

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Stories and Organizational Change –
Participants and Sensemaking in Local Government**

**A thesis report presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for
the Degree of Master of Philosophy (Business) in Communication
Management at Massey University, New Zealand**

**Mary Day
2002**

**Stories and Organizational Change –
Participants and Sensemaking in Local Government**

**A thesis report presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
Degree of Master of Philosophy (Business) in Communication
Management at Massey University, New Zealand**

**Mary Day
2002**

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank all those people who have provided assistance and support during the time I have worked on this research project.

In particular, I give sincere thanks to my supervisor, Professor Judy McGregor, for her encouragement, valuable feedback, guidance and contribution of ideas based on her wide knowledge and experience.

In addition, thanks must go to Alec Hunter who provided assistance with the transcription of tapes, to Sharon Benson, Annalyn McGill and Rachel Stillwell for their cheerful and willing assistance with the document production.

I am also very grateful for the assistance and time given by Ainsley Simmonds at the editing stage.

Finally, I would like to thank Massey University, College of Business, for giving me the Wellington Academic Development Award (WADA), which provided the resources, (both time and money), necessary to complete this research project.

Stories and Organizational Change – Participants and Sensemaking in Local Government

Abstract

This project explores the role of storytelling by individuals in times of organizational change. The study was carried out in a local body organization that, like other local body bodies in New Zealand, had been undergoing a series of changes over a period of several years as the result of central government reform.

There is a wide body of literature supporting the theory that the performance of stories is a key part of an organization's members' sensemaking. It has been shown that people reconstruct and interpret different experiences of organizational change and learning.

For this study a total of 21 employees from the local body were interviewed by way of storytelling. The main research question asked: "what do stories told by employees in an organization undergoing change indicate about the change?" Closely related sub-questions asked if stories indicated resistance or commitment to the changes, or degrees of resistance and/or commitment. Resistance to change is recognised as a critically important factor that can influence the success or otherwise of an organizational change. This resistance can be an impediment to progress. In times of organizational change, stories told by employees may indicate resistance to the change which, if not adequately addressed, may retard organizational change efforts.

The major findings from the employees' stories revealed some important key themes. They were that the participants had conflicting views of what the purpose of the current changes were. In addition, there was a general sense of, "here we go again", following on from previous changes in the organization. This perception gave the effect that participants had difficulty in viewing the current changes seriously. There was also a general perception that the right people were not being included in the change-making decision process. People felt left out and therefore expressed resistance in their stories. Further, a special group of people was selected from within the organization to carry out the change process and they too indicated feelings of isolation from and rejection by the organization's employees, and that created for them feelings of resistance.

Overall, it seemed clear the stories provided confirmed that participants resisted the change to varying degrees. Thornhill, Lewis and Millmore. (2000) states perceptions about change will affect its acceptance and may lead to resistance that could effectively minimise or even negate the purpose of the intended change. The analysis of these stories provided implications for change managers. This study has shown that the individuals' narratives or stories are a powerful vehicle and source of knowledge of how employees view happenings within the organization. A positive lesson to be learned from this research, and one which can be utilised by change managers in the future, is the significance of employees' stories and their importance to managers to listen to, gauge and assess the mood of the organization toward change.

A second round of interviews with a small group of the original interviewees, one year on, served the purpose of giving the participants an opportunity to reflect on the events and for sensemaking of what they didn't necessarily understand or were not aware of at the time of the first round. This proved to be a valuable opportunity to consider, reflect and learn for future organizational change processes.

It is suggested that it would be useful to conduct similar research within other local bodies that have also been undergoing series of changes over recent years following central government reform. Because of the uniqueness of local bodies and their position seated between public service organizations and the private sector, they are in a position where they are pressured to satisfy the demands of the stakeholders, both the community and the ratepayer-elected body of councillors. No doubt councils are continuing to investigate the most appropriate local government structures to meet their stakeholder's needs and the delivery of services.

Key Words

change, change management, commitment, culture, organization, organizational employees, resistance, sensemaking, stories.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
CHAPTER ONE: STORIES AND ORGANIZATIONAL CHANGE	1
1.1. Introduction	1
1.2. Organizational Stories	2
1.3. Culture defined and its relationship with stories	4
1.4. Stories defined and their roles in an organization	6
1.5. Introduction to study	7
1.5.1. Project description/proposal	7
1.5.2. Defining resistance and commitment	8
1.5.3. Specific objectives	9
1.5.4. Case study description	10
1.5.5. Local government reform	13
2. CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW	18
2.1. Review of relevant theory	18
2.2. Culture	18
2.2.1. Cultures in organizations - three perspectives	20
2.3. Storytelling	22
2.4. Review of relevant theory and research	24
2.4.1. Research on storytelling	25
2.4.2. The culture in which stories are told	25
2.5. Conclusions on relevant theory and research and future directions for New Zealand research	32
3. CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY	34
3.1. Introduction	34
3.2. Qualitative versus quantitative method debate	35
3.3. Method of data collection and process	38
3.4. Selection of participants	39
3.5. Ethical concerns/issues	40
3.6. Data analysis methods	40
3.7. Grounded Theory	41
3.8. Content analysis	42
3.9. Limitations	45

