

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Heritage Management: Principles for an Asset Management Approach

A dissertation presented in partial fulfilment
of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Resource and Environmental Planning
at Massey University, Palmerston North,
New Zealand

Gwynith Susan Ensor

2000

A high-contrast, black and white photograph of a classical building's entrance. The image features a prominent portico with several columns supporting a pediment. The architecture is detailed with classical motifs, including a decorative urn-like ornament on the pediment's center. To the left, a traditional street lamp stands on a tall, slender pole. The lighting is dramatic, with deep shadows and bright highlights, emphasizing the textures and forms of the stone and metal.

Heritage Management

Principles
for an Asset
Management
Approach

Abstract

The recent Government reviews of heritage management in New Zealand have highlighted a number of problems that are contributing to a continued loss of our heritage resource. These problems include: inadequate central government leadership and local government administration; conflict of commercial and community interests; inadequate funding; and physical deterioration of heritage places as a consequence of poor knowledge and management practices. Although policies in various government agencies are designed to address these issues, the results demonstrate that policies have largely failed in their implementation. In response to these problems, this dissertation investigates and develops a new approach for heritage management drawing on the asset management plan and proposes a series of principles to adapt the plan to improve heritage management.

A literature review of heritage management identifies the causes of heritage place loss, and reviews current approaches to heritage management. This is followed by an appraisal of asset management as a potential framework for heritage management. The asset management plan is compared with heritage management objectives to determine whether the plan can be successfully adapted. Three heritage asset management plans are investigated to reveal issues specific to heritage place management. These issues are analysed in conjunction with the plan methodology set out in the *New Zealand Infrastructure Asset Management Manual* to guide the development of a series of heritage principles. The principles are reviewed by five experts to evaluate their feasibility for underpinning heritage asset management plans.

It is shown that a new approach to heritage management needs to be adopted to protect heritage places. Many agencies currently implement asset management plans and have the ability to apply the methodology to heritage management. Some agencies have already begun to adapt the asset management plan for heritage. If heritage asset management plans are to address current heritage issues adequately, they need to incorporate sustainable management objectives, full lifecycle management and long-term strategies to secure resources. The principles proposed in this dissertation are designed to promote a comprehensive and consistent approach to the preparation of heritage asset management plans. If widely implemented as a management tool by central and local government agencies, the heritage asset management plan could provide the basis of an integrated, structured and long-term process for heritage management in New Zealand.

Acknowledgements

First, I would like to thank my supervisor Jenny Dixon. I am very grateful for her guidance and encouragement throughout the preparation of this dissertation. Jenny's numerous emails and occasional phone discussions were a real boost in times of doubt.

I would also like to thank Justin Ensor for seeding the idea for the research, reviewing my drafts and answering some tricky questions. David Clelland has also been instrumental in turning the idea into reality with his enthusiasm and experience of asset management planning.

Thanks must also go to the many people who contributed to my research. In particular, I would like to recognise the contribution of the expert reviewers – Greg Vossler, Richard Kirby, Peter Richardson, Gavin McLean and Ian Bowman. Their insights and positive response to my research was a grand finale to eight months work.

And finally, I would like to thank Matt Johnston for reading my drafts and sharing the highs and lows of my work.

Contents

Abstract	iii
Acknowledgements	v
Contents	vii
List of figures, tables and photographs	ix
Chapter One: Introduction	1
Dissertation aim	2
Dissertation objectives	2
Research methodology	2
Structure of dissertation	4
Chapter Two: Heritage Management	9
The value of heritage	10
Defining heritage	10
Why heritage needs protection	12
Heritage in New Zealand	13
The cause of heritage place loss in New Zealand	15
Economic pressures on heritage buildings	15
Tourism pressures on heritage	17
Physical decay and degradation	17
The legislative and institutional framework for heritage protection	18
National level heritage protection	18
The Historic Heritage Review and the Resource Management Amendment Bill	20
Local level heritage protection	21
Local government initiatives for heritage protection	23
Heritage conservation	25
Turning heritage policy into action	30
Chapter Three: Asset Management	35
An overview of asset management	36
Asset management application in New Zealand	38
Comparison of asset management and heritage management	41
Conclusion	45
Chapter Four: Heritage Asset Management Case Studies	47
Methodology for reviewing heritage asset management plans	48
Case Study One: New South Wales Government	49
Case Study Two: Wellington Regional Council	51
Case Study Three: Department of Conservation	53
Comparative analysis of conventional and heritage asset management plans	55
Chapter Five: Principles for Heritage Asset Management Plans	61
Service levels	62
Service level theory	63
Service levels for heritage assets	63
Case study review	66
Proposed modifications to service levels for heritage assets	67
Lifecycle management	68

