered did not provide enough information to confirm or refute this statement. The results that were collected seemed to imply that the gender division of labour was not or is no longer as pronounced as UNICEF implied.

Bennett and Harewood (2003:24) reported that ni-Vanuatu women worked longer hours than men and UNICEF (1998:6) concurred saying they had less free time than men. The HAF results gathered did not provide enough information to confirm or refute this statement. However, discussions during the fieldwork visit indicated that this was the case. Men typically finished work mid afternoon and then went to the nakamal while the women continued with food preparation for the evening meal, child care and other household tasks.

Harvard Tool 2: Access and Control Profile

The men said that both men and women had access to and control of all resources, apart from education and training, which both can access but only men control⁹⁸. The women painted a slightly different and more limited picture. They felt that they did control education and training along with men, but they could not control land and they could not access or control labour. If the women had limited control of education, then it would be very important to include the men in this education project.

Men had overall control of reproductive resources, but women controlled a few aspects of reproductive resources such as choosing what to cook and sewing and buying children's clothes.

The women reported being able to access and control all benefits apart from political power. They reported that they were not able to access or exert control over the community decision making forum and the men gave the same report. This information indicates how critical it is to have the buy-in and support of the men in this project. They are the ones who have the balance of power in the community and if they do not appreciate the importance of the project they are in an easy position to limit its effectiveness and constrain the involvement of the women.

The men also listed overseas travel as a benefit that men controlled, but both sexes could access.

Harvard Tool 3: Influencing factors

This community seemed to be very optimistic; they saw many opportunities and few constraints before them. This is in keeping with Pango Village being an urban community in Port Vila with access to educational opportunities, paid work, the market and tourism.

The women's group reported that women were not free to express their opinions in the political arena. Men or the council of chiefs made most of the decisions and women

98 Assuming that they did not forget to tick this box.

were prohibited from joining the council of chiefs. Women could only listen in general meetings or public hearings. The men's group did not mention any of these issues and in fact said that political factors presented an opportunity by bringing equality and economic and social development. It would be good to check with the men what they meant by equality. In addition, evidence from around the world indicates that economic and social development is slowed by a lack women's participation in decision making arenas.

Harvard Tool 4: Checklist

The findings are incorporated below under 'gender impact' and 'recommendations'.

Gender Impact

The gender impact of the education starts at home project is likely to be positive. The project demonstrated a real concern for women and children and prioritisation of their issues. Women were free to participate or not. Delivery channels were accessible to women, females were used to deliver services and childcare was provided at workshops. Sufficient resources were set-aside for women and they were not diverted to the interests of men. Action was taken to resolve resistance to the change process. The project met a strategic gender need by encouraging men to be involved in the development of their small children.

Recommendations

The project may be enhanced by:

- Ensuring that men in the project communities are sufficiently informed and involved in the project.
- The community suggested doing more awareness raising about the project.
- Investigating the project workload. This project may be a little over-ambitious. It may be possible to work with fewer communities, with the view to running a phase two project that encompassed more communities in the long term.
- Investigating why the project manager was not spending half their time on this project. Changes were needed so that either they are available for the required

amount of time or the remaining staff were compensated in some way for the additional workload.

- Seeking gender balance on the WVV Tanna Island staff. While issues of travel and heavy work requirements may be more challenging for women, the organisation could look for creative ways of dealing with them. Women may also be able cope with these perceived constraints better than expected. Discussions have taken place regarding WV employing women to work in relief situations and the women employed have performed well.

Comparison of the Gender Analysis Matrix and Harvard Analytical Framework Results

The Education Begins At Home Project GAM and HAF results provide some opportunity to compare the two GA tools, as the same project was under review and the communities had some similarities in that they were both located in semi-urban areas, near Port Vila on Efate Island.

The GAM and HAF provided very different results. While the facilitators were inexperienced in both techniques, the GAM clearly showed project impacts on men and women, while the HAF took much reflection to decipher this information. However, the HAF project cycle analysis questions provided superior information on the GAD approach of WVV, which the GAM did not even attempt to collect. This difference in orientation is reflected in the different recommendations generated by each GA tool.

Project:	Ridim Laef – Functional Literacy
Duration:	September 2002 to September 2005.
Location:	Tanna and Santo Islands.
Beneficiaries:	2,097 beneficiaries participated in literacy classes (including 1,765 women).
Major development objective:	To empower participating communities, through functional literacy, to improve their quality of life through better access to and use of existing services and opportunities.
Project objectives:	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Develop the capacity of at least 130 literacy trainers to provide literacy training to the target beneficiaries by September 2005. 2. Develop quality functional literacy teaching materials to be used in literacy training by September 2005. Appropriate teaching material for functional literacy courses are prepared, revised or collected and used by literacy trainers. 3. Increase functional literacy knowledge of approximately 1,440 illiterate women and 360 men in Santo and Tanna Islands and integrate them into other development programmes by September 2005.

Letaopam Village Gender Analysis Matrix Results

The GAM and details regarding the session can be viewed in Appendix IV, Table 10.

The project impact on the women was very desirable. The women had increased mobility and independence because they could now communicate at the hospital, the bank and the store. They gained skills that would help them access better job and income generating opportunities and they could open a bank account and save money. Older women were going to town because they could now communicate. Women were on the Literacy Committee and gaining experience in leadership. Women were generally getting more involved in decision making affecting their lives. They reported increased confidence and self-esteem. The project also challenged the gender division of labour because the classes finished at 11.30am and the women did not have enough time to cook the midday meal. In their absence the men cooked the midday meal, looked after the children, did housework and gardened.

The project impact on the men was mixed. They received the benefits of their wives greater independence and ability to earn a higher income, but they were falling behind developmentally. The men were getting a little dependent on the women, for example if they needed something from the shop they would ask the women to get it because they

could communicate. The men were not supportive of their wives attending the literacy classes and the women reported domestic problems.

The project goal was to empower participating communities, through functional literacy, to improve their quality of life through better access to and use of existing services and opportunities. While the women were certainly enjoying these benefits, the men were falling behind. Hence the project effects were not entirely consistent with the stated programme goal.

A number of results were unexpected. The project was initially aimed at women and assumed that men had received sufficient education through the formal system. Later it was realised that many men were also illiterate and the project allowed men to attend classes. However, few men took up this opportunity. This may have been due to the initial project awareness raising targeting women and the men may have been less informed regarding the project and the importance of being literate, or they may have thought that it was just a women's project. WVV staff suggested that the men might not have wanted to attend because they might look stupid in front of the women while they were learning. Some of the literacy materials produced by the project focussed on topics that were of more interest to women. The literacy trainer for this community was a female and the men may not have wanted to be taught by a woman.

The men had started building a house for community meetings with government workers, but had stopped half way through. When the women learned Bislama they were keen to hear the government workers and so they finished the building themselves so the meetings could be held. In doing this they discovered that they too could build roofs.

Gender Impact

The gender impact of this project is likely to be mixed. The project has had a very positive impact on the women and had significantly empowered them. They were very enthusiastic about the new freedom and opportunities they now enjoy. However, the men were starting to fall behind the women developmentally.

Recommendations

The project may be enhanced by:

- Holding separate literacy classes for the men. Running separate classes for men in the Nakamal proved to be an excellent solution in Ikurup Village⁹⁹.
- Getting the support of all the village leaders. The village Nakamal Chief had not supported the literacy classes and had not encouraged the men to attend. It would be helpful to find out why this was the case and work with all the community leaders in this village to encourage their ownership of the project.

Ikurup Village Gender Analysis Matrix Results

The GAM and details regarding this session can be viewed in Appendix IV, Table 11.

The women reported being able to write to others, communicate in hospital and access government information in Bislama. This should result in much more independence for the women. The classes covered basic numeracy as well as reading and writing, hence the women were able to trade in the markets and increase their income. Income in the hands of women typically goes toward meeting the needs of the family and helping the whole family develop. The women were sharing what they had learnt with their family, which hopefully will help empower the women by raising their self-confidence. The gender division of labour was being challenged as men helped with the women's household tasks while they attended their classes.

The Ikurup Village results were significantly better than those found at Letaopam Village. There did not appear to be any conflict over women attending the classes and not being able to complete all of their household chores. Instead the women reported that there was community support for education and the men were helping with the housework while they attended the classes. The basic project design organised classes during the day that were primarily aimed at women. The men were welcome to attend these classes, however few took up this opportunity. The male literacy trainer in Ikurup took the initiative to run additional classes for men at the Nakamal. Separate classes for

⁹⁹ To do this the project would need to train an additional male literacy trainer, as women are not allowed access to the Nakamal.

men may have led to a situation where they were more comfortable learning and avoided situations where they might have looked foolish in front of the women. The men also usually meet in the Nakamal during the late afternoon and evening, so classes during these hours would not affect their productive activities. Men attending the Nakamal literacy classes were more likely to appreciate the benefits of the women attending class and hence be more supportive of them attending. The Nakamal classes also ensured that the men did not fall behind.

People who declined to participate in the literacy classes risked falling behind developmentally. However, the women had been sharing what they had learnt with their family, disseminating the lessons within the wider community.

An unexpected result was that the community reported that one of the project impacts was becoming more organised in order to find time to attend the classes.

Gender Impact

The gender impact of the literacy classes appeared to be very positive. The women were being empowered without leaving the men behind.

Recommendations

Further improvements could be made to the wider project by sharing the lessons from Ikurup Village.

- The project should consider running separate literacy classes for men in each village. The Nakamal proved to be a good location for men's literacy classes in Ikurup. This may be a good location as it catches men at a time and location that they regularly and willingly attend.
- Ideally the project design should train a male and a female literacy trainer in each village. Male literacy trainers have access to both the classroom and the Nakamal and may be better received by male students. However utilising female literacy trainers provides an opportunity for women in the communities to experience

leadership and be empowered by teaching others. Male family members may also be more open to women attending classes taught by a woman.

Project:	Preschool Education
Duration:	October 2003 to September 2006.
Location:	14 rural communities in West and South-west Tanna Island.
Beneficiaries:	Approximately 6,000 direct beneficiaries (50% female and 46% children).
Project goal:	Improve access to education for pre-school aged children.
Project activities:	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Construct new pre-schools in four communities.2. Train pre-school teachers to staff four new pre-schools.3. Equip new and existing pre-schools with educational materials.

Letaopam Village Gender Analysis Matrix Results

The GAM and details regarding the session can be viewed in Appendix IV, Table 12.

The men only listed one positive impact of the project ‘Women are able to get more work done while their children are at pre-school’. A group of women may have been able to list more positive impacts as women are often closer to their children, more aware of their needs and carry more responsibility for educating them.

The men made a number of comments regarding ways of paying for the pre-school fees. It would be good to investigate further. How much are the fees? How much labour and time do parents spend paying for them? Are they reasonable? Could the project assist by introducing some more profitable income generating activities to help pay for the fees?

The project objective was to improve access to education for pre-school aged children. Children were attending the pre-school, however one cannot tell from the GAM impacts listed whether more children were now attending a pre-school than before, this question needed to be covered in the GAM session. One could assume that pre-schooling was more accessible as they have built the pre-school in their community, however it is important to consider whether the project may also have created other constraints that impede the numbers being schooled. For example, are the children of the poorest members of the community attending? What happens if parents are not able to pay for the pre-school fees?

Children who do not attend pre-school will fall behind. The project staff mentioned that the Government of Vanuatu has also started to introduce a policy that children who have not attended pre-school will not be able to attend primary school.

It was surprising that there were not more positive results.

Gender Impact

The gender impact of the project was hard to tell from the men's GAM results. Men and women appeared to be working together to implement the project. The project may also have encouraged men to be more involved in their children's education. Women were able to get more work done while their children were at pre-school but also had to get up earlier to get the children ready and had to help raise the funds to pay the fees.

Recommendations

The project may be enhanced by:

- Conducting a GAM on the project with a women's group to gather more information on the gendered impacts of the project.
- Investigating the system of fees further and considering their affordability.

Project:	Water Supply
Duration:	October 2003 to September 2006.
Location:	14 rural communities in West and South-west Tanna Island.
Beneficiaries:	Approximately 6,000 direct beneficiaries (50% female and 46% children).
Project goal:	Increase the number of households with access to clean water.
Project activities:	1. Repair water supply systems in two communities. 2. Extend water supply systems in three communities.

Ikurup Village Gender Analysis Matrix Results

The GAM and details regarding the session can be viewed in Appendix IV, Table 13.

The men were very positive about this project. There were less domestic issues in the community. The men used to get jealous and suspicious when the women took too long getting water from the creek. Children used to refuse to get water from the creek, which

was 1-2km away, so parents would whip them. Now the children do not complain about fetching water and more are getting to school, as they cannot disappear into the bush after having their bath in the creek.

The women started washing clothes everyday, which was increasing their workload. Considering that they were accustomed to washing their clothes less often, it was interesting to note that they did not use the time saved from gathering water for more productive work or more leisure time¹⁰⁰.

The men used to get a container of water for their kava sessions and when it ran out they stopped the session. With more water available they started consuming more kava. The researcher enquired whether this was beneficial as excessive kava can lead to problems. The project staff felt that kava consumption had not risen to detrimental levels, however the men themselves gave this impact a minus. Assuming that the minus sign was not a mistake, more questions should be asked regarding why they felt this was an undesirable impact¹⁰¹.

The project goal was to increase the number of households with access to clean water and this was achieved.

The men reported that everyone participated.

The men reported that there were more good impacts than they expected. The researcher was surprised by the women choosing to wash clothes everyday, the increased kava consumption and the range of social improvements that occurred.

The GAM raised general learnings in addition to those on gender:

- Once taps are built, people move closer to them. Planners need to keep this in mind when choosing their location and make sure they are not placed in cyclone and earthquake prone places.

¹⁰⁰ In the long term the community could consider some time saving appropriate technologies. Ladies in other communities reported spending a day a week washing clothes which is a developmental constraint.

¹⁰¹ Kava is a valued part of Vanuatu culture therefore any actions to curb consumption would be best generated and instituted by the communities.

- It was exciting to see how many and how diverse the benefits of increased access to water have been. The community can now make concrete and have made a toilet and a biogas unit. Children have started helping to grow flowers next to the houses. There is less stealing of domestic animals, as they do not have to cross neighbours properties looking for water. The availability of water has led to the improved health and survival of the community's animals. They reported that the pigs are growing fatter, the cattle survive better and the vegetables and taro grow better.

Gender Impact

The overall impact of the project has been very positive. Increased access to water has created new opportunities for both sexes. The gender division of labour is also being challenged as men and women now share water collection. Some of the impacts on women appear to be mixed. They have less time collecting water but more time washing clothes. Completing a GAM with the women would help to clarify the impact of the project on them.

Recommendations

- Completing the GAM with a group of women from the community to check the project gender impacts on them.

Project:	Iemsene Water Supply System
Duration:	October 2005 to October 2006.
Location:	Three rural communities and other nearby smaller villages in West Tanna, Tanna Island.
Beneficiaries:	2,360 direct beneficiaries.
Project goal:	To provide clean and safe water supply for drinking and other household uses to the targeted population of 2,360 in West Tanna.
Project activities:	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To form and train gender-balanced water committees to survey and manage water and sanitation resources for their own communities. 2. PHAST¹⁰² training amongst community members to promote good hygiene practices and understanding of water supply systems. 3. Child-focussed activities on water and sanitation issues. 4. Water supply systems extended/established/repaired for target communities. 5. Latrine construction.

Iemsene Village Harvard Analytical Framework Results

The HAF tables and details regarding the sessions can be found in Appendix IV, Tables 14 to 20.

Harvard Tool 1: Activity Profile

The women listed six productive activities and the men listed ten. The results indicated that only women and girls engaged in making kato/laplap, boys alone marketed green coconuts and only males acted as shopkeepers, planted Sandlewood and Vanilla and raised bulls. A reasonable proportion of the productive activities were shared between the sexes and age groups. Hence there was not an extensive gender division of labour. However, it appeared that men alone were involved in the more lucrative activities.

The lists from each group were quite similar. Both groups only listed five reproductive activities and seemed a little short, the women did not even list childcare. The results indicated that only women cooked and fed children and men alone built houses. The community shared collecting firewood, gardening, fetching water and childcare. The shared activities seemed to be mainly those conducted outside of the home.

102 PHAST stands for Participatory Hygiene And Sanitation Transformation.

The women listed four community management activities and the men listed six. The lists had a number of different items in each. Only the men listed ‘community hall’, ‘committee’, ‘chief’ and ‘literacy school’¹⁰³. The community management activities seemed to be more segregated by age than by sex.

