Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Illuminating the assessment of practicum
in New Zealand early childhood initial teacher education

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for
the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Education
at Massey University, Manawatū,
New Zealand

Karyn Michelle Aspden
2014
Abstract

Practicum is a core feature of initial teacher education. It is the site of induction and mentoring, intended to support the student teacher in their move from neophyte to graduating teacher. Practicum is seen by many to be the most powerful influence in shaping student teachers’ practice. Practicum is also a key point of assessment within the initial teacher education programme, leading to a determination of the student’s professional development and readiness to teach.

This study illuminates the way in which assessment of practicum was enacted and experienced in four representative New Zealand initial teacher education institutions, offering a critical examination of institutional policy and practice, as well as the experiences of practicum participants – student teacher, associate teacher and teacher educator. Informed by the writings of Barbara Rogoff (2003) a multi-phase, mixed methods QUAL/Quan research design (Creswell, 2003) was utilised to foreground institutional, interpersonal and intrapersonal factors that shaped the lived experiences of practicum assessment. In Phase One, key informant interviews with institutional representatives provided understanding of the policies and practices that define the assessment framework for each institution. In Phase Two, an online survey completed by seventy-four student teachers, twenty-six associate teachers and twenty teacher educators captured the experiences of key participants and their descriptions of the strengths and challenges of practicum assessment. Phase Three comprised a case study of one practicum triad from each institution. Interviews with the triad participants examined the way in which assessment of practicum was conducted in the context of relationships, highlighting the critical influence of the interactions between the triad members.
Key findings support a view of practicum assessment as complex and multi-faceted, enacted with institutional parameters, but highly individualised in practice. The need for greater transparency and rigour in assessment practices is implicated in the findings of this study, as well as the importance of meaningful collaboration between participants that addresses entrenched hierarchical patterns within the triad. In highlighting the complexity of practicum assessment, a framework is proposed for conceptualising the way in which the experience of practicum assessment is determined by the influence of multiple institutional, interpersonal and intrapersonal variables.
Acknowledgements

The thesis journey is one shared with many along the road. I have been blessed to have many wonderful people support, encourage, guide and inspire me.

To my supervisors – my journey began with a long phone call to Professor Claire McLachlan who saw the possibilities in my messy ideas, reassured me that the thesis journey was worth taking, and kindly agreed to be my supervisor. Thank you Claire, for supporting, guiding and provoking me, and believing that I could achieve. My thanks also to Dr Kerry Bethell, for your calm presence, reassurance and different perspective on my topic.

To my family and friends – your support has been beyond words. You have believed in me and made many sacrifices to help me reach this goal. To my husband, Tony, thank you for the many hours spent transcribing, proofreading and presenting my words, as well as the extra housework and parenting that fell to you in my absence. To Mum, who was so willing to do all that you could, above and beyond. To Caragh and Dominic (who do not remember a time when I was not working on my PhD!), you are my joy and my delight.

To my colleagues – Many thanks to those at Massey University and in the wider early childhood initial teacher education field that have encouraged and supported me. Special thanks to past and present members of the Early Years team at Massey University: Tara McLaughlin, Monica Cameron, Penny Smith, Judy Watson, Jo Dean and Lil Reynecke. Thanks also to Associate Professor Bobbie Hunter and Jayne Jackson for early thesis conversations during my time at Albany.
To the participants - My sincere thanks to the four ITE institutions who allowed me access to their early childhood programme, and to the participants who were so generous of their time and willing to share their knowledge and experiences to enrich our understanding of practicum assessment.

I am grateful for the award of a New Zealand Federation of Graduate Women scholarship in 2010 and a Massey University Research Fund Grant in 2013 that provided support for this research journey.
This thesis is dedicated to my father, Robert James Hoey Armstrong, with love.
Table of Contents

Chapter One - Introduction .................................................................................................. 1
1.1. Overview ........................................................................................................................... 1
1.2. My experiences of practicum ........................................................................................... 1
1.3. Defining key terms ............................................................................................................ 5
   1.3.1. Initial teacher education........................................................................................... 5
   1.3.2. Institution ................................................................................................................. 5
   1.3.3. Practicum .................................................................................................................. 6
   1.3.4. The early childhood practicum ................................................................................. 7
   1.3.5. The triad.................................................................................................................... 8
   1.3.6. Student teacher ........................................................................................................ 9
   1.3.7. Associate teacher.................................................................................................... 10
   1.3.8. Teacher educator.................................................................................................... 10
1.4. The significance of practicum and its assessment .......................................................... 10
1.5. The purpose and design of the study ............................................................................. 13
1.6. Outline of the thesis ....................................................................................................... 15
1.7. Summary ......................................................................................................................... 16

