Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
The Writing of Explanations and Justifications in Mathematics

Brenda Anne Bicknell

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Education Massey University 1998
ABSTRACT

This study reports on the writing of explanations and justifications in mathematics. A variety of approaches including a document analysis, teacher survey, students’ responses to problem solving tasks, and student interviews were used to examine the complexities and interpretations of writing explanations and justifications in mathematics. The study involved six teachers and 36 Year 11 students from a provincial co-educational secondary school; 14 of the students were interviewed.

An analysis of the Year 11 national mathematics examination, School Certificate, revealed a significant increase in emphasis on the writing of explanations; from 2.7% of the total marks in 1992, to 16% of the total marks in 1997. It was not until 1997 that students were specifically asked to write justifications. In this study students experienced some difficulties writing explanations and had concerns about whether their explanations were satisfactory; a variety of modes of representation were used by students. Most students surveyed were unable to write justifications; they lacked knowledge and confidence in justifying their solutions. The teachers believed that the writing of explanations and justifications was an important process but expressed a number of concerns. These concerns were the class time needed, and the lack of resources and professional development. Both students and teachers were concerned about not knowing what makes a quality response.

The writing of explanations and justification should be a valued and regular part of the mathematics programme so that students are able to develop and evaluate mathematical arguments and proofs and effectively communicate their findings to others. The study suggests that students and teachers need to work together in negotiating an understanding of what is meant by an explanation, and a justification, and what makes a quality response.
This thesis is essentially about the interface of mathematics, language, and the communication process. This study began to form in my mind when I became aware of the impact of a new mathematics syllabus which specifies mathematical processes as a separate and identifiable strand. Teachers and students were expressing interest in, and concern about the writing process in mathematics and so I decided to take the opportunity, in the final stages of my degree, to explore a topic that appeared important and timely. It also gave me an opportunity to mesh two personal interest areas, language and mathematics, and more specifically to try and answer key questions about the writing of explanations and justifications in mathematics. I felt confident that a qualitative methodology was appropriate in order to answer these questions and so my journey began...

I would like to acknowledge and thank the many people who made this study possible. Firstly I would like to acknowledge Dr. Glenda Anthony, my main supervisor, who provided continuing interest and invaluable professional support. My thanks are extended to Brian Finch, my second supervisor who gave such positive and encouraging feedback throughout the study.

To Johanna, Lesley, Anne, and Tim a special thanks; you showed such faith in my original ideas and helped me remain confident and focused. Special appreciation must go to my other friends and teaching colleagues who have endured my 'ups' and 'downs' as I shared frustrations, concerns, and excitement with them. My gratitude is extended to the staff and students of the school, who contributed their time and efforts, and willingly shared their views with me; without their input this study would not have been possible.

Lastly, I must acknowledge my family for their patience and tolerance in having a mother and wife whose attention at times seemed more focused on this study than on family interests and commitments. I have returned!

Good company in a journey makes
the way to seem the shorter.

Izaak Walton, The Compleat Angler
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**ABSTRACT** (ii)

**PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS** (iii)

**TABLE OF CONTENTS** (iv)

**CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION**

1.1 Background to the Study 7
1.2 Research Objectives 9
1.3 Definition of Terms 9
1.4 Overview 10

**CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW**

2.1 Introduction 11
2.2 Language and Mathematics 12
2.3 Communication 15
2.4 Problem Solving 26
2.5 Assessment 31
2.6 Summary 42

**CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH DESIGN**

3.1 Introduction 43
3.2 Data Collection Methods 45
3.3 The Project: Setting, Sample, and Schedule 51
3.4 Quality Criteria 54
3.5 Summary 59

**CHAPTER 4: SCHOOL CERTIFICATE ANALYSIS**

4.1 Introduction 60
4.2 Analysis Criteria 61
4.3 What Emphasis is Given to the Writing of Explanations and Justifications? 62
4.4 In Which Content Strands Do the Questions Appear? 65
4.5 What Prompts Are Used and How Well Did Students Respond to Them? 66
4.6 Summary 74
### CHAPTER 5: STUDENT RESPONSES
- 5.1 Introduction 76
- 5.2 Problem Analysis 76
- 5.3 Summary 94

### CHAPTER 6: STUDENT VIEWS
- 6.1 Introduction 95
- 6.2 Students' Feelings About the Writing of Explanations and Justifications 96
- 6.3 Classroom Practice 101
- 6.4 Knowing What Makes a Quality Response 102
- 6.5 How Does Writing in Mathematics Differ From Writing in English? 103
- 6.6 Summary 104

### CHAPTER 7: TEACHER RESPONSES
- 7.1 Introduction 106
- 7.2 The Importance of Writing Explanations and Justifications 107
- 7.3 Using 'Mathematics in the New Zealand Curriculum' 108
- 7.4 Problems Identified By the Teachers 110
- 7.5 Summary 113

### CHAPTER 8: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION
- 8.1 Introduction 115
- 8.2 The Role of Writing Explanations and Justifications 115
- 8.3 Issues of Concern 116
- 8.4 Implications 120
- 8.5 Further Research 123
- 8.6 Conclusion 125

### BIBLIOGRAPHY
127

### APPENDICES:
- Appendix A: Information Sheet 138
- Appendix B: Problem Solving Tasks 139
- Appendix C: Student Interview Schedule 142
- Appendix D: Teacher Questionnaire 143
LIST OF TABLES:

4.1 Explanations and Justifications in School Certificate Mathematics 62
4.2 Marks Allocated to Explanations and Justifications in School Certificate Mathematics by Content Strand 65
4.3 Writing Prompts Used in School Certificate Mathematics for the Writing of Explanations and Justifications 67
5.1 Students' Mathematical Arguments for Problem 1 78
5.2 Students' Modes of Representation for Problem 3 85
5.3 Students' Mathematical Arguments for Problem 5 91
7.1 Years of Teaching Experience 106
7.2 Suggested Year for Introducing Writing Explanations and Justifications 109

LIST OF FIGURES:

2.1 Elaborations in student expository writing 22
(Shield & Galbraith, 1998, p. 42)
4.1 Percentage of total marks for each content strand, 1992-1997 65
4.2 School Certificate, 1994, Question Two 68
4.3 School Certificate, 1994, Question Eleven 69
4.4 School Certificate, 1995, Question Eleven 71
4.5 School Certificate, 1995, Question Eight 72
4.6 School Certificate, 1997, Question One 74
5.1 The measurement problem 77
5.2 An example of an explanation using symbols 79
5.3 An example of an explanation using symbols and words 79
5.4 An example of an explanation which includes a diagram 80
5.5 The number problem 82
5.6 The statistics problem 84
5.7 An example of a verbal explanation 86
5.8 An example of an explanation combining words and symbols 86
5.9 An example of an incomplete verbal explanation 87
5.10 The algebra problem 88
5.11 The geometry problem 90
5.12 An example of an explanation using symbols 92
5.13 An example of an explanation using symbols, words, and a diagram 92