

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Measuring Social Well-being: A Critical Review
of the Development, Reliability and Validity of
Social Well-being Measures with Particular
Reference to Selected Measures in New Zealand**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
degree of

Master of Arts
in
Social Policy

Massey University, Palmerston North,
New Zealand

Karina Lea O'Neill

2004

Abstract

An overview of the major overseas and New Zealand measures of social well-being is provided in the thesis. The research methods employed are forms of documentary and interview research. The relevant literature is reviewed and the principal researchers from some of the New Zealand measures were interviewed concerning the issues surrounding the measurement methods. The measures described include poverty lines, deprivation and standard of living indexes and social indicators. The reliability and validity issues of five New Zealand recent measures of social well-being are critiqued. The thesis also discusses the possible developments that these five measures might undertake in order to address their reliability and validity issues.

The thesis argues that social well-being measures could be developed in terms of their concept definition, choice of indicators for assessment and level of public participation in order to provide more valid estimations. This would allow for more detailed research findings concerning the experienced types and levels of social well-being and would enable more adequate social policy initiatives because the specific resource needs of different population groups could then be more easily identified and targeted.

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank my family and friends for their support through my studies and my thesis supervisors Dr. Andrew Trlin and Dr. Paul Perry, School of Sociology, Social Policy and Social Work, Massey University. Thanks also to the researchers who gave freely of their time to discuss various measurement issues with me. I would like, in particular, to acknowledge the social researchers in New Zealand who have produced measures of social well-being to advocate for positive change on behalf of those who lack various types of social well-being, and the research participants involved in these measures who have given freely of their private information. Your work has enabled me to gain a greater understanding of the realities of research and everyday life in New Zealand.

Table of Contents

Abstract	i
Acknowledgments	ii
List of Acronyms	vii
1. Introduction	1
1.1 The Definition and Measurement of Well-being	1
1.2 The Motivations of the Research	3
1.3 Research Aims and Objectives	3
1.4 Thesis Structure	4
2. Research Design and Methods	7
2.1 Literature Based Research	7
2.2 Interview Based Research	8
2.3 Research Ethics	10
3. The Nature and Measurement of Social Well-being	11
3.1 The Concept of Well-being	11
3.1.1 Social Well-being	13
3.2 The Measurement of Social Well-being	17
3.2.1 Social Well-being Measures in the Context of the Thesis	18
3.3 Why is Social Well-being Measured?	18
3.3.1 The Social Policy Context of Measuring Social Well-being	19
3.3.2 The Political Context of Measuring Social Well-being	20
3.4 Conclusion	21
4. The Development of Social Well-being Measurement Outside of New Zealand	23
4.1 Early Twentieth Century	23
4.1.1 Poverty	23
4.1.2 Social Policy and Political Contexts	26

4.2	Mid-Twentieth Century	26
4.2.1	Poverty	27
4.2.2	Deprivation	29
4.2.3	Social Indicators	29
4.2.4	Social Policy and Political Contexts	30
4.3	Late Twentieth Century	31
4.3.1	Poverty	32
4.3.2	Deprivation	33
4.3.3	Social Indicators	33
4.3.4	Well-being Measures	33
4.3.5	Social Policy and Political Contexts	34
4.4	Conclusion	35
5.	The Development of Social Well-being Measurement in New Zealand	37
5.1	Early Twentieth Century	37
5.1.1	Standard of Living	37
5.1.2	Social Policy and Political Contexts	38
5.2	Mid-Twentieth Century	38
5.2.1	Poverty	39
5.2.2	Social Indicators	40
5.2.3	Hardship	41
5.2.4	Social Policy and Political Contexts	42
5.3	Late Twentieth Century	42
5.3.1	Poverty	43
5.3.2	Social Indicators	45
5.3.3	Deprivation	48
5.3.4	Standard of Living	48
5.3.5	Social Policy and Political Contexts	50
5.4	Conclusion	51

6.	Case Studies: The Motivations or Aims and Technical Aspects of Five New Zealand Measures of Social Well-being	52
6.1	The New Zealand Poverty Measurement Project - Poverty Line	52
6.2	The New Zealand Council of Christian Social Services – Poverty Indicator Project	54
6.3	The Ministry of Social Development - Social Report	56
6.4	The Department of Public Health and Wellington School of Medicine and Health Sciences - NZDep Index	59
6.5	The Ministry of Social Development – The Economic Living Standard Index	61
6.6	Conclusion	62
7.	Case Studies: A Critique of Five New Zealand Measures of Social Well-being	64
7.1	Reliability and Validity Issues	64
7.1.1	Concept	64
7.1.2	Measurement Method	65
7.1.3	Data Limitations	67
7.2	The New Zealand Poverty Measurement Project - Poverty Line	70
7.3	The New Zealand Council of Christian Social Services – Poverty Indicator Project	76
7.4	The Ministry of Social Development - Social Report	78
7.5	The Department of Public Health and Wellington School of Medicine and Health Sciences - NZDep Index	81
7.6	The Ministry of Social Development – The Economic Living Standard Index	84
7.7	Conclusion	85

8.	Conclusions and Recommendations	88
8.1	Key Research Findings	88
8.2	Recommendations	89
8.2.1	Concept Definition	90
8.2.2	Indicator Areas and Demographic Representation	91
8.2.3	Participatory Research Methods	92
8.3	Social Policy Implications	93
Appendices		94
Appendix A	Interviewee Introductory Letter	94
Appendix B	Research Information Sheet	96
Appendix C	Interview Questions Guideline	98
Appendix D	Equivalence Scales	99
Appendix E	The New Zealand Poverty Measurement Project's Focus Group Parameters	100
Appendix F	The New Zealand Council of Christian Social Services' Poverty Indicator Project Questionnaire	101
Appendix G	The Ministry of Social Development's Social Report Outcome Domain Definitions and Indicators	105
Appendix H	The Department of Public Health and Wellington School of Medicine and Health Sciences NZDep Index Specific Census Question Framework	108
Appendix I	The Ministry of Social Development's Economic Living Standard Index Questionnaire	109
Bibliography		118

List of Acronyms

Benefit Datum Level	BDL
Business Economic Research Limited	BERL
Department of Social Welfare	DSW
Economic Living Standard Index	ELSI
Genuine Progress Indicator	GPI
Household Economic Survey	HES
Household Expenditure and Income Survey	HEIS
Ministry of Social Development	MSD
Ministry of Social Policy	MSP
New Zealand Council of Christian Social Services	NZCCSS
New Zealand Poverty Measurement Project	NZPMP
Pensioner Datum Level	PDL
Poverty Indicator Project	PIP
New Zealand Royal Commission on Social Security	NZRCSS
United States of America	USA