Heritage Management: Principles for an Asset Management Approach

A dissertation presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Resource and Environmental Planning at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand

Gwynith Susan Enson
2000
Abstract

The recent Government reviews of heritage management in New Zealand have highlighted a number of problems that are contributing to a continued loss of our heritage resource. These problems include: inadequate central government leadership and local government administration; conflict of commercial and community interests; inadequate funding; and physical deterioration of heritage places as a consequence of poor knowledge and management practices. Although policies in various government agencies are designed to address these issues, the results demonstrate that policies have largely failed in their implementation. In response to these problems, this dissertation investigates and develops a new approach for heritage management drawing on the asset management plan and proposes a series of principles to adapt the plan to improve heritage management.

A literature review of heritage management identifies the causes of heritage place loss, and reviews current approaches to heritage management. This is followed by an appraisal of asset management as a potential framework for heritage management. The asset management plan is compared with heritage management objectives to determine whether the plan can be successfully adapted. Three heritage asset management plans are investigated to reveal issues specific to heritage place management. These issues are analysed in conjunction with the plan methodology set out in the New Zealand Infrastructure Asset Management Manual to guide the development of a series of heritage principles. The principles are reviewed by five experts to evaluate their feasibility for underpinning heritage asset management plans.

It is shown that a new approach to heritage management needs to be adopted to protect heritage places. Many agencies currently implement asset management plans and have the ability to apply the methodology to heritage management. Some agencies have already begun to adapt the asset management plan for heritage. If heritage asset management plans are to address current heritage issues adequately, they need to incorporate sustainable management objectives, full lifecycle management and long-term strategies to secure resources. The principles proposed in this dissertation are designed to promote a comprehensive and consistent approach to the preparation of heritage asset management plans. If widely implemented as a management tool by central and local government agencies, the heritage asset management plan could provide the basis of an integrated, structured and long-term process for heritage management in New Zealand.
Acknowledgements

First, I would like to thank my supervisor Jenny Dixon. I am very grateful for her guidance and encouragement throughout the preparation of this dissertation. Jenny’s numerous emails and occasional phone discussions were a real boost in times of doubt.

I would also like to thank Justin Ensor for seeding the idea for the research, reviewing my drafts and answering some tricky questions. David Clelland has also been instrumental in turning the idea into reality with his enthusiasm and experience of asset management planning.

Thanks must also go to the many people who contributed to my research. In particular, I would like to recognise the contribution of the expert reviewers – Greg Vossler, Richard Kirby, Peter Richardson, Gavin McLean and Ian Bowman. Their insights and positive response to my research was a grand finale to eight months work.

And finally, I would like to thank Matt Johnston for reading my drafts and sharing the highs and lows of my work.
Contents

Abstract iii
Acknowledgements v
Contents vii
List of figures, tables and photographs ix

Chapter One: Introduction 1
Dissertation aim 2
Dissertation objectives 2
Research methodology 2
Structure of dissertation 4

Chapter Two: Heritage Management 9
The value of heritage 10
  Defining heritage 10
  Why heritage needs protection 12
Heritage in New Zealand 13
  The cause of heritage place loss in New Zealand 15
  Economic pressures on heritage buildings 15
  Tourism pressures on heritage 17
  Physical decay and degradation 17
The legislative and institutional framework for heritage protection 18
  National level heritage protection 18
  The Historic Heritage Review and the Resource Management Amendment Bill 20
  Local level heritage protection 21
  Local government initiatives for heritage protection 23
Heritage conservation 25
Turning heritage policy into action 30

Chapter Three: Asset Management 35
An overview of asset management 36
Asset management application in New Zealand 38
Comparison of asset management and heritage management 41
Conclusion 45

Chapter Four: Heritage Asset Management Case Studies 47
Methodology for reviewing heritage asset management plans 48
Case Study One: New South Wales Government 49
Case Study Two: Wellington Regional Council 51
Case Study Three: Department of Conservation 53
Comparative analysis of conventional and heritage asset management plans 55

Chapter Five: Principles for Heritage Asset Management Plans 61
Service levels 62
  Service level theory 63
  Service levels for heritage assets 63
  Case study review 66
  Proposed modifications to service levels for heritage assets 67
Lifecycle management 68
List of Figures
Figure 1.1 Research Methodology 4
Figure 4.1 (Appendix 6) The New South Wales Government process for plan preparation 55
Figure 4.2 (Appendix 6) Analyses and surveys required to understand heritage places 56
Figure 4.3 (Appendix 6) Wellington Regional Council process for plan preparation 64
Figure 4.4 (Appendix 6) The Department of Conservation process for plan preparation 72

List of Tables
Table 2.1 Activities and incentives used by councils to encourage voluntary heritage protection 24
Table 2.2 The heritage management process 26
Table 2.3 Criteria used in assessment of heritage values 27
Table 2.4 Objectives of heritage management policy 28
Table 3.1 The lifecycle management process 38
Table 3.2 Comparison of asset management and heritage management policy objectives 42
Table 3.3 Comparison of the asset management lifecycle process with the heritage management process 44
Table 4.1 Asset management case study topic areas and scope of research 49
Table 4.2 Summary of the heritage asset management plan case studies to produce a model heritage asset management plan 56
Table 4.3 Comparison of conventional asset management plan with model heritage asset management plan 58
Table 5.1 Summary the infrastructure lifecycle asset management plan process 70
Table 5.2 Summary of the heritage lifecycle management process 81
Table 5.3 Assets matched with appropriate valuation methods 85
Table 6.1: General views on heritage place management and asset management plans 95
Table 6.2: Review of heritage service level modifications 98
Table 6.3: Review of lifecycle management modifications for heritage assets 103
Table 6.4 Review of resource allocation for heritage assets 107
Table 6.5 Concluding comments 110

Frontispiece Photographs
Frontispiece: Old Government Buildings, Wellington
Chapter One: Botanical Gardens gazebo, Wellington
Chapter Two: Pipitea Marae, Wellington
Chapter Three: A heritage house and high rise buildings, The Terrace, Wellington
Chapter Four: Shed 5 Restaurant (previously a wharf building), Wellington waterfront
Chapter Five: Old Government Buildings, Wellington
Chapter Six: Monuments, Bolton Street Cemetery, Wellington
Chapter Seven: MLC Building, Lambton Quay, Wellington
Appendices: Graves, Bolton Street Cemetery, Wellington
Bibliography: Bungalow, Wellington