The community appeared to have limited mobility and most of the activities were carried out locally. Women’s mobility did not seem to be particularly constrained.

Harvard Tool 2: Access and Control Profile

The women said they could access all of the five resources listed, but only three of the five benefits (asset ownership, basic needs and education). The men’s view of the women’s access was much more constrained. The men said that women could access only two of the resources from the initial list (land and education/training) and none of the benefits. The women said they could control only two of the five resources listed (equipment and education/training), but could control all of the benefits. It seemed strange that women could control so many more benefits than the men, in addition, one cannot control something they cannot access. The women may have confused their men’s and women’s columns here. The men’s view of the women’s control was much more constrained. They agreed that the women could control two of the resources, but said that the women could control land rather than equipment. The men claimed that the women had no control over any of the benefits. The women had access to the literacy classes and were on the village Literacy Committee. The women reported that both men and women must agree on education decisions, yet only the women were listed as having access to and control over education and training. The facilitator could have suggested putting a tick for both men and women in this section. Likewise, for basic needs they should have ticked access for both men and women¹⁰⁴.

The men said they could access four of the initial list of five resources and all of the benefits listed. The women’s view of men’s access was a little more constrained. The women agreed that men could access four of the resources, but said that they could only

103 It would be good to get some information regarding exactly what they meant by each of these activities.

104 Otherwise men could not survive in this community.

access three of the benefits (income, asset ownership and political power). The men said they could control four of the resources and all of the benefits. The women's view of the men's control appeared to be more constrained. The women agreed that the men could control four of the resources, but said that they only controlled two of the benefits (asset ownership and education). Again, it appeared that the women's group results for the control of benefits section were the wrong way around for men and women.

The men's group responses indicated that Iemsene Village was a very male dominated community. However, the women's responses showed that they have significantly more access to and control of resources and benefits than the men perceive¹⁰⁵. The researcher suspected that the women's view of the balance of power was a closer reflection of reality, whereas the men's responses indicated what they deemed to be a suitable state of affairs. One of the facilitators reported that they felt the men's responses indicated that the community was very male dominated and that there was a need to address gender issues in this community.

Harvard Tool 3: Influencing factors

The women listed five constraints and four opportunities and the men listed more than 10 constraints and one opportunity. The literacy classes for women led to more opportunities; the above results would lead one to question whether they also resulted in more optimism. The results were quite different from those elicited from the Pango Community. This is in keeping with Iemsene Village being a rural community with fewer opportunities than Pango Village, which was on the outskirts of Port Vila.

Both the men and women reported being frustrated by corrupt and ineffective politicians and too many taboos.

The researcher was surprised to see that the men mentioned that the traditionally male dominated society did not give opportunities to women and that this was a constraint.

¹⁰⁵ Regardless of whether or not they confused some of their columns.

The community reported having land issues. Traditionally the male community members inherited the land, however there were now too many boys. They were also afraid that the law might force them off their land and if they did legally secure their land it could lead to restrictions on its use.

The women stated that more males was an opportunity because they stayed in the village, while more females was a constraint because traditionally they leave the village when they get married. This demonstrated that boys were seen in a more positive light than girls in this community. This message can flow through into all areas of life and lead to many disadvantages for girls and women.

The women commented on having too many institutional structures in the community. The project needs to consider how it adds to this mix and how much community time and resources it requires.

The men mentioned the limited educational opportunities a number of times. The lack of education leads to problems because the government only offer training courses in Bislama. Hence there may be value in offering men's literacy classes in this village.

Harvard Tool 4: Checklist

The findings of this tool were incorporated below under 'gender impact' and 'recommendations'.

Gender Impact

The gender impact of the project was likely to be positive. The project personnel had a genuine concern for women. Women and men were on the Water Committee, providing greater transparency in community decision making and a forum where the needs of both genders could be addressed. The project met women's needs by providing water and putting taps in homes. The project had sufficient resources and had planned for sustainability by implementing the Water Committee and requiring a small charge for the water.

Recommendations

The project may be improved by:

- Providing the Water Committee with more training and job descriptions to help clarify and improve their role in the community.
- Reflecting with this Christian community on Bible passages that teach that men and women are of equal value.
- Starting literacy classes for men to help overcome the lack of educational opportunities.
- Seeking gender balance on the WVV Tanna staff team.

Chapter Six: Lessons Regarding the Effective Application of Gender Analysis Frameworks

The following chapter covers the fieldwork learnings on the effective application of GA frameworks. The section below starts with the general GA process findings. Sections dedicated to the WEEF, GAM and HAF lessons follow this.

General Gender Analysis Process Results

The next section overviews the general GA process learnings that were not specific to one particular GA tool. Lessons were grouped together under common themes and included facilitators, GA participants, GA sessions and data validity.

Facilitators

The section on facilitators starts by describing the impact of facilitators experience in leading community sessions and then considers the number facilitators and their sex.

Experience of Facilitators

Prior experience in facilitating community group sessions aids learning to use the GA tools. The WVV staff facilitating the Beverly Hills Village sessions included project staff that were experienced in facilitating groups and also those employed for office support. This added to the challenges of the session.

Number of Facilitators

The Beverly Hills GAM sessions had groups with up to five staff in them facilitating. The different facilitators had different ideas about explaining what was required and this got confusing for the participants and slowed progress. It is better to have no more than two facilitators in each group. One can ask the questions and fill in the matrices, the other can listen and write detailed notes on the discussion.

Sex of Facilitators

All of the Tanna GA sessions were run by male facilitators and a male community leader translated for the women's group in Iemsene Village. This may have impacted the answers given by the women's groups. Women do not always feel comfortable talking to a man, or may simply feel more confident talking to a female facilitator (Miller & Razavi, 1998:29). In Vanuatu particularly, women are not encouraged to speak in public or to challenge men (Osteria, 1991:70). Ideally females should facilitate sessions with women and men should work with male groups.

From this section one can see that facilitators play a significant part the success of GA sessions. Facilitation is best done in pairs with one facilitator leading the session and filling out the matrices and the other taking detailed notes on the community discussions. Facilitators need to be aware of how their sex can affect the responses given and wherever possible women should facilitate women's groups.

Participants

The next section looks at issues regarding the community members who participate in the GA sessions. Issues regard including men and women in the GA sessions, session timing, participant involvement in the project, language used, group size and participant diversity.

Including Men and Women in the Gender Analysis Sessions

Williams (1994:234) reported 'Women and men have different life experiences, knowledge, perspectives and priorities. One cannot necessarily represent the interests of the other and neither alone can fully represent their community'. The GA process is incomplete if only members of one sex are involved in the analysis. The different groups have different insights and perspectives and interests in the project outcomes. The GA process also encourages each group to consider the other, leading to awareness raising.

Typically men speak in public in Vanuatu and in some communities women are prohibited from speaking in public meetings (Boe, 2006). The fieldwork GA sessions ran separate women's and men's groups to try and encourage the women to speak up and share their views. During the sessions in Letaopam and Ikurup different projects were investigated with the men's and women's groups. This was chosen on the spur of the moment, because the women were more involved in some projects and the men were more involved in others. However, the resulting analysis of each project was incomplete and hence inconclusive.

At the debrief from one of the GAM sessions the male facilitators mentioned that they did not ask the young men what they thought the impact of the project would be on women in the community as they 'knew they would not know'. It is important not to assume what people know and what they do not know. The first task of the GA facilitator is to gather data on these different viewpoints, later they must check it for accuracy. Drawing faulty viewpoints into the open may also present the opportunity for clarification of the facts.

At Ikurup Village the women's group analysed the gender impact of the literacy project. The results gave a lot of detail regarding how the women have benefited in the community and little on how the men have been affected. This is in keeping with the fact that the results were created by a group of women. While men's literacy is higher than that of women in Vanuatu, Ikurup is an isolated community and men's literacy was probably quite low before the project started. Hence the project almost certainly resulted in significant benefits for both men and women. The need to include both men and women is even more pronounced in the HAF. In the Pango Village activity session the lists produced by the men's and women's groups only had two items in common between them. In the Iemsene activity session the women listed three productive activities that were linked to goods sold at the market, the men had not mentioned two of these. This is in keeping with the fact that it is predominantly women who sell goods at the market. Men only sell kava and boys only market green coconuts there.

It is essential to conduct GA with members of both sexes to gain a fuller picture of the project impacts.

Session Timing

Development practitioners need to give communities sufficient warning of GA sessions and negotiate a good time for them.

The Pango Village ladies group were involved in the Presbyterian Church women's week and they left that meeting to attend the HAF session. When they were offered afternoon tea to thank them for their participation, they refused saying that they were fasting for the day. Less people could attend the Iemsene Village HAF session because there were two kastom ceremonies taking place in the village at that time.

Participant Involvement in the Project

It is helpful to check what the involvement of GA participants has been in the project being analysed.

During the GAM session in Beverly Hills it came to light that nearly half of the women's group had had no involvement in the project. Subsequently the group split into two, one group consisted of those who had direct experience of the project, the other group was made up of those who did not. The women who were new to the project explored what impact they felt the project could have on them, their families and community if they got involved.

For participants who were directly involved in the project, understanding whether they acted as project committee members, volunteer community mobilisers or simply beneficiaries is helpful. These different groups will have different experiences of the project and different perspectives. They may also have different interpretations that they want to promote regarding their handiwork.

Language Used

GA participants should be encouraged to use their language of preference. Gender issues are complex and participants are likely to consider them in the greatest depth in the easiest medium for them.

The Letaopam Village women's group chose to do most of their discussion in Bislama, which many of the women had only learned through the literacy project that was being analysed. This may have stifled the discussion, however it did indicate that they had made a lot of progress via the project and they may have been proud to demonstrate these new skills. The men in this village were falling behind on their Bislama skills, hence the women may also have been freer to share in this language without being overheard to the same degree.

Group Size

The ideal group size depends on the confidence and experience of the group members.

At Beverly Hills the big groups seemed to quench the discussion and only the more confident, articulate members replied to questions. At the debrief the staff shared that in their experience very small groups of especially shy participants results in yes/no answers. In addition, if too few participants are involved, the GA may not adequately represent the community.

Participant Diversity

When a project is designed to impact a whole community it is good to engage GA participants who represent the spectrum of diversity of the community (Wilde, 2001:17).

At the Beverly Hills GAM seven women were present but only two ladies said a lot. Both appeared to be in their twenties or early thirties, one was the local literacy trainer and the other had been attending the project awareness raising sessions. Five teenagers were present but said very little and did not look very interested. They may have lacked

the confidence to speak up or may have been unused to being asked their opinion. In addition, the project being analysed was the early childhood development project, which did not immediately relate to the girls lives as they were not married and did not have children of their own.

From this section the critical lesson is including both men and women in the GA sessions, as each have different experiences and perspectives and neither can adequately speak for the other. Other issues were the importance of working with the community to negotiate a time that is suitable for them, checking and taking into account the prior involvement of community members in the project, communicating in the best language for participants, choosing a suitable group size and seeking the opinions of a range of project participants.

Session

The following section looks at practical issues surrounding GA sessions, including taking detailed notes on discussions, visual issues, sufficient time to complete the GA sessions and getting the discussion started.

Detailed Notes on the Discussion

All GA tools need to be backed up by someone taking detailed notes on the session discussion. The researcher forgot to take notes at the Tanna WEEF session and much of the richness of the discussion was lost.

Visual Issues

At the first GA session at Beverly Hills the facilitators used A4 sized copies of the GAM to record people's answers. However using the A4 sheets gave the impression that participants were being asked survey questions. In later GA sessions the matrices were drawn onto flipchart paper so the group could see what was happening.

A1 sheets were used for all the HAF sessions. However, the facilitators ran out of room for the activities matrix during the HAF in Pango Village. At the next HAF on Tanna a

second piece of paper was stuck underneath for additional space. Three lines were drawn for the three categories of activities, however having no lines for each activity made it difficult to see which ticks went with which activity afterwards. At the second HAF the facilitators were instructed to draw a line under each activity the group listed. This made it much easier to process the results.

The first Beverly Hills women's group sat in rows in the church and did not all have eye contact with each other. It is better to arrange GA groups into some sort of circle or semi-circle to aid hearing and sharing with one another.

Sufficient Time to Complete the Gender Analysis

Groups need sufficient time to complete the GA sessions (Feldstein, 1994:172). It may take time for participants to develop confidence just to speak up.

At the Beverly Hills GAM session the young girls group was well behind the other groups, their time was cut short and they did not complete filling out the GAM. There could have been value in extending their session further as the exercise was an opportunity to engage and encourage these young women. They were probably not used to people (especially foreigners and people outside of their community) eliciting and valuing their views.

Getting the Discussion Started

People need time to consider the questions asked and compose their reply. Facilitators need to resist the temptation to keep rephrasing questions to try and get the discussion going. The group should talk more than the facilitator. The facilitator for the Iemsene Village Men's HAF group started with a joke that helped to break the ice.

From this section one can see the importance of taking detailed notes on the discussion surrounding the GA exercises. Development practitioners can aid the GA sessions by considering visual issues, placing the GA matrices on A1 sheets and arranging the group so that all have eye contact. Negotiating a time that suits the community will help

ensure that a representative group from the community are able to attend and give their best during the GA session.

Data Validity

Not all of the information offered by GA participants will be correct or accurate or the full story (Wilde, 2001:17). When contradictory answers emerge this is an opportunity to ask more in-depth questions. Answers should be verified by asking for clarification and/or cross checking with other sources or other methods (Feldstein, 1994:71, Wilde, 2001:18). It is critical to check what people mean so facilitators do not impose their own interpretation.

The first section of this chapter overviewed general learnings regarding GA processes. Practical issues regarding facilitators, participants and sessions can enhance or detract from GA sessions and the results generated and need to be considered when development practitioners plan and run sessions.

Women's Equality and Empowerment Framework Lessons

The following section outlines the WEEF process lessons. The first section compares the claims of the WEEF author with the fieldwork experience. This is followed by learnings in the areas of difficult concepts, facilitation issues and collecting sufficient information. The final section considers the potential of the WEEF to empower participants.

Women's Equality and Empowerment Framework Aims

March (1999:92) reported that the aims of the WEEF included helping development practitioners to question what women's empowerment meant in practice and critically assessing to what extent a project or programme was supporting that empowerment. The WEEF was a great help in identifying what women's empowerment meant in practice; each level of empowerment was clearly explained in the instructions. The WEEF of the WVV Country Programme visibly showed the degree to which each project was supporting women's empowerment and gave an overall summary of the country programme commitment to empowerment and what remained to be done.

The WEEF should not be confused with an organisational GA. The tool did not examine WVV and missed the fact that women were being discriminated against in employment at the project management level.

Difficult Concepts

The WEEF looked at more than one level of empowerment and thoroughly described each level. The empowerment categories looked daunting to teach and apply, but once underway people became familiar with the terms and concepts and applied them appropriately. The explanation for each category of empowerment had a range of examples in it, which aided understanding of the concepts, but could lead to giving out ticks too freely.

Initially the researcher gave everyone zeros for not including women's issues in the project objectives. Then they realised that including women's issues did not necessarily mean that 'women' were mentioned in the wording. They had to go back and redo this category for a number of projects.

Facilitation Issues

The researcher used group sessions to fill out the WEEF. There was limited discussion as it was mainly the project managers who provided the information and defended their project. It was uncomfortable for the individuals assessing their project in front of the group, however it did elevate the importance of gender and people were held accountable for gender issues in their projects. Participants reported that they enjoyed learning about the wider country programme and there was some cross fertilisation of ideas.

Everyone was on board with gender issues and wanted a good report. It was hard to give out zeros for good projects that helped women, but their project objectives did not explicitly deal with women's issues.

Collecting Sufficient Information

The WVV Country Programme included one programme (Tafea Community Development Programme), which consisted of projects on pre-school education, health care, water supply and community development. The WEEF analysed the programme as a whole rather than analysing the four projects within it. It would have been more beneficial to analyse the whole country programme at the project level to avoid a further loss of detail and promote learning about the Tafea CDP.

The researcher ran the WEEF sessions unaided. They took some notes on the first session, but none were recorded at the second session. Detailed notes on the WEEF session discussion are an important supplement to the information displayed in the WEEF.