Chapter Two - Literature Review ....................................................................................... 17
2.1. Introduction .................................................................................................................... 17
2.2. Search strategy ............................................................................................................... 18
2.3. Defining assessment ....................................................................................................... 19
2.4. Criteria-based, performance, or competency-based assessment .................................. 23
2.5. Beliefs about ‘good teaching’ ......................................................................................... 28
2.6. Authentic assessment .................................................................................................... 30
2.7. Assessment practices ...................................................................................................... 34
2.8. Challenges of practicum assessment ............................................................................ 39
   2.8.1. The purpose of assessment: accountability vs. support.......................................... 40
   2.8.2. Reliability and validity ............................................................................................ 42
   2.8.3. Bias, consistency and fairness ................................................................................ 44
   2.8.4. Shared expectations .............................................................................................. 47
   2.8.5. The failing student ................................................................................................. 48
2.9. Alternative assessment approaches ............................................................................... 50
Chapter Four - The Institutional Plane

4.1. Introduction

4.2. Description of methods

4.2.1. Sample

4.2.2. Data collection

4.2.3. Data analysis

4.2.4. Presentation of findings

4.3. Characteristics of the institutions

4.4. Institutional assessment philosophy

4.4.1. Conceptual framework

4.4.2. The place of practicum in the ITE programme

4.4.3. Standards-based assessment

4.4.4. The purpose of assessment

4.4.5. Assessment principles

4.5. Assessment practices – how institutions assess practicum

4.5.1. Triadic assessment meeting

4.5.2. Observation

4.5.3. Documentation

4.5.4. Use of assessment criteria

4.5.5. Goal setting and reflection

4.5.6. Self-assessment

4.5.7. Feedback

4.5.8. Decision-making practices

4.5.9. Grading models

4.5.10. When students are not succeeding

4.6. Moderation, consistency and fairness

4.7. Induction and professional development

4.8. Innovations in practicum assessment

4.9. Institutional challenges related to the assessment of practicum

4.9.1. Cost of practicum

4.9.2. Workload

4.9.3. Bias

4.9.4. Quality settings

4.9.5. Feedback
5.7.3. Challenges identified by teacher educators .......................................................... 196
5.7.4. Bias ........................................................................................................................ 199
5.7.5. Feeling silenced .................................................................................................... 202
5.7.6. Disagreement over assessment outcomes .......................................................... 203
5.7.7. Failing students .................................................................................................. 204
5.8. Induction, preparation and professional development .............................................. 206
  5.8.1. Associate teachers ............................................................................................ 206
  5.8.2. Teacher educators ........................................................................................... 207
  5.8.3. Student teachers .............................................................................................. 208
5.9. Authenticity ............................................................................................................. 208
5.10. Summary ................................................................................................................ 210

Chapter Six - The Interpersonal Plane ................................................................. 213
  6.1. Introduction ............................................................................................................ 213
  6.2. Description of methods ........................................................................................ 213
    6.2.1. Sample ........................................................................................................... 213
    6.2.2. Data collection ............................................................................................... 214
    6.2.3. Data analysis ................................................................................................ 215
      6.2.3.1. Analysis of the post-assessment interviews ............................................. 215
      6.2.3.2. Analysis of the triadic assessment meeting ............................................. 216
    6.2.4. Presentation of the findings ........................................................................ 216
  6.3. Overview of the case studies ............................................................................... 217
  6.4. Relationships ........................................................................................................ 220
    6.4.1. Relationships – Case Tahi ............................................................................. 220
    6.4.2. Relationships – Case Rua ............................................................................. 221
    6.4.3. Relationships – Case Toru ........................................................................... 222
    6.4.4. Relationships – Case Wha ........................................................................... 223
    6.4.5. Power in the triadic relationships ................................................................ 225
    6.4.6. Personal anecdotes ....................................................................................... 228
  6.5. Assessment processes and practices .................................................................. 228
    6.5.1. The associate teacher ................................................................................... 228
    6.5.2. The teacher educator .................................................................................... 231
    6.5.3. The student teacher ...................................................................................... 234
    6.5.4. The triadic meeting ...................................................................................... 237
    6.5.5. Feedback in the triadic ................................................................................ 242
8.5. Strengths and weakness of the present study .............................................................. 325
8.6. Future research ............................................................................................................. 330
8.7. Final thoughts: The complexity of practicum ............................................................... 332

