Partnerships with the community sector as a strategy for good practice and effective governance for local government

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts (Social Policy) at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand

Nadine Ord
2000
Abstract

This research evaluates current practice by local government in partnerships with the community sector and it considers the contribution of partnerships to the governance function of local government. This research emphasises that partnerships based on good practice contribute to effective governance by local government and are conducive to implementing the role of local government in the current policy and societal context.

An analysis of the strategic plans of a selection of urban local authorities in New Zealand suggests a high level of interest in a partnership approach. However, there is little consistency in the definition and practice of partnerships by authorities. By reviewing the literature on partnerships in New Zealand and internationally, key success factors in working in partnership are considered and a definition of partnership based on good practice is defined.

The experiences of two partnerships involving a local authority and a community organisation from the greater Auckland area, presented in this research, highlight the contribution of partnerships to the success of projects and to fulfilling a local authority's strategic goals. These 'case studies' also raise implementation issues. The processes used to overcome these issues in the two case studies are consistent with the findings from the European and North American research, and, hence, contribute to defining characteristics of successful partnerships.
Glossary

ACC               Auckland City Council
ANGOA             Association of Non-Governmental Organisations of Aotearoa
BERL              Business and Economic Research Limited
CEO               Chief Executive Officer
CDC               Canterbury Development Corporation
CODA              Community Opportunities Development Association
CPW               Community Project Worker
DIA               Department of Internal Affairs
EU                European Union
GI                Glen Innes
IPS               Institute of Policy Studies
KRA               Key Result Areas
LATE              Local authority trading enterprise
LGNZ              Local Government New Zealand
MDL               McKinlay Douglas Ltd
MFE               Ministry for the Environment
MOE               Ministry of Education
n.p               no page number
OECD              Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
OP 2000           Opportunities 2000
SRA               Strategic Result Areas
TLA               Territorial local authority
UK                United Kingdom
WAPA              Waitakere Principals' Association
Acknowledgements

A large number of people have contributed to this thesis. I wish to particularly thank the following people:

- Christine Cheyne and Mike O’Brien, my two supervisors from Massey University, who have supported and coached me through this research and willingly shared with me their time and knowledge.

- Those who took the time for me to interview them from the Waitakere Principals’ Association, Waitakere City Council, Glen Innes Youhttown Establishment Board and Auckland City Council. The time and experience you gave to this research is sincerely appreciated.

- My managers and colleagues at Auckland City Council. Particular thanks to Kelvin Norgrove, Trudi Fava, Judith Webster and Ian Leader (now at Waitakere City).

- The Massey University distance library service.

- Norman Ord, who started teaching me to read with plastic letters and is still teaching me the finer use of our written language. Thank you for all the hours put in to proof reading and for saying all the right things.

- My family and friends for their tolerance of my single focus over the past year and the missed birthdays and lack of phone calls.

- Andrew for his understanding and providing me with an abundance of distractions.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................... ii  
Glossary ........................................................................................................... iii  
Acknowledgements ......................................................................................... iv  
Table of Contents ........................................................................................... v  
List of Tables and Figures .............................................................................. viii  
Author’s Note ................................................................................................... ix  

## CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION .......................................................................... 10
  Introduction ..................................................................................................... 10  
  Key concepts .................................................................................................. 12  
  Aims and objectives of the research .............................................................. 26  
  Thesis structure .............................................................................................. 27  

## CHAPTER 2 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY ..................................................... 29
  The research question ..................................................................................... 29  
  The purpose of the study ............................................................................... 30  
  The research design ........................................................................................ 31  
  Collection of the data ..................................................................................... 34  
  Data Analysis .................................................................................................. 36  
  Ethics ............................................................................................................... 38  
  Conclusion ....................................................................................................... 39  