The above section overviewed the WEEF process results. While the WEEF concepts look difficult they are accompanied by clear instructions and are reasonable to apply in practise. The use of group sessions was difficult for project managers defending their projects, but did elevate gender and held people accountable for dealing with gender issues. Like the other GA tools, collecting sufficient information using a second facilitator to take detailed discussion notes would have been helpful.

Women's Equality and Empowerment Framework Empowerment Potential

Miller and Razavi (1998:28) reported that the WEEF encouraged a 'bottom up' approach to planning. This was true in the respect that the WEEF focussed on and hence encouraged empowerment¹⁰⁶.

March (1999:99) reported that the WEEF strengthened the translation of a commitment to women's empowerment into actual plans and policy. The WEEF could lead to this, however just completing the WEEF does not mean that the findings will be put into practise.

¹⁰⁶ It is interesting that Longwe came up with a GA tool for development workers to use, rather than a GA tool to use with communities (such as the GAM), which were empowering in their execution.

March (1999:99) reported that the WEEF was strongly ideological and development meant overcoming women's inequality compared to men in every respect. This point leads one to question whether the WEEF really is a GAD tool, as there are occasions where some men are more disadvantaged than women. Development practitioners should not assume that any particular group is disempowered. Their GA tools should help them to discover which groups are disempowered and how they can assist.

In conclusion, the WEEF framework gave a good visual overview of how WVV were attempting to empower women and deal with gender inequality. The WEEF provided a good way of doing a review without drowning in detail and taking up copious amounts of time and resources. It was not a comprehensive exercise, but it was a good place to start.

Gender Analysis Matrix Lessons

The following section outlines the GAM process lessons. The first section compares the claims of the GAM author with the fieldwork experience. This is followed by learnings in the areas of facilitation skills, data validity, interpreting GAM results, variations on the GAM method and general learnings raised by the GAM.

Gender Analysis Matrix Aims and Principles

March (1999:74) reported that the GAM was a community based technique that identified and analysed gender differences and determined the different impact development interventions had on women and men. The GAM forced the community group and facilitators to focus on project impacts and to consider how these impacts differed for men and women. In contrast, the HAF required much reflection to identify the project impacts and then to assess how men were affected differently from women.

March (1999:68) reported that some of the underlying GAM principles included people having all the knowledge they needed to do GA in their own community and only needing technical experts to help as facilitators to get them started. The only information gathered during the GAM tool was that offered by the community

members, hence their knowledge was held in the highest esteem. It would take experienced facilitators to get the community started in their own GA though.

Parker (1993:vi), the GAM author stated:

“Unlike traditional methods of analysis, the Gender Analysis Matrix does not begin with an assessment of the current situation. Rather, it enables the community to articulate a full range of expectations concerning a particular project, so that over time, the likelihood of changes favouring gender equity is increased.”

The GAM got straight to the point, focussing on project impacts and how these impacts differed for men and women. This is very important for development workers with limited time. The community were able to communicate a range of information regarding the project, this was particularly apparent with the Ikurup Village men's GAM on the water project. This point may also help non-gender aware development workers come on board with using the GAM and may also point to the use of the GAM as a general monitoring tool. The researcher was not present in the community long enough to observe whether changes favouring gender equity were increased.

The GAM proved to be a true GAD tool, as it did not just consider women. It helped to identify disadvantaged men in Letaopam Village.

Gender Analysis Matrix Facilitation Issues

The section below overviews facilitation issues related to the GAM, including the experience of facilitators, language and difficult concepts.

Experience of Facilitators

It takes an experienced facilitator to fill out the GAM correctly. Listening to people's comments and identifying the best place to put them under pressure is difficult. When facilitators asked a group one question they often gave the answer for a different

question and the facilitator needed to recognise this and write the answer in the appropriate box.

One of the facilitators for the Letaopam Village GAM reported that when he asked the women's group a question, they would respond with a story. Consequently he had to listen carefully to ensure he got the point.

The Ikurup Village men's comment 'more work done' on the water project looks as if it should go under labour not resources.

Language

The GAM uses a few easy words and is easily translated into different languages. For the second and third GAM sessions the researcher wrote up the GAM in English and then got the staff to add the Bislama and local language translations as well.

Difficult Concepts

The GAM concepts are harder to explain than they look.

For new facilitators it is hard to differentiate between women's, men's, household and community impacts and between impacts on labour, time and culture. Often the same comments end up in multiple boxes.

If an impact only relates to women then it is suitable to place it under 'women'. If an impact relates to a whole family, then it is suitable to just place it under 'household', instead of placing it under 'men', 'women' and 'household'. For example the comment 'wash daily' for the Ikurup Village men's group analysis of the water project could just go under 'household' as both males and females are now washing daily.

The section above demonstrates a range of learnings regarding facilitation issues related to the GAM. The GAM looks simple, but takes an experienced facilitator to get the right information in the right place.

GAM Data Validity

The following section overviews issues regarding GAM data validity. Learnings relate to collecting sufficient detail, checking if comments are relevant to the project and checking for errors.

Collecting Sufficient Detail

Facilitators need to collect enough information, but not too much. Facilitators should not enter every point made on the GAM. They need to try to identify and fill in the relevant impacts alone and make notes on the discussion around those points. Ideally facilitators should have a scribe working with them to write down these more detailed discussion notes so that the flow of the session is not broken.

Collecting some more detail could strengthen the Ikurup Village women's analysis of the literacy project. It would be good to know how participant's time had been affected and whether the project activities took up much of their time.

Culture is very important in Vanuatu and is a very important category to investigate in the GAM. The Ikurup Village women's comments on culture did not appear to address how the literacy project has changed the culture. Their comment 'women cannot talk in front of men' is a general comment about Vanuatu culture.

The Letaopam Village men's group stated that the community had 'enough time' when asked how the primary school activities impacted people. Normally participants give a comment along the lines of '- Time to raise funds for school fees'. However this does not state whether the time commitment is excessive or whether the community can cope with it. It would be best to record the second comment and then take more detailed notes on the discussion regarding the issue.

Is This a Relevant Comment?

When considering the impact of the Letaopam Village pre-school on women's labour, the men noted 'Cook their breakfast, wash them, change them into school clothes and

walk them to pre-school.' However, if the women normally cook the children's breakfast, this does not need to be listed on the GAM. Likewise, if the women normally wash the children everyday, then this is not a project impact. 'Able to do more work while children are in pre-school' is definitely an impact.

The culture notes from the Letaopam Village men's group related to aspects of the communities culture. However, what was needed was the changes in the culture as a result of the project. Men 'spend most time out' and 'women cannot talk in front of men' are general comments about the community, rather than impacts of the project.

The Beverly Hills women's group analysis of the Education Starts At Home Project stated 'men do not help women carry firewood.' This did not appear to be an impact of the project. Becoming aware of the issue may be an indirect project impact or an impact of the GAM session itself.

The Ikurup Village men's group stated that the water project had enabled community members to 'live longer.' This is largely an untested impact at this stage as the water system has been implemented recently. The comment implies more of a positive attitude towards the project and the impacts of the project to date.

Some Errors?

It is easy to write down the wrong impact sign (+, - or ?) during a session. It helps to double-check the plus and minus signs at the end of the GAM activity and ensure that one understands why the community gave each impact, each designation.

The Ikurup Village men's group put a plus next to 'More work [for women] as they do clothes washing and wash the house every day now.' The women's group put a plus next to impact on men's workload, however the men have a higher workload due to filling in for the women while they are at class. For both of these examples one might expect a minus sign due to the heavier workload.

The Ikurup Village men's group put a plus next to 'more time on community work' in regards to the water project and the women's group put a plus next to community

involvement in the literacy project. These could be errors, however there did seem to a sense in which the community enjoyed the opportunity to work together on a project.

The Beverly Hills women's group one recorded 'Father does not take much notice of project.' However this does not appear to agree with the rest of the comments in this GAM. Requesting more information would help to differentiate whether the comment related to an individual or the community in general.

The section above demonstrated the need to collect sufficient detail on the GAM, but not too much. Development practitioners also need to check if comments are relevant to the project being evaluated and check for errors.

Interpreting the Results

+, - and ?

Allocating the +, - and ? signs is the first step in reviewing whether the impacts are desirable or not. This data was missing from the Letaopam Village men's analysis of the primary school.

Final Questions

The final questions help to explore the results. If facilitators omit to reflect on the results then much of the value of the activity is wasted.

It is very easy to forget these questions altogether or discover that the group has started to break up thinking that they have finished the exercise. It would help to write these questions at the bottom of the matrix before starting the session so they are not forgotten.

The final GAM questions helped to explore the results, however the main question seemed to be missing. Development practitioners need to ask 'how should these results impact the design of the project?'

Variations on the Gender Analysis Matrix Method

Trainee facilitators tried or suggested the following variations to the GAM.

Not Filling in the Table

The facilitators for the Beverly Hills men's group tried to innovate by using the GAM to prompt their questions, but wrote notes instead of filling in the matrix. The notes produced deviated considerably from the information required.

Scrapping the matrix altogether is probably counterproductive as it forces participants and facilitators to systematically consider all project impacts. Using the matrix increases the odds that the desired information will be recorded and then reflected upon.

Participants Fill in the Matrix

One of the facilitators for the Beverly Hills young women's group suggested that some of the participants may have preferred to fill out the GAM table themselves instead of discussing it as they had received an education but were too shy to contribute to a discussion.

This sounds like an interesting approach, however experienced project staff do not find it easy to get started filling out the table and no doubt it would be harder again for the youth. Staff could try it with some of the young women, but should still follow it up with a group discussion to check the results and gather more in-depth information via the discussion.

Getting the Discussion Started

A male facilitator started the Letaopam Village women's group discussion by asking one of the women to share their life story from birth to the present and noting down the literacy project impacts on the GAM as they went. This group got started much faster than the men's group.

The section above considered some variations to the standard GAM. Facilitators should really be proficient in carrying out the standard GAM before they deviate significantly from the framework.

General Learnings Raised by the Gender Analysis Matrix

The GAM raised some general learnings in addition to those on gender. The Ikurup Village men's group GAM on the water project revealed general learnings on safe tap locations and the many, diverse benefits of better access to water.

Gender Analysis Matrix Empowerment Potential

Miller and Razavi (1998:29) reported that the GAM shifted the focus of information gathering and analysis away from the development planner to the people who were the subjects of the analysis. Both the researcher and the facilitators were learning to use GA for the first time. Consequently the focus fell to following the GAM instructions and filling out the tables correctly. After dwelling on the results and the process the researcher felt that the resulting GAM was somewhat extractive. Time reflecting on the results with the community was needed to move from collecting information, to considering with the community what it meant for them and what they would like to do about it.

March (1999:68&74) reported that the GAM identified and constructively challenged assumptions about gender roles and helped to raise awareness of women's subordination as a result of unequal gender relations. The GAM appeared to have the potential to identify assumptions regarding gender roles, however the researcher was not sure that this occurred during the fieldwork sessions. The likelihood of this happening would have increased if both the men's and the women's groups did their GAMs on the same project and then a facilitator gathered the groups into a combined group to compare and crosscheck the results. It would probably take a skilled facilitator to constructively challenge assumptions about gender roles. It was not possible to see if the GAM sessions had raised awareness of women's subordination, the communities did not offer any indication that the information on the GAMs was a revelation to them. It would have been good to ask the staff if they had been aware of the issues raised prior

to the GAM being conducted. The GAM needs to be used with communities on an on going basis.

In conclusion, the GAM looks easy but it takes an experienced facilitator to ensure that the information is complete, with no errors and in the right boxes, with only the appropriate comments included. However, even while facilitators are learning they can still discover valuable information with the communities.

Harvard Analytical Framework Lessons

The following section outlines the HAF lessons. The first section compares the claims of the HAF authors with the fieldwork experience. This is followed by learnings concerning facilitation skills, session duration, enjoyment of participants and facilitators, data validity, interpreting HAF results and variations on the HAF method. The last section considers the empowerment potential of the HAF.

Harvard Analytical Framework Aims

March (1999:35) reported that the HAF aims included demonstrating that there was an economic case for allocating resources to women as well as men, helping planners design more efficient projects and improve overall productivity and trying to get more women involved in development projects. The HAF did demonstrate that there was an economic case for allocating resources to women as well as men. The activities matrix highlighted the productive activities undertaken by women, dispelling notions that they were restricted to their homes and housework and pointing to a need for profitable Income Generation Activities. The HAF information could help planners to design more efficient projects and improve overall productivity. However, the inexperienced researcher and facilitators ended up gathering more general information and inaccurate time data that did not assist with these aspirations. Use of the HAF would not automatically lead to the involvement of more women in development projects.

Tool One: Activity Profile

March (1999:32-33) reported that the HAF collected micro-level data at the community and household level, mapped the work and resources of men and women in a

community and highlighted the main differences. The HAF collected excellent micro-level data at the community and household level. Out of all the GA tools, the HAF was the one that project staff reported enjoying collecting the information on the community and felt that they got to know them better by doing it.

March (1999:53) reported that the HAF considered productive and reproductive tasks, but missed out community work. While early HAFs only included the first two categories, 'community management' is easily added to the matrix and the researcher included all three categories for the fieldwork HAFs.

Tool Two: Access and Control Profile

Miller and Razavi (1998:2&5) reported that the HAF framework looked at access to and control over income and resources, highlighting the incentives and constraints under which men and women worked in order to anticipate how projects would impact their productive and reproductive activities as well as the responsibilities of other household members. The HAF gathered some information on men's and women's access and control to different resources and benefits, but more detail was needed to understand the intricacies of the community and the underlying power relations and the means of household and community decision making. These processes tend to be complex.

Miller and Razavi (1998:4) reported that the HAF framework took as its starting point the view that the household was not an undifferentiated unit with a common production and consumption function. Households were seen as systems of resource allocation themselves. This was a helpful starting point, which the HAF results proved to be correct.

Tool Four: Project Cycle Analysis

WVI (2005:87) reported that the HAF addressed the definition of project objectives and assessed how these objectives related to women and men's involvement within a project and the effect of the project on gender. The questions in the fourth HAF tool asked important questions regarding the development organisation. Development

organisations have an important gender impact on the development work they set out to do; yet the GAM and WEEF do not consider this at all.

The questions really focussed exclusively on women rather than gender though. Out of the 17 questions on project implementation, 11 requested the user to consider how the project affected women and two checked that men did not divert resources to their own needs. The remaining four general questions did not specify sex. There was very little consideration of men in these questions, other than as a potential hindrance. The questions really need to be rewritten to explore gender issues rather than exclusively women's issues.

The questions also assumed that women were disadvantaged. The questions would be an excellent aid when women do happen to be the disadvantaged party (and more often than not they are). However the basis of GA is investigating reality and not making such assumptions. The Project Cycle Analysis questions need to be rewritten to reflect this.

Facilitation Issues

The section below overviews facilitation issues related to the HAF, including the experience of facilitators, involvement of men and women, language and difficult concepts.

Experience of Facilitators

While facilitators are learning to use the HAF the first three tools tend to provide general data that is not explicitly focussed on the project. These results are then difficult to use to assess the overall gender impact of the project. It takes an experienced HAF facilitator to guide these tools to explore the data that is most relevant to the project.

While facilitators are learning to guide the influencing factors analysis the answers generated tend to be more general comments rather than insights into what influencing factors led to the gender division of labour and access/control of resources/benefits. It takes an experienced HAF facilitator to draw out these issues.

Involvement of Men and Women

Most of the men's and women's group activity lists only had a few items in common between them. In Iemsene Village only the women listed fetching water and cooking/feeding, which were predominantly female activities and only the men listed house building, which was a male only activity. Consequently it is very important to ask both groups for their input.

Language

The HAF tables were written in English. They would have been more accessible for the community if they had been translated into Bislama.

Difficult Concepts

The final questions look relatively straightforward but they are hard to explain during the actual interview.

One of the questions asked 'What training techniques will be used to develop delivery systems?' It may have been more helpful to ask 'Are the training techniques used suitable for both men and women?'

Another question was 'Is preferential access to resources by males avoided?' However, surely preferential access for underprivileged groups is desirable, rather than ensuring that all men are excluded from gaining preferential access?

The section above demonstrated a range of learnings regarding facilitation issues related to the HAF. While the HAF provides rich data on gender in a short space of time, it takes an experienced facilitator to focus on the areas that are of most importance to the project being evaluated. The need to involve men and women in GA is particularly apparent in the HAF, each group provides the most detail on their own sphere of activity and influence.

