The role of public relations strategies in shaping or reflecting national identity: A content analysis of the speeches of two Governors-General in New Zealand

A 219.899 presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Communication at Massey University, Auckland, New Zealand

NATALIE YVETTE BRUNZEL

01089129

2015

Word count, 29,922
Abstract

This thesis focuses on the role public relations strategies perform in reflecting or shaping New Zealand identity by using content analysis to examine the speeches of two Governors-General from different eras. The core data which is the focus of this analysis comprises the swearing-in, Waitangi Day and Anzac Day speeches delivered by Lord Cobham (1957-1962) and Sir Jerry Mateparae (2011-present). Cobham, an English aristocrat, became Governor-General a decade after New Zealand commenced governing independently and ended a decade before Britain joined the European Union. It signals a time when New Zealand prosperity hinged on Britain and represents a moment in time when British ideology was strongly linked to New Zealand identity. Mateparae, a New Zealander with Māori ancestry, took office at a time of increased debate surrounding the nation’s identity in relation to the flag. A comparison between the two offers insight into the fluidity of the nation’s identity.

Amidst the debate of the flag is an underlying questioning of the need for New Zealand to maintain its link with Britain. The Governor-General’s role is ceremonial, constitutional and community focused. This means the incumbent performs a key part, by delivering speeches, in the rituals which symbolise the nation’s identity (e.g., Waitangi Day). It is important to understand whether the Governor-General is shaping or reflecting the New Zealand national identity as the role requires s/he be apolitical.

Qualitative content analysis was used to analyse the data applying the rhetorical theory framework. The findings suggest that two Governors-General have used public relations strategies to primarily reflect the dominant publics’ national identity, within the existing social hierarchy. The findings of this research could be
furthered by an analysis of what New Zealanders perceive to be the role of the Governor-General and who s/he reflects compared with the findings of this thesis which emphasised that only the views of the influential publics were being reflected.
Acknowledgements

There are a number of people without whom I would not have been able to complete this thesis. The encouragement and support that I have received throughout this journey has been inspiring. Firstly, I would like to thank those that have gone before me, whose literature ignited a passion for learning that will continue throughout my life.

Secondly, there is the academic input. I would like to thank Associate Professor Dr Margaret Brunton and Professor Christoper Galloway for their numerous hours of revising draft manuscripts and helping me navigate the undulating seas of academic writing. I also would like to acknowledge the countless hours and patients Dr Vanessa van der Ham from the Student Learning Centre provided.

I want to express my gratitude to Jan Mandeno for everything! Your calm, steady input ensured that I continued even when it seemed like an insurmountable task at hand. I would also like to thank Gerard Chow for being so flexible with the support that the Disability Support Services provided without which writing this thesis would have been impossible.

A large part of this thesis required support from Library staff to locate materials, so I would like to thank Archives NZ, Massey University Library and National Library staff. I would like to especially thank Fiona Diesch for your
unwavering support in navigating the complexities of the EndNote referencing programme.

Last but not least I am grateful to my family for supporting and willingness to go the extra mile in all aspects of my life (especially Suzanne Brunzel for all the healthy meals). To my friends whom have helped in big and small ways: Rebecca Bailey, Monika Benkovic, Sheri Cowell, Sharné Lucas, Alison Booth, Julie Tolsma and Elizabeth Mandeno.
Table of Contents

Abstract............................................................................................................................................ 2
Acknowledgements ............................................................................................................................ 4

Chapter 1: Introduction .................................................................................................................. 1

1.1 National identity ........................................................................................................................ 2
1.2 Purpose ...................................................................................................................................... 8
1.3 Research Question .................................................................................................................... 10
1.4 Analysis .................................................................................................................................... 10
1.5 Scope ...................................................................................................................................... 11
1.6 Rationale .................................................................................................................................. 12
1.7 Organisation of thesis ................................................................................................................ 15

Chapter 2: Literature Review ........................................................................................................ 17

2.1 National Identity ....................................................................................................................... 17
2.2 New Zealand National Identity ................................................................................................. 22
2.3 Language .................................................................................................................................. 28
2.4 Public Relations ....................................................................................................................... 28
2.4.1 Rhetorical theory .................................................................................................................... 30
2.4.2 Speeches ............................................................................................................................... 33

Summary 2.5 ...................................................................................................................................... 37

Chapter 3: Methodology ................................................................................................................ 38

3.1.1 Rationale ............................................................................................................................... 39
3.1.2 Constructivist/Interpretive research ..................................................................................... 40

