Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Conservation versus Visitor Use: a Case Study within New Zealand’s Conservation Estate

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the degree of

*Masters of Resource and Environmental Planning*

at Massey University

Katherine Anna Hellström

1999
For the Tomtens and other wise friends at Puhikereru
I would like to extend a warm thank you to my supervisor, Phil McDermott, for his guidance and support during this research. For this I am very grateful. Also, I would like to thank the many individuals in the Nelson/Marlborough region who gave their time patiently and willingly for me. Finally, I would like to thank Mat and my parents John and Judy for their patience and support throughout this time!
Abstract

World tourism has boomed in recent years and as a result there is increasing pressure being placed on destinations in the natural environment. This pressure has implications for the long-term sustainability of 'natural' destinations. It is with regard to these issues that this thesis investigates whether recreation and conservation goals can be reconciled in New Zealand's conservation estate using sustainable approaches to tourism development.

This research question is analysed thorough a review of relevant policy and literature, and semi-structured interviews with people involved in tourism in a variety of contexts. In order to gain an appreciation of tourism impacts at a site-specific level, the Queen Charlotte Walkway in the Marlborough Sounds is investigated, using quantitative and qualitative research techniques. The walkway was recently developed in order to reduce pressure on the Abel Tasman Coastal Track in the Nelson region. However, in the years since its development, visitor numbers have grown considerably on both tracks.

The Queen Charlotte Walkway situation encapsulates the issues relating to the ongoing conflict between recreation and conservation in natural areas, and enables a better understanding of the consequences of New Zealand's institutional arrangements for tourism management. Moreover, the case study complements the findings of the policy and literature research as it illustrates a number of weaknesses in these institutional arrangements.

As a result of these weaknesses, tourism management agencies have limited options available to deal with tourism growth, particularly considering the lack of provision for regulatory management of visitors to the conservation estate. The study also illustrates that these agencies are currently unable to adopt a holistic approach to tourism planning due in part to an absence of strategic links in the institutional arrangements for tourism. This has serious implications for the achievement of sustainable tourism development in this country.

While the case study was specific to the Queen Charlotte Walkway, the findings of this thesis are relevant to any situation where rising tourist numbers are potentially threatening the intrinsic values of New Zealand's conservation estate.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS iii
ABSTRACT iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS v
LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES ix

CHAPTER ONE - Introduction

1.1. The Situation 1
1.2. Aim and Objectives of the Thesis 4
1.3. Research Design and Methodology 6
1.3.1. Identification of the Planning Issue 6
1.3.2. Information Sources 6
1.3.3. Use of a Case Study 7
1.4. Organisation of the Thesis 7

CHAPTER TWO - Tourism and the Environment

2.0. Introduction 9
2.1. Tourism and its Relationship with the Environment 9
2.1.1. Positive Impacts of Tourism 10
2.1.2. Negative Impacts of Tourism 11
2.2. The Sustainability Concept 13
2.2.1. Differing Philosophical Approaches Towards the Concept of Sustainability 14
2.2.2. The Implications of Differing Philosophical Approaches towards Sustainability 16
2.3. Carrying Capacity 18
2.3.1. Limits to Growth in the Tourism Industry 17
2.3.2. Advantages and Disadvantages of the Carrying Capacity Management Technique 19
2.4. Tourism and Sustainability 20
2.5. Alternative Tourism - a Sustainable Form of Tourism? 24
CHAPTER THREE - The Institutional Arrangements for Tourism Management in New Zealand

3.0. Introduction 34
3.1. Tourism Growth Trends in New Zealand 34
3.2. Planning for Tourism 37
3.3. The Role of the New Zealand Government in Tourism Planning 39
  3.3.1. The Government's Historical Role 39
  3.3.2. Central Government's Role in the 1990s 40
  3.3.3. Regional Government's Role in Tourism Planning 42
  3.3.4. Local Government's Role in Tourism Planning 43
3.4. New Zealand Legislation Relating to Tourism Planning 45
  3.4.1. The Conservation Act 1987 45
  3.4.2. The Resource Management Act 1991 46
  3.4.3. Other New Zealand Statutes Relevant to Tourism Planning and Safety Standards 48
3.5. Tourism Management Agencies and Organisations in New Zealand 49
  3.5.1. The Department of Conservation 49
  3.5.2. The Tourism Policy Group 50
  3.5.3. The New Zealand Tourism Board 52
  3.5.4. The New Zealand Tourism Industry Association 54
3.6. Implications of New Zealand's Institutional Arrangements for Tourism 54
3.7. Conclusion 56
CHAPTER FOUR - The Sustainable Tourism Dilemma: Management Issues in New Zealand