Lifecycle management theory	68
Lifecycle management for heritage assets	71
Case study review	71
Proposed modifications for heritage asset lifecycle management	72
Lifecycle management summary	80
Resource allocation	83
Resource allocation overview	83
Resource allocation for heritage assets	85
Case study review	89
Proposed modifications to resource allocation approaches	90
Conclusion	92
Chapter Six: Expert Review	93
Heritage management	95
Service levels	98
Lifecycle management	103
Resource allocation	107
Concluding discussion	109
Chapter Seven: Conclusion	115
Research aim and objectives	115
Research findings	116
Recommendations and future research	118
Appendices	
Appendix 1: New Zealand Historic Places Trust Categories	119
Appendix 2: Legislative protection mechanisms for heritage	120
Appendix 3: Proposed Amendments to the Resource Management Act relevant to heritage protection	122
Appendix 4: Financial incentives for heritage protection	123
Appendix 5: New Zealand Infrastructure Asset Management Manual Table of Contents	126
Appendix 6: Heritage asset management case studies	128
Annex 1: Surveys required to determine asset heritage significance, condition, environment, adaptability and viability	144
Annex 2: Information record for New South Wales Government State Heritage Inventory	145
Annex 3: Wellington Regional Council Asset Standard document	146
Annex 4: Wellington Regional Council maintenance history sheet	147
Annex 5: Example of Auckland Conservancy Historic Places Register	149
Annex 6: Performance indicators and measures for the Department of Conservation Heritage Asset Management System	151
Appendix 7: Summary of methodology for determining the remaining economic life of assets	152
Appendix 8: Information sent to expert reviewers (Chapter Five with integrated questionnaires)	153
Glossary	155
Bibliography	159

List of Figures

Figure 1.1 Research Methodology	4
Figure 4.1 (Appendix 6) The New South Wales Government process for plan preparation	55
Figure 4.2 (Appendix 6) Analyses and surveys required to understand heritage places	56
Figure 4.3 (Appendix 6) Wellington Regional Council process for plan preparation	64
Figure 4.4 (Appendix 6) The Department of Conservation process for plan preparation	72

List of Tables

Table 2.1 Activities and incentives used by councils to encourage voluntary heritage protection	24
Table 2.2 The heritage management process	26
Table 2.3 Criteria used in assessment of heritage values	27
Table 2.4 Objectives of heritage management policy	28
Table 3.1 The lifecycle management process.	38
Table 3.2 Comparison of asset management and heritage management policy objectives	42
Table 3.3 Comparison of the asset management lifecycle process with the heritage management process.	44
Table 4.1 Asset management case study topic areas and scope of research	49
Table 4.2 Summary of the heritage asset management plan case studies to produce a model heritage asset management plan	56
Table 4.3 Comparison of conventional asset management plan with model heritage asset management plan	58
Table 5.1 Summary the infrastructure lifecycle asset management plan process	70
Table 5.2 Summary of the heritage lifecycle management process	81
Table 5.3 Assets matched with appropriate valuation methods	85
Table 6.1: General views on heritage place management and asset management plans	95
Table 6.2: Review of heritage service level modifications	98
Table 6.3: Review of lifecycle management modifications for heritage assets	103
Table 6.4 Review of resource allocation for heritage assets	107
Table 6.5 Concluding comments	110

Frontispiece Photographs

Frontispiece: Old Government Buildings, Wellington
Chapter One: Botanical Gardens gazebo, Wellington
Chapter Two: Pipitea Marae, Wellington
Chapter Three: A heritage house and high rise buildings, The Terrace, Wellington
Chapter Four: Shed 5 Restaurant (previously a wharf building), Wellington waterfront
Chapter Five: Old Government Buildings, Wellington
Chapter Six: Monuments, Bolton Street Cemetery, Wellington
Chapter Seven: MLC Building, Lambton Quay, Wellington
Appendices: Graves, Bolton Street Cemetery, Wellington
Bibliography: Bungalow, Wellington

