Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
The Use of Standards for
Information Systems within New Zealand Healthcare

A thesis presented in partial
fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree
of Master of Science
in Information Systems at
Massey University

Lisabeth Sarah Constance Weston
1999
Abstract

Standards are starting to gain prominence in a world that to some may seem to be being devoured by the advancements of technology. Healthcare is by no means void of the impact of technology, in fact some believe that technology could serve no better purpose than to advance healthcare.

To be able to link these new (and what some may consider incredulous) technologies, from hospital to hospital, doctor to doctor, patient to doctor, or any of the permutations of these, appropriate information systems standards are required.

Whilst people have begun to acknowledge that standards are important, few are willing to put forward what is exactly required from a standard, or indeed why one standard is considered to be more appropriate than another standard. Consequently this research aims to create and then investigate the framework to ascertain what the critical success factors are when selecting and utilising a standard. An associated goal of this study is to gain an understanding of which standards for information systems are being utilised within the New Zealand healthcare environment.

A survey of New Zealand healthcare found that the ‘Completeness’ of the standard is considered to be the most important element for adopting health information systems standards. Organisations wish to adopt standards that meet the required need, and that provide the required functionality. A number of different standards are utilised within New Zealand healthcare, some of which differ between organisations. Information systems management standards were the least utilised standards by all organisations.

It was found that organisation type and structure and the purpose of the standards both influenced the relative importance of different factors in the selection of standards.
Acknowledgements

There are a number of people whom I would like to thank for their support and guidance. My supervisor Dr Richard Whiddett was instrumental in keeping me on track, focussed and making sure that my work was at a high level. Dr Inga Hunter was also of great assistance with regard to the detailed elements of my work. The people in the Statistics Department were also very helpful with the numerical aspect of this project.

I would also like to thank the majority of the staff within the Information Systems Department at Massey University, for their encouragement and support throughout my years at Massey. A special thank you must go to Sue and Lisa for putting up with an endless barrage of questions about the technicalities of the English language.

I am grateful to the people who took the time to complete the survey and/or interviews, or give me advice on the logistics of my research project; this success can be transferred to all of those who contributed.

Last, but by no means least I would like to thank my friends and family, especially my Mum, my Dad (who had the torture of reading this) and Chris. All of whom managed to put up with me going through the different phases of thesis writing, and at the conclusion did not want to disown me (much to my joy).
Table of Contents

ABSTRACT .................................................................................................................... II

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.............................................................................................. III

TABLE OF CONTENTS............................................................................................... IV

LIST OF FIGURES........................................................................................................ IX

LIST OF TABLES.......................................................................................................... X

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION.......................................................................................... 11

1.1 RESEARCH QUESTIONS....................................................................................... 13
1.2 THESIS STRUCTURE........................................................................................... 15
1.3 LIMITATIONS........................................................................................................ 16

CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW ............................................................................ 18

2.1 METHODOLOGY.................................................................................................... 18
2.2 ORDER OF THE LITERATURE REVIEW............................................................. 19
2.3 OVERVIEW OF STANDARDS ........................................................................... 19
  2.3.1 Definition of a Standard................................................................................. 19
  2.3.2 Reasons for Adopting Standards................................................................. 22
  2.3.3 Problems with Standards.............................................................................. 25
  2.3.4 Identifying the Criteria for a Good Standard................................................ 29
2.4 THE USE OF STANDARDS WITHIN HEALTHCARE........................................ 36
  2.4.1 Identify Why Standards are Crucial Within Healthcare............................. 36
  2.4.2 Standards' Developers within the Healthcare Arena.................................... 42
2.5 THE USE OF STANDARDS WITHIN NEW ZEALAND HEALTHCARE .......... 44
  2.5.1 Structure of the New Zealand Heath System............................................. 44
  2.5.2 New Zealand's Role within Standards Development.................................. 45
  2.5.3 Healthcare Standards within New Zealand............................................... 47
2.6 SUMMARY OF CHAPTER 3 - LITERATURE REVIEW....................................... 51

CHAPTER 3 DEVELOPMENT OF RESEARCH MODEL............................................. 53

3.1 INFORMATION SYSTEMS RESEARCH............................................................... 53
CHAPTER 3 RESEARCH DESIGN

