Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
A comparison of reading attainment in two first grade classes in a state and a Montessori school in Switzerland

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Master’s Degree
In
Educational Psychology (MEdPsych)

At Massey University, Auckland
New Zealand

Judith Mary Elben
2015
ABSTRACT

The main purpose of this study is to examine whether the age at which children start to learn to read affects their later progress - specifically, whether an earlier start at reading gives children an advantage when they enter first grade at the age of six years. The study was conducted in Zürich, Switzerland, and compared a first grade class in a local school with two first grade classes in a Montessori school. There were 42 participants aged between six and seven years, 22 girls and 20 boys. The children were given a series of alphabet knowledge, reading and phoneme tests at the beginning and end of the year to measure the reading progress of each group. It was found that although the Montessori children who had already attended the Montessori kindergarten had an advantage over the local children, this advantage was only significant for alphabet knowledge, and was not translated into a significant advantage in either phonemic awareness or reading ability. Reasons for this were considered including the relative efficiency with which children learned to read in German at the local school, possible failings in the Montessori instruction, and the fact that many of the local children had already learned to read at home before starting school something that may be related to the high socioeconomic status (SES) and home literacy environment (HLE) of both groups.
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the school principals for allowing me to conduct the study at their schools; the teachers for generously sharing their time, experience and classrooms with me; and the children for taking part in the testing with such enthusiasm.

I would also like to thank my supervisors, Professor Tom Nicholson and Dr Michael Irwin for their patient support and invaluable advice.

Finally, I would like to thank Dr Sebastian Suggate for advising me on the appropriate tests to use in German.
**Table of Contents**

Abstract 2

Acknowledgements 3

Table of Contents 4

List of Tables, Graphs and Figures 7

List of Appendices 9

Literature Review 10

The importance of literacy 10

What is literacy? 12

Teaching literacy 13

How is literacy taught in Switzerland? 15

The Montessori approach to literacy 18

When should children be taught to read? 23

Does orthography play a role in how children are taught to read? 27

Cultural and social aspects of reading acquisition 28

How well do children read in Switzerland? 30

Conclusion 31

Methodology 33

Participants 33

Setting 34

Local school 34

Montessori school 35

Measures 38

BAKO 1-4 38

ELFE 1-6 40

Letter recognition 41

Teacher interviews 42
Parent questionnaire 42
Design 43
Procedure 43
Data analysis 44
Ethical considerations 45
Summary 45

Results 47
Parent education 47
Parent occupation 48
Home literacy environment 48
Visits to the library 48
Number of children’s books at home 49
Reading to children 50
Children reading on their own 51
Gender differences in children reading on their own 51
Number of alphabet letters known 52
Children’s reading ability prior to first grade 53

Literacy assessments 54
Letter recognition 55
Reading 55
Phonological knowledge 56

Home language 58
Gender 59
Summary 59

Discussion 61
Introduction 61
Initial advantages 61
List of Tables, Graphs and Pictures

Figure 1 A typical room in a Montessori kindergarten  18

Table 1 Parents’ education  46
Table 2 Parents’ occupation  47
Table 3 Family library visits  48
Table 4 Library visits, simplified  48
Table 5 Number of children’s books at home  49
Table 6 Parents reading to children  50
Table 7 Children reading on their own, by school  50
Table 8 Children reading on their own, by gender  51
Table 9 Number of letters known at entry to first grade  52
Table 10 Children’s reading level at entry to first grade  52
Table 11 Reading level, simplified  53
Table 12 Letter recognition test means  54
Table 13 Reading test means  55
Table 14 Phoneme test means, raw score  55
Table 15 Phonemes test means, percentage rankings  56
Table 16 Letter recognition means, by home language  56
Table 17 Reading test means, by home language  57
Table 18 Phoneme test means, by home language  57
Table 19 Test performances, by gender  58
Graph 1 Scatterplot Graph of Pretest and Posttest Reading Scores, by School
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Low risk approval</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Parent information form, German</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Parent information form, English</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Parent questionnaire, English</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Example of ELFE word test</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Example of ELFE sentence test</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Example of ELFE text comprehension test</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8-10</td>
<td>BAKO phoneme test</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Letter recognition test</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>