Understanding Guest Retention: An examination of New Zealand accommodation establishments

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy in Management Massey University

Shirley Jean Barnett 2007
Acknowledgements

First, I would like to acknowledge and thank Dr Robin Smith who never doubted that I could complete a PhD. As a mentor he provided sound advice and as a friend he provided a listening ear when needed.

Thanks must also go to my supervisors, Professor Andrea McIlroy and Dr James Lockhart, who provided support and guidance through what was a long and sometimes arduous process. Their combined assistance, support and comments helped to make the PhD journey a valuable learning experience and, dare I say it, sometimes even interesting and enjoyable.

Professor Tony Vitalis has been helpful providing both tangible and intangible support; and I would like to thank Tony and other colleagues in the Department of Management. Particular thanks to my PhD support group – we have seen each other through triumphs, anxieties, desperation and a gamut of other emotions that never seemed far from the surface as we each undertook this journey. I am grateful for your support, unfailing energy, good humour and a nudge in the right direction when it was necessary. So thanks to Annemarie, Jo, Warren, John and particularly Colin who kept me on track and focused. Thanks also to other friends who took me out for coffee and listened to me moan or rave about my thesis depending on how I was feeling at the time.

Last but not least, I would also like to acknowledge and thank my family for their love, support, and belief in my ability to finish the thesis.

Ko koe ki tēnā, ko ahau ki tēnei kīwai o te kete.
You were all instrumental in this journey and I couldn’t have done it without you.
Abstract

The importance of customer retention has become a major theme in the literature since the 1990s when empirical studies showed that retaining 5% of customers could lead to an increase in profits ranging from 25% to 85%. However, customer retention does not appear to have moved from the theoretical into the practical world. Specifically, there were few empirical studies which focused on customer retention and none were identified in the New Zealand accommodation sector.

The travel and tourism industry contributes approximately 9% to New Zealand’s GDP, and 10% of all spending by travellers and tourists is in the accommodation sector. Impacts, such as seasonality, characterise the accommodation sector and many establishments have occupancy rates which can fluctuate from 90% to 30% in the off-season. With average annual occupancy rates for New Zealand hotels and motels hovering around 55%, retention is a strategy that owners and managers could implement in order to increase occupancy and profits.

In this study the research question was based on a review of the literature and the a priori knowledge and experience of the researcher. To ensure the research question framing this study was answered in the most exhaustive and comprehensive manner a seven step research process based on work by Bourgeois (1979) was followed. Data was gathered using both deductive and inductive methods in order to nullify the two main research problems raised by Bourgeois (1979). First, that theories are cast at a high level which is removed from reality and second that empirical studies often result in just a description of the data.

In the deductive phase of this study a survey was mailed to New Zealand accommodation establishments that provided accommodation and meals, and had a liquor licence. The main focus of this survey was to learn what owners and managers understood about guest retention and to answer the first research objective. It was discovered that New Zealand
accommodation managers: actively work to retain their guests; know the value of guest retention; understand the links between guest satisfaction, loyalty and retention; understand the specific reasons behind guest defections; understand the importance service recovery; and understand how loyalty schemes lead to guest retention.

The second phase was a case study involving three accommodation establishments. These findings added depth to the study and allowed for new knowledge to be extrapolated from the findings. It was discovered that in two establishments the focus was guest satisfaction and building relationships with customers. Whilst the resort hotel did have a strategy to encourage lapsed business to return this wasn’t measured or monitored. Thus the second research objective was answered.

In the penultimate chapter an amended profit chain has been proposed which included ‘Building Customer Relationships’ as the link between satisfaction and profitability. This is based on the finding that the case establishments saw retention as a proxy for satisfaction and, therefore, focused on satisfying guests and building personal relationships as methods of guest retention.

The research question framing this study can be answered by saying that the strategies used by owners and managers in New Zealand accommodation establishments to manage guest retention tend to be related to guest satisfaction and building personal relationships. However, this is not because they do not understand guest retention but see it as part of the bigger picture involving the building of relationships with guests.
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1 Background to the Study .............................................................. 1  
   1.1.1 Synopsis of the services literature  
   1.1.2 Outlining the empirical context  
   1.1.3 Identifying the gaps  
   1.1.4 Research question and objectives  

1.2 The Research Process ............................................................... 7  
   1.2.1 Undertaking this study  
   1.2.2 Methodology and methods  

1.3 The Actual Research ............................................................... 14  
   1.3.1 Clarifying terminology  

1.4 Thesis Structure ........................................................................ 19

## Chapter 2: The New Zealand Accommodation Sector

2.1 Introduction ............................................................................. 22  

2.2 Setting the Scene ................................................................... 23  
   2.2.1 Defining terms  
   2.2.2 The relationship between the travel and tourist industry and the accommodation sector  
   2.2.3 Historical development  

