

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Human Security
for Humanitarian and Development Practitioners:
The Experience of Aid Workers
from New Zealand Red Cross

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
degree of

Master of Philosophy
in
Development Studies

at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand

Aaron James Davy
2014

This thesis has been completed as private study undertaken by the author. Except where explicitly stated and cited, the opinions conveyed in this thesis are the author's own and do not necessarily reflect the views or policy of New Zealand Red Cross (NZRC), the International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC), the International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC), or any agency or part of the Red Cross Movement thereof.

Abstract

This thesis aims to investigate the application of human security to informing and reflecting the experience of New Zealand Red Cross (NZRC) aid workers, particularly those delivering health and medical assistance in highly 'militarised' locations. It is claimed by some that the roots of human security are actually found in the nineteenth-century establishment of the Red Cross and its operational mandate since that time. Contemporary case-studies of NZRC aid worker experience of personal security will assist in elucidating this claim, particularly in reference to the organisation's record of working in situations of conflict and insecurity, and its association with military frameworks.

With its focus upon a broad range of risks to the individual or community, human security may appear as an ambiguous or dissociated framework for the application to a single organisational occupation or individual. Additionally, a broad scan of academic literature suggests that existing human security dialogue retains a focus on the recipients of humanitarian or developmental aid, as opposed to the aid workers themselves. At the core of human security, however, there may be framing elements that can adequately inform and reflect the context and experience of personal security of development and humanitarian aid workers, such as those from the Red Cross.

Red Cross aid workers, deployed through the New Zealand Red Cross, are often located in field environments that include some type of military (or informal militia) presence. The coexistence of such militarised influences within a humanitarian operation or development programme can complicate the aid worker's experience of security. This thesis investigates the basis of these experiences, and uses a human security discourse to review the frameworks application to the personal security of Red Cross aid workers themselves. This will provide an opportunity to analyse how the operational security of the Red Cross as an organisation can be further informed by a human security analysis.

Acknowledgements

Foremost I would like to acknowledge the indefatigable patience and support of Dr Maria Borovnik over the many years that it took to complete this research. In particular, her supervision and guidance was a source of motivation to continue when the going was getting tough. I would also like to thank Associate Professor Glenn Banks for his supervision, revision assistance and much-appreciated advice.

I would like to thank my New Zealand Red Cross work colleagues, particularly Glenn Rose, and Andrew McKie who was an invaluable resource person when discussing the history of the delegates programme and the organisational archive. I would also like to thank the New Zealand Red Cross delegates themselves; for their humour, support and inspiration during what can sometimes be a challenging work-load and difficult subject matter.

I would like to thank my brother Glenn Davy, and friends Cathy Blakely and Rochelle Berry, for reviewing my work and offering suggestions.

Lastly, I would like to especially thank my partner Nicholas Netzler, and my parents Andrew and Beverley Davy, for their encouragement, support and irregular distractions during the long gestation of this thesis.

The note-making, drafting, revision and rewriting of this thesis was undertaken while travelling within the following countries; United Kingdom, Switzerland, Lebanon, Senegal, The Gambia, Burundi, South Africa, Kenya, South Sudan, Fiji, Australia and New Zealand.

Table of Contents

Title Page and Cover	i
Disclaimer	iii
Abstract	v
Acknowledgements	vi
Table of Contents	vii
List of Graphs and Figures	x
List of Tables	x
List of Photos	x
List of Acronyms and Abbreviations	xi
Chapter 1 – Introduction: The Personal Security of Red Cross Aid Workers	1
Introduction	1
Specific Context of New Zealand Red Cross Aid Workers	7
Rational and Aim of Thesis	8
Focus of Analysis and Use of Red Cross Terminology	11
Chapter Outline	12
Chapter 2 – Methodology: Critical Theory in Human Security Research	15
Introduction	15
Qualitative Methodologies and Interpretation	16
Phenomenology, Subjectivity and Thematic Aspects	18
Critical Theory, Defence and Security Studies, and Organisations	19
Ethical Concerns and Position of Author	20
Sample Selection and Data Analysis	22
Conclusion	23

Chapter 3 – Historical Security and its Characterisation in the Red Cross	25
Introduction	25
Global History of Security and the Red Cross	27
Local History of Security and the New Zealand Red Cross	34
New Zealand Red Cross Delegates, Insecurity and Military Normalisation	44
Conclusion	45
Chapter 4 – Theoretical Concepts of Human Security	
and Personal Security for Health-Based Aid Workers	48
Introduction	48
Traditional Definitions of Human Security	50
Core Aspects of Human Security	51
Human Security within a Development Paradigm	54
Human Security, Development and Rights	57
Human Security within a Humanitarian Paradigm	59
Human Security within Civilian-Military Coordination	61
Human Security within the Provision of Health Services	63
Personal Security as a Component of Human Security	64
Conclusion	68
Chapter 5 – Case-Studies of New Zealand Red Cross	
Delegate Security Incidents and Operational Definitions	72
Introduction	72
Deployment Relationships between New Zealand Red Cross	
and other Components of the Red Cross	74
Operational Definitions of Security in the Red Cross	77
Security Incidents involving Individual Violations	80
Security Incidents involving Operational Violations	83
Security Incidents involving Strategic Violations	89
Conclusion	93