4.	CHAPTER FOUR: FINDINGS WITH SOME DISCUSSION	47
4.1.	Introduction	47
4.2.	Main Themes	50
4.2.1.	Operation Change – What is it?	50
4.2.2.	Operation Change team – perceptions / views	55
4.2.3.	Management team perceptions/views of Operation Change	61
4.2.4.	Staff perceptions/views of management in relation to Operation Change	63
4.2.5.	Signs of organizational resistance/commitment to Operation Change	64
4.2.6.	Staff perceptions/views of consultants and councillors	67
4.2.7.	Staff perceptions/views of consultants	68
4.2.8.	Staff perceptions/views of councillors	69
4.3.	Stories and sensemaking	70
5.	CHAPTER FIVE: ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION STAGE-ONE	88
5.1.	Introduction	88
5.2.	Theme One – Operation Change goals	90
5.3.	Theme Two –Weariness - Frequency of change	91
5.4.	Theme Three – Lack of employee involvement	94
5.5.	Theme Four – Isolation of Operation Change team	95
5.6.	Themes and their link to resistance and commitment	96
5.7.	Further factors related to Operation Change	98
6.	CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSIONS STAGE-ONE	101
7.	CHAPTER SEVEN: IMPLICATIONS STAGE-ONE	105
8.	CHAPTER EIGHT: HINDSIGHT – REFLECTIONS	111
9.	CHAPTER NINE: FINALE – OVERALL CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS STAGES ONE AND TWO	119
9.1.	Overview	119
9.2.	Implications for researchers	121
9.3.	Implications for change agents and managers	122
9.4.	Implications for research with local body organizations in New Zealand undergoing change	124
	REFERENCES	126
	INTRODUCTION TO APPENDICES	145

LIST OF TABLES

	Page
Table 1: Empirical Research Report Format	X
Table 2: Characteristics of the Three Perspectives of Organizational Culture and Storytelling	21
Table 3: Qualitative versus Quantitative: Characteristics of Qualitative and Quantitative Research	36
Table 4: Types of Qualitative Research in Education	37
Table 5: Interview Structure Continuum	38

LIST OF FIGURES

	Page
Figure 1: Research Project Plan: scope of research	2
Figure 2: The City units and functions	11
Figure 3: Stakeholders in Local Body Organisations	15
Figure 4: Components of Data Analysis: Interactive Model	41
Figure 5: Components of Data Analysis: Flow Model illustrating the overlapping processes of data collection, reduction and the drawing of conclusions.	45
Figure 6: Context Chart of interviewees positions	48
Figure 7: Staff feelings and reactions towards Operation Change	54
Figure 8: Continuum of feelings toward Operation Change by team members	59
Figure 9: Continuum of degrees of resistance / commitment towards Operation Change expressed by Interviewees	67
Figure 10: Typology of Operation Change team members feelings about Operation Change	96
Figure 11: The relationship between degrees of resistance/commitment	97
Figure 12: The life story of Operation Change	99
Figure 14: Position of Second Interviewees	111
Figure 15: Four Stage Organizational Learning Cycle	112
Figure 16: The sensemaking, listening, feedback cycle model	123

LIST OF APPENDICES

	Page
Appendix 1: Letters to participants – for stage-one interviews	146
Appendix 2: Information sheet for participants – for stage-one interviewees	148
Appendix 3: Participant Consent Form	150
Appendix 4: Conversation starters, story starters and probes for stage-one	153
Appendix 5: Themes arising from analysis of stories	155
Appendix 6: Letter and summary of stage-one implications given to stage-two participants	157
Appendix 7: Questions used as starters for stage-two interviewees	161

Content/Format of the Thesis Report

The format of this report mostly follows the formal style for empirical research reporting as described by Sumser (2001), with a few modifications and additions.

Sumser (2001) suggests three main sections. The first section is titled Conceptual Elements and consists of theory and a review of literature. The second section is titled Methodological Elements and consists of hypotheses or questions, definition of terms, design, sample and findings. The third and last section is also titled Conceptual Elements and consists of the analysis, conclusions and implications. Table 1 illustrates the format:

Table 1: Empirical Research Report Format (adapted from Sumser (2001) p. 45).

Conceptual Elements	Methodological Elements	Conceptual Elements
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Theory• Review of Literature	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Hypotheses/Questions• Definition of Terms• Design• Sample• Findings	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Discussion/Analysis• Conclusion• Implications

This report consists of the three main sections as described by Sumser (2001). The three sections are divided into chapters.

The first section covers conceptual elements over two chapters. Chapter One introduces the scope of the research project plan, rationale and context. It explores concepts, theories related to organizational culture, organizational change and stories and provides definitions. The project proposal and objectives are outlined, followed by a description of the local body organization where the research was conducted. A brief overview of local body reform in New Zealand in the last ten years is given.

Chapter Two, which is the Literature Review, covers some relevant theory of organizational culture and how storytelling can be viewed as a vital part of culture. Relevant research is also discussed.

Section two covers methodological elements in Chapters Three and Four. In Chapter Three the quantitative and qualitative research methodologies are briefly compared.

Various methods of qualitative data analysis are described and reasons for the chosen method of data analysis are given.

Chapter Four presents the findings from the interviews conducted, and stories gathered from the interviewees in stage-one. Findings are grouped into eight main themes.

Vignettes or excerpts of stories collected are included to illustrate the main points or themes identified from the findings. Following an introduction 4.1, this Chapter Four is divided into two sections: section 4.2, which provides findings to support the identified themes, and section 4.3, which provides interviewees' stories to illustrate identified themes.

Section three again covers conceptual elements in Chapters Five, Six, Seven, Eight and Nine.

Chapter Five contains an analysis and discussion of the main findings from stage-one, as outlined in Chapter Four. Excerpts of stories are included to support findings. Chapter Six pulls the results of the stage-one study into a conclusion, that sets the scene for the implications in Chapter Seven. The implications provide some pertinent messages for change management agents. Chapter Eight outlines the details of the second round of interviews (stage-two), carried out with five of the original 21 interviewees one year on. Before the second interview all five had been provided with a copy of the main findings arising from the original interviews. Interviewees' hindsight views and reflections on the events of the organizational change are described and discussed. Chapter Nine provides a brief overall conclusion with further implications.