Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
THE IMPACT OF FOREIGN AID ON RECIPIENT COUNTRIES: A CASE STUDY OF FOREIGN AID FLOW TO EAST TIMOR IN RECONSTRUCTING AND DEVELOPING THE COUNTRY POST-INDEPENDENCE

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Philosophy in Development Studies at Massey University
New Zealand

JORGE DA CONCEIÇÃO TEME
2001
Dedicated to:

My families: TEME NA' NUBE & SALU MATA,
and the ones I really love:
Tina Maria Gorreti,
Luz & Lib
ABSTRACT

The impact of foreign aid on recipient countries, particularly in the context of the reconstruction of East Timor, is the main theme examined in this thesis. The analysis highlights that the impact on East Timor is in three areas, its economy, culture, and politics.

On the basis of different examined theories, various concepts on foreign aid are elaborated, and their advantages and disadvantages underlined. By its very nature, aid is perceived as indispensable to those in need and on this basis is labelled as a tool to help the poor or those who deserve it. But the imposition of conditions on aid has been attacked as intervening in the recipient state's affairs, and seen thereby as a tool to exert pressure rather than to ease the difficulties. For those reasons, radical critics oppose foreign aid allocation, blaming donors for using development issues and poverty as a justification to establish their own power base and leaving the recipients scarred, notably in the key areas of their economic, political, and cultural life. On the other hand, moderate critics suggest that foreign aid is needed but it should be reviewed and genuinely implemented in accord with its humanitarian vision and mission.

This dissertation has pointed out three detrimental impacts of foreign aid on East Timor: economic dependency, political intervention, and cultural imitation. The reconstruction of East Timor's economic devastation has entirely depended on foreign aid which has laid a solid base for future chronic and massive economic dependency. There is evidence of political distortions whereby international influences are dictating what they think are the best directions for East Timor to take. As for culture, East Timor has been strongly influenced into adopting models and styles, traditions and values imported with foreign aid. This thesis concludes that to escape from this reality is impossible, particularly when one takes into account the total destruction East Timor has suffered. Finally, this work leads to several recommendations to possible ways to improve the implementation of aid in East Timor, and offers some clues to minimise the potential negative impact on this newly independent nation.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Firstly I would like to glorify my God Jesus Christ who always loves me, guides me and gives me strength to develop my talent. I initially doubted that this work could be completed on time, though my God always gives me spirit to face any constraints in my life.

Secondly, I would like to thank my supervisor Dr. Donovan Storey for his particular support. His tireless guidance, and the open and friendly atmosphere he has created, are key factors that have contributed to the completion of this work.

Thirdly, I extend my gratitude to Prof. John Overton and Dr. Barbara Nowak who have given valuable assistance and deep understanding during my years of study at Development Studies, particularly when I was being challenged to campaign for my country's freedom, while at the same time working hard to fulfil my academic requirements.

I thank Dr. Sergio Viera de Melo, the head of East Timor's Transitional Administration, who has provided me with reliable sources of information about East Timor's reconstruction. I would particularly like to thank Mr. Xanana Gusmão, the East Timorese President-in-waiting who gave me valuable insights and support in this crucial topic writing. I am also indebted to Mr. João Carrascalão, the Minister of Infrastructure under UNTAET who gave me inspiration to undertake this work. During my field research from March 16 until the end of May 2000, he was a key source of much of my information.

I also thank Manuel Abrantes, SH, (Secretary of the Justice and Peace Commission, Dili Diocese), Aderito de Jesus Soares, SH, (SIL) Manuel Fernando Exposto SH, (Yayasan Hak), Johnson Panjaitan, SH, (ELSAM, Indonesia), Dr. George Yunus Aditjondro (Newcastle University, Australia), Father Jovito de Araújo do Rego, (IPI) Father Domingos Barreto (Caritas East Timor), Ms. Simpson (OXFAM International, Dili), Mr.
Browney (UNICEF Dili), Sra. Maria do Ceu Ferrer (Timor Aid Dili), Drs. Filomeno Alêixo (World Bank, Dili) Drs. Francisco Lelan (UNTAET Dili), Drs. José Aparicio (Darwin, Australia) Drs. Amandio da Conceição (UNDP Dili), Drs. Gaspar de Araújo, (UNTAET Land property Unit) Martinho Abani (Joventude Loroico Lifau, Oe-cusse), Dr. Serge Berneau (Agriculture Department, UNTAET), Graham Day (former Head Administrator, Oe-cusse) and others, for their contributive ideas to this piece of work.

My particular thanks to the New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade (MFAT) in general for the financial support for me and my family during my years of study and to Mr. Charles Chua and Bruce Graham and all the staff at the International Student Support Office. I can not forget to thank the East Timor movement in New Zealand (including the free East Timor coalition), Hon. Matt Robson, Minister of Corrections, Maire Leadbeater, the spokesperson of East Timor Independence Committee, and her partner Graeme, Tim Howard, Colin Iles and Mary Beth, who have given a great support for both my study and struggle.

To all my friends and allies including those whose names are not mentioned here, I would like to thank you all for the warm spirit of kinship and friendliness we have built together, and for the cooperation and support that you gave me directly and indirectly during my study at Massey University.

