

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**The Characteristics of Successful Benchmarking
Implementation**

Guidelines for a national strategy for promoting benchmarking

**A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree in Master of Philosophy in Science and
Advanced Technology
at Massey University, Manawatu, New Zealand**

Ahmed Abbas

2014

Abstract

The MPhil research project presented in this thesis forms the first part of an intended PhD research project. The purpose of the PhD will be to develop a framework to increase the uptake of benchmarking on a national level whilst the aim of the MPhil is to examine the state of benchmarking globally. More specifically, the study objective is to measure and understand the perceived effectiveness, awareness, current and future uptake of benchmarking. The study also explores best practice benchmarking characteristics such as duration of the projects, motivations of benchmarking projects and main benefits of benchmarking.

An on-line questionnaire was used to collect data. The questionnaire was translated into five languages and promoted mainly by the Global Benchmarking Network, (GBN) a network of benchmarking centres representing 21 countries. The data was then analysed using SPSS statistical package.

The questionnaire consists of seven sections: (1) Organisation's profile, (2) Use of improvement technique, (3) General questions on benchmarking, (4) Best practice benchmarking projects planning phase, (5) Best practice benchmarking projects research and analysis phase, (6) Best practice benchmarking projects implementation phase, and finally (7) Best practice benchmarking projects evaluation phase.

The analysis suggests that informal and performance benchmarking is being used by a majority of organisations while best practice benchmarking is lagging behind them. Benchmarking awareness, effectiveness and future uptake compares favourably with other popular improvement techniques.

Table of Content

Abstract	iii
Table of Content	iv
List of Figures	ix
Chapter 1: Introduction to the Research.....	1
1.1 Introduction to the chapter	1
1.2 Background to the research	1
1.3 Aim and objectives of the research	2
1.4 Scope of the research.....	3
1.5 Importance of the research and outcomes	3
1.6 Outline of the thesis	4
Chapter 2: Literature Review.....	5
2.1 Introduction.....	5
2.2 The raise of benchmarking.....	5
2.3 Description of benchmarking.....	6
2.4 Types and Pitfalls of Benchmarking	8
2.5 Best Practice Benchmarking	11
2.6 Large Scale Benchmarking Initiatives	12
Chapter 3: Research Methodology.....	15
3.1 Introduction.....	15
3.2 Research Questions	15
3.3 Data Sources	15
3.4 Questionnaire Development.....	17
3.5 Questionnaire Structure and Questions	18
3.6 Validity and Reliability	19
3.7 Questionnaire Delivery Methods and Distribution Channels.....	20
Chapter 4: Results	21
4.1 Introduction.....	21
4.2 Survey Results.....	21
4.3 Survey Results Analysis	21
4.3.1 Questionnaire Section 1 Organisation Profile.....	21
4.3.1.1 Question 1.1 Responses Distribution.	21
4.3.1.2 Question 1.2. What is your organisation’s major business activity? ..	24
4.3.1.3 Question 1.3. Within which sector does your organisation operate? ..	25

4.3.1.4	Question 1.4. For how many years has your organisation been operating?	26
4.3.2	Questionnaire section 2. Use of Improvement Techniques	27
4.3.2.1	Question 2.1. Improvement techniques implemented in your organisation.	27
4.3.2.2	Question 2.2. What are the main reasons for not using performance benchmarking or best practice benchmarking within your organisation?	32
4.3.3	Questionnaire Section 3 General Questions on Benchmarking	33
4.3.3.1	Question 3.1. Benchmarking Training, Data Collection and Dissemination of Results.	33
4.3.3.2	Question 3.2. For each of the following performance areas, does your organisation collect benchmarks (performance comparison data on other companies)?	35
4.3.3.3	Question 3.3. Which of the following services in benchmarking, if supplied by a third party (an external organisation), would your organisation potentially use?	40
4.3.3.4	Question 3.4 Does your organisation currently use benchmarking services provided by a third party?	41
4.3.3.5	Question 3.5. If there was a national or regional benchmarking award to encourage organisations to undertake benchmarking projects, would your organisation be interested in applying or finding out more information about it?	42
4.3.4	Survey Section 4: Best Practice Benchmarking Projects - Planning	43
4.3.4.1	Question 4.1. How many benchmarking projects do you conduct per year (typically)?	43
4.3.4.2	Question 4.2. What is the size of a typical benchmarking team within your organisation?	44
4.3.4.3	Question 4.3. Does your organisation use a particular methodology for undertaking benchmarking projects?	45
4.3.4.4	Question 4.4. How long does a benchmarking project normally take?	46
4.3.4.5	Question 4.5. What are the main reasons for undertaking benchmarking projects?	47

4.3.4.6	Question 4.6. In the last three years which areas of your organisation have conducted benchmarking projects?.....	48
4.3.4.7	Question 4.7. Our benchmarking project teams usually consist of people from the following areas.....	49
4.3.4.8	Question 4.8. What types of benchmarking projects do you usually conduct?	50
4.3.4.9	Question 4.9. When planning a benchmarking project.	51
4.3.5	Section 5: Best Practice Benchmarking Projects - Research and Analysis	54
4.3.5.1	Question 5.1. Which of the following methods does your organisation use to collect benchmarking data and best practice information?	54
4.3.6	Section 6: Best Practice Benchmarking Projects - Implementation	55
4.3.6.1	Question 6.1. How long does the implementation phase typically take?	55
4.3.6.2	Question 6.2. What percentage of benchmarking projects result in implementation?	56
4.3.7	Section 7: Evaluation	57
4.3.7.1	Question 7.1 At the end of a benchmarking project, do you measure the improvements that have occurred?.....	57
4.3.7.2	Question 7.2. The outcomes (best practices and/or results achieved) from benchmarking projects are typically communicated by:	60
4.3.7.3	Question 7.3. The main benefits of benchmarking projects have been:	61
4.3.7.4	Question 7.4. On average, what is the financial return (US\$) from a typical benchmarking project after one year of implementation?.....	62
4.3.7.5	Question 7.5. Approximately, what percentage of time is spent by your organisation on each phase of the benchmarking process out of total time spent?	63
4.3.7.6	Question 7.6. According to your experience, how do the following factors contribute to the success of a benchmarking project?.....	64
4.3.8	Cross Tabulation Results.....	66
4.3.8.1	Typical benchmarking team size in major effectiveness benefit organisations.....	66