4.0. Introduction 58
4.1. The Case for a National Strategy For Sustainable Tourism 58
4.2. Tourism Management Issues Facing the Department of Conservation 62
4.3. ‘Visitor Use’ versus ‘Protection’ in New Zealand’s Conservation Estate 63
4.4. Visitor Use’ and ‘Protection’ in Conservation Management Planning 67
4.5. Freedom and Equity of Access in the Conservation Estate 71
4.5.1. The Benefit Principle 72
4.5.2. Differential Charging 74
4.5.3. Implementing a New Funding Regime 75
4.6. Diversion: The Search for New Attractions 76
4.7. Conclusion 79

CHAPTER FIVE - Tourism in the Conservation Estate: a Comparative Case Study

5.0. Introduction 81
5.1. Outdoor Recreational Opportunities in the Upper South Island, New Zealand 82
5.2. Creating a New Product in the Conservation Estate: a Case Study 84
5.3. Historical Development of the Abel Tasman Coastal Track 89
5.4. Historical Development of the Queen Charlotte Walkway 96
5.5. Stakeholders’ Objectives for the Development of the Queen Charlotte Walkway 105
5.5.1. The Department of Conservation 105
5.5.2. The New Zealand Tourism Board 107
5.5.3. Marlborough District Council 108
5.5.4. Destination Marlborough 109
5.5.5. The Queen Charlotte Walkway Committee 109
5.5.6. The Community 110
5.6. Effectiveness of Stakeholders’ Objectives for the Walkway Development 111
5.7. Conclusion 118
CHAPTER SIX - The Queen Charlotte Walkway: a Sustainable Tourism Product?

6.0. Introduction 121
6.1. The Assessment Framework 121
6.1.1. Environmental and Ecological Sustainability 122
* Physical Track Condition 122
* Accommodation Issues 127
* Hygiene Issues 130
6.1.2. Cultural and Community Sustainability 136
* Key cultural concerns regarding the Walkway 136
* Key community concerns regarding the Walkway 137
* Community concerns regarding general tourism growth 139
* Increased Pressure on Anakiwa, Picton and Havelock 140
6.1.3. Social Sustainability 141
* A general increase in pressure on the walkway 142
* Increased pressure due to mountain-biking 142
* Increased pressure on accommodation 143
6.1.4. Economic and Commercial Sustainability 144
* Economic benefits of the walkway development 145
* Perceived funding inequities on the walkway 146
6.1.5. Managerial Sustainability 147
* Evidence of strategic planning 147
* Inadequacies in walkway planning process 148
6.1.6. Political Sustainability 149
6.2. Analysis of Results 149
6.3. Conclusion 152

CHAPTER SEVEN - Conclusion 153

7.1. Research Aim and Objectives 153
7.2. Key Findings 154
7.3. Conclusions and Suggestions for Improving Practice 156
7.3.1. Political Level 157
7.3.2. Planning Level 157
7.3.3. Management Level 158
7.3.4. Resourcing Level 158
7.4. The Future 159
APPENDICES

BIBLIOGRAPHY

LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

TABLES

Table 1  Various definitions of the concept of tourism sustainability  23
Table 2  Summary of stakeholders’ objectives for the Queen Charlotte Walkway  111
Table 3  Substitutability of the ATCT and the QCW based on resource characteristics  113
Table 4  Types of analysis used to evaluate sustainability of QCW  121
Table 5  Track damage due to trampling and mountain-biking effects  124
Table 6  Damage to campsites  129
Table 7  Summary of sustainability elements  150

FIGURES

Figure 1  Sustainable tourism framework  31
Figure 2  International visitor arrivals since 1984  36
Figure 3  New Zealand’s institutional arrangements for tourism management  55
Figure 4  The upper South Island of New Zealand  82
Figure 5  Abel Tasman Coastal Track  86
Figure 6  Queen Charlotte Walkway  88
Figure 7  Change in visitor demographics on the Queen Charlotte Walkway  104
Figure 8  Comparison of Abel Tasman and Queen Charlotte visitor numbers  115
Figure 9  Percentage share of international arrival numbers on the AT and QC tracks  116
Figure 10  Location of campsites and track sections analysed on the QCW  125
Figure 11  Typical damage caused by mountain-biking and subsequent ‘multiple tracking’ on the QCW  127