References ...................................................................................................................... 335

List of Appendices ........................................................................................................... 357

Appendix A: Information Sheet – Initial Teacher Education Institution .............................. 359
Appendix B: Massey University Human Ethics Committee Consent .................................... 361
Appendix C: Approval for Minor Amendments to MUHEC Consent .................................. 362
Appendix D: Information Sheet – Phase One Key Informant .............................................. 363
Appendix E: Information Sheet – Phase Two Survey Participants ........................................ 365
Appendix F: Information Sheet for Participants - Phase Three Case Studies ...................... 367
Appendix G: Consent Form: Key Informant – Phase One .................................................. 369
Appendix H: Consent Form - Case Study Participant .......................................................... 371
Appendix I: Guided Interview Topics for Key Informant Interviews .................................... 373
Appendix J: Authority for Release of Transcripts ............................................................... 375
Appendix K: Student Teacher Survey ............................................................................... 377
Appendix L: Associate Teacher Survey ............................................................................. 389
Appendix M: Teacher Educator Survey ............................................................................. 403
Appendix N: Email Invitation to Survey Participants ......................................................... 417
Appendix O: Interview Topics for Phase Three Guided Interviews - Associate Teacher ..... 419
Appendix P: Interview Topics for Phase Three Guided Interviews - Student Teacher ....... 421
Appendix Q: Interview Topics for Phase Three Guided Interviews - Teacher Educator ...... 423
List of Figures

Figure 3.1. Flow chart of research design ................................................................. 87
Figure 3.2. Diagram of sequential exploratory design of the study ....................... 89
Figure 5.1. Number of practicums completed ...................................................... 163
Figure 8.1. Practicum Influences model ............................................................... 308
List of Tables

Table 2.1 Heron’s Six Category Intervention Analysis ................................................................. 36
Table 3.1 Thematic overview .................................................................................................. 96
Table 3.2 Overview of the research design ........................................................................... 104
Table 4.1 Overview of practicum characteristics by institution ............................................. 115
Table 5.1 Number of questionnaire respondents per institution and total ........................... 158
Table 5.2 Associate teachers’ ratings of confidence in specific assessment acts .................. 165
Table 5.3 Teacher educators’ ratings of confidence in specific assessment acts .................... 167
Table 5.4 Orientation of description of participants’ experiences of practicum assessment .... 169
Table 5.5 Examples of categorisation of descriptions provided by participants ................. 170
Table 5.6 Characteristics of successful practicum assessment as identified by associate teachers ..................................................................................................................... 173
Table 5.7 Average rating and average ranking of key assessment purposes ......................... 176
Table 5.8 Ratings of importance of assessment practices ..................................................... 178
Table 5.9 Student teacher beliefs about self-assessment experiences ..................................... 182
Table 5.10 Assessment challenges experienced by participants ........................................... 189
Table 5.11 Assessment concerns described by associate teachers ........................................ 191
Table 5.12 Assessment concerns described by student teachers ............................................ 193
Table 5.13 Assessment concerns described by teacher educators ....................................... 197
Table 5.14 Is there the potential for bias to influence the assessment of practicum? .............. 200
Table 5.15 Perceived causes of bias ......................................................................................... 201
Table 5.16 Reasons identified for feeling silenced in the assessment .................................... 202
Table 5.17 Strategies utilised when a student is at risk of failing a practicum ....................... 205
Table 5.18 Student teacher preparation for practicum assessment ........................................ 208
Table 5.19 Frequency rating of how often assessment gives an authentic picture of the student .................................................................................................................. 209
Table 6.1 Overview of case study characteristics ................................................................. 218
Table 6.2 Examples of feedback utilised by teacher educators ............................................. 245
Table 6.3 Desired student teacher qualities as identified by associate teachers and teacher educators ........................................................................................................... 252