Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Middle school students’ experiences and perceptions of educational decision making

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Master in Education

at Massey University, New Zealand

Iona Bonney

2016
Abstract

This descriptive case study investigated student perceptions and experience of choosing option subjects in a stand-alone middle school environment. The focus was on students making subject-choice decisions in preparation for their following year of school. A review of recent literature relevant to adolescent educational decision making was undertaken and a gap in research using student voice in the middle school years was identified.

Students in Years 8, 9 and 10 were surveyed to gain an overview of subject choice experiences at the school, and more in depth insights were shared in focus group interviews. Parents/caregivers of interviewed students, and school staff were surveyed to triangulate data from students. Reviews of relevant school and government documents contextualised the students’ subject choice environment.

Quantitative data were analysed using SPSS software to identify response trends and relationships between variables. Qualitative data were analysed using a priori codes derived from research literature and emerging in initial data analysis. Findings were consistent with established research indicating both individual and school structural factors influence subject-choice decision making. New issues emerged related to the provision of advice and support for students making subject choices and developing future study plans. Implications for supporting students in subject-choice decision making and how parents/caregivers, school staff and school systems can be assisted to better respond to student needs in a middle school setting are delineated.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Undertaking this master’s study through distance learning has been a challenging and at times lonely journey. I have been lucky to have been encouraged and supported by many mentors, colleagues, family and friends along the way.

I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisors Dr Jenny Poskitt and Dr Jeanette Berman for their encouragement, insightful comments and thought provoking questions. Their belief in the project and patient guidance have been constant companions on this journey.

A special thank you must go the student participants in this study whose openness and trust allowed me to look at the issues through their eyes. My thanks also go to the Board of Trustees, Senior Leadership Team, staff and school community, particularly the parents/caregivers and staff participants, for their cooperation and permission to base this study in their school environment.

I would like to acknowledge the support of TeachNZ, whose study support grant in 2015 provided me with valuable time in the final stages of the project.

I would also like to thank Dr Mervyl McPherson for her expert assistance in using SPSS for the statistical analysis of data.
CONTENTS

Chapter 1: INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................1
  BACKGROUND ..................................................................................................................1
  BOUNDARY OF INVESTIGATION ..................................................................................2
  PURPOSE .........................................................................................................................2
  THESIS ORGANISATION ..............................................................................................3

Chapter 2: LITERATURE REVIEW ...............................................................................4
  Middle Years Schooling ...............................................................................................4
  Subject choice ...............................................................................................................5
  ADOLESCENT DEVELOPMENT .....................................................................................6
    Brain development ......................................................................................................6
    Identity development .................................................................................................7
    Developing self-esteem ...............................................................................................7
    Adolescent motivation and engagement ....................................................................8
  ADOLESCENT FUTURE PLANNING ...........................................................................9
    Aspirations ..................................................................................................................9
    Study pathways ........................................................................................................10
    Careers .....................................................................................................................11
  ADOLESCENT DECISION-MAKING SKILLS .................................................................12
    Mind set ......................................................................................................................12
    Strategies ..................................................................................................................13
  FACTORS INFLUENCING EDUCATIONAL DECISION MAKING .................................14
    Subject enjoyment and perceived ability ..................................................................14
    Perceived usefulness of a subject ..............................................................................15
    Perceived status of subjects .....................................................................................15
  KEY INFORMANTS .......................................................................................................16
Family and cultural capital ................................................................. 16
School: Teachers, Heads of Departments (HODs), Deans and Counsellors .......... 17
Peers ........................................................................................................ 18
Media ............................................................................................................. 18

STRUCTURAL FACTORS ................................................................. 19
School ethos for learning ......................................................................... 20
School curriculum and course construction .............................................. 20
Subject clusters and option lines ............................................................. 22
Qualification structures ............................................................................ 23
Timetabling ............................................................................................... 24
Transition and timing of support ............................................................. 24

STUDENT VOICE ........................................................................ 25

SUMMARY ..................................................................................... 25

RESEARCH QUESTIONS ..................................................................... 28

Chapter 3: METHODOLOGY ......................................................... 29

RESEARCH DESIGN ........................................................................ 29
Case study design .................................................................................. 29
Phases of the study ................................................................................ 30
Researcher role ...................................................................................... 31
Sample representation .......................................................................... 31

RESEARCH PRINCIPLES .............................................................. 33
Research rigour ...................................................................................... 33
Validity and reliability .......................................................................... 33
Generalisability .................................................................................... 34

ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS ..................................................... 34
Consent ................................................................................................. 34
Confidentiality and privacy ................................................................. 35
Conflict of interest and bias .............................................................. 35
Power imbalances ........................................................................... 36
Dual teacher and researcher role ...................................................... 36
Cultural considerations .................................................................... 36
Benefits ............................................................................................ 37
Reciprocity ....................................................................................... 37
Ownership of information ............................................................... 37
DATA COLLECTION TOOLS ............................................................. 38
Questionnaires .................................................................................. 38
Focus group interviews .................................................................... 38
Document review ............................................................................. 39
DATA ANALYSIS ................................................................................. 40
Quantitative data analysis ............................................................... 40
Descriptive statistics ....................................................................... 40
Nominal and ordinal data ............................................................... 40
Inferential statistics ......................................................................... 41
Interview data .................................................................................. 42
ISSUES ARISING ................................................................................ 41
SUMMARY .......................................................................................... 42
Chapter 4: FINDINGS .......................................................................... 44
THE DECISION MAKING PROCESS .................................................... 44
Planning ............................................................................................ 44
Researching ..................................................................................... 45
Eliminating options ......................................................................... 45
INFLUENCES ON SUBJECT CHOICES ............................................. 47
# APPENDICES