Session Duration

The researcher assumed that three visits to the community would be needed to complete the different sessions, however on average the whole HAF took just over an hour with the communities. This is very reasonable for busy development practitioners and community members who put their work aside for the duration of the sessions.

Enjoyment of Participants and Facilitators

The Pango Village community enjoyed doing the HAF so much that they requested the WVV staff to return and do it with a bigger group from the community. One of the men commented that he used to think that only women did housework, but as they filled out the activities tool he realised that both men and women shared the housework. He also used to think that men controlled most things, now he understands that both men and women control some things in Pango. Community members also reported that doing the influencing factors exercise helped them to see opportunities that they had not seen before.

The WVV staff project worker appreciated the opportunity to get to know the Pango community better and build a closer relationship with them. She reported that it would be easier to arrange project activities with them in future as a result.

Data Validity

The following section overviews issues regarding HAF data validity. Learnings relate to collecting sufficient detail and checking for errors.

Collecting Sufficient Detail

Development practitioners should always keep in mind that any summary of data simplifies the details beneath and risks losing important information. For example in Iemsene Village the women's group ticked that women controlled equipment, however during the discussion it was revealed that only women committee members had control over some equipment. Likewise, further examination of the activities such as tourism would probably uncover a greater gender division of labour. For example the women

may dominate cleaning and cooking for the tourists versus a high proportion of men managing the tourist resorts. The HAF tables provide an excellent summary of the project information, however this needs to be supplemented with notes on the discussion surrounding the HAF exercises. Facilitators are recommended to work in pairs, with one leading the session and filling out the HAF tables and the other observing the session and taking notes on the discussion.

In the activities matrix 'Boys' and 'Girls' are very broad categories, potentially extending from babies through to working youth. Facilitators should check how the community define boys versus men and girls versus women¹⁰⁷. Additional columns can also be added as necessary. The Pango Village analysis may have benefited from adding two extra columns to separate children from youth.

The activity lists appeared to be incomplete. For example in Iemsene Village both groups only listed five reproductive activities and the women did not even list childcare. Project staff did not rush the group; hence more time may not have produced better results. The use of supplementary tools may have helped to get a better list. Participant observation, transect walks and getting a group member to describe their typical day would all help to put together a more comprehensive list of the tasks.

The activity table did not indicate what proportion of the community were engaged in each productive activity, hence it was difficult to tell how significant the information given was. This is particularly a problem for Pango Village, which is a semi-urban area with a variety of productive opportunities. Filling out the table as it is may be more useful in communities where people's lives are more uniform, such as isolated rural communities.

The hours per day on the activity profile did not appear to add up. In addition, some activities were done simultaneously such as baby-sitting and cooking and the time columns do not demonstrate this. Some participants calculated time from the beginning to the end of an activity, rather than estimating the actual time they engaged in doing it. For example when the Pango Village men were asked how long it took them to collect

107 In some cultures a person is considered a youth until they are married.

firewood they allowed time to walk from home to the bush and stop and chat on the way. It was also questionable whether the communities concept of time very accurate, as people in most of the communities tended to arrive an hour after agreed times¹⁰⁸. The time and frequency data was required, yet in Iemsene Village the women only filled in a few of the time slots, but filled out most of the frequency cells. The men were the opposite and filled in all the time data, but did not give any details regarding the frequency. Consequently it was difficult to assess women's workloads from the data collected and whether they could reasonably fit in the additional project activities. The data also did not indicate when project activities were best run. The time data would be more accurate and more useful if it was collected using a 24-hour clock or calendar exercise.

The men in Iemsene Village listed 'community hall', 'committee', 'chief' and 'literacy school' under community management activities. It would be helpful to get some information regarding exactly what they meant by each of these activities. Likewise, 'Yes' is not enough when filling out the influencing factors table. Facilitators need to understand why the group stated that something was an opportunity or a constraint and reflect this in their notes.

For the fourth tool on the Pango Village Education Starts At Home Project the researcher only interviewed one of the project facilitators. Interviewing a group would have helped to verify the information and tap into a wider range of experience and perspectives. Interviewing alone had the benefit of having more freedom to share. Utilising both individual and group interviews would be beneficial.

Checking for Errors

All of the lists and data sets provided by the men's and women's groups conflicted in some way and needed to be crosschecked. In addition it is very easy for facilitators to make mistakes with the HAF and confuse columns or forget to tick something or put activities under the wrong category.

108 And sometimes with the help of someone going to their home to hurry them up!

Examples included:

- The Pango Village men reported spending three hours on church activities and two hours on sports a day. This sounded a bit high¹⁰⁹.
- The Iemsene Village women listed house building under community management activities. If the community volunteer their time to one another and build the houses in the village as a team, then it would be appropriate to place this activity under community management. If individual families build their own homes it should have been placed under reproductive activities.
- The Iemsene Village men's productive activity list may contain reproductive activities. Gardening, breakfast preparation and school are only productive activities if you are selling the crop from the garden, selling breakfast food for a profit and acting as the schoolteacher for a wage.

When processing the results the HAF presents a very real temptation to tick the boxes for people. It is very easy to think 'Surely they forgot to tick this' or 'Maybe they got confused at this point.' Questionnaires may have the upper hand here, as one cannot quote something that people did not say. Somehow it seems much less dishonest to tick a box 'on someone's behalf'. Facilitators must check before adding or amending any information generated during the HAF exercises. Incomplete, honest data is useful, complete, tampered-with data is a liability.

The above section overviewed issues regarding HAF data validity. Facilitators are best to work in pairs with one leading the session and filling in the tables and the other writing detailed notes on the discussion. Supplementary use of PLA tools can also help to gather more accurate information. The HAF system of tables is easy to make mistakes on and then the temptation is to 'correct them'. Development practitioners need to carefully check the results and never make changes without consulting the community.

Interpreting the Results

The HAF results give a snap shot in time and do not differentiate project impacts from general information on the community. For example, the Pango Village Education

¹⁰⁹ Maybe it should have been per week.

Starts At Home Project had been running for a year and the HAF results showed that the men were involved in childcare (one of the aims of the project). However, the results did not differentiate what the project had changed, hence men may have always been involved in childcare in this particular community. Determining this information using the HAF would have required doing the HAF before and after the project. Alternatively facilitators could specifically ask the participants how the project has changed the gender division of labour after each tool is completed. However such a question would not gel well with the overall HAF approach of systematic data collection.

Variations on the Harvard Analytical Framework Method

Facilitators started the activities session with the three categories of activities listed (productive, reproductive and community management activities) and then asked the community to list the activities. Writing some example activities under each category might help the community understand what information was being requested and help to get them started on the activity.

More rows could be added to the access and control table to allow for sub-categories and the collection of more in-depth information.

Some of the HAF concepts can be difficult to explain, particularly with the influencing factors table. One facilitator contextualised them, when asking about who had access to basic needs he asked 'if I gave the family one mattress, who gets the mattress?'. One danger with this approach is that it could limit the reply to that particular example.

Some HAF facilitators use PLA tools to gather the community information (Percy, 1999:401) and then use the HAF tables to provide a summary of the information. For example some use the 24-hour clock to understand how people use their time. The use of such tools would significantly help to improve the information collected, but would require more time.

Harvard Analytical Framework Empowerment Potential

The HAF has been labelled as an 'efficiency approach' and charged with omitting to challenge gender relations (INSTRAW, 2004, March, 1999:49&51). However, tools that are said to be empowering, like the GAM, do not automatically challenge gender relations, such an action would require reflecting on the GA results with the community and helping them to make positive changes. This could also be done with the HAF. When the HAF matrices are compiled with the community, they highlight aspects of gender inequality and facilitators could work with the community to address them.

INSTRAW (2004) reported that the HAF was too focussed on the household, with little analysis of the institutions that perpetuate gender inequality. While this is true, neither the GAM nor the WEEF do this either. One of the strengths of these frameworks is that they are accessible for time pressured development workers. It is better to get timely information, relevant to the project and do something with it, than do a comprehensive review, drowning in detail and be left with no time, resources or enthusiasm to do anything with the findings.

Ironically, despite all the claims that the WEEF and GAM empower communities and the HAF does not, the HAF sessions were the only fieldwork sessions in which community members indicated that they had been empowered in some way. The Pango ladies group were very impressed with activities they did, displayed on their matrices. They requested that the project staff run another session so their husbands could appreciate all that they did too. In addition, one of the male Pango participants reported that the sharing of activities and control revealed in the HAF was a revelation to him.

In conclusion, the HAF is a good place to start learning about gender in a community. The tool systematically collects a lot of data on a community in a short space of time. It dispels myths about who does what, challenges assumptions about the balance of power in the community and compels one to ask more questions. The HAF could be a good tool to use during project identification and design as it helps development practitioners to understand how the community has been operating and what their needs are.

Chapter Seven: Conclusion

This research thesis critically examined development project GA frameworks, trialing them with WVV staff and project communities. This final chapter compiles the main points from the preceding results and discussion chapters under each GA framework, followed by general comments on the process of conducting GA. The final section presents some ideas regarding future research in the area of GA.

The research findings confirmed earlier literature reports regarding project GA and added weight to claims that no GA tool can replace the need for gender sensitive practitioners. The thesis also covered a number of practical tips to help development practitioners facilitate GA sessions.

Women's Equality and Empowerment Framework

The WEEF demonstrated that WVV have a strong concern for women's issues and are encouraging women's empowerment. The WVV country programme could be improved by engaging in more conscientisation around gender issues. In addition, literature on Vanuatu and interviews with ni-Vanuatu indicate that domestic violence is a major gender concern in this country. WVV should consider engaging with this issue.

The WEEF provides an excellent visual overview of programmes. The tool was a great help in identifying what women's empowerment meant in practice; the instructions clearly explained each level. The WEEF can provide a timely overview when reviewing the overall programme of development agencies that work in areas where women have been proven to be disadvantaged.

The WEEF does not consider men's needs and issues, whereas the GAM brought to light a situation where ni-Vanuatu men were more disadvantaged than the women. The WEEF is not a complete GAD tool; it should be used as part of a gender toolkit.

Harvard Analytical Framework

The Harvard Analytical Framework collected rich data on men and women in the communities, helping project staff to get to know the communities better. It also questioned the effectiveness of the development organisation in dealing with gender issues, WVV need to provide equal opportunities for women at the project management level.

The HAF was the only fieldwork tool that resulted in the community expressing signs of empowerment. One of the ladies groups were so excited by their activities profile that they wanted their husbands to attend a session so they could appreciate all that their wives did too. The HAF could be particularly helpful at the beginning of a WV Area Development Programme. The tool could help project staff to get to know a new community and explore their needs.

HAF users need to really stop and reflect on the results to consider how they will impact the project. Filling out the HAF tables as is can result in incomplete, inaccurate data. PLA techniques would help to gather the activities information and could also help combat claims that the framework is extractive. The project cycle analysis questionnaire needs to be rewritten to explore gender issues rather than women's issues.

Gender Analysis Matrix

The GAM clearly showed project impacts for both men and women. One of the literacy projects had greatly benefited women, but could be improved by running separate classes for the men. The findings from the research GAMs with single sex groups were inconclusive, staff need to complete the exercise by conducting the GAM with the opposite gender.

The GAM focuses on project impacts; users do not have to process the results further to assess how the project will impact the community. The tool appears to be an excellent monitoring aid to provide timely and ongoing information. The GAM results are not restricted to gender issues; the framework shows potential as a general monitoring tool.

The inexperienced researcher and facilitators omitted to reflect on the results with the community; hence the group participants did not have the chance to consider what it meant for them and what they would like to do about it. The resulting exercise was somewhat extractive in nature and the empowerment potential of the tool was curtailed.

Gender Analysis Process

Experienced facilitators are needed to get the most out of the frameworks, however anyone can greatly benefit from utilising these tools. The tools work best when facilitators work in pairs, with one asking the questions and filling in the matrices and the other taking detailed notes on the discussion surrounding the exercise.

No GA framework can replace an awareness of gender issues and the will to work towards a fairer society. GA frameworks that are designed to empower the participants can deliberately or inadvertently be used in an extractive way, while frameworks that are labelled as extractive can be used creatively to empower those who take part. In addition, the results of the most empowering GA session can be ‘left on the shelf’ and never implemented.

GA sessions provide rich data on gender in a relatively short period of time. While they risk not collecting enough information, the systematic collection and use of some information should help move development work forward.

Future Research

Aid and development institutions should periodically engage in organisational GA and take action to implement fairer gender relations in their own establishment. Such activities would analyse why gender relations are unequal and to what degree, both within their organisation and in the society in which they are operating. Areas to examine include:

- What gender relationships inflect the organisation’s values, objectives and policy?
- How are they embodied in its practice?
- What is the external historical, political, economic, social and cultural context in which gender interventions are being made?

- What is the history and culture of the organisation and of gender within it?
- What are the priorities and power of men and women in the organisation?
(MacDonald, 1999:82)

In addition, there is an ongoing need for in-depth GA of the different institutions (households, communities, markets, states and civil society organisations and so on) that reproduce gender hierarchies. Such research challenges enduring assumptions, leads to better understanding of the core issues behind underdevelopment and improves approaches to providing assistance. Researchers should continue to probe at length and share their findings with the wider development community.

While development workers should be informed by and act on the researchers findings, gathering this level of detail is neither practical nor desirable for development practitioners. They are better to consistently and systematically utilise the faster and more accessible project GA frameworks, despite their failings. Users should be aware of the critiques of each GA tool, take action to minimise these issues and take them into account when analysing the results.

Future research could investigate to what degree project GA frameworks are used and the findings implemented in development work. There is little point in perfecting these tools if few are using or acting on them, such energy could be better invested in promoting their use.

APPENDIX I: Gender Analysis Framework Instructions

The following instructions are taken from ‘A Guide to Gender-Analysis Frameworks,’ published by Oxfam in 1999, unless otherwise referenced.

Women’s Equality and Empowerment Framework

The table below shows a sample WEEF grid for a country programme.

Table A1.1 Women’s Equality and Empowerment Framework

Sector	Project	Level of Equality					Recognition of women’s issues
		Welfare	Access	Conscientisation	Participation	Control	

The table below outlines each ‘level of equality.’

Table A1.2 Women’s Empowerment Framework Categories

Level	Explanation	Examples
Welfare	The level of material welfare of women, relative to men.	Equal access to food supply, income and medical care.
Access	Women’s access to the factors of production on an equal basis with men.	Equal access to land, labour, credit, training, marketing facilities and all publicly available services and benefits.
Conscientisation	Women and men understand gender issues and are aware of the detrimental impacts of such issues.	Understanding that gender roles are culturally determined and can be changed. Belief that the sexual division of labour should be fair and agreeable to both sides.
Participation	Involving the women affected by the decisions taken and involving them in the same proportion in decision making as their proportion in the community.	Women’s involvement in needs assessment, project formulation, implementation and evaluation. Women’s participation in the processes of policy making, planning and administration.
Control	Utilisation of women’s participation, through conscientisation and mobilisation, to achieve equality of control over the factors of production and equality of control over the distribution of benefits.	Equality of control means a balance of control between men and women, so that neither side is put into a position of dominance or subordination.

The levels of recognition of ‘women’s issues’ are explained in the table below.

Table A1.3 Levels of Recognition of Women's Issues in Project Design

Level	Definition	Implications
Negative (-)	Project objectives make no mention of women's issues.	Experience has shown that women are very likely to be left worse off by such a project.
Neutral (0)	The conservative level, project objectives recognise women's issues.	Concerns remain that the project intervention does not leave women worse off than before.
Positive (+)	Project objectives are positively concerned with women's issues.	Project aims to improve the position of women relative to men.

The 'levels of recognition' identify the extent to which project objectives are concerned with women's development. The degree to which the project is defined as potentially empowering women is characterised by the extent to which it addresses women's issues. 'Women's issues' are defined as all issues concerned with women's equality in any social or economic role and involving any of the levels of equality (welfare, access, conscientisation, participation, control). An issue becomes a 'women's issue' when it looks at the relationship between men and women, rather than simply at women's traditional and subordinate sex-stereotyped gender roles.

Session participants systematically discuss each project within the country portfolio and decide which levels of equality and what level of recognition each project has.

Gender Analysis Matrix

The table below shows the basic GAM Matrix

Table A1.4 Gender Analysis Matrix

	Labour	Time	Resources	Culture
Women				
Men				
Household				
Community				

The table below explains the four different 'levels' of society used in the analysis.