Finally to my beloved wife Tina Maria Gorreti and sons: Luzerio Donzilio Junior da Conceição Teme and Libertinho João Vitilino da Conceição Teme, I would like to thank them for the courage and support they have given, so that this piece of work could be completed. "Graças a Deus nas altura"
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**ABSTRACT**

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**THE MAPS OF EAST TIMOR**

**CHAPTER I: DEVELOPMENT AND RECONSTRUCTION PERSPECTIVES:** An Introduction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1 BEHIND THE EMERGENCE OF AID</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 THE SCOPE OF STUDY</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 THE AIM OF RESEARCH</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 THE CONCEPTS OF FOREIGN AID</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 THE CONCEPTS OF RECONSTRUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 PROBLEMS OF DEFINING FOREIGN AID</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7 METHODOLOGY</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8 CHAPTER OUTLINE</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER II: POLITICS AND THE CONCEPTS OF FOREIGN AID**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1 INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 THEORETICAL DEBATES ON FOREIGN AID</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 CRITICS OF FOREIGN AID</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1 Radical critics/Conservative Critiques</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2 Moderate Critiques</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 MOTIVES BEHIND FOREIGN AID</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 POLITICS OF FOREIGN AID</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 DONORS’ INTERESTS IN FOREIGN AID</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.7 RECIPIENTS’ INTERESTS IN FOREIGN AID 38
2.8 THE IMPACT OF FOREIGN AID ON RECIPIENTS 40
2.9 SUMMARY 44

CHAPTER III: THE ROLE OF THE WORLD BANK IN THE RECONSTRUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT 47

3.1 INTRODUCTION 47
3.2 THE WORLD BANK AT A GLANCE 47
3.3 WORLD BANK AND POST EUROPEAN RECONSTRUCTION 50
3.4 WORLD BANK AND THE RECONSTRUCTION OF THE THIRD WORLD COUNTRIES 53
3.5 A RESUME ON THE WORLD BANK AND POST CONFLICT RECONSTRUCTION 61
3.6 THE ‘50 YEARS IS ENOUGH” CAMPAIGN 64
3.7 SUMMARY 66

CHAPTER IV: EAST TIMOR: THE HISTORY, REFERENDUM AND ITS AFTERMATH 69

4.1 INTRODUCTION 69
4.2 PHYSICAL GEOGRAPHY 69
4.3 ETHNICITY 72
4.4 POPULATION 73
4.5 THE ECONOMY 73
4.6 AN OVERVIEW OF EAST TIMOR HISTORY 74
4.7 DEVELOPMENT UNDER INDONESIAN OCCUPATION 77
4.8 EAST TIMOR AFTER SOEHARTO 84
4.9 THE EAST TIMOR REFERENDUM AND ITS AFTERMATH 86
4.10 REACTIONS TOWARD THE RESULT OF REFERENDUM 90
CHAPTER V: THE FLOWS OF FOREIGN AID TO EAST TIMOR AND DIFFERENT ROLE PLAYERS IN THE RECONSTRUCTION PROCESS 94

5.1 INTRODUCTION 94
5.2 PRELIMINARY AID FLOW TO EAST TIMOR 94
5.3 ANALYSING ACTORS ROLES IN THE RECONSTRUCTION PROCESS 96
5.3.1 The National Council for East Timor Resistance (CNRT) 97
5.3.2 The INTERFET 97
5.3.3 The UN 98
5.3.4 The UN Agencies 99
5.3.5 International Institutions 106
5.3.6 Foreign Governments 109
5.3.7 Foreign Development Agencies 110
5.3.8 NGOs 113
5.3.8.1 International NGOs 113
5.3.8.2 Local NGOs 119
5.4 MANY ACTORS—DIFFERENT AGENDAS 122
5.5 THE PARTICIPATION OF DONORS AND NGO'S: Voluntarism or Bonanza 125
5.6 AID TO EAST TIMOR: Rehabilitation or Relief Funding? 138
5.7 CONTINOUS ASSISTANCE: Commitments or Scenarios? 130
5.8 ANALYSING DONORS AND NGO'S WEAKNESSES 133
5.9 SUMMARY 135

CHAPTER VI: DIFFERENT VIEWS ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF AID IN RECONSTRUCTING EAST TIMOR AND PEOPLE'S PARTICIPATION 138

6.1 INTRODUCTION 138
6.2 UNTAET'S VIEW OF AID IMPLEMENTATION 138
6.3 WORLD BANK'S VIEW ON AID FOR EAST TIMOR 143
6.4 THE VIEWS OF NGO'S AND UN AGENCIES ON AID 145
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.5 AID IMPLEMENTATION AND THE VIEWS OF FOREIGN OBSERVERS</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6 AID IMPLEMENTATION AND THE VIEWS OF TIMORESE LEADERS/INTELLECTUALS</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7 PUBLIC REACTIONS TOWARD FOREIGN AID AND ITS IMPLEMENTATION</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8 RESPONSE TO REACTIONS</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9 SUMMARY</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER VII: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 CONCLUSION</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDICES</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE MAPS OF EAST TIMOR

Map 1: A Simple Topography of East Timor

Map 2: East Timor and the Surrounding countries