3.2 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS ................................................................. 54
3.3 ECONOMIC CONSIDERATIONS ......................................................... 55
3.4 RELEVANCE TO RESEARCH AREA .................................................... 56
3.5 THEORETICAL MODEL DEVELOPMENT ............................................ 57
  3.5.1 Standards' Adoption Framework ................................................. 58
  3.5.2 Standards Categorisation Scheme .................................................. 62
  3.5.3 Stages of Growth ................................................................. 64
  3.5.4 Hypotheses Development .......................................................... 66
  3.5.5 The Information Systems Manager .............................................. 67
  3.5.6 Initial Hypotheses Development ................................................. 69
  3.5.7 Final Hypotheses Development .................................................... 72
  3.5.8 Summary of Development of Research Models ............................. 73

CHAPTER 4 RESEARCH DESIGN ............................................................... 75

4.1 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY ............................................................. 75
  4.1.1 Different Classifications of Survey ................................................. 79
  4.1.2 Research Design ................................................................. 80
  4.1.3 Unit of Analysis ................................................................. 81
  4.1.4 Use of Multi-Item Scales .......................................................... 81
  4.1.5 Pre-testing and Pilot Data .......................................................... 82
  4.1.6 Construct and Content Validity ..................................................... 85
  4.1.7 Reliability .............................................................................. 86
  4.1.8 Sample Identification ................................................................. 86
  4.1.9 Sample Selection .................................................................... 87
  4.1.10 Response rate and evaluation of non-response bias ....................... 88
  4.1.11 Correlation Assessment ............................................................ 89
  4.1.12 Statistical Analysis .................................................................. 90
4.2 DESIGN OF DATA COLLECTION INSTRUMENT .................................... 90
  4.2.1 Survey Design ................................................................. 90
  4.2.2 Question Design .................................................................... 92
  4.2.3 Survey Management ................................................................. 93
4.3 SUMMARY OF RESEARCH METHODOLOGY ..................................... 94
4.4 SUMMARY OF DATA COLLECTION INSTRUMENT .............................. 95
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Response Rates</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Demographics</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1 Public Hospitals</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2 IPAs</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.3 Private Hospitals</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.4 Analysis of Demographics</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Organisational Use of Computers</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.1 Public Hospitals</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.2 IPAs</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.3 Private Hospitals</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.4 Analysis of the Organisational Use of Computers</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 The Standards Selection Process</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.1 Public Hospitals</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.2 IPAs</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.3 Analysis of the Standards Selection Process</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5 Critical Success Factors when adopting Standards</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.1 Overall Rankings</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.2 Additional Organisations’ Ranking of the CSFs</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.3 Analysis of the CSFs when Adopting Standards</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6 Individual Elements of the Critical Success Factors</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.1 Level of Consensus CSF Elements</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.2 Product Availability CSF Elements</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.3 Completeness CSF Elements</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.4 Maturity/Stability CSF Elements</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.5 Problems/Limitations CSF Elements</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.6 Interoperability CSF Elements</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.7 Extra Elements</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.8 Additional Organisations Rating of the Individual Elements of the CSFs</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7 Different Standards Applications in Use</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7.1 Technology Infrastructure</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7.2 Clinical Coding</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7.3 Information Exchange Protocols</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7.4 Information Systems Management</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7.5 Analysis of Standard Usage within Different Applications</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8 Critical Success Factors within Different Applications</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8.1 Completeness CSF</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8.2 Interoperability CSF</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8.3 Level of Consensus CSF</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8.4 Maturity/Stability CSF</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8.5 Product Availability CSF</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8.6 Problems/Limitations CSF</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8.7 Analysis of the CSFs within Different Applications</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.9 Open Ended Questions</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.10 Summary of Results</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHAPTER 6 DISCUSSION

6.1 Generalisability of Results                                         | 139  |
6.2 People Involved with Standards Adoption                             | 140  |
6.3 Applicability of the Standards’ Adoption Framework                  | 141  |
6.4 Hypotheses Findings                                                 | 142  |
6.4.1 Hypothesis One – Overall Standards Adoption                       | 142  |
6.4.2 Hypothesis Two – Technology Infrastructure                        | 143  |
6.4.3 Hypothesis Three – Clinical Coding                               | 143  |
6.4.4 Hypothesis Four – Information Exchange Protocols                  | 144  |
6.4.5 Hypothesis Five – Information Systems Management                 | 144  |
6.4.6 Summary of Hypotheses                                             | 144  |
6.5 Comments from Open-Ended Questions                                  | 145  |
6.6 General Issues                                                      | 148  |
6.6.1 Issues within the CSFs                                            | 148  |
6.6.2 The Issue of Time                                                 | 149  |
6.6.3 Nolan’s Stages of Growth                                           | 149  |

