The Changing Face of Palestinian Leadership

The Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions Movement

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts

In Politics

at Massey University, Turitea

New Zealand

Pippa Barnes

2014
Abstract

The face of Palestinian leadership has developed and diversified greatly since the British Mandate period, with many groups claiming representation of the Palestinian people and the national movement. The unresolved matter of Palestinian leadership is central to Israeli occupation and any resolution. Established in 2005, the development and success of the Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions (BDS) movement represents a new chapter in Palestinian leadership building upon Palestine’s established history of popular resistance. This thesis examines the effects of the BDS movement on the direction and strength of Palestinian leadership and the Palestinian national movement. Using a distributed leadership framework, the research analyses how the grassroots, transnational nature of the BDS movement has modernised and globalised the Palestinian struggle. The difficult political environment of the occupation has caused formal Palestinian leadership to be greatly compromised through the restrictions tied to the Oslo Accords and formal peace process. The organisational structure of the BDS movement allows it to operate outside of these realms, counter-positioning itself against the failed US-led diplomacy. The thesis questions the use of the common comparison of BDS with the anti-apartheid movement in South Africa; the wider politics of the situation and relationships between Palestinian leadership bodies differs vastly from those of apartheid South Africa. The comparative thread throughout the research is two-fold: an objective comparison of the BDS movement with anti-apartheid movement in South Africa; and an analysis of BDS’s own use of the comparison as a strategic and organisational tool. The recent rise of protest movements present an alternative to formal political institutions. The BDS movement represents a broader trend in political leadership as the advent of new media has shifted an element of power into grassroots mass movements. This thesis finds that the BDS movement has reintroduced grassroots resistance and leadership to the Palestinian political system. Its distributed leadership model has provided an alternative outlet that circumvents the restrictive formal political process. However, as the BDS movement does not seek the institutionalised power that any future Palestinian state requires, formal Palestinian leadership must incorporate the movement’s grassroots elements traditional to Palestine.
Acknowledgements

Thank you to Dr. Nigel Parsons, long-suffering supervisor, whose passion for Palestinian politics started me on this path many years ago. You truly went above and beyond, for which I am eternally grateful. Thank you also to all the staff at Massey who assist post-graduate and distance students, especially those in the library and politics department, and provide amazing services. The Masterate Scholarship provided greatly appreciated financial incentive.

Thank you to Mum, after six years you are now relieved of your proof-reading duties. To my friends, you no longer have to hear about my thesis but thank you for always listening and providing much-needed distraction. I promise I’m done.
# Table of Contents

Abstract .......................................................................................................................i

Acknowledgements ....................................................................................................ii

Table of Contents ........................................................................................................iii

Abbreviations ..............................................................................................................v

Glossary .......................................................................................................................vi

Tables ...........................................................................................................................vii

1.0 Introduction ..........................................................................................................1

2.0 Conceptual Framework ........................................................................................7

   2.1 Traditional Leadership Frameworks ............................................................8

   2.2 Non-traditional Leadership Frameworks ....................................................11

      2.2.1 Distributed Leadership Framework ...........................................12

      2.2.2 Relational Leadership Framework .............................................14

      2.2.3 Social Movement Leadership Framework ..................................16

2.3 Leadership Framework Criteria.....................................................................21

2.4 Conclusion..................................................................................................24

3.0 Literature Review .................................................................................................26

3.1 Palestinian Leadership ...................................................................................27

   3.1.1 1923-1948: Leadership under the British Mandate ....................28

   3.1.2 1958-1969: PLO and Fatah Genesis............................................29

   3.1.3 1973-1993: Institutionalisation of the PLO and Formation of Hamas.......................................................................................31

   3.1.4 Post-1994: Oslo and Institutionalisation ........................................34

   3.1.5 Arafat & Charisma.........................................................................35

   3.1.6 2000-2008: The Rise of Hamas....................................................36

   3.1.7 Post-2004: Abbas and Charisma..................................................38

   3.1.8 Palestinian-Israeli Leadership ....................................................40

   3.1.9 Conclusion.................................................................................41

3.2 Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions .................................................................41