Table A1.5 Explanation of the ‘Levels’ of Society

Women	Women of all ages who were involved in the WVV project.
Men	Men of all ages who were involved in the WVV project.
Household	Each community should be asked how they define a household and this definition should be used for this level of analysis. In general a household is defined as all women, men and children living together, even if they are not part of one nuclear family.
Community	Everyone within the project area.

When different groups exist within the project area, additional rows for each group of men and women can be added to the matrix.

The GAM Matrix is filled in by considering the project driven changes in the lives of participants. The table below explains the four kinds of impact that need to be analysed.

Table A1.6 Gender Analysis Matrix: Four Kinds of Impact

Impact	Sub-impact	Example
Labour	Tasks Level of skill Labour capacity	Did the project lead to participants taking on new tasks or dropping old ones? Did the project result in participants requiring: Less skill? More skills? Training? Formal education? Has the project increased or decreased the number of people required to carry out particular tasks now? Has the intervention increased or decreased how much participants can do? Is hired labour needed now?
Time	Time it takes to carry out a task	Is it faster or slower to carry out the task impacted by the project?
Resources	Access to resources Control over resources	Has the project increased or decreased: -Incomes -Access to land -Access to credit For any of the groups in the target area? Has the project increased or decreased: -Control over income -Control over land -Control over credit For any of the groups in the target area?
Socio-cultural factors	Gender roles Status Other	Has the project impacted gender roles in the target communities? Has the project affected the status of any group in the community? Has the project helped to continue and/or expand existing social networks? Have there been any other changes in social aspects of the community or groups within the community as a result of the project?

When a group finish filling in the GAM Matrix they analyse the results by debating the following questions:

- Are the effects listed on the GAM desirable? Are they consistent with the programme's goals?
- How is the intervention affecting those who do not participate?
- Which results are unexpected? (These will appear on GAMs filled in during and after implementation)

Last of all the group add a +, - or ? next to each entry in the GAM matrix.

- + Indicates that the outcome is consistent with the project goals.
- Indicates that the outcome is contrary with the project goals.

- ? Indicates that participants are unsure as to whether the outcome is consistent or contrary to the project goals.

The GAM matrix should be reviewed and revised once a month for the first three months and once every three months thereafter. Every box should be verified on each review of the GAM and the discussion questions repeated. Over time, community members learn to facilitate the process themselves.

At the planning stage the group considers whether the potential gender effects are desirable, at the design stage they question whether gender considerations should change the design of the project. At the monitoring and evaluation stages the group investigate and address the broader programme impacts.

Harvard Analytical Framework

The HAF consists of four different sections, an activity profile, an access and control profile, an influencing factors profile and a checklist.

The table below shows the basic outline of the activity profile.

Table A1.7 Harvard Tool 1: Activity Profile

Activities	Women/girls	Men/boys
Productive Activities Agriculture: Activity 1 Activity 2, etc Income generating: Activity 1 Activity 2, etc Employment: Activity 1 Activity 2, etc Other:		
Reproductive Activities Water related: Activity 1 Activity 2, etc Fuel related: Food preparation: Childcare: Health related: Cleaning and repair: Market related: Other:		

Tool one differentiates who undertakes the different activities in the project area by age and gender. Differentiating by ethnicity, social class or other important distinguishing characteristics can be accomplished by adding additional columns (WVI, 2005:87).

Reproductive activities are those activities carried out to produce and care for family members. They might include fuel and water collection, food preparation, birthing, childcare, education, health care and laundry. These activities are often viewed as non-economic (Rao, 1991:12).

Columns can also be added to indicate the amount of time for each task, the frequency with which it is performed and where the activity is performed. Identifying where the activity is performed will help give an indication of people's mobility. This carries implications for project delivery systems (WVI, 2005:89).

The group starts the activity profile by listing the different tasks engaged in by people in the community. They need to differentiate between generations to determine the input of each age group. This is important because most projects are not targeted at homogeneous population groups. The gender-based division of labour as well as the access to and control over resources and benefits are likely to differ, often quite substantially, according to socio-economic class or ethnic affiliation. Therefore, it is essential to develop the activity profiles separately for each of the distinct population groups to whom the project is targeted (Rao, 1991:13).

The group should collect the most detail on the areas most directly associated with a project. For example, if the project concerns a new agricultural production technology, then the gender division of labour for each agricultural productive activity should be delineated, for example, land clearance, preparation, seeding, weeding and processing (Rao, 1991:12).

The second HAF tool is the access and control profile. The table below shows the basic layout of this matrix.

Table A1.8 Harvard Tool 2: Access and Control Profile

	Access		Control	
	Women	Men	Women	Men
Resources - Land - Equipment - Labour - Cash - Education/training, etc - Other				
Benefits - Outside income - Asset ownership - Basic needs (food, clothing, shelter etc) - Education - Political power/prestige - Other				

Users list what resources people use to carry out the tasks identified in the activity profile. Then they investigate who has access to and control over resources and benefits in the community.

The flow of resources and benefits is a fundamental concept in the analysis of how projects will affect and be affected by women. It is very important to differentiate between access and control, access to resources does not necessarily imply the power to control them. To control a situation is to impose one's own definition upon the other actors in that situation. It is important to differentiate between access and control over the use of resources and access to and control over the benefits derived from the mobilisation of resources. Even where women have unrestrained use of resources, they are not always able to realise the gains from their use (Rao, 1991:13).

The third HAF tool considers the influencing factors affecting the first two tools. It charts factors, which influence the differences in the gender division of labour, access and control as listed in tools one and two. The table below shows the basic layout of this matrix.

Table A1.9 Harvard Tool 3: Influencing Factors

Influencing factors	Constraints	Opportunities
Community norms and social hierarchy Demographic factors Institutional structures Economic factors Political factors Legal parameters Training Attitude of community to development workers		

Community norms and social hierarchies include family or community forms, cultural practices and religious beliefs. Institutional structures include the nature of government bureaucracies and arrangements for the generation and dissemination of knowledge, skills and technology. General economic conditions include poverty levels, inflation rates, income distribution, international terms of trade, infrastructure.

The reason for specifying these determining factors is to identify which can facilitate or constrain a project. Determining factors include all those factors that shape gender relations and determine different opportunities and constraints for men and women (Rao, 1991:14). The influencing factors tool helps development workers to anticipate what inputs will be needed to make the intervention successful from a gender perspective (March, 1999:35)

Some factors, if not most, will not be amenable to change by a project. Therefore, the task for project design and implementation is to assess the above factors in terms of whether and how they will have an effect on or be affected by a project. It is also important to identify the exogenous trends or dynamic forces that are already affecting change on what men and women actually do. Projects are not implemented and carried out within the static environment implied by the activity and access and control profiles. Dynamic forces (political, social, environmental or physical) can either enhance the accomplishment of a project's objectives or seriously impede it (Rao, 1991:14).

The fourth and final HAF tool is a questionnaire that considers the gender impact of the implementing organisation on the project. The project cycle analysis asks which activities the project will affect and how issues of access and control relate to these activities. This analysis helps development practitioners to pinpoint areas of a project that must be adjusted to achieve the desired outcomes. The questionnaire includes key questions and categories to be examined in four distinct stages of project development: project identification, design, implementation and evaluation (WVI, 2005:87&98).

Project stage Gender issues to be considered:

- | | |
|----------------|---|
| Identification | <ul style="list-style-type: none">– Project clientele.– Defining project objectives.– Identifying opportunities and/or constraints of men's and women's project involvement (WVI, 2005:98). |
| Design | <ul style="list-style-type: none">– Impact on women's and men's activities.– Access and control of resources and benefits. |

Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gender relationships in the project area. • Project personnel. • Organisational structure. • Operations. • Logistics.
Evaluation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Data requirements for evaluating the projects effects on gender.

The table below provides the questions for project implementation

Table A1.10 Harvard Tool 4: Women's Dimension in Project Implementation Checklist

<p>Personnel</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Are project personnel aware of and sympathetic towards women's needs? 2. Are women used to deliver the goods or services to women beneficiaries? 3. Do personnel have the necessary skills to provide any special inputs required by women? 4. What training techniques will be used to develop delivery systems? 5. Are there appropriate opportunities for women to participate in project management positions? <p>Organisational structures</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Does the organisational form enhance women's access to resources? – Does the organisation have adequate power to obtain resources needed by women from other organisations? – Does the organisation have the institutional capability to support and protect women during the change process? <p>Operations and logistics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Are the organisation's delivery channels accessible to women in terms of personnel, location and timing? – Do control procedures exist to ensure dependable delivery of the goods and services? – Are there mechanisms to ensure that the project resources or benefits are not usurped by males? <p>Finances</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Do funding mechanisms exist to ensure programme continuity? 2. Are funding levels adequate for proposed tasks? 3. Is preferential access to resources by males avoided?
--

4. Is it possible to trace funds for women from allocation to delivery with a fair degree of accuracy?

Flexibility

- Does the project have a management information system which will allow it to detect the effect of the operation on women?
- Does the organisation have enough flexibility to adapt its structures and operations to meet the changing or new found situations of women?

Participants consider which activities the project will affect and how the issues of access and control relate to those activities. The factors that determine who undertakes particular activities and with what access and control are critical because they act as mediators for the project's effects on women. The analysis helps pinpoint areas of a project that have to be adjusted in order to achieve the desired outcome (Rao, 1991:15).

At the project identification stage, questions that relate to women as project clientele need to be addressed. This includes defining project objectives in terms of women, identifying the opportunities and/or constraints for women's project involvement, and finally, identifying possible negative effects on women. In the design stage of the project, questions related to the impact of women's activities and access and control of resources and benefits need to be raised. For project implementation, questions regarding the relationship of women in the project area to project personnel, organisational structures, operations and logistics need to be considered. Finally, data requirements for evaluating the project's effects of women must be addressed (Rao, 1991:15).

APPENDIX II: Schedule in Vanuatu

Mon	Tues	Wed	Thurs	Fri	Sat	Sun
					29 Jul	30
					Arrived in Vanuatu	
31 July	1 August	2	3	4	5	6
Public holiday	GAD training with Efate and northern-based WVV staff	Training on introduction to GAs, empowerment theory, WEEF WEEF – WVV northern and Efate Programme	Training on GAM theory GAM - Beverly Hills Village	Debrief - Beverly Hills GAM GAM/WEEF SWOT analysis		
7	8	9	10	11	12	13
	HAF training	HAF - Pango Village	HAF – SWOT analysis			
14	15	16	17	18	19	20
Travelled to Tanna Island	Training for Tanna WVV staff on GAD, introduction to GAs and GAM theory	GAM - Letaopam Village Training on empowerment theory and WEEF WEEF – WVV Tanna Programme WEEF SWOT	GAM - Ikurup Village GAM SWOT HAF training HAF Project Analysis - Ikurup project	HAF - Iemsene Village HAF SWOT Finished GAD training	Returned to Efate Island	
21	22	23	24	25	26	
HAF Project Analysis - Pango Village project		Returned to New Zealand				

APPENDIX III: Participant Information Sheets and Participant Consent Forms in English and Bislama

A Critical Exploration of Gender Analysis:
Exploring the Value and Practice of Gender Analysis Through Engaging in Gender Analysis with Communities and Development Staff in Vanuatu.

INFORMATION SHEET

Researcher Introduction

Researcher		Supervisor	
Name:	Joanna Holmes	Name:	Dr Regina Scheyvens
Contact details:	Private Bag 92078, Auckland, New Zealand Joanna.holmes@worldvision.org.nz	Contact details:	School of People, Environment and Planning, Massey University, Private Bag 11-222, Palmerston North, New Zealand r.a.scheyvens@massey.ac.nz
Employment:	Programme Support Officer at World Vision New Zealand		
Name of degree:	Master of Philosophy in Development		

There is wide recognition around the world that in order for communities to rise above poverty, development interventions need to be sensitive to gender issues. Gender and Development (GAD) tries to help men and women, boys and girls find better ways to treat each other and work together. GAD is based on the findings of Gender Analysis (GA). GA asks: Who does what in this community? Who has the resources in this community? Who decides this? How do they decide this? Who gains from the way things are? Who loses from the way things are?

This research thesis looks at some of the different ways GA is carried out in order to ascertain its effectiveness. The researcher will conduct GA exercises with members of both development organisations and communities in order to explore both the strengths and weaknesses of these exercises.

The GA exercises will benefit participants by helping them think about how everyone treats each other in their family and community. It will also be of value in helping development workers think about how they can do their work better and help more people.

Participant Recruitment

Community members who have been involved in World Vision Vanuatu (WVV) project/programme work will be invited to take part in the GA exercises. Group sizes need to be big enough to encourage discussion and small enough not to get out of hand. Ideally groups will involve 10-20 participants in each. The GA groups need to include equal numbers of men and women in order to try and fairly represent the position of

both. Participants will be thanked by sharing a light afternoon or morning tea together during the GA sessions. There should not be any significant discomforts or risks to participants as a result of participation in this research project.

Project Procedures

The completed GA frameworks will be used by the researcher to consider the effectiveness of GA and especially, can organisations such as WV implement GA in better ways? Copies of the GA frameworks will be made for the communities and WVV. WVV staff will store their copies in the project files. The originals will be left with the Vanuatu Cultural Centre (VCC). The VCC will dispose of the originals in the years to come as they see fit. GA tools enable communities to compile and analyse their own results. Consequently the community will have immediate access to their results. A summary of the overall findings of the thesis will be provided to WVV staff in January 2008 (the researcher is completing all the work over two years) and they will distribute this information to the communities involved.

Participant Involvement

The researcher will endeavour to meet with participants at the best time and place for them.

Emaemsine, Letaopam, Ikurup and Freswota Villages

The Emaemsine, Letaopam, Ikurup and Freswota Villages are invited to take part in a Gender Analysis Matrix (GAM) in their community. The GAM is a community based technique for identifying and analysing gender differences to determine the different impact development interventions have on women and men.

Mele Village Participants

Mele Village members are invited to take part in a Harvard Analytical Framework (HAF) GA. The framework involves mapping the work and resources of men and women in the community and highlighting the main differences. The HAF takes approximately one and a half days in total to complete. If participants are unable to gather for one and a half days the activities will be spread over time.

WVV Staff

WVV staff are invited to carry out a Women's Equality and Empowerment Framework (WEEF) GA. This framework will help staff to question what women's empowerment means in practice and to critically assess to what extent the country programme is supporting that empowerment. The WEEF should take half a day.

Participant's Rights

You are under no obligation to accept this invitation. If you decide to participate, you have the right to:

- Decline to answer any particular question;
- Withdraw from the study during the month of the research;
- Ask any questions about the study at any time during participation;
- Provide information on the understanding that your name will not be used unless you give permission to the researcher;

- Be given access to a summary of the project findings when it is concluded.

Project Contacts

Participants are welcome to contact the researcher and/or their supervisor if they have any questions about the project.

Low Risk Notification

“This project has been evaluated by peer review and judged to be low risk. Consequently, it has not been reviewed by one of the University’s Human Ethics Committees. The researcher named above is responsible for the ethical conduct of this research.

If you have any concerns about the conduct of this research that you wish to raise with someone other than the researcher, please contact Professor Sylvia Rumball, Assistant to the Vice-Chancellor (Ethics & Equity), telephone 06 350 5249, e-mail humanethicsouthb@massey.ac.nz”.

Lukluk long fasin blong stadiem jenda:
*Lukluk long valiu mo fasin blong stadiem jenda tru long samfala eksesaes blong
 stadiem jenda wetem ol komiuniti mo dvelopmen staf long Vanuatu.*

OL INFOMESEN STADI

Riseja	Supavaesa
Nem: Joanna Holmes	Nem: Dr Regina Scheyvens
Kontak: Private Bag 92078, Auckland, New Zealand Joanna.holmes@worldvision.org.nz	Kontak: School of People, Environment and Planning, Massey University, Private Bag 11-222, Palmerston North, New Zealand r.a.scheyvens@massey.ac.nz
Wok Programme Support Officer at blong World Vision New Zealand	
hem: Nem Master of Philosophy blong in Development	
digri:	

Jenda i minim ol wok we ol man mo woman, ol boe mo gel, oli save mekem long komiuniti blong olgeta mo wanem janis oli gat olsem man, woman, boe o gel, long laef blong olgeta. Sem taem tu jenda i lukluk long ol rilesen bitwin ol man mo woman insaed long kalja blong olgeta.

