Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Enabled at last? A study of the development of three Maori health providers from 1994 – 2001

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts in Social Policy

at Massey University, Palmerston North,

New Zealand

Joan May Rangioue Barcham

2007
Abstract

This thesis is a study of the experiences of three Maori health providers in the Heretaunga (Hawkes Bay) region, New Zealand. Focusing on the first six to seven years of their existence this study examines how government policies of devolution and the associated creation of appropriate health care organisations for Maori affected the operation of these organisations. The following topics were utilised throughout the thesis as a structure for analysis: the contracting model used, the reporting required by the funders, inadequate funding, professional intolerance, competition for resources, and health system restructuring resulting in short term policies. Looking at the issue of tino rangatiratanga this thesis draws on these topics to determine whether or not this new policy environment has actually led to increased tino rangatiratanga for Maori – specifically Maori working in Maori health providers. The evidence provided in this thesis shows that in many respects this has not been the case. While increased tino rangatiratanga has been an outcome of the devolution process, the process has not delivered the extent of tino rangatiratanga that some hoped would be delivered through the devolution of service delivery to Maori. However, despite the relatively bleak picture that this thesis has painted of the experiences of these Maori health providers, their experiences should still be seen as an example of success. The changes in government policy which led to the creation of Maori service providers as discussed in this thesis have led to the creation of an environment in which a greater degree of Maori control over Maori health issues has been achieved. This thesis shows that unfortunately this change has not been to the extent that the women interviewed for this thesis hoped it would be when they first set up their organisations. The problem is that the policies, structures and processes, which they as Maori health practitioners and workers in Maori health provider organisations have had to work through, have at points, seemed to impede the operation of their organisations. However, despite these problems, shifts in government policy combined with their ongoing efforts have created a space in which they are able to assert their tino rangatiratanga through the practice of their mana wahine.
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank all those people over the years that have made it possible for this thesis to be completed.

I would like to first thank the women who agreed to be interviewed and their organisations that supported this work. This project would not have been possible without them. I hope that they will view this thesis as recognition of their inspirational pioneering in the field of Maori health. It represents one of the great stories of Maori development - especially of Maori health improvement.

I am deeply indebted to all members of my family, who have endured over the years, my moods and absences, and who have contributed to the completion of this thesis. You all know who you are.

I would like to thank the three supervisors who helped me through the difficult stages in writing this thesis. Without them, I would not have 'seen the light' that comes on during the journey.

My sincerest thanks to the Extra-mural library staff who have bent over backwards to answer the incoherent and possibly sometimes tiring requests. They deserve a huge bouquet for great customer service, always on time and at the right price.

I am ingratiated to the Tuwharetoa Trust and the Ngati Whakaue Education Endowment Trust for their financial assistance at various stages in my tertiary education.

Finally, I would especially like to thank Faye Milner who saved me many hours of transcribing.
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 1:
### Introduction
- Case Studies 4
- Health Providers 4
  - Kahungunu Health Services (Choices) 4
  - Te Kupenga Hauora 5
  - Te Taiwhenua o Heretaunga 5
- Chapter Outline 6

## Chapter Two:
### Setting the Scene – Maori in the New Zealand Health System 9
- Pre-colonisation to the 1970s 9
- Assimilationist thought continues – developments in the 1970s 13
- A neo-liberal swing – development in the 1980s 15
- Increased devolution to Maori? – developments in the 1990s 20
- Issues and problems – true devolution or empty rhetoric? 23
- Conclusion 27

## Chapter Three:
### Research Design – Maori-Centred Research 28
- Maori-centred research 29
- Qualitative research 31
- Study Design 32
  - Case study and informant selection 32
  - In-depth Interviews and the Questionnaire 34
  - Data collection and analysis 35
- Interviewees 36
- Ethical issues 36
- Conclusion 39
Chapter Four:

Choices

Kahungunu Health Services (Choices) 40
Jean Te Huia 41
Erin Sandilands 42
Tangi Huata 43

Health services provided by Choices 44

Overview of Ministry of Health contracted services 44

Issues facing Choices 45
The contracting model and reporting to the funder 45
Inadequate funding 46
Professional intolerance 48
Competition for resources 51
Health system restructuring resulting in short term policies 51
Tino rangatiratanga 52

Conclusion 53

Chapter Five:

Te Kupenga Hauora 55

Te Kupenga Hauora 55
Marj Joe 58
Audrey Robin 58
Huia Johnson 58
Donna Robin 59

The health services provided by TKH and to whom 59
Overview of Ministry of Health contracted services 60

Issues facing Te Kupenga Hauora 60
The contracting model and reporting to the funder 60
Inadequate funding 62
Professional intolerance 63
Competition for resources 64
Health system restructuring resulting in short term policies 65
Tino rangatiratanga 66

Conclusion 67
Chapter Six:

Te Taiwhenua o Heretaunga

Te Taiwhenua o Heretaunga 68
Alayna Watene 70
Angeline Tangiora 71
Rose Whenuaroa 71

The health services provided by TTOH and to whom 72
Overview of Ministry of Health contracted services 73

Issues facing TTOH 73
The contracting model and reporting to the funder 74
Inadequate funding 75
Professional intolerance 76
Competition for resources 77
Health system restructuring resulting in short term policies 79

Tino rangatiratanga 79

Conclusion 81

Chapter Seven:

Weaving the Threads Together 82
Devolution 82

Major Topics of Analysis 83
The contracting model and reporting to the funder 84
Inadequate funding 86
Professional intolerance 87
Competition for resources 89
Health system restructuring resulting in short term policies 90

Tino rangatiratanga 91

Conclusion 94

Chapter Eight:

Conclusion 96
A space for tino rangatiratanga? 96
The contracting model and reporting to the funder 97
Inadequate funding 98