4.3.8.2	Frequency of providing best practice benchmarking training to the employees in each sector.....	67
4.3.8.3	Benchmarking methodology used in each sector.....	67
4.3.8.4	Future use of benchmarking for each organisation size	68
4.3.8.5	Types of best practice benchmarking projects in each organisation size	69
4.3.8.6	Employee-related data collection in each sector.....	70
4.3.8.7	Customer-related data collection in each sector	71
4.3.8.8	Financial-related data collection in each sector	72
4.3.8.9	Process-related data collection in each sector.....	73
4.3.8.10	Product-related data collection in each sector	74
4.3.8.11	Main reasons for not using benchmarking in large organisations....	75
4.3.8.12	Main reasons for not using benchmarking in medium organisations	76
4.3.8.13	Main reasons for not using benchmarking in small organisations ...	77
4.3.8.14	Main reasons for not using benchmarking in micro organisations ...	78
4.3.8.15	Main reasons for using benchmarking in each sector.	79
Chapter 5: Discussion and Conclusion		81
5.1	Introduction to the Chapter	81
5.2	Awareness and Uptake of Benchmarking	81
5.3	Effectiveness of Benchmarking.....	82
5.4	Future Use of Benchmarking	83
5.5	Benchmarking and the Other Performance Improvement Tools.....	84
5.6	Best Practice Benchmarking.....	84
5.7	Conclusion.....	87
5.8	Research Limitations	88
5.9	Future research	89
References		90
Bibliography.....		95
Appendix-I: Benchmarking Definitions		99
Appendix-II: Global Benchmarking Network (GBN) members		100
Appendix-III: Questionnaire		103

List of Figures

Figure 1. Research Plan	3
Figure 2. World responses distribution.....	22
Figure 3. Responses distribution by country	23
Figure 4. Responses distribution by organisation size	24
Figure 5. Response distribution by business activity	25
Figure 6. Responses distribution by sector	26
Figure 7. Number of years in operation.....	27
Figure 8. Awareness of business improvement techniques	28
Figure 9. Current use of business improvement techniques	29
Figure 10. Effectiveness of business improvement techniques	30
Figure 11. Future use of improvement techniques.....	31
Figure 12. Reasons for not using benchmarking or best practice benchmarking	32
Figure 13. Benchmarking training for employees.....	33
Figure 14. Collection and use of benchmarking data	34
Figure 15. Disseminations of best practices	35
Figure 16. Collection of benchmarking data in employee-related area	36
Figure 17. Collection of benchmarking data in financial-related areas.....	37
Figure 18. Collection of benchmarking data in process-related areas	38
Figure 19. Collection of benchmarking data in product or services related areas	39
Figure 20. Collection of benchmarking data in customer-related areas	39
Figure 21. Most important services supplied by third party	41
Figure 22. Current use of benchmarking service by third party provider.....	42
Figure 23. Level of interest in a benchmarking award.....	42
Figure 24. Number of benchmarking project per year.....	44
Figure 25. Size of typical benchmarking team	45
Figure 26. Methodology used in benchmarking projects.....	46
Figure 27. Duration of benchmarking projects	47
Figure 28. Main reasons for undertaking benchmarking	48
Figure 29. Benchmarking in organisation areas.....	49
Figure 30. Benchmarking team structure	50

Figure 31. Types of benchmarking projects	51
Figure 32. Project brief development	52
Figure 33. Calculating the financial aspects of the project	53
Figure 34. Adherence to code of conduct	54
Figure 35. Most popular data collection methods	55
Figure 36. Implementation phase duration.....	56
Figure 37. Percentage of benchmarking projects ending with implementation .	57
Figure 38. Evaluating improvements	58
Figure 39. Financial analysis at the end of benchmarking projects.....	59
Figure 40. Evaluating benchmarking project process	60
Figure 41. Methods of project outcomes communication.....	61
Figure 42. Main benefits of benchmarking projects	62
Figure 43. Financial return of benchmarking projects	63
Figure 44. Time allocation for each phase of benchmarking project.....	64
Figure 45. Most important requirements for a successful benchmarking project	65
Figure 46. Typical benchmarking team size and benchmarking project benefit	66
Figure 47. Frequency of providing best practice training in each sector	67
Figure 48. Use of benchmarking methodology in each organisation size	68
Figure 49. Future use of best practice benchmarking in different organisation sizes.....	69
Figure 50. Types of implemented benchmarking projects in different organisation sizes.....	70
Figure 51. Percentage of collecting employee-related benchmarks in each sector	71
Figure 52. Percentage of collecting customer-related benchmarks in each sector	72
Figure 53. Percentage of collecting financial-related benchmarks in each sector	73
Figure 54. Percentage of collecting process-related benchmarks in each sector	74
Figure 55. Percentage of collecting product-related benchmarks in each sector	75
Figure 56. Main reasons for not using benchmarking in large organisations	76

Figure 57. Main reasons for not using benchmarking in medium organisations	77
Figure 58. Main reasons for not using benchmarking in small organisations	78
Figure 59. Main reasons for not using benchmarking in micro organisations ...	79
Figure 60. Main reasons for undertaking benchmarking projects in each sector	80