CHAPTER 7 CONCLUSION

7.1 Research Questions                                                   | 151  |
7.1.1 Question One                                                      | 151  |
7.1.2 Question Two                                                      | 152  |
List of Figures

FIGURE 1 - RESEARCH TESTING MODEL ................................................................. 14
FIGURE 2 - INITIAL STANDARDS' ADOPTION FRAMEWORK ................................. 59
FIGURE 3 - FINAL STANDARDS' ADOPTION FRAMEWORK .................................... 61
FIGURE 4 - STANDARDS SELECTION ......................................................................... 63
FIGURE 5 - HYPOTHESIS BUILDING ......................................................................... 66
FIGURE 6 - IS MANAGER RICH PICTURE ................................................................. 69
FIGURE 7 - COMPARISON OF NUMBER OF STAFF EMPLOYED ............................... 99
FIGURE 8 - NETWORK USAGE ................................................................................ 103
FIGURE 9 - NUMBER OF WORK STATIONS USED ...................................................... 104
FIGURE 10 - TIME STANDARD HAS BEEN IN PLACE ............................................. 107
FIGURE 11 - TIME TAKEN TO IMPLEMENT STANDARDS ..................................... 108
FIGURE 12 - OVERALL CSF RANKING FOR ADOPTING ANY IS STANDARD ............ 110
FIGURE 13 - INDIVIDUAL LEVEL OF CONSENSUS MEANS .................................. 115
FIGURE 14 - INDIVIDUAL PRODUCT AVAILABILITY MEANS ................................ 116
FIGURE 15 - INDIVIDUAL COMPLETENESS MEANS ............................................. 117
FIGURE 16 - INDIVIDUAL PROBLEMS/LIMITATIONS MEANS ............................. 118
FIGURE 17 - INDIVIDUAL INTEROPERABILITY MEANS ........................................ 119
FIGURE 18 - CSFs ranked by Technology Infrastructure Application ..................... 123
FIGURE 19 - CSFs ranked by Clinical Coding Application ....................................... 124
FIGURE 20 - CSFs ranked by Information Exchange Application ............................ 125
FIGURE 21 - CSFs ranked by Information Systems Management Application .......... 126
FIGURE 22 - Completeness CSF Ranked by Application .......................................... 128
FIGURE 23 - Interoperability CSF Ranked by Application ....................................... 129
FIGURE 24 - Level of Consensus CSF Ranked by Application ............................... 130
FIGURE 25 - Maturity/ Stability CSF Ranked by Application ................................... 131
FIGURE 26 - Product Availability CSF Ranked by Application .............................. 132
FIGURE 27 - Problems/Limitations CSF Ranked by Application ............................ 133
List of Tables

TABLE 1 - HEALTH INTERNET STANDARDS................................................................. 50
TABLE 2 - HL7 COMMUNICATION STANDARDS....................................................... 50
TABLE 3 - EDIFACT STANDARDS ........................................................................... 50
TABLE 4 - CLINICAL CODING STANDARDS ............................................................ 51
TABLE 5 - NZHIF STANDARDS .............................................................................. 51
TABLE 6 - STANDARDS APPLICATIONS ................................................................. 62
TABLE 7 - NOLAN'S STAGES OF GROWTH ............................................................ 65
TABLE 8 - TOTAL RESPONSE RATES ..................................................................... 97
TABLE 9 - CSF ABBREVIATIONS ......................................................................... 109
TABLE 10 - CSFs RANKED FOR IPA AND PUBLIC HOSPITAL .................................. 111
TABLE 11 - PRIVATE HOSPITALS OVERALL RANKING OF THE CSFs .................. 111
TABLE 12 - HEALTHCARE SERVICE PROVIDER OVERALL RANKING OF THE CSFs . 112
TABLE 13 - IT SERVICE PROVIDERS OVERALL CSF RANKING ................................ 113
TABLE 14 - HARDWARE/SOFTWARE OVERALL CSF RANKING ............................. 114
TABLE 15 - STANDARDS USED WITHIN NEW ZEALAND HEALTHCARE .............. 153