Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Telling lives:
Children’s stories of hope, loss, love, and violence in Aotearoa/New Zealand

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy
in
Social Anthropology

at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand.

Jennifer Jean Infanti
2008
Abstract

This is a descriptive, exploratory study of children’s experiences and understandings of domestic violence in the Manawatu region of Aotearoa/New Zealand. It responds to the historical absence of children in anthropological research and in studies of domestic violence.

The research is based on data gathered through group activities and discussions with children, five to twelve years old, in a domestic violence education and support group. A series of life history interviews was also undertaken.

The study uncovers a myriad of ways that children make sense of domestic violence; incorporate their experiences of domestic violence into their identities; and manipulate, adapt, disrupt, or reproduce cultural knowledge about domestic violence in their own lives and relationships. Special focus is given to the role of helping or compassionate social relationships in children’s lives, not only for the physical safety of children but also for their ability to cope with domestic violence and bounce back from other hardships in life. The children’s narratives shared in this study have practical implications for domestic violence service delivery in New Zealand, as well as applied research with children more generally. The study also highlights children’s capacities for powerful observations, insights, and critical analysis.

The thesis itself incorporates many different modes of data (re-)presentation, including poetry, drama, vignettes, and experiments with narrative voice and researcher reflexivity. The use of these literary forms helps to weave multiple perspectives into the thesis, allowing participants to speak for themselves. It also assists in producing an engaging and accessible account of children’s lives, which shows or represents lived experience, an alternative to the large number of statistical analyses that exist in the literature on domestic violence.
Dedication

This research would have been entirely different if Chantelle had not been present at every initial programme interview and session of the Dragonflies Tamariki Programme. For your practical assistance, your wisdom, and your keen interest in this work, Chantelle, I am extremely fortunate. For the kind of friendship we shared over the course of our work together—an uncommon and intimate connection of spirit—I am immensely grateful. This work is as much yours as it is mine.
Acknowledgments

I have an affection for the overly sentimental, and I must admit to savouring this moment: Writing my own acknowledgments. It is both heart-warming and humbling to reflect on all of the people who have helped this project to its fruition and made my four years in New Zealand a truly wonderful time.

My gratitude extends first to my research participants who made this work possible. Although I cannot name you in this work, I hope I have thanked you enough in person for sharing your time and experiences with me with so much enthusiasm and earnestness. Your stories have touched my life in far-reaching ways.

The Palmerston North Women’s Refuge Trust Inc. played a similarly crucial role in breathing life into my research topic. To Erena, in particular, thank you for giving my ideas unreserved support; I could not have got this project off the ground without it.

Next, to my supervisors as Massey University in Palmerston North, many thanks first to Peggy for getting me to New Zealand and for your confidence in my academic abilities. To Robyn, who joined my supervisory ‘team’ at a critical point in the project, thank you for giving my writing such thoughtful consideration, and for your empathy and insight into the PhD process. To Sita, you have provided essential continuity over the four years of this study. Thank you also for challenging me to make this a much better, and more creative, thesis.

To the friends I shared an office with at Massey—in particular, Kirsty, Tom, Lorena, and Polly—thank you for always providing a lively workspace, for commiserating with me, and celebrating the small successes (yours and mine) along the way.

Now, acknowledgments to my friends in Palmerston North, who will be affectionately missed when I leave New Zealand. To Aurélie, Nicolas, and Carol—my best flatmates ever!—I don’t believe I’ll eat another piece of quiche (or kimchi!) without a fond memory of life at Atawhai with you all—thank you for this. Thank you to Dan for your empathy; to Arne for brightening my days with thoughts of vegan cupcakes; to Romaric for encouraging me to get out on the weekends, especially to the river; and to David and Karine for your generosity and friendliness from the very start. To Amélie, ma minouchette, what would I have done without you? Having
you there (online!) to listen to all my complaints has been a huge relief; I could not have started or completed my PhD with anyone more fun or supportive. Next year, post-PhD’s, we will have many adventures. Thanks to Dr. Tuffley for your time and BtFxnical genius when I hardly even knew you—your generosity was (is!) much appreciated. And, to Kelly, thank you for the reassurance that I wasn’t actually “the most stressed PhD student in the world”...and for the soufflé! To Dion, well, this is most tricky—I would need an entire page to acknowledge all of the ways you’ve helped me get through this thesis (and that is no exaggeration). I’ll settle on thanking you, here, for sharing your most perceptive and constructive opinions and ideas on my work and for the many adventures we’ve had together. For your friendship, Dion, ma petite frite, I am truly fortunate.

Now, to ma puce, otherwise known as Donn, or Little Monster, thank you for starting with me in New Zealand and offering an exciting “escape” to Geneva at the end, and for teaching me how to be (maybe just a little bit) more patient and peaceful. While I have tried to apply your “Five Rules to Thesis Success in Top Speed,” I am lacking the basic qualification—Rule Number One: Be Donn Morrison. Fortunately, I’ll soon be on a flight to Switzerland. Thanks also for putting up with all my ‘doubting moments’ and, most of all, for the surprising and delightful way our relationship has been enriched despite of (perhaps because of) so much time and distance.

Finally, to my family in Canada—most of all my mom, Phyllis—thank you for the unqualified belief in my abilities. I am pleased to say that, in fact, you were right, I made it to the end. Mom, I have yet to meet anyone as caring or compassionate as you and your example, I believe, has helped me become a much better researcher. While I cannot share this thesis with Dad, we both know that the hours I spent discussing writing (mine and others) with him fueled my desire to ask questions in general. It might not be the most appropriate place to acknowledge this here, but why not? Let it be in print: I could never have imagined—let alone wished for—better parents.