Chapter 6 – Discussion: Identifying Gaps and Limitations in Red Cross	
Operational Security from a Human Security Lens	95
Introduction	95
Human Security Concepts represented	
in the Characteristics of the Red Cross	97
Links between the Red Cross and Human Security	101
Human Security reflected in the Management	
of Operational Security at the Red Cross	102
Aspects of Human Security and Gaps at the Strategic Level	107
Aspects of Human Security and Gaps at the Operational Level	110
Aspects of Human Security and Gaps at the Individual Level	111
Limitations in the application of Human Security	111
Conclusion	113
Chapter 7 – Conclusion: Human Security	
for New Zealand Red Cross Delegates	115
Introduction	115
Overall Aim of Thesis	115
Reflections on the Utilised Methodology	117
Response to Research Questions	119
Relevance of Red Cross to	
Development Paradigms and Development Studies	123
Relevance of Human Security	
to New Zealand Red Cross Delegates, and the Red Cross	124
Appendix 1 - Information Sheet for Research Participants	127
Appendix 2 - Consent Form for Research Participants	129
Appendix 3 - Incident Questions for Determining Case Study Inclusion	130
Appendix 4 - New Zealand Red Cross Delegate Deployments (1989 – 2014)	131
Appendix 5 - Incidences of New Zealand Red Cross Delegate Fatalities	132
Appendix 6 - Recognition of Exposure to Insecurity	
by Nurses from New Zealand	133
References	135

List of Graphs and Figures

Graph 1.1 - Trends in Frequency of (Major) Aid Worker Security Incidents (2000 – 2012)	4
Figure 5.1 - NZRC Deployments across the Components of the Red Cross	75
Figure 6.1 - Relationship of Concepts, Characteristics and Operational Definitions within the Discussion	96
Figure 6.2 - Location of Human Security and the Red Cross within a Security Matrix	98
Figure 6.3 - Location of Red Cross and the Spectrum of Security Challenges	99

List of Tables

Table 2.1 - Utilised NZRC Delegate Case-Studies	23
Table 4.1 - Human Security Framed Statements on the Interdependence between Rights and Development	58
Table 4.2 - Types of Health Security Violations in Humanitarian Operations and Development Programmes	67
Table 5.1 - Operational Definitions and Classifications of NZRC Delegate Security Incidents	78

List of Photos

Photo 3.1 - The 5 th NZRC Welfare Team at Camp Radcliffe, Vietnam, 1971	39
Photo 3.2 - NZRC Delegate in Papua New Guinea, 2011	42
Photo 3.3 - NZDF Conducted Scenarios at NZRC IMPACT Training, 2010	45
Photo 5.1 - NZRC Delegate seconded to the IFRC, alongside RCNS Staff in Senegal, 2012	76
Photo 5.2 - NZRC Delegate seconded to the ICRC in Libya, 2011	77
Photo 7.1 - NZRC Delegate seconded to the ICRC in Gaza, 2014	124

List of Acronyms and Abbreviations

AWSD	Aid Worker Security Database
BNA	Basic Needs Approach
BTC	Basic Training Course
CAR	Central African Republic
CCPS	Concentration Camp Parcel Service
Civ-Mil	Civilian-Military
CP	Civil and Political
DRR	Disaster Risk Reduction
EOM	End of Mission
FA	First Aid
HCiD	Health Care in Danger
HD	Human Development
HDI	Human Development Index
HPI	Human Poverty Index
HPG	Humanitarian Policy Group
IASC	Inter-Agency Standing Committee
ICISS	International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
IDRL	International Disaster Response Law
ICU	Intensive Care Unit
IDP	Internally Displaced Person
IED	Improvised Explosive Device
IFI	International Financial Institutions

IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
IFRC	International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies
IHL	International Humanitarian Law
IMPACT	International Mobilisation and Preparation for ACTION
ISAF	International Security Assistance Force
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MFAT	(New Zealand) Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade
The Movement	The Red Cross Movement
MSF	Médecins Sans Frontières (Doctors Without Borders)
MSU	Mobile Surgical Units
MUHEC	Massey University Human Ethics Committee
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organisation
NGO	Non-Government Organisation
NZDF	New Zealand Defence Force
NZRC	New Zealand Red Cross
ODA	Official Development Assistance
OEF	Operation Enduring Freedom
POW	Prisoner of War
PPE	Personal Protective Equipment
PRCS	Palestinian Red Crescent Society
R2P	Responsibility to Protect (also abbreviated as RtoP)
RCNS	Red Cross National Society
RPG	Rocket-Propelled Grenade
SARC	Syrian Arab Red Crescent

SLA	Sudan Liberation Army
UDHR	Universal Declaration on Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
VAD	Voluntary Aid Detachments
WHO	World Health Organisation
WWI	World War One
WWII	World War Two