## CHAPTER 3 PARTNERSHIPS: THE RHETORIC AND THE REALITY ............... 40
  Introduction ..................................................................................................... 40  
  SECTION ONE: THE LANGUAGE OF PARTNERSHIPS .................................. 41  
    The rhetoric .................................................................................................. 41  
    Strategic plan document analysis .................................................................. 42  
  SECTION TWO: THEORIES AND DRIVERS .................................................. 52  
    The theoretical framework of partnerships ................................................. 52  
    Motivations .................................................................................................... 60  
  SECTION THREE: PARTNERSHIPS IN PRACTICE ........................................... 64  
    A cross-national comparison ....................................................................... 64  
    The success factors ....................................................................................... 69  
    Conclusion ..................................................................................................... 74  

## CHAPTER 4 THE POLICY ENVIRONMENT ..................................................... 75
  Introduction ..................................................................................................... 75  
  SECTION ONE: GLOBAL TRENDS AND AGENDA 21 .................................. 76
Globalisation .......................... 76
Agenda 21 .................................. 78

SECTION TWO: THE NATIONAL CONTEXT ................. 80
The Broad Themes since 1984 ...................... 80
Local government reform ...................... 81
The role of the community .................. 83
The Labour-Alliance Coalition government .... 86

SECTION THREE: LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN NEW ZEALAND: THE CONTEXT FOR LOCAL AUTHORITY PARTNERSHIPS .......................... 87
Introduction .................................. 87
The principles and purpose of local government in New Zealand .......... 87
How do partnerships with the community sector serve the purposes of local government ............ 91
Conclusion .................................. 93

SECTION FOUR: THE COMMUNITY SECTOR: POSSIBILITIES FOR COLLABORATION .......................... 94
Introduction .................................. 94
Characteristics of the Community Sector ....... 94
The community sector in contemporary New Zealand .......................... 95
Possibilities for partnership? ............... 97
Conclusion .................................. 98

CHAPTER 5 CASE STUDIES: FROM COMPETITION TO COOPERATION ............... 100
Introduction .................................. 100
The Waitakere Education Project .............. 103
Glen Innes Community Project Worker .......... 115
Key points from across the case studies .......... 125
Conclusion .................................. 131

CHAPTER SIX CONCLUSIONS AND POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS ............... 132
The strengths and benefits of partnerships: good practice for local government ............... 135
Limitations and concerns ............... 137
Opportunities for implementation ............... 138
Policy implications and recommendations ............... 140
Further Research .......... 141
Conclusion .................................. 142

BIBLIOGRAPHY .................................. 143
Case Studies Documents ............... 151

APPENDICES .................................. 153
Appendix A: Information Sheet for local government employees and elected representatives ............... 154
Appendix B: Information Sheet for community sector representatives ............... 158
List of Tables and Figures

Table 1  Number of Times Partnership is Referred to in Local Authority Strategic Plans  43
Table 2  Case Study Interviews  101
Table 3  Case Study Documents  102

Figure 1  Billis’ Worlds of the Voluntary sector  19
Figure 2  Arnstein’s Ladder of Participation  56
Figure 3  Burns’ Modified Ladder of Participation  57
Figure 4  Model of Waitakere Education Project Structure  113
Author's Note

A number of internal reports, letters, minutes and publications were used for the case studies in this research as well as interviews.

To differentiate between the references listed in the general bibliography and these case study documents, the following standard is used; for the former, author is followed by year, e.g. (Geddes, 1995), for the latter, author, organisation or partnership is followed by day/month/year, e.g. (WAPA and Waitakere Education Project, 27/07/00).

Some of these case study documents are not dated or titled. When referring to these documents where these are not provided, the most descriptive way to identify these documents is used, e.g. (Community Project Worker, leaflet).

The case study documents are listed separately at the back of the general bibliography, and in the introduction of Chapter Five.

To distinguish between direct quotes of the case study interviews and the case study publications from the general publications used, these are both indented and italicised. Referencing of these interviews follow the following standard, e.g. (Chairperson Youhtown Glen Innes, 9/08/00). The case study interviews are listed in the introduction of Chapter Five.