Truaot long wol tede i gat bigfala save se ol dvelopmen projek oli mas tingting hevi long jenda sapos oli wantem se ol komiuniti oli ronem poveti. Jenda mo Dvelopmen (long Inglis: Gender and Development – GAD) i traem blong givhan long ol man mo woman, ol boe mo gel blong lukaotem ol gudfala wei blong stap tugeta mo wok tugeta. GAD hem i bes long ol faending blong fasin blong stadiem jenda (long Inglis: Gender Analysis – GA). Fasin blong stadiem jenda I askem ol kwestin olsem: Hu nao i mekem wanem long komiuniti ia? Hu nao i holem ol risos long komiuniti ia? Hu nao i mekem ol disisen long saed blong ol risos ia? Oli mekem ol disesen olsem wanem? Hu nao i win long sistem ia? Hu nao i stap lus long sistem ia?

Risej ia i lukluk long sam long ol difren wok blong GA blong luk save sapos i wok gud o no. Riseja bae i mekem sam eksesaes long saed blong GA wetem ol memba blong ol dvelopmen organaesesen mo ol komiuniti blong faenemaot ol gud mo nogud samting insaed long ol eksesaes.

Ol patisipen bae oli gat moa save tru long ol GA eksesaes mo bae oli save tingbaot hao nao ol pipol oli stap liv wetem ol narafala memba blong famle mo komiuniti. Sem taem tu ol eksesaes bae oli givnan long ol dvelopmen woka blong tingbaot hao oli save leftistmap wok blong olgeta blong givhan long fulap moa man mo woman.

Hu nao ol patispen?

Ol memba blong komiuniti we oli bin wok wetem sam projek mo program blong Wol Visen Vanuatu (WVV) bae oli gat invitesen blong tek pat long ol GA eksesaes. Ol saes blong ol grup bae oli bigwan smol blong enkarajem toktok, be bae ol grup oli no bigwan tumas blong mekem toktok i had. I gud sapos i gat 10 o 20 patisipen long wanwan grup.

Insaed long ol GA grup ol namba blong ol man mo woman oli mas semak blong mekem sua se I gat gudfala reprisentesen blong tingting blong tufala saed. Riseja bae i talem tankyu long ol patispen tru long wan moning o aftanun ti long taem blong ol GA eksesaes. Ol patispen oli no shud gat eni probem o trabol tru long risej projek ia.

Riseja bae I yusum staid blong hem olsem wanem?

Riseja bae I yusum ol risal blong ol GA eksesaes blong lukluk sapos fasin blong stadiem jenda i wok gud o no, mo tu sapos ol oganaesesen olsem WVV i save yusum GA long wan wei we I gud moa. Riseja bae i givim ol kopi blong ol GA fremwok long ol komiuniti mo WVV. Ol staf blong WVV bae oli putum ol kopi blong olgeta long projek fael. Bae ol origonal i stap wetem Vanuatu Kaljoral Senta (VKS). VKS i save sakem ol original long ol yia we i kam sapos i wantem. Ol komiuniti bae oli save yusum ol fasin blong stadiem jenda insaed long ol komiuniti blong olgeta. Olsem ia, ol komiuniti oli save lukluk kwiktaem ol risal blong olgeta. Riseja bae i givim wan samari blong ol faending blong risej ia long WVV staf long Januari 2008 (riseja bae i tekem 2 yia blong mekem risej ia) mo ol staf blong WVV bae oli pasem ol infomesen i go long ol komiuniti we oli bin tek pat.

Hao nao ol patisipen oli tek pat?

Riseja bae i traem blong mit wetem ol patisipen long wan taem mo ples we i stret long olgeta.

Ol viley blong Emaemsine, Letaopam, Ikurup mo Freswota

Riseja i invaetem ol viley blong Emaemsine, Letaopam, Ikurup mo Freswota blong tek pat long Gender Analysis Matrix (GAM) insaed long ol komiuniti blong olgeta. GAM hem i wan eksesaes long level blong komiuniti we i aidentifaem mo lukluk long ol difrens blong wok mo laef blong ol man mo woman blong luk save ol difren risal we divelopmen i gat long olgeta.

Ol patisipen blong Mele Vilej

Riseja i invaetem ol memba blong Mele viley blong tek pat long wan GA eksesaes we oli singaotem Harvard Analytical Framework (HAF) GA. Fremwok ia i mekem ol map blong ol wok mo risos blong ol man mo woman long komiuniti mo i lukluk long ol bigfala difrens bitwin tufala saed. Bae i tekem wan ful dei mo wan haf dei blong mekem eksesaes ia. Sapos hem i no posibol blong ol patisipen i staon longtaem olsem ia, bae riseja i save spesem ol aktiviti long fulap difren dei.

Ol staf blong WVV

Riseja i invaetem ol staf blong WVV blong tek pat long wan GA eksesaes we oli singaotem Women's Equality and Empowerment Framework (WEEF) GA. Fremwok ia i givhan long ol staf blong lukluk long hao nao fasin blong leftemap ol woman (Women's Empowerment) i wok mo blong lukluk strong long hao nao kantri program blong WVV i sapotem ol fasin blong leftemap ol woman. Eksesaes ia bae i tekem wan haf dei nomo.

Ol raet blong ol patisipen

I orate sapos yu no wantem akseptem invitesen ia. Sapos yu agri blong tek pat long risej, yu gat raet blong:

- No givem ansa long wan kwestin;
- Kamaot long stadi sapos yu no wantem mekem;
- Askem eni kwestin long saed blong stadi long eni taem blong eksesaes;
- Givem infomesen wetem andastanding se riseja i no save talemaot nem blong yu anles we yu talem se i oraet;
- Lukluk samari blong ol projek faending taem risej i finis.

Ol Kontak blong Projek

Ol patisipen oli welkam blong kontaktem riseja o supavaesa blong hem sapos i gat eni kwestin long saed blong projek.

Risej i no save spoelem eni man

Ol narafala riseja oli bin lukluk long stadi ia mo oli bin agri se ino save spoelem eni man. From tingting ia, Human Ethics Committee long Univesiti i no bin gat nid blong lukluk long stadi ia. Riseja, Joanna Holmes, hem i gat responsibiliti blong mekem gud wok blong hem long wan fasin we i no spoelem wan man.

Sapos yu no agri wetem sam samting insaed long risej ia, mo yu wantem talemaot long wan man we hem i no riseja, yu save kontaktem Profesa Sylvia Rumball, Assistant blong Vice-Chancellor (Ethics & Equity), telefon 06 350 5249, e-mail humanethicsouthb@massey.ac.nz.

***A Critical Exploration of Gender Analysis:
Exploring the Value and Practice of Gender Analysis Through Engaging in Gender
Analysis with Communities and Development Staff in Vanuatu.***

PARTICIPANT CONSENT FORM

This consent form will be held for a period of five (5) years

I have read the Information Sheet and have had the details of the study explained to me.
My questions have been answered to my satisfaction and I understand that I may ask
further questions at any time.

I agree to participate in this study under the conditions set out in the Information Sheet.

Signature:

Date:

Full Name - printed

*Lukluk long fasin blong stadiem jenda:
Lukluk long valiu mo fasin blong stadiem jenda tru long samfala eksesaes blong
stadiem jenda wetem ol komiuniti mo dvelopmen staf long Vanuatu.*

AGRIMEN BLONG TEK PAT LONG STADI

Riseja bae I holem fom ia kasem faev (5) yia

Mi bin ridim ol infomesen pepa mo oli bin eksplenem gud ol wok blong stadi long mi.
Oli bin ansarem evri kwestin we mi bin askem mo mi andastand se mi save askem sam
moa kwestin bakegen sapos mi wantem.

Mi agri blong tek pat long stadi ia, folet ol kondisen blong infomesen pepa.

Saen:

Deit:

**Nem blong yu – plis
yu raetem i klia gud**

APPENDIX IV: Gender Analysis Session Results

World Vision Vanuatu Country Programme Women's Equality and Empowerment Framework

2nd August 2006 and 16th August 2006

WVV staff did the WEEF in two groups. The first group had 15 (including seven women) Efate Island and northern Vanuatu based staff took two and a half hours to assess six projects. The second group had Five male Tanna Island based staff took approximately one hour to assess three projects and one programme.

Table A4.1 World Vision Vanuatu Country Programme Women's Equality and Empowerment Framework

Sector	Project	Level of Equality					Recognition of women's issues
		Welfare	Access	Conscientisation	Participation	Control	
Education	Children's Education Begins at Home		x	x	x	x	+
	Functional Literacy		x		x	x	+
	National Literacy		x		x	x	+
	Traditional Food Education for Children	x	x		x		0
Health	HIV/AIDS	x		x	x	x	+
	Water and Sanitation	x	x		x	x	+
	Water Development	x	x		x	x	0
Integrated Rural Development	Tafea Community Development Programme	x	x		x	x	+
Livelihoods	Farm Processing	x	x		x	x	+
Staff Development	Staff Capacity Building		x	x	x	x	0

Beverly Hills Village Children's Education Begins at Home Project Gender Analysis Matrix

3rd August 2006, Efate Island

Women's Group One GAM

Five WVV female staff facilitated, seven women who had taken part in the project participated in the session and the exercise took one hour.

Women's Group Two GAM

Two WVV female staff facilitated and five young women attended who did not have children and who had not been involved in the project.

This group were very shy and were well behind the other groups. Their time was cut short and they did not complete a significant portion of the GAM. Consequently there results have not been included here.

Men's Group

Five WVV male staff facilitated and seven men participated in this session.

The facilitators tried to innovate and use the GAM to prompt their questions but wrote notes instead of filling in the matrix. The notes produced deviated considerably from the information required and have not been included here.

Table A4.2 Beverly Hills Village Children's Education Begins At Home Gender Analysis Matrix

	Labour	Time	Resources	Culture
Men	+ Men started helping with house work.	+ Father coming home from work and spending time with family instead of going elsewhere.	+ Access to knowledge on ECD ¹¹⁰ . + Access to knowledge on healthy living.	+ Men have changed their behaviour towards children. + Men are more aware of ECD and how to care for young children. + Men now help with house work.
Women	+ More women attending the awareness sessions and workshops.	- Time is not suitable for most people. + Time well spent because it helps women help their children + Project encourages time management.	+ Children's education is increased through the project. + Access to knowledge of ECD.	+ Men now help women educate the children.
Household	- Men do not help women carry firewood. + Men and women working together.			- Traditionally men are responsible for carrying wood but now women do most of the firewood collecting. - Father not taking much note of ECD project. + Men now helping with house work.
Community	+ Young men in the community are now more co-operative.	- Project activities done at an unsuitable time. + Thursday nights are more suitable for men as it is the Men's fellowship night.	+ Access to knowledge of ECD.	+ More aware of the importance of both parents caring for children. + Younger children treated better. + Young men started gathering groups to visit new born babies.

¹¹⁰ ECD stands for Early Childhood Development

Pango Village Children's Education Begins at Home Project Harvard Analytical Framework

9th August 2006, Efate Island

Women's Group

A female WVV staff member facilitated and a female volunteer Community Mobiliser filled in the charts. Seven women attended the session and appeared to be middle aged to older. The group included the Presbyterian women's group president and secretary.

Men's group

A female WVV staff member facilitated. Five men attended the session and appeared to be middle aged to older. The group included three chief council members and two community members.

Harvard Tool 1: Activity Profile

Table A4.3 Pango Village Education Starts At Home Women's Group Activity Profile

Activities	Boys	Girls	Men	Women	Old men	Old women	Time	Frequency	Place
Productive Activities									
- Teaching			x	x	x	x	7hrs	Daily	Pango School
- Mechanic	x		x				8hrs	Daily	Back yard
- Electrician	x		x				8hrs	Daily	House
- Carpenter	x		x				8hrs	Daily	Village
- Tailor		x		x			9hrs	Daily	Home
- Tourism		x	x	x	x	x	10hrs	Daily	Village/ town
Reproductive Activities									
- Cooking/baking	x	x	x	x	x	x	1-2hrs	Daily	Kitchen
- Washing	x	x	x	x		x	2hrs	Daily	Outside home
- Weaving		x		x		x	3hrs	Daily	Home
- Gardening	x	x	x	x	x	x	8hrs	Daily	Bush
- Caring for children	x	x	x	x	x	x	8hrs	Daily	Home
- Fishing	x	x	x	x	x	x	7hrs	Daily	Reef
- Fire collecting	x	x	x	x	x	x	2hrs	Daily	Bush
- Cleaning house		x		x		x	2hrs	Daily	Home
- Sewing		x		x		x	3hrs	Daily	Home
Community Management Activities									
- Marriage	x	x	x	x	x	x	1 week		
- Death	x	x	x	x	x	x	30mins		
- Church	x	x	x	x	x	x	1 day	Wkly	Church
- Chief Day	x	x	x	x	x	x	1 day		Nakamal
- School parent/teacher meetings			x	x	x	x	1hr		Pango School

The women's group took 30 minutes to fill out this matrix

Table A4.4 Pango Village Education Starts At Home Men's Group Activity Profile

Activities	Boys	Girls	Men	Women	Old men	Old women	Time	Frequency	Place
Productive Activities									
- Rent out house	x		x	x	x	x			Village home
- Carving			x	x			8hrs	Daily	
- Kava preparing	x	x	x	x	x	x	4hrs	Daily	Nakamal
- Retail shop	x	x	x	x	x	x	6am-9pm	Daily	
- VANWODS (Women's MED)		x		x		x	2-3hrs	Wkly	Village
- Agriculture/gardening	x	x	x	x	x	x	4hrs	Daily	Garden
- Fishing	x	x	x	x	x	x	4-5hrs	Daily	Reef
- Sewing		x		x		x	6hrs	Daily	Home/women's club
- Collecting firewood	x	x	x	x	x	x	2hrs	Daily	Bush
- Building construction			x		x		8hrs	Daily	
- Seed nursery			x	x			4hrs*	Daily	
- Joinery			x				8hrs	Daily	
- Arts and crafts			x	x			12hrs	Daily	
Reproductive Activities									
- Wash clothes		x		x		x	2hrs	Daily	Home
- Cooking/baking	x	x	x	x	x	x	1.5-2.5hrs	Daily	Home
- Cutting firewood	x	x	x	x	x	x	20mins	Daily	Home/bush
- Sweeping house	x	x	x	x	x	x	10mins	Daily	Home
- Maintaining home yard	x	x	x	x	x	x	1-2hrs	Daily	Home
- Baby sitting	x	x	x	x	x	x	Day	Daily	Home
- Feeding animals	x	x	x	x	x	x	1hr	Daily	Home
- Wash dishes	x	x	x	x	x	x	15mins	Daily	Home
Community Management									
Activities									
- Council of chiefs	x	x	x	x			4hrs	Wkly	Nakamal
- Women's group meeting				x		x	4hrs	Wkly	Church
- Church activities	x	x	x	x	x	x	3hrs	Daily?	Church
- Sports	x	x	x	x			2hrs	Daily?	Community/Vila
- Wedding	x	x	x	x	x	x	Week**		Community
- Celebrations (i.e. birthdays)	x	x	x	x	x	x	Day		Home
- Community clean-up	x	x	x	x	x	x	Day	Wkly	Pango Village

* During the two months of planting season

** One week to prepare for the wedding and four hours for the wedding ceremony

The men's group took 40 minutes to fill out this table

Harvard Tool 2: Access and Control Profile

Table A4.5 Pango Village Education Starts At Home Women's Group Access and Control Profile

	Access		Control	
	Men	Women	Men	Women
Resources				
- Land	x	x	x	
- Equipment	x	x	x	x
- Labour	x		x	
- Production	x	x	x	x
- Reproduction	x	x	x	x
- Capital	x	x	x	x
- Education/training, etc	x	x	x	x
- Quarry	x		x	
Benefits				
- Outside income	x	x	x	x
- Asset ownership	x	x	x	x
- In-kind goods*	x	x	x	x
- Education	x	x	x	x
- Political power/prestige	x		x	
- Health	x	x	x	x

*Such as food, clothing, shelter

Women have access to and control over smaller pieces of equipment like sewing machines. Men control the bigger pieces of equipment.

The women's group took 10 minutes to fill out this table.

