PRINCIPAL SELECTION BY BOARDS OF TRUSTEES
PERCEPTION AND PROCESS

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Educational Administration.

H. Rose Norman

Department of Education
Massey University
1980
Abstract

This research study examines three regional primary school Boards of Trustees in New Zealand leading up to the appointment of their new teaching principal. It focuses on trustee perceptions of educational leadership and on each Board's principal selection procedures. The conceptual and research framework identifies three areas for investigation: trustees' new employer role as a result of devolved educational control and their future training needs; the principal's dichotomous role as leader and manager of the school; and the efficacy of the principal selection process taking into account trustees' knowledge of the job, core principal qualities necessary for the position, identification of selection criteria, subjective factors and gender considerations.

A qualitative case study approach was used to illuminate the selection process which involved a total of 17 trustees. The research design was based around four information sources: documentary analysis, questionnaire, observational recording of meeting discussions, and a focussed interview with each trustee. Results of the study showed that trustees' predominant perceptions of principal qualities lay in the area of personal relationships and practical teaching experiences, with a preference for leadership rather than managerial skills. Trustees were not yet comfortable in their employer role, and selection processes displayed weaknesses in assessment methodologies and their consistent application. Results also revealed the impact on trustees' decision-making of subjective factors such as selector impressionism, and of the concept of 'best fit' involving dual processes of job and person perceptions.

As a consequence, the study recommends that future trustee selection training should be directed towards an understanding of employment legislation and of school leadership and management issues, and a greater proficiency in the use of valid assessment methods. These research findings have implications not only for trustee personnel training but for the expectations of a principal's role in today's schools, and for a broader definition of the principle of merit selection.
Acknowledgements

I would like to express my appreciation to the 17 primary school trustees who agreed to my presence at their principal selection meetings and who freely shared their personal time and experiences to answer the questionnaire survey and interview questions. Like the other hundreds of trustee volunteers throughout New Zealand, their conscientious endeavours to enhance teaching and learning for children often go unrecognised.

Dr Wayne Edwards and Marian Court provided supervisory support, and I thank them both for their pertinent observations and suggestions during the compilation of this research study, and for their critical analysis and encouragement in the concluding stages of editing.

The assistance of my secretarial staff, Margot Koele and Lisa Johnson, with processing drafts of the study is very much appreciated. Their comments were often timely as were those of Susan Lovett, Dunedin College of Education.

For the duration of the research, my wife Julie processed drafts and transcribed the trustees’ interviews. To her and our two children, Danielle and Iain, I owe a huge debt as they patiently watched their husband and father disappear at unseemly hours to the study or to another Board meeting.
# Table of Contents

Abstract  

Acknowledgements  

List of Tables and Figures  

Introduction  

Chapter One  
GOVERNANCE AND SCHOOL LEADERSHIP ISSUES:  
CONTEXTUAL AND CONCEPTUAL LITERATURE  
The role of governing bodies in principal selection  
Management versus leadership: the great debate  

Chapter Two  
RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION OF PRINCIPALS:  
A REVIEW OF THE RESEARCH LITERATURE  

Chapter Three  
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY  

Chapter Four  
CASE STUDY: HIGHFIELD PRIMARY SCHOOL  

Chapter Five  
CASE STUDY: CENTRAL PRIMARY SCHOOL  

Chapter Six  
CASE STUDY: MIDDLETON PRIMARY SCHOOL  

Chapter Seven  
FROM PERCEPTION TO PROCESS: AN ANALYSIS  
Trustee perceptions of educational leadership  
The selection process
Chapter Eight
PRINCIPAL SELECTION: TRUSTEE IMPLICATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Trustees' employer role in the 1990's
Recommendations for training and future practice

Conclusion

Appendices
Board of Trustees questionnaire
Observational recording format
Trustee interview schedule
Letter requesting participation
Letter of support
Agreement of understanding
Interview transcript
Trustee meeting summary sheet
Data sources for research questions

References
List of Tables and Figures

Figure 1 Data collection time chart 50

Table
4.1 Trustee perceptions of principal qualities by grouped ranking:
    Highfield Primary School 54
4.2 Leadership qualities identified at candidate interview:
    Highfield Primary School 56
4.3 Priority order of essential leadership qualities:
    Highfield Primary School 57
4.4 Critical factors during shortlisting and post-interview discussion:
    Highfield Primary School 59
4.5 Concepts of leadership and management:
    Highfield Primary School 60
4.6 Documentary analysis:
    Highfield Primary School 71
4.7 Major criteria identified across a range of sources:
    Highfield Primary School 76
5.1 Trustee perceptions of principal qualities by grouped ranking:
    Central Primary School 90
5.2 Leadership qualities identified at candidate interview:
    Central Primary School 92
5.3 Priority order of essential leadership qualities:
    Central Primary School 93
5.4 Critical factors during shortlisting and post-interview discussion:
    Central Primary School 95
5.5 Concepts of leadership and management:
    Central Primary School 96
5.6 Documentary analysis:
    Central Primary School 108
5.7 Major criteria identified across a range of sources:
    Central Primary School 112
6.1 Trustee perceptions of principal qualities by grouped ranking:  
Middleton Primary School  

6.2 Leadership qualities identified at candidate interview:  
Middleton Primary School  

6.3 Priority order of essential leadership qualities:  
Middleton Primary School  

6.4 Critical factors during shortlisting and post-interview discussion:  
Middleton Primary School  

6.5 Concepts of leadership and management:  
Middleton Primary School  

6.6 Documentary analysis:  
Middleton Primary School  

6.7 Major criteria identified across a range of sources:  
Middleton Primary School  

7.1 Essential principal qualities in ranked order:  
Highfield, Central and Middleton Primary Schools  

7.2 Criteria identification across documentary sources:  
Highfield, Central and Middleton Primary Schools