3.2 Method ..................................................................................................................................... 43
3.2.1 Critical analysis ..................................................................................................................... 44
3.2.2 Rhetorical theory ................................................................................................................... 47
3.2.3 Limitations ............................................................................................................................ 51
Appendix 4.1: Cobham’s Waitangi Day Speech 1960 without coding .......................... 136
Appendix 5: Cobham’s Waitangi Day Speech 1962 Original ............................... 138
  Appendix 5.1: Cobham’s Waitangi Day Speech 1962 ........................................ 144
Appendix 6: Mateparae’s Waitangi Day Speech 2012 .................................. 148
Appendix 7: Mateparae’s Waitangi Day Speech 2013 .................................. 152
Appendix 8: Mateparae’s Waitangi Day Speech 2014 .................................. 156
Appendix 9: Mateparae’s Waitangi Day Speech 2015 .................................. 160
Appendix 10: Mateparae’s Anzac Day Speech 2012 - Christchurch .................. 163
Appendix 11: Mateparae’s Anzac Day Speech 2013 - Wellington .................. 165
Appendix 12: Mateparae’s Anzac Day Speech 2014 – Anzac Cove .................... 168
Appendix 13: Coding Phase 1 ............................................................................ 171
  Appendix 13.1: Cobham’s Swearing-in Speech 1957 .................................. 172
  Appendix 13.2: Mateparae’s Swearing-in 2011 ........................................... 174
  Appendix 13.3: Cobham’s Waitangi Day Speech 1959 .............................. 177
  Appendix 13.4: Cobham’s Waitangi Speech 1960 ..................................... 180
  Appendix 13.5: Cobham’s Waitangi Day Speech 1962 .............................. 182
  Appendix 13.6: Mateparae’s Waitangi Day Speech 2012 ......................... 186
  Appendix 13.7: Mateparae’s Waitangi Day Speech 2013 .......................... 190
  Appendix 13.8: Mateparae’s Waitangi Day Speech 2014 .......................... 194
  Appendix 13.9: Mateparae’s Waitangi Day Speech 2015 ......................... 198
  Appendix 13.10: Mateparae’s Anzac Day Speech 2012 ............................ 201
  Appendix 13.11: Mateparae’s Anzac Day Speech 2013 ............................ 203
  Appendix 13.12: Mateparae’s Anzac Day Speech 2014 ............................ 206
Appendix 14: Coding Phase Two ..................................................................... 209
  Appendix 14.1: Cobham’s Swearing-in Speech 1957 ............................... 210
  Appendix 14.2: Mateparae’s Swearing in Speech 2011 .............................. 212
  Appendix 14.3 Cobham’s Waitangi Day Speech 1959 .............................. 215
Appendix 14.4 Cobham’s Waitangi Day Speech 1960................................. 218
Appendix 14.5 Cobham’s Waitangi Day Speech 1962................................. 220
Appendix 14.6: Mateparae’s Waitangi Day Speech 2012............................. 224
Appendix 14.7: Mateparae’s Waitangi Day Speech 2013............................. 228
Appendix 14.8: Mateparae’s Waitangi Day Speech 2014............................. 232
Appendix 14.9: Mateparae’s Waitangi Day Speech 2015............................. 236
Appendix 14.10: Mateparae’s Anzac Day Speech 2012.............................. 239
Appendix 14.11: Mateparae’s Anzac Day Speech 2013.............................. 241
Appendix 14.12: Mateparae’s Anzac Day Speech 2014.............................. 244
Appendix 15: Summary of Newspapers.................................................... 247
Appendix 15.1: Wednesday 4th September 1957...................................... 248
Appendix 15.2: Thursday 5th September 1957........................................... 248
Appendix 15.3: Friday 6th September 1957.............................................. 250
Appendix 15.4: Saturday 7th September 1957............................................ 251
Appendix 15.5: Monday 9th September 1957........................................... 251
Appendix 15.6: Tuesday 10th September 1957.......................................... 252
Appendix 15.7: Wednesday 11th September 1957..................................... 254
Appendix 15.8: Thursday 12th September 1957....................................... 255
Appendix 15.9: Friday 13th September 1957............................................. 255
Appendix 15.10: Saturday 14th September 1957....................................... 255
Appendix 15.11: Monday 16th September 1957........................................ 256
Appendix 15.12: Tuesday 17th and Wednesday 18th September 1957........ 256
Appendix 15.13: Thursday 19th September 1957..................................... 257
Appendix 15.14: Friday 20th September 1957.......................................... 257
Appendix 15.15: Saturday 21st September 1957....................................... 257
Appendix 15.15: Monday 23rd September 1957....................................... 258
Appendix 15.16: Tuesday 24th September 1957....................................... 258
Appendix 15.17: Wednesday 25th September 1957................................................................. 259
Appendix 15.18: Thursday 26th September 1957................................................................. 259
Appendix 15.19: Wednesday 24th August 2011................................................................. 259
Appendix 15.20: Thursday 25th August 2011................................................................. 260
Appendix 15.21: Friday 26th August 2011................................................................. 260
Appendix 15.22: Saturday 27th August 2011................................................................. 261
Appendix 15.23: Sunday 28th August 2011 ................................................................. 261
Appendix 15.24: Monday 29th August 2011................................................................. 262
Appendix 15.25: Tuesday 30th August 2011 ................................................................. 262
Appendix 15.26: Wednesday 31st August 2011............................................................... 263
Appendix 15.27: Thursday 1st September 2011 ............................................................. 263
Appendix 15.28: Friday 2nd September 2011 .................................................................. 264
Appendix 15.29: Saturday 3rd September 2011............................................................... 265
Appendix 15.30: Sunday 4th September 2011 ................................................................. 266
Appendix 15.31: Monday 5th September 2011 ................................................................. 266
Appendix 15.32: Tuesday 6th September 2011 ................................................................. 266
Appendix 15.33: Wednesday 7th September 2011............................................................ 267
Appendix 15.34: Thursday 8th September 2011 ............................................................... 267
Appendix 15.35: Friday 9th September 2011 ................................................................. 268
Appendix 15.36: Saturday 10th September 2011............................................................. 269
Appendix 15.37: Sunday 11th September 2011................................................................. 269
Appendix 15.38: Monday 12th September 2011 ............................................................... 270
Appendix 15.39: Tuesday 13th September 2011 ............................................................... 270
Appendix 15.40: Wednesday 14th September 2011........................................................ 271
Appendix 16: Anzac Day Newspaper clippings (e.g., Queen’s message. The Dominion. April 24 1958.) ............................................................................................................................... 272
List of tables:

Table 1: Modes of persuasion ........................................................................ 50
List of figures:

Figure 1: Step model of inductive category development................................. 57