Table A4.6 Pango Village Education Starts At Home Men's Group Access and Control Profile

	Access		Control	
	Men	Women	Men	Women
Resources				
- Land	x	x	x	x
- Equipment	x	x	x	x
- Labour	x	x	x	x
- Production	x	x	x	x
- Reproduction	x	x	x	x
- Capital	x	x	x	x
- Education/training, etc	x	x	x	
Benefits				
- Outside income	x	x		x
- Asset ownership	x	x	x	Is this a tick?
- In-kind goods*	x	x	x	x
- Education	x	x	x	x
- Political power/prestige	x		x	
- Travel overseas	x	x	x	

The men's group took 15 minutes to fill out this table.

Harvard Tool 3: Influencing factors

Table A4.7 Pango Village Education Starts At Home Women's Group Influencing Factors

Influencing factors	Constraints	Opportunities
Community norms and social hierarchy		The norms provide opportunity for the community in terms of respect and trust. The social structure is such that it provides an environment where women can have access to development.
Demographic factors*		The more population the better as this will provide more job opportunities.
Institutional structures		Yes
Economic factors		Yes
Political factors	Women are not free to express their opinions. Men or the council of chiefs makes most decisions.	For men, its an opportunity to exercise their decision making powers for the community.
Legal parameters	In Pango the chief hears a local hearing. Women are not represented on the counsel of chiefs (it's a big no). But they are allowed to come and listen in the general meeting or a public case/hearing.	Men have the advantage of having a say in the community legal matters, so for them its an opportunity to make a decision whilst women can only listen and not say anything.
Training		Yes
Attitude of community to development workers		Its an opportunity for them and the community when community development workers come. They have a positive attitude towards them.

* The participants estimated that there are approximately 1,000 people in this village and there are more women than men.

The women's group took 20 minutes to fill out this matrix.

Table A4.8 Pango Village Education Starts At Home Men's Group Influencing Factors

Influencing factors	Constraints	Opportunities
Community norms and social hierarchy		Give freedom to people. Give chance to both men and women and equal rights. Security purposes. Development.
Demographic factors	Most men are married to women from other islands which leads to a loss of identity, mixing cultures and slow development.	Women are the ones that are involved more in development activities.
Institutional structures		Learn new ideas and gain information. Easy communication. Bring development.
Economic factors		Bring vatuvatu to community. Benefits community. Brings work/jobs. Have access to other things.
Political factors		Brings unity. Transparency. Equality. Economic and social development.
Legal parameters		Solve problems. Put family in right place and brings back unity.
Training		Educate people. Build ability skills.
Attitude of community to development workers		Allow for different development into community most of the time. Welcome all. Weigh-up different development options.

The men's group took 25 minutes to fill out this table.

Harvard Tool 4: Checklist

One female staff member was interviewed to collect the information below.

Table A4.9 Pango Village Education Starts At Home Women's Dimension in Project Implementation Checklist

Personnel	
Are project personnel aware of and sympathetic towards women's needs?	Yes
Are women used to deliver the goods or services to women beneficiaries?	Yes
Do personnel have the necessary skills to provide any special inputs required by women?	Yes. Staff are also doing child protection training. In some areas training is contracted to other organisations that have more expertise.
What training techniques will be used to develop delivery systems?	Sometimes staff explain things but people remain confused - could do more communication training. Could also improve planning and not leaving things till the last minute.
Are there appropriate opportunities for women to participate in project management positions?	There is only one female project manager, the rest are all men. When recruiting they consider what each role requires and favour men when a lot of travelling and heavy work is involved. Pregnant women generally are not employed.
Organisational structures	
Does the organisational form enhance women's access to resources?	Yes. Women and children are prioritised. Female staff are given access to general resources.
Does the organisation have adequate power to obtain resources needed by women from other organisations?	Yes. WVV meet with other organisations and network with them. They contract to other organisations/NGOs to do some work.
Does the organisation have the institutional capability to support and protect women during the change process?	Staff talk with men who object to the change process and women are not forced into anything. For example chiefs have objected to teaching about condoms. But a women trainer was able to successfully explain and defend the training.
Operations and logistics	
Are the organisation's delivery channels accessible to women in terms of personnel, location and timing?	Personnel – Yes, women facilitators are utilised. Childcare is provided at workshops. More women attend the workshops than men. Location – there are problems sometimes. Some areas do not have a big enough house and participants end up sitting in shade. One meeting was near main road, which was a concern with the children present. Staff are seeking to improve the meeting location. Timing - just need to warn participants in time and be flexible with timing. For example give them more time for finishing housework before starting the project activities.
Do control procedures exist to ensure dependable delivery of the goods and services?	Monthly and quarterly reports have been produced. Now need to do the annual report, which is overdue.
Are there mechanisms to ensure that	No, this is usually not an issue. Men support the

the project resources or benefits are not usurped by males?	women's projects and are happy for women to take the lead in development projects.
Finances	
Do funding mechanisms exist to ensure programme continuity?	If there is a need to continue a project WVV look for funds to do a phase two project. In regards to this particular project, twelve communities were targeted which was too many to do everything in the plan over three years. Other communities would also like to have the project there too.
Are funding levels adequate for the proposed tasks?	The Project Manager is assigned to two projects (theoretically a 50:50 split of their time). However they do not seem to have enough time available for this project. This is placing a heavy workload on the remaining staff, who are getting demotivated as a consequence. The overall funds are ok. There are not enough funds for twelve communities under each budget line item though. Staff wanted to spend two weeks in one area doing research but had to cut it down to one week to remain within budget and they have to generally rush things.
Is preferential access to resources by males avoided?	Women and children are prioritised.
Is it possible to trace funds for women from allocation to delivery with a fair degree of accuracy?	Periodic reports are produced, an auditor is employed and WV PDG periodically visit and check the finances.
Flexibility	
Does the project have a management information system that will allow it to detect the effect of the operation on women?	The Project Managers evaluation report documents what they thought the impact of the project was on the men, women and children in the community.
Does the organisation have enough flexibility to adapt its structures and operations to meet the changing or newfound situations of women?	Yes. For example staff work according to the times people are available.

Letaopam Village Literacy Project Gender Analysis Matrix

16th August 2006, Tanna Island

A male WVV staff member facilitated with the female literacy facilitator from the local community assisting. Twenty women, two small children and one older girl attended the session. A third of the women were older ladies, the majority of the group appeared to be in their thirties. Some women came and went during the session.

Table A4.10 Letaopam Village Literacy Project Gender Analysis Matrix

	Labour	Time	Resources	Culture
Women	+ Domestic duties easier - can read the instructions on things bought from the store. + More independent.	+ More time with friends and family that attend the classes. - Less time at home and in the garden.	+ Access to education. + Able to get a job or a new job. + Increased income and can save money. + Healthier as can communicate with doctor and take health advice. + Can run new businesses.	+ Increased self esteem. - Domestic problems as not able to complete all housework due to classes. + Women more educated. + Confident to travel now to Port Vila.
Men	- More workload while women are at classes.	- Less time due to more work while women are at class.	- Men do not attend class and are missing out on this educational opportunity.	- Men becoming less educated than women. - Domestic problems due to women not completing all the housework due to classes and men not appreciating how important the classes are.
Household	+ Homes more organised now.	+ Enough time due to better organisation.	+ Own new businesses now. + Family has a bank account because the mother can fill out deposit slips and read the receipt.	+ More co-operation between family members.
Community	+ Community work together to build the literacy classroom.	- Less time available for individuals.	+ Better health. + Formed a Literacy Committee. + New income generation activities. + Can take advantage of more government services.	+ Women more involved in decision making. - The Nakamal Chief has not supported the Literacy Classes and has not encouraged men to attend.

Ikurup Village Functional Literacy Project Gender Analysis Matrix

17th August 2006, Tanna Island

Two male WVV staff facilitated, aided by a community volunteer. Five women and one sleeping dog attended the session. One woman appeared to be in her twenties and the others appeared to be in their thirties.

Table A4.11 Ikurup Village Literacy Project Gender Analysis Matrix

	Labour	Time	Resources	Culture
Women	+ Workload reduced – men share the workload while women are at the literacy classes.	+ More organised to accommodate classes.	+ Able to communicate in hospital. + Can write and access education. + Can trade in the market. + Share lessons with family.	- Women cannot talk in front of men. + Educated.
Men	+ Workload. + Participation in building the literacy house.	- Spent most time out.	+ Share responsibilities in gardening.	+ Opportunity to access information.
Household	+ Share responsibilities.	+ More organised to accommodate classes.	+ Healthier.	+ Support education.
Community	+ Involvement in activities.	+ Recognised timetable.	+ Healthier. + Education.	+ Support education.

Letaopam Village Pre-school Project Gender Analysis Matrix

16th August 2006, Tanna Island

Three male WVV staff facilitated (one at a time). Fourteen men and one boy attended the session. All of the men appeared to be in their twenties and thirties.

Table A4.12 Letaopam Village Pre-school Project Gender Analysis Matrix

	Labour	Time	Resources	Culture
Women	Get children ready for pre-school – cook their breakfast, wash them, change them into school clothes and walk them to pre-school. Able to do more work while children are in pre-school.	Have to wake early to get children ready for pre-school in time. Need to return from garden to pick up children from pre-school. Time to support pre-school.	Weave baskets and mats and market crops to raise pre-school fees.	Sometimes exchange produce instead of paying the pre-school fees.
Men	Produce crops for sale in market to pay pre-school fees. Help build classroom. Clean up pre-school yard.	Enough time.	Sell cash crops such as kava and peanuts to pay for pre-school fees.	Boys must be circumcised before they start school. Girls are told special kastom stories before they start school.
Household	Household participation in community work.	Enough time.	Donation of animals or food as payment for pre-school fees.	Custom story, songs, dances.
Community	Work together to build pre-school. Work together to raise funds for the pre-school.	Enough time.	Pay for building materials.	Parents teach children: taboos, respect, traditions, functions such as Kaur (circumcision), Toka.

Ikurup Village Water Project Gender Analysis Matrix

17th August 2006, Tanna Island

Two male WVV staff facilitated. Eight men and one little girl attended this session. Three of the males appeared to be teenagers; three were estimated to be in their twenties/thirties and two looked as if they were around forty years old.

	Labour	Time	Resources	Culture
Women	+ More work as they do clothes washing and wash the house every day now.	+ Less time to collect water. + More time at home.	+ Better hygiene.	+ Use dish and brush to wash clothes now. - Wash everyday. + Learning to do new things with water now.
Men	+ Now water is available work is easier as the garden can be planted closer.	+ More time with family/friends/home. + More time spent on other jobs. - More kava time.	+ Now have a fish pond. + More work done. + Access to water. + Healthier. + Increased number and quality of domestic animals. + Can wash daily and so sleep well after heavy work.	+ Variety of food. + Mainly women used to collect water – now share the job. + Reduced domestic problems – used to blame women if not enough water and get cross if they took too long fetching it. + Live longer. + Less stealing of domestic animals as they do not have to wander over other properties searching for water now.
Household	- More time washing clothes now.	+ More time together.	+ Better hygiene. + More children getting to school as they cannot disappear into the bush after having their morning wash at the creek.	+ Unity. - Relocation of houses closer to the taps. Now live further from graves and they are being overgrown by the bush. Also used to know where to place houses so they are safe from cyclones and earthquakes. + Wash everyday. + Plant flowers.
Community	+ Decreased workload.	+ More time on community work.	+ Can build more permanent houses as can make concrete. + Now have a biogas project. + Built a toilet and made own concrete slab. + Created a Water Committee. - Water fee.	+ Co-operating together more.

Iemsene Village Water Supply System Harvard Analytical Framework

18th August 2006

Women's Group

One male WVV staff member facilitated with a male community leader translating. Seven women and six children attended the session. Some of the women appeared to be in their late twenties or thirties, most were middle aged.

Men's Group

Two male WVV staff facilitated. Seven men and one boy attended the session. Three were white haired older men, one appeared to be a teenager and the rest in their twenties or thirties.

Harvard Tool 1: Activity Profile

Table A4.14 Iemsene Village Water Project Women's Group Activity Profile

Activities	Boys	Girls	Men	Women	Old men	Old women	Time	Frequency	Place
Productive Activities									
- Weaving		x	x	x		x	2 days		House
- Sale of vegetables/garden crops		x	x	x			6hrs	Wkly	Mon/Fri market
- Poultry		x	x	x	x	x		Daily	Village
- Piggery	x	x	x	x	x	x		Daily	Village
- Kato/Laplap		x		x				Wkly	Mon/Fri market
- Green coconut	x							Wkly	Mon/Fri market
Reproductive Activities									
- Collect firewood	x	x	x	x				Daily	Bush
- Garden	x	x	x	x				Daily	Village
- Fetch water	x	x		x				Daily	Am/pm creek
- Washing clothes		x		x				Wkly	Creek
- Cooking/feeding		x		x				Daily	Home
Community Management Activities									
- Clean village	x	x	x	x				Wkly	Village
- Build house	x		x						
- Pre-school project committee	x		x	x					
- Water project committee	x		x	x					

The group took 30 minutes to fill out this table

Table A4.15 Iemsene Village Water Project Men's Group Activity Profile

Activities	Boys	Girls	Men	Women	Old men	Old women	Time	Frequency	Place
Productive Activities									
- Feed pigs/fowl/cows			x		x		5 mins		Pigs pen
- Garden	x	x	x	x	x	x	0.5-1 day		Bush
- Shop keeper	x		x				Day		Lenakel Village
- Breakfast preparation	x	x	x	x	x	x	30 mins		Home
- School	x	x		x			0.5-1 day		School
- Planting of Sandlewood/Vanilla	x		x		x		0.5 day		Hill/house
- Fetch water	x	x	x	x	x	x	Day		Creek
- Community work	x	x	x	x	x	x	Day		Community
- Fasem Buluk	x		x		x		20 mins		Where grass is
- Church	x	x	x	x	x	x	Full day		
Reproductive Activities									
- Gardening	x	x	x	x	x	x	0.5-1 day		Hill
- Child care	x	x	x	x	x	x	Day		Home
- Clothes washing		x	x	x	x	x	Day		Sea
- Collect firewood	x	x	x	x	x	x	0.5 day		Hill/bush
- House building	x		x		x		2-4 wks		Home
Community Management									
Activities									
- Community hall			x				0.5 day		Hall
- Pre-school			x	x			0.5 day		Kindergarten
- Water tank			x	x			0.5 day		Home
- Committee			x	x			Day		Community hall
- Chief			x				Day		Nakamal
- Literacy school				x			0.5 day		Literacy house

The group took 30 minutes to fill out this table

Harvard Tool 2: Access and Control Profile

Table A4.16 Iemsene Village Water Project Women's Group Access and Control Profile

	Access		Control	
	Men	Women	Men	Women
Resources				
Land	x	x	x	
Equipment	x	x	x	x
Labour	x	x	x	
Capital	x	x	x	
Education/training, etc		x		x
Benefits				
Income	x			x
Asset ownership	x	x	x	x
Basic needs		x		x
Education		x	x	x
Political power/prestige	x			x

The women's group took 25 minutes to fill out this table.

Table A4.17 Iemsene Village Water Project Men's Group Access and Control Profile

	Access		Control	
	Men	Women	Men	Women
Resources				
- Land	x	x	x	x
- Equipment	x		x	
- Labour	x		x	
- Cash	x		x	
- Education/training, etc		x		x
- Custom ceremonies	x	x	x	
Benefits				
- Income	x		x	
- Asset ownership	x		x	
- Basic needs	x		x	
- Education	x		x	
- Political power/prestige	x		x	

The men's group took 20 minutes to fill out this table.

Harvard Tool 3: Influencing factors

Table A4.18 Iemsene Village Water Project Women's Group Influencing Factors

Influencing factors	Constraints	Opportunities
Community norms and social hierarchy	Too many taboos and norms – confusing.	
Demographic factors	If more females – constraint as they leave the village.	If more males – opportunity as they stay in the community.
Institutional structures	Too many – confusing and time consuming, some people on more than one (includes church, chiefs, youth groups, community, women's group). Would prefer one institutional structure.	
Economic factors		Market produce for income.
Political factors	Politicians just make false promises and bribe them.	
Legal parameters	Afraid of legal parameters – might force them off their land.	
Training		Literacy classes.
Attitude of community to development workers		Welcome development workers.

The group took approximately 15 minutes to fill out this table.