2.3 The Accommodation Sector in New Zealand ............................ 28  
   2.3.1 Development of the sector  
   2.3.2 Recent growth in the sector  
   2.3.3 Economic importance of the sector  
   2.3.4 Impacts on the sector  
   2.3.5 Accommodation forecasts  
   2.3.6 The importance of guest retention  

2.4 Conclusion .............................................................................. 44

## Chapter 3: Reviewing Some Service Management Literature

3.1 Introduction ............................................................................. 46  

3.2 The Evolution of Service Management ..................................... 47  

3.3 An Integrated View of Service Delivery .................................... 51  
   3.3.1 The service profit chain  
   3.3.2 Internal service quality  
   3.3.3 The importance of employee satisfaction, retention and profitability  
   3.3.4 Customer satisfaction  
   3.3.5 Service quality


3.3.6 Service quality and customer satisfaction: Are they different constructs?
3.3.7 Customer satisfaction to customer loyalty
3.3.8 Customer loyalty and/or customer retention
3.3.9 Leading to revenue growth and profitability

3.4 A Focus on Customer Retention .................................................. 68
3.4.1 The importance of retaining customers
3.4.2 Measuring and monitoring retention
3.4.3 Defections management
3.4.4 Complaint management
3.4.5 Service failure and recovery

3.5 Conclusion .................................................................................. 81

Chapter 4: Designing the Survey

4.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 83
4.2 Research Statements ...................................................................... 83
4.3 Identifying the Sample .................................................................. 84
   4.3.1 Study population
   4.3.2 Sampling frame
   4.3.3 Sample
   4.3.4 Census
4.4 Constructing the Survey Instrument ............................................ 87
   4.4.1 Data collection tools
   4.4.2 Mail survey
   4.4.3 Questionnaire design
4.5 Testing the Survey Instrument ...................................................... 90
   4.5.1 Pretesting
   4.5.2 Pilot testing
4.6 Reliability and Validity ............................................................... 91
   4.6.1 Reliability
   4.6.2 Reliability in this study
   4.6.3 Validity
   4.6.4 Validity in this study
4.7 Maximising Response Rates ....................................................... 98
   4.7.1 Mail out
   4.7.2 Incentive
   4.7.3 Ethical consideration
4.8 Research Bias .............................................................................. 99
4.9 Data: Editing, Coding & Entry .................................................... 102
4.10 Conclusion .................................................................................. 103
# Table of Contents Continued

## Chapter 5: Survey Findings

5.1 Introduction ............................................................................. 105  
5.2 Response Rates ........................................................................ 105  
  5.2.1 Actual response rate  
  5.2.2 Comparing response rates  
  5.2.3 Incentive winner  
5.3 The Findings ............................................................................. 106  
  5.3.1 Classification questions  
  5.3.2 Likert Scale items  
  5.3.3 Importance of strategies  
  5.3.4 Open-ended question  
5.4 Conclusion ................................................................................ 113  

## Chapter 6: Survey Analysis and Discussion

6.1 Introduction ................................................................................ 115  
6.2 Testing the Research Statements ............................................. 115  
  6.2.1 Accommodation managers actively work to retain their guests  
  6.2.2 Accommodation managers know the value of guest retention  
  6.2.3 Accommodation managers understand the links between guest acquisition, satisfaction, loyalty and retention  
  6.2.4 Accommodation managers understand the specific reasons behind guest defections  
  6.2.5 Accommodation managers understand the importance of service recovery  
  6.2.6 Accommodation managers understand how loyalty schemes lead to guest retention  
6.3 Findings from Other Likert Scale Items ................................. 130  
6.4 Classification Questions ........................................................... 135  
  6.4.1 Position of respondent and number of rooms in establishment  
  6.4.2 Cross tabulations: Likert Scale items, position of respondent and number of rooms in establishment  
  6.4.3 Comparison of return guests by international guests  
6.5 Analysis of the Importance of Four Strategies ....................... 142  
6.6 Open-ended Responses ............................................................. 143  
6.7 Answering the First Research Objective ................................ 148  
6.8 Conclusion ................................................................................ 152
Table of Contents Continued

Chapter 7: Designing the Case Study

7.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 155
7.2 The Case Study ............................................................................. 155
   7.2.1 The case in this study
   7.2.2 Concerns about case studies
   7.2.3 Validity, reliability and objectivity
   7.2.4 Triangulation within establishments
7.3 Identifying Accommodation Establishments .................................. 159
   7.3.1 The process of classification
   7.3.2 Choosing three establishments
   7.3.3 Finalising the research process
7.4 Data Collection Tools ................................................................... 163
   7.4.1 Interviews
   7.4.2 Surveys
7.5 Data Analysis ................................................................................ 168
7.6 Conclusion .................................................................................... 169

