

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**A Comparative Analysis of Student and Tutor  
Expectations and Experiences within a University  
Tutorial Setting**

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the degree of

**Master of Arts**

in

**Second Language Teaching  
at  
Massey University**

Dorothy Ann Dowds

1999

## **ABSTRACT**

The changing face of tertiary education within New Zealand has brought with it new challenges. One of these challenges has been catering for the increasing numbers of international students that choose to study at Massey University. This study focuses on the needs of these students in their first year at university in the context of the university tutorial. The study compares the expectations and experiences of students with English as their second language with those of students with English as their first language. It also draws a comparison between the views of these two groups of students with those of the tutors involved in the course. Information was gathered from the three groups of participants, by a survey, on their expectations and experiences of learning that takes place within the interactive tutorial setting. Additional data was obtained by interviewing a sample of the students with English as a second language.

The study reveals that there is a pronounced similarity between the expectations and concerns of both groups of students. All students and their tutors support the need for interactive learning. Despite this acknowledgement, high proportions of the students were dissatisfied with their personal performance within the tutorial. Language limitations were an acknowledged barrier to interaction for L2 students but these difficulties were not confined to international students with many local students having equally strong concerns. Lack of adequate preparation was raised as a major factor in the student's ability to participate successfully within the tutorial. . Tutors need to have skills that provide a positive interactive learning experience the will lead to a higher level of academic achievement for all students regardless of diverse abilities.

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

On completion of this thesis I would like to acknowledge the support and guidance from a number of people. A special mention is needed in recognition of my supervisor Dr. Margaret Franken for her time and effort. I am very appreciative of her continuing patience, professional encouragement and her unwavering ability to maintain my focus on the objectives of this study. I also wish to acknowledge the College of Education and Department of Educational Studies and Community Support for giving me the Advanced Study Award, which allowed me space to further this project.

I want to thank all the students who gave their input into this project especially the second language students who shared their concerns and experiences with me. I also wish to gratefully acknowledge the support of my teaching colleagues who not only participated in the study but also provided willing advice and support.

Finally, I wish to express my appreciation of the professional advice and personal faith of my husband Jack who provided invaluable moral support. I also wish to thank my children Adam and Rachel for their words of encouragement and their understanding of frequent absences. I also appreciatively acknowledge my daughter Rachel's invaluable assistance in sharing her superior computer skills.

## Table of Contents

			<b>Page</b>
<b>List of Figures</b>			vii
<b>List of Tables</b>			viii
<b>Chapter</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	1
<b>Chapter</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>Teaching across Cultures</b>	
	2.1	Introduction	5
	2.2	International students	5
	2.3	Response of the Universities	7
	2.4	Issues of academic competence	9
	2.5	Academic staff and student expectations	11
	2.6	The learning context	13
	2.6.1	The lecture	13
	2.6.2	The tutorial	15
	2.7	Conclusion	19
<b>Chapter</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>Barriers to Academic Competence in a New Cultural Context</b>	
	3.1	Introduction	21
	3.2	Academic competence	22
	3.3	Influence of Culture shock	22
	3.3.1	Culture	22
	3.3.2	Culture shock	23
	3.3.3	Adjustment to the host culture	24
	3.4	Institutional shock	26
	3.5	Conclusion	28

<b>Chapter</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>An Academic Culture: Expectations</b>	
	4.1	Introduction	30
	4.2	Student expectations of the University as an academic culture	30
	4.3	Expectations: Academic tasks	32
	4.4	Expectations: The cognitive process	34
	4.5	Expectations: Interaction and the role of the instructor	36
	4.6	Expectations: Interaction and the role of the student	38
	4.7	Conclusion	41
<b>Chapter</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>Investigation of Interaction within the Tutorial Setting</b>	
	5.1	Introduction	42
	5.2	Research design	43
	5.3	The present study	44
	5.4	The research questions	45
	5.5	Data gathering	46
	5.6	Rationale for the questionnaire items	46
	5.7	The questions	47
		5.7.1 The respondents	48
	5.8	The interview	48
		5.8.1 The respondents	50
	5.9	Data analysis	50
	5.10	Summary	51
<b>Chapter</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>The Results: L1 and L2 Students</b>	
	6.1	Introduction	52
	6.2	The response of the students	52
		6.2.1 Evaluating the tutorial	52
		6.2.2 Interaction and participation	55
		6.2.3 Tutorial preparation	60