## APPENDIX A: ETHICS DOCUMENTS, INFORMATION SHEETS AND CONSENT DOCUMENTS

| Appendix A1.1: Māori Kaumatua information letter | 122 |
| Appendix A1.2: Research information sheet | 125 |
| Appendix A1.3: School management information sheet | 127 |
| Appendix A1.4: Student information sheet | 129 |
| Appendix A1.5: Parent of focus group participant information sheet | 131 |
| Appendix A1.7: Parent participant information sheet | 133 |
| Appendix A2.1: Parent digital consent for child’s participation in study | 135 |
| Appendix A2.2: Student focus group consent form | 137 |

## APPENDIX B: DATA COLLECTION DOCUMENTS

| Appendix B1.1: Student questionnaire | 138 |
| Appendix B1.2: Student questionnaire response summary | 142 |
| Appendix B1.3: Parent/caregiver questionnaire response summary | 163 |
Appendix B1.4: Staff questionnaire response summary ................................................................................ 177
Appendix B1.5: School student ethnicity data .................................................................................................. 190

APPENDIX C: DATA ANALYSIS DOCUMENTS .......................................................... 191
Appendix C1.1: Student survey data summary tables example ................................................................. 191
Appendix C1.2: Parent/caregiver and staff survey theme analysis example ..................................................... 193
Appendix C2.1: Data analysis codebook ........................................................................................................... 197
Appendix C2.2: Student survey open question analysis example .................................................................. 198
Appendix C2.3: Year 8 student interview coded analysis example ............................................................... 200
Appendix C2.4: Year 9 student interview coded analysis example ............................................................... 202
Appendix C2.5: Year 10 student interview coded analysis example ............................................................. 204
Appendix C2.6: Qualitative data theme tables example .................................................................................... 206
Appendix C2.7: Parent/caregiver survey open question analysed responses .................................................. 208
Appendix C2.8: Staff survey open question analysed responses ........................................................................ 209
Appendix C2.9: Document analysis tables example ....................................................................................... 210
Appendix C3.1: SPSS variable relationship tables ........................................................................................ 212

List of tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Comparison of student study sample and school population demographics</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Parent survey demographic data</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Staff Demographic data</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Relationships between influences on subject choices and gender</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2. Relationships between Influences on subject choices and ethnicity .......................... 49
4.3. Relationships between liking subjects and year level .............................................. 51
4.4. Relationships between student attitudes and perceived ability by gender and year level ........................................................................................................................................ 53
4.5. Relationship between reported considerations made in subject choices and year level ............................................................................................................................................... 57
4.6. Relationship between factors considered for subject choices and ethnicity .............................................................................................................................................. 57
4.7. Relationship between general work skills consideration in subject status and ethnicity ........................................................................................................................................... 59
4.8. Student knowledge of NCEA ...................................................................................... 65
4.9. Parent knowledge of future plans ............................................................................... 66
4.10. Study plans compared to qualification required for their chosen career pathway .............................................................................................................................................. 66
4.11. Relationships between parents as an information source and year level.............. 68
4.12. Relationships between who they would approach for subject-choice advice and year level ............................................................................................................................................ 71
4.13. Relationships between who they would approach for advice on subject choice and gender ........................................................................................................................................... 71
4.14. Relationships between who they would approach for advice on subject choice and ethnicity ........................................................................................................................................... 72
4.15. Likelihood of directing student to source for advice .............................................. 72
4.16. Having enough information to make subject choices by year level....................... 73
4.17. Relationships between information level and gender ............................................ 73
4.18. Comparison of subject-choice decisions, information use and access and gender ........................................................................................................................................... 74
4.19. Significant relationships found between use of information resources and ethnicity and gender ........................................................................................................ 74

4.20. Resources found useful by parents/caregivers and staff on assisting students to make subject-choice decisions ........................................................................ 75

4.21. Information seen by parents/caregivers and staff as helpful for students to make subject-choice decisions ........................................................................ 75

4.22. Relationships between information level and confidence to make subject-choice decisions ........................................................................................................ 76

4.23. School organisation helpful to assist subject-choice decisions as reported by parents/caregivers and staff ........................................................................ 88

**List of figures**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Influences on student subject choices as reported by students</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. Influences on student subject choices as reported by parents/caregivers and staff</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3. Student attitudes to school subjects by year level</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4. Student perception of ability, by year level</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5. Relationship between student perceptions of ability and attitude to subjects</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6. Relationship between attitudes, ability perceptions and influences on subject choices</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7. Self-system considerations important for subject choices decisions as reported by parents/caregivers and staff</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8. Factors considered by students in subject-choice decisions</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9. Factors important for students to consider in subject-choice decision making as reported by parents/caregivers and staff</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>