Chapter 8: Case Study Findings and Discussion

8.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 170
8.2 The Establishments ....................................................................... 171
   8.2.1 Motor lodge
   8.2.2 Resort hotel
   8.2.3 City hotel
8.3 The Findings: Presentation and Discussion ................................. 174
   8.3.1 Motor lodge
   8.3.2 Resort hotel
   8.3.3 City hotel
8.4 Answering the Second Research Objective .................................. 196
8.5 Conclusion .................................................................................... 200

Chapter 9: Weaving the Threads Together

9.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 201
9.2 Answering the Research Question .............................................. 202
9.3 Contribution to Knowledge ........................................................... 205
Table of Contents Continued

Chapter 10: Final Comments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.1 Limitations</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2 Further Research</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3 Conclusion</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

References ................................................................. 215

Appendices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Page Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 1–Research Statements and Literature</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 2–Establishment Questionnaire</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 3–Reasons for Including Classification Items in Survey</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 4–Research Statements, Explanation and Likert Scale Items</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 5–Reasons for Including Extra Likert Scale Items in Questionnaire</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 6–Changes Made to Questionnaire</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 7–Covering Letter</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 8–Reliability Statistics</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 9–Incentive Information</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 10–Estimated Percentages of Return and New Guests</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 11–Estimated Percentages of Domestic and Intern'l Guests</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 12–Actual Number of Responses to all Likert Scale Items</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 13–Total Points Allocated to Four Strategies (Q 37)</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 14–Likert Scale Responses- 18 Items Related to Research Statements</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 15–Cross Tabulations - Likert Scale Items with Size of Establishment and Respondent</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 16–Responses to Likert Scale Items</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 17–Information Sheet for Establishments</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 18–Consent Form for Establishments</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 19–Information Sheet for Interviewees</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 20–Consent Form for Interviewees</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 21–Owner/Manager Interview</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 22–Owner/Manager Interview - Prompt Questions</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 23–Motor Lodge Employee Survey</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 24–Resort Hotel Employee Survey</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 25–City Hotel Employee Survey</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 26–Letter for Employees</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 27–Motor Lodge Description</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 28–Resort Hotel Description</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 29–City Hotel Description</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1.1</td>
<td>A model of holistic management in service organisations</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1.2</td>
<td>Impacts on research topic choice</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1.3</td>
<td>The relationship between methods, study objectives, and the research question</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.1</td>
<td>Types of travellers and tourists</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.2</td>
<td>Relationship between travel and tourist industry and the accommodation sector</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.3</td>
<td>Total accommodation establishments in NZ 1997–2005</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.4</td>
<td>Guest nights in accommodation establishments 2002/2003, 2003/2004, 2004/2005</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.5</td>
<td>Average annual occupancy 1997–2005</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.1</td>
<td>Theories contributing to the evolution of service management</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.2</td>
<td>The service profit chain</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.3</td>
<td>Concepts related to customer retention</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.1</td>
<td>Forms of reliability</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.2</td>
<td>Internal consistency testing – empowerment</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.3</td>
<td>Internal consistency testing – retention</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.4</td>
<td>Forms of validity</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.5</td>
<td>Identifying bias in the sample – number of rooms</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.6</td>
<td>Identifying bias in the sample – location</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.1</td>
<td>Position of respondent</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.2</td>
<td>Private ownership</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.3</td>
<td>Number of rooms</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.4</td>
<td>Quality rating system</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.5</td>
<td>Type of rating</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.6</td>
<td>Percentage of return guests (per annum)</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.7</td>
<td>Percentage of international guests (per annum)</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.8</td>
<td>Main reason for stay</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.1</td>
<td>In this establishment we actively work to keep our overnight guests coming back (Likert item 10)</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.2</td>
<td>Retention strategies are unnecessary if overnight guests regularly return to the establishment (Likert item 18)</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.3</td>
<td>This establishment spends more money marketing to new overnight guests than they spend trying to keep existing guests (Likert item 29)</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.4</td>
<td>It is not important to know the dollar value of overnight guests who return to our establishment (Likert item 19)</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures Continued

Figure 6.5: Returning overnight guests market our establishment by making favourable word of mouth comments (Likert item 23) ....................... 120
Figure 6.6: In this establishment we believe that returning overnight guests spend more than new guests (Likert item 32) ............................ 120
Figure 6.7: Satisfied overnight guests are more likely to return to this establishment than unsatisfied guests (Likert item 25) ............................ 121
Figure 6.8: In this establishment we do not believe that there is any relationship between satisfied overnight guests and returning guests (Likert item 34) ................................................................. 122
Figure 6.9: It is cheaper to attract new overnight guests than to keep existing guests (Likert item 36) .......................................................... 122
Figure 6.10: This establishment has no idea why overnight guests return (Likert item 12) ................................................................. 123