	6.2.4	The tutors' role	65
	6.2.5	Evaluating tutorial activities	72
	6.2.6	The contribution of international students	75
	6.2.7	Student difficulties	77
6.3		Conclusion	79
<b>Chapter</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>Comparing the Results: L1 and L2 Students and their Tutors</b>	
	7.1	Introduction	80
	7.2	The Response of the tutors	80
		7.2.1 Evaluating the tutorial	80
		7.2.2 Interaction and participation	81
		7.2.3 Tutorial preparation	83
		7.2.4 The tutors' role	84
		7.2.5 Evaluating tutorial activities	87
		7.2.6 Contribution of international students	90
		7.2.7 Student difficulties	91
	7.3	Summary	92
	7.4	Conclusion	94
<b>Chapter</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>Deliberations</b>	
	8.1	Introduction	95
	8.2	Evaluating the tutorial	95
	8.3	Interaction and participation	96
	8.4	Tutorial preparation	99
	8.5	Tutors' role	100
	8.6	Tutorial activities	101
	8.7	Contribution of International students	102
	8.8	Student difficulties	102
	8.9	Summary	104

<b>Chapter</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>Conclusions</b>	
		Introduction	106
		Pedagogical Implications	106
		Implications for further study	110
		Concluding remarks	111
		<b>Bibliography</b>	113
<b>Appendix</b>	<b>A</b>		
		Records of International students at Massey University in 1998	128
<b>Appendix</b>	<b>B</b>		
		Records of International students at Massey University in 1999	131
<b>Appendix</b>	<b>C</b>		
		Adapted model for questionnaire categories	133
<b>Appendix</b>	<b>D</b>		
		Consent forms and background information for questionnaire	135
<b>Appendix</b>	<b>E</b>		
		Tables showing the results of <i>t</i> -tests	137
<b>Appendix</b>	<b>F</b>		
		Attributes for L2 student/tutor interaction	139



## List of Figures

	<b>Page</b>
Figure 1: Number of Students Representing Main Ethnic Groups at Massey University 1998	6
Figure 2: Matrix Model for Questionnaire Design	47
Figure 3 Importance of Interaction for Students & Tutors	81
Figure 4 Comparison of Views on Levels of Student Interaction within the Tutorial	82
Figure 5 Perceived View of Tutors' Role within the Tutorial	84
Figure 6 Advantageous Attributes for Student/Tutor Interaction	85
Figure 7 Skills Gained in Tutorials	87
Figure 8 Student Skills	89

## List of Tables

		Page
Table 1:	Optimal Setting for Academic Learning within the University Context	53
Table 2:	Responses to statements "Small group learning can be a most rewarding experience"	54
Table 3:	Rankings of Importance of Interaction	55
Table 4:	Expectations of Tutorial Participation	56
Table 5:	Expectations of Personal Participation	57
Table 6:	Understanding of Tutorial Content	59
Table 7:	Types of Tutorial Preparation	60
Table 8:	Importance of Preparation	61
Table 9:	Student Perception of Tutorial Preparation	62
Table 10:	Personal Preparation	63
Table 11:	Expectations of the Tutor	66
Table 12:	Responsibility for the Success of the Tutorial	67
Table 13a:	L1 Students' Response to Attributes for Student/Tutor Interaction	68
Table 13b:	L2 Students' Responses to Attributes for Student/Tutor Interaction	68
Table 14a:	L1 Ranking of Tutorial Activities	72
Table 14b:	L2 Ranking of Tutorial Activities	73
Table 15a:	L1 Ranking of Tutorial Skills Gained	73
Table 15b:	L2 Ranking of Tutorial Skills Gained	74
Table 16:	Responses to the Presence of L2 Students in Tutorial	75
Table 17:	Responses to Perceived Personal Difficulty with Understanding of Course Content	77
Table 18:	Responses to the Statement that Spoken Language is a Problem in Tutorials	78