   3.2.1 Palestinian Popular Resistance....................................................41

   3.2.2 BDS Movement.........................................................................42

   3.2.3 South Africa Anti-Apartheid Movement Comparison .................45

   3.2.4 Israeli Apartheid.........................................................................48

3.3 Conclusion..................................................................................................50

4.0 Methodology ........................................................................................................51

4.1 Ontology and Epistemology ............................................................................53

4.2 Qualitative and Quantitative Methods ............................................................54

4.3 Comparative Method ..................................................................................57

4.4 Sources.......................................................................................................58

4.5 Conclusion..................................................................................................61
5.0 Distributed Leadership in Palestine’s Narrative of Boycott: The Foundations of the BDS Movement .................................................................62
  5.1 BDS Movement Origins – pre-2005..................................................64
    5.1.1 The Great Revolt 1936-1939......................................................64
    5.1.2 Arab League Boycott 1948-1979..............................................67
    5.1.3 First Intifada 1987-1993.........................................................69
    5.1.4 Modern Origins 2001-2004.....................................................76
  5.2 Conclusion..........................................................................................80

6.0 Development of the BDS Movement: 2005-present..........................82
  6.1 BDS Movement Establishment..........................................................83
    6.1.1 Palestinian Civil Society 2005 Statement.................................83
    6.1.2 BDS National Committee.......................................................85
  6.2 BDS Leadership: Balancing Palestinian Ownership with International
    Involvement......................................................................................86
    6.2.1 International BDS Groups.......................................................86
    6.2.2 Palestinian BDS Leadership and Self-Determination..............88
    6.2.3 Achieving Context-sensitivity..................................................88
    6.2.4 The Role of Framing...............................................................90
  6.3 Distributed Leadership Framework Analysis.....................................92
    6.3.1 BDS Movement Establishment 2005 ......................................92
    6.3.2 Operation Cast Lead 2008-2009.............................................94
    6.3.3 Operation Pillar of Defence 2012..........................................96
    6.3.4 Operation Protective Edge 2014............................................100

7.0 Palestinian Power Relations and Effects..............................................105
  7.1 Palestinian Leadership Dynamics.....................................................105
    7.1.1 Comparative Anti-Apartheid Leadership Dynamics................107
    7.1.2 Israeli Relations.................................................................112
  7.2 Palestinian Leadership Moving Forward..........................................113

8.0 Conclusions.........................................................................................117

Appendices...............................................................................................121

Reference List............................................................................................137
**Abbreviations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AHC</td>
<td>Arab Higher Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIPAC</td>
<td>American Israeli Public Affairs Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALF</td>
<td>Arab Liberation Front</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BDS</td>
<td>Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BNC</td>
<td>BDS National Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COSATU</td>
<td>Congress of South African Trade Unions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFLP</td>
<td>Democratic Front for the Liberation of Palestine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>Israel Defence Forces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDM</td>
<td>Mass Democratic Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>oPt</td>
<td>Occupied Palestinian Territories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PA</td>
<td>Palestinian Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PACBI</td>
<td>Palestinian Campaign for the Academic and Cultural Boycott of Israel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCP</td>
<td>Palestinian Communist Party (now PPP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PFLP</td>
<td>Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLO</td>
<td>Palestine Liberation Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPP</td>
<td>Palestinian People’s Party (formerly PCP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UDF</td>
<td>United Democratic Front</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNHRC</td>
<td>United Nations Human Rights Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNLU</td>
<td>Unified National Leadership of the Uprising</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Glossary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Al-Nakba</td>
<td>‘The Catastrophe’ – the 1948 expulsion of Palestinians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concertive action</td>
<td>The valued power of the strength of the aggregate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green Line</td>
<td>Pre-1967 borders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heterarchy</td>
<td>Unranked power sharing arrangements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intifada</td>
<td>Uprising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Quartet</td>
<td>Peace mediation team of the UN, EU, US, and Russia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tafrigh</td>
<td>The placing of civilian members onto an organisation’s payroll</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zakat</td>
<td>Tithe</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tables

Table 1: Distributed leadership during pre-2005 boycott-based campaigns..........................64

Table 2: Distributed leadership of the BDS movement development post-2005.........................92