J.J.I.

Approval for this research was obtained from the Massey University Human Ethics Committee, PN Application 04/181.
# Contents

## List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>xi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 1 It all started in Rio de Janeiro

- The very beginning ........................................... 1
- Staking ‘the field’ in Aotearoa/New Zealand ............... 2
- New beginnings .................................................. 5
- Reference points .................................................. 6
- Capturing experience alive ...................................... 7
- Invitation .......................................................... 8

## 2 The bigger story

### Part I—The historical framework: Children and childhood in anthropology

- Early conceptualisations: ‘evolutionism’ to ‘socialisation’ .... 13
- Emerging critiques: ‘Symbolic interactionism’ to ‘child saving’ ... 15
- Children as social actors ............................................ 18

### Part II—Domestic violence in anthropology and Aotearoa/New Zealand

- Anthropological research on domestic violence .................. 20
- Aotearoa/New Zealand: The local research context ............... 24
- Children in domestic violence research in Aotearoa/New Zealand ... 26

### Part III—Writing stories, showing lives

- Writing experiments .................................................. 31
  - Reflexive texts ..................................................... 31
  - Autoethnography ..................................................... 32
  - Ethnographic fiction ............................................... 32
  - Creative analytic practices ....................................... 34
  - Narrative ethnography ............................................. 34
  - Writing for action .................................................. 36
- Chapter conclusions .................................................. 38
## 3 Becoming an engaged anthropologist

- Recording the field .......................................................... 42
  - Writing my way in: Writing methods ................................ 42
  - Writing performance ..................................................... 45

- A Record of Fieldwork: A Play in Four Acts ......................... 47
  - Audience Briefing: Act I .............................................. 48
  - Act I: The Assessment Interview .................................... 49
  - Reflections: Act I ...................................................... 59
  - Audience Briefing: Act II ............................................. 62
  - Act II: Week 5 of the *Dragonflies Tamariki Programme* ..... 63
  - Reflections: Act II ...................................................... 94
  - Jamie ........................................................................... 95
  - Ben ............................................................................. 96
  - Olivia .......................................................................... 97
  - Kerry ........................................................................... 99
  - Steven .......................................................................... 100

- Interval: From *Dragonflies* to Follow-up Interviews .............. 103
  - Audience Briefing: Act III ............................................ 107
  - Act III: A Conversation with Steven ............................... 108
  - Reflections: Act III ...................................................... 132
  - Accidents and injuries, secrets and silences ....................... 132
  - Connecting to family through sport ................................ 135
  - “Children have to hide:” Coping with family violence ........ 136

  - Audience Briefing: Act IV ............................................. 139
  - Act IV: Olivia’s story .................................................... 140
  - Reflections: Act IV ...................................................... 148
  - Optimism and discursive resources ................................. 148
  - Alternative futures and possible selves: Reflexivity and agency 150
  - “An upside-down pineapple cake:” Intellectual capacities ........ 152
  - On ‘witnessing’ and helping family relationships ............. 154

- Chapter conclusions ............................................................ 156

## 4 Pania’s story: A manifesto for hope ................................. 159

- Introducing Pania’s story .................................................... 160
  - Pania’s story ................................................................. 162
  - Bearing witness (A poem for four voices) ........................ 162
  - Reflections on Pania’s story: Resilience in the face of trauma 178

- Part I: On hope ..................................................................... 178
  - Understanding hope ....................................................... 180
  - Psychological perspectives on hope ................................. 180
  - Resilience research on hope ......................................... 182
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Phenomenological hope</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social and relational views of hope</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pania’s hope</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hope-as-a-skill</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Realistic hope: A social practice and imperative</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Part II: On wisdom</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What is wisdom?</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Illustrating Pania’s wisdom</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Knowledge of life’s unpredictabilities and uncertainties</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Engaging in self-reflection</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reframing: Making ‘the best of things’</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Implications of Pania’s wisdom</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The interplay of hope and wisdom</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusions on hope, wisdom, love, and relational possibilities</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>5 Joshua’s story: On anger, loss, and violence</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Introducing Joshua</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>First meeting</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Scenes from three viewpoints</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Week 4: Joshua’s group of the Dragonflies Tamariki Programme</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reflections</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“I cut the man’s leg with a sword:” Fantasies of violence</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The chaos and uncertainties of life</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>6 The finale</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>On the nature of violence and abuse: A summary of children’s experiences</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Parenting: Separations and multiple losses</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Silencing discourses</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Informal help(ers) in children’s lives: Siblings and extended family</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Māori and domestic violence in Aotearoa/New Zealand: A public debate</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Methodological contributions to research with children</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Final reflections: Fieldworker as witness</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Appendices</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Appendix A: Dragonflies programme information</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Appendix B: Research information sheets</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Appendix C: Research consent forms</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures

3.1 Excerpt from *A Place for Starr*, by Howard Schor and Mary Kilpatrick 77
3.2 Olivia’s workbook answers: “What is abuse?” 79
3.3 Jamie’s workbook answers: “What does it feel like when parents fight?” 80
3.4 Olivia’s workbook answers: Final questions on *A Place for Starr* 81
3.5 Kerry’s ‘angry fight’ drawing 85
3.6 Olivia’s ‘angry fight’ drawing 86
3.7 Ben’s ‘angry fight’ drawing 88
3.8 Jamie’s ‘angry fight’ drawing 91