Table A4.19 Iemsene Village Water Project Men's Group Influencing Factors

Influencing factors	Constraints	Opportunities
Community norms and social hierarchy	Male dominated society – traditions do not give opportunities to women. A lot of taboos – difficult to maintain.	
Demographic factors	More males – leading to land issues as males traditionally inherit the land. Some men are marrying and leaving the village – this decreases their culture.	
Institutional structures	Not enough educational opportunities/ schools in village.	
Economic factors	Do not produce enough for market due to lack of water. Difficult access during dry season. Land issue – due to too many boys.	
Political factors	Politicians just make false promises and bribe them. Keep promising to provide water.	
Legal parameters	Now securing land legally – extended families cannot just use it.	
Training	Too many boys putting pressure on land. Too many to go to school – then cannot understand training when offered in village as Bislama not the local language.	
Attitude of community to development workers		Good attitude attracts interest of NGOs and government.

The group took approximately 15 minutes to fill out this table.

Harvard Tool 4: Checklist

Table A4.20 Iemsene Village Water Project Women's Dimension in Project Implementation Checklist

Personnel	
Are project personnel aware of and sympathetic towards women's needs?	Yes
Are women used to deliver the goods or services to women beneficiaries?	Women cook food for the workers, they help clean the site and collect materials. There are three women and four men on Water Committees.
Do personnel have the necessary skills to provide any special inputs required by women?	No special inputs are needed for this project.
What training techniques will be used to develop delivery systems?	PHAST ¹¹¹ training and plumber training are provided and men and women are included in both.
Are there appropriate opportunities for women to participate in project management positions?	Yes – on Water Committee
Organisational structures	
Does the organisational form enhance	Yes, the project does not just put taps in the

¹¹¹ PHAST stands for Participatory Health And Sanitation Training.

women's access to resources?	Nakamal, they put them in homes as well.
Does the organisation have adequate power to obtain resources needed by women from other organisations?	Yes
Does the organisation have the institutional capability to support and protect women during the change process?	WVV have an office on the island where the work is done and have committees working on things.
Operations and logistics	
Are the organisation's delivery channels accessible to women in terms of personnel, location and timing?	Personnel – all staff are male. However women and men are on the Water Committees. Location – staff visit the women's villages Training – yes
Do control procedures exist to ensure dependable delivery of the goods and services?	Yes – monthly reports are produced and the Country Manager and support offices visit
Are there mechanisms to ensure that the project resources or benefits are not usurped by males?	Yes - have people policing taps to ensure that water is not wasted
Finances	
Do funding mechanisms exist to ensure programme continuity?	Yes – there is a small charge for the water WVV also work with the Vanuatu Government and they help to maintain systems
Are funding levels adequate for the proposed tasks?	Yes
Is preferential access to resources by males avoided?	Men have a greater say where to put tanks. Women have some say. Have more transparency now re decisions made because both men and women are on the committees. Need to encourage more negotiation between men and women. The project committees are becoming a forum for women to challenge men's decisions. Need to have more committee training and job descriptions.
Is it possible to trace funds for women from allocation to delivery with a fair degree of accuracy?	Not applicable for this water project.
Flexibility	
Does the project have a management information system that will allow it to detect the effect of the operation on women?	No – could use the GAM at the beginning and end
Does the organisation have enough flexibility to adapt its structures and operations to meet the changing or newfound situations of women?	Yes – apply lessons learnt. The reporting format has changed – it now asks for the numbers of men and women (not just totals).

Bibliography

- Asian Development Bank (1994) *Women in Development: Issues, Challenges and Strategies in Asia and the Pacific*. Asian Development Bank: Manila.
- Barker, K. (ed.) et al (1995) *The NIV Study Bible*. Zondervan Publishing House: Grand Rapids.
- Bennett, M. and Harewood, J. (2003) *Lonely Planet Vanuatu*. Lonely Planet Publications: Melbourne.
- Boe, S. (2006) Interview with the World Vision Vanuatu Country Programme Manager, 14th August.
- Bruyn, M. de (1995) “A Gender Based Approach to Advancing Women’s Social Status and Position” in Bruyn, M. et al (eds) *Advancing Women’s Status: Gender Society & Development, Women and Men Together?* KIT Press: The Netherlands. p11-20.
- Crocombe, R. (ed.) (1995) *Customary Land Tenure and Sustainable Development: Complementarity or Conflict?* South Pacific Commission: Noumea.
- Cummings, M. (2002) *Young Women Speak: A Report on the Young Women, Beauty and Self-Image Video Training Project*. Vanuatu Young People’s Project, Port Vila.
- Donald, I. et al (2002) “Slo Slo: Increasing Women’s Representation in Parliament in Vanuatu,” in *Development Bulletin*, No. 59, p 54-57.
- Department of Women’s Affairs (2001) *The Department of Women’s Affairs Gender Policy Guidelines and Action Plans 2001-2003*.
- Department of Women’s Affairs (2004) *Department of Women’s Affairs Statement of Intent 2004-2007*
- El-Bushra, J. (2000) “Rethinking Gender and Development Practice for the Twenty-First Century” *Focus on Gender* Vol. 8, No.1, March. p55-62.
- Feldstein, H. et al (eds) (1994) *Tools for the Field: Methodologies Handbook for Gender Analysis in Agriculture*. Kumarian Press: West Hartford.
- Gibb, H. (2001) *Gender Mainstreaming: Good Practices from the Asia Pacific Region*. Renouf Publishing Ltd.: Ottawa.
- Grace, R. and Vurobaravu, T.S. (2004) *An Analysis of 23 Years of Labour Floor Records from Vila Central Hospital*. Port Vila.
- Griffiths, R. (2005) *Cultural Etiquette in the Pacific Islands*. Secretariat of the Pacific Community: Noumea. p.137-141.

- Guitt, I. and Shah, M. (1998) "Waking up to Power, Conflict and Process" in Guitt, I. and Shah, M. (eds) *The Myth of Community: Gender Issues in Participatory Development*. Intermediate Technology Publications: London. p.1-23.
- Hughes, D. (2005) *Masculinity, Mental Health and Violence in Vanuatu*. The Foundation of the Peoples of the South Pacific Vanuatu: Port Vila.
- International Labour Organisation, South-East Asia and the Pacific Multidisciplinary Advisory Team (1998) *A conceptual framework for gender analysis and planning*. Available from: www.ilo.org/public/english/region/asro/mdtmanila/training/unit1/harvardfw.html
- Jackson, C. (1996) "Rescuing Gender From the Poverty Trap" in *World Development*, Vol. 24, No. 3, p. 489-504.
- Jackson, C. (1999) "Men's Work, Masculinities and Gender Divisions of Labour" in *The Journal of Development Studies*, Vol. 36, No.1, October. p.89-108.
- Jackson, C. (2000) "Men at Work: Labour, Masculinities, Development," in the *European Journal of Development Research* 12, No.2. p1-22.
- Jacobsen, J. (1992) *Worldwatch Paper 110, Gender Bias: Roadblock to Sustainable Development*. Worldwatch Institute: Washington.
- Jolly, M. (1994) *Women of the Place: Kastom, Colonialism and Gender in Vanuatu*. Harwood Academic Publishers: Amsterdam.
- Jolly, M. (2002) "Women's Rights, Human Rights and Domestic Violence in Vanuatu," in *Development: A Cultural Studies Reader*. Blackwell: Oxford.
- Jolly, M. and Macintyre, M. (1989) *Family & Gender in the Pacific: Domestic Contradictions and the Colonial Impact*. Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge: Cambridge.
- Kabeer, N. (1995a) "Targeting Women or Transforming Institutions? Policy Lessons From NGOs' Anti-Poverty Efforts," in *Development in Practice* 5:2. Oxfam GB: Oxford.
- Kabeer, N. (1995b) *Reversed Realities: Gender Hierarchies in Development Thought*. Verso: London.
- Kabeer, N. and Subrahmanian, R. (eds.) (1999) *Institutions, Relations and Outcomes: A Framework and Case Studies for Gender-Aware Planning*. Zed Books: London.
- Kenneth, D. and Silas, H. (1986) "Vanuatu: Traditional Diversity and Modern Uniformity" in *Land Rights of Pacific Women*. Institute of Pacific Studies of the University of the South Pacific: Suva.

- Large, J. (1997) "Disintegration Conflicts and the Restructuring of Masculinity" in *Gender and Development* Vol. 5, No. 2, June. p. 23-30.
- Lewis, D. (2004) "African Gender Research and Postcoloniality: Legacies and Challenges." Council for the Development of Social Science Research in Africa, Gender Series, Vol. 1. www.codesria.org/links/conferences/gender/LEWIS.pdf
- Lindstrom, L. and White, G. (eds.) (1994) *Culture – Kastom – Tradition: Developing Cultural Policy in Melanesia*. Institute of Pacific Studies, University of the South Pacific: Suva.
- Longwe, S. H. (1995) "Opposition to Gender-Sensitive Development: Learning to Answer Back" in *Gender and Development* 3(1):47-50.
- Luen, A. (2006) Interview of the Vanuatu National Council of Women President, 16th August.
- Lukere, V. and Jolly, M. (2002) *Birthing in the Pacific: Beyond Tradition and Modernity?* University of Hawaii Press: Honolulu.
- MacClancy, J. (1981) *To Kill a Bird With Two Stones: A Short History of Vanuatu*. Vanuatu Cultural Centre: Port Vila.
- MacDonald, M. et al. (1999) *Gender and Organisational Change: Bridging the Gap Between Policy and Practice*. Royal Tropical Institute: Amsterdam.
- Mackenzie-Reur, V. (1996) *Women in Vanuatu: A Country Profile*. United Nations: New York.
- March, C. et al (1999) *A Guide to Gender-Analysis Frameworks*. Oxfam GB: Oxford.
- Massey University (2003) *131.703 Gender and Development Study Guide*
- McLeod, A. (2004) *Women, Peace and Security: An Examination of the Role of Women in the Prevention and Resolution of Conflict in Vanuatu*. UNIFEM.
- Miles, W. (1998) *Bridging Mental Boundaries in a Postcolonial Microcosm: Identity and Development in Vanuatu*. University of Hawaii Press: Honolulu.
- Miller, C. and Razavi, S. (1998) *Gender Analysis: Alternative Paradigms*. <http://www.sdnnp.undp.org/gender/resources/mono6.html>.
- Moldofsky, L. (2001) "Despite the Lingering Power of Kastom, Women in Vanuatu are Recognizing Their Worth and Taking Strides Toward Equality," in Time Pacific, No. 33, August 20-27.
- Molyneux, M. (2004) "The Chimera of Success" in the *IDS Bulletin* 35, No. 4, p. 112-116.

- Momsen, J. and Townsend, J. (1987) *The Geography of Gender in the Third World*. Hutchinson: London. p.28.
- Morrell, R. (1998) "Of Boys and Men: Masculinity and Gender in Southern African Studies" in the *Journal of Southern African Studies*, Vol. 24, No. 4, Special Issue on Masculinities in Southern Africa, Dec. p. 605-630.
- Moser, C. (1989) "Gender Planning in the Third World: Meeting Practical and Strategic Gender Needs," in *World Development* 17(11). p.1799-1825.
- Mosse, J. (1993) *Half the World, Half a Chance*. Oxfam: Oxford.
- Narayan, U. (2002) "Contesting Cultures: Westernisation, Respect for Cultures and Third World Feminists," in *Development: A Cultural Studies Reader*. Blackwell: Oxford.
- Netine, E. (2000) "A Literacy Programme for Women in Vanuatu," in *Development Bulletin*, No. 51, p 49-51.
- NZAID (2004) *Vanuatu Fact Sheet*. www.nzaid.govt.nz.
- NZAID (2006) *NZAID Draft Policy for Achieving Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment*
- Osteria, T. (ed.) (1991) *Women in Health Development: Case Studies of Selected Ethnic Groups in Rural Asia-Pacific*. Institute of Southeast Asian Studies: Singapore.
- Parker, A. (1993) *Another Point of View: A Manual on Gender Analysis Training for Grassroots Workers*. UNIFEM: New York.
- Paterson, D. (ed.) (2000) *Selected Constitutions of the South Pacific*. Institute of Justice and Applied Legal Studies, The University of the South Pacific: Suva.
- Percy, R. (1999) "Gender Analysis and Participatory Rural Appraisal: Assessing the Current Debate Through an Ethiopian Case Study Involving Agricultural Extension Work" in the *International Journal of Educational Development* 19. p. 395-408.
- Piau-Lynch, A. (2004a) *Assessment of the Country Perspective on Gender and Women's Health in Vanuatu*. WHO, Vanuatu.
- Piau-Lynch, A. (2004b) *Combined Initial, Second and Third Periodic Reports of the Government of Vanuatu to the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women*. Accessed via the UN website.
- Piau-Lynch, A. (2006) Interview with a Vanuatu human rights worker, 16th August.
- Randell, S. (2002) *Vanuatu South Pacific: The Girl Child*. Presentation at the Townsville International Women's Conference in Australia.

- Randell, S. (ed) (2003) *Ni-Vanuatu Role Models Part One: Successful Women in Their Own Right*. Blackstone Publishing: Port Vila.
- Randell, S. and J. Bolenga (eds) (2003) *I Stret Nomo: Girls in Vanuatu Can Do Anything!* Blackstone Publishing: Port Vila.
- Rao, A. (1991) *Gender Analysis in Development Planning: A Case Book*. Kumarian Press: West Hartford.
- Rarua, C. (2006) Interview with the Vanuatu Government Department of Women's Affairs Gender Planner, 8th August.
- Rathgeber, E. (1990) "WID, WAD, GAD: Trends in Research and Practice" in *The Journal of Developing Areas*, Vol. 24. p. 489-502.
- Sachs Robertson, A. (2004) *ICPD+10: Progress in the Pacific in Gender Equality, Equity & the Empowerment of Women*. UNFPA.
- Sanga, K. et al (eds.) (2004) *Re-Thinking Vanuatu Education Together*. Institute of Pacific Studies, University of the South Pacific: Suva.
- Sen, G. and Grown, C. (1988) *Development, Crises and Alternative Visions: Third World Women's Perspectives*. Earthscan Publications Ltd: London.
- Sitai, et al. (2006) Evaluation of the Vanuatu Community Business Opportunity Development Project. World Vision Australia Evaluation Report.
- South Pacific Commission (1995) *Fourth Sub-Regional Caucus for Melanesian Women*. South Pacific Commission: Noumea.
- Sweetman, C. (2002) "Editorial" in *Gender and Development* Vol. 10, No.3, November. p.2-9.
- Toa, E. (2005) "A Report on Gender, Kastom and Domestic Violence," in *The Independent*, 30th August.
- Tor, R. and A. Toka (2004) *Gender, Kastom & Domestic Violence: Research on the Historical Trend, Extent and Impact of Domestic Violence in Vanuatu*. Vanuatu Department of Women's Affairs.
- United Nations Development Programme (2005a) Vanuatu Country Fact Sheet, http://hdr.undp.org/statistics/data/country_fact_sheets/cty_fs_VUT.html
- United Nations Development Programme (2005b) Vanuatu Country Sheet, <http://hdr.undp.org/statistics/data/countries.cfm?c=VUT>
- United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund (1998) *A Situation Analysis of Children and Women in Vanuatu 1998*. Government of Vanuatu: Suva.
- UNIFEM (2005) Progress of the World's Women 2005: Women, Work and Poverty.

- United Nations International Research and Training Institute for the Advancement of Women. (2004) *Gender Research Methodologies*. <http://www.un-instraw.org/en/index.php?option=content&task=blogcategory&id=189&Itemid=252>
- Vernooy, R. (ed.) (2006) *Social and Gender Analysis in Natural Resource Management: Learning Studies and Lessons from Asia*. Sage Publications: New Delhi.
- Vanuatu National Council of Women (2006) *Vanuatu National Council of Women Strategic Plan January 2006 to December 2010*.
- Waikato News (2005) *Lecturer Influences Foreign Policy*,
<http://www.waikato.ac.nz/news/index.shtml?article=501>
- Wallace, T. (1998) “Institutionalising Gender in UK NGOs” in *Development in Practice*. 8(2). p. 159-172.
- Wilde, V. (2001) *Socio-Economic and Gender Analysis Programme: Field Level Handbook*. FAO: Rome.
- Williams, S. et al (1994) *The Oxfam Gender Training Manual*. Oxfam (UK and Ireland): Oxford.
- World Fact Book (2006) <http://www.cia.gov/cia/publications/factbook/geos/nh.html>
- World Vision International, (2005) *World Vision Gender Training Toolkit*. World Vision International: Monrovia.
- World Vision New Zealand (2006) *About World Vision New Zealand*.
www.worldvision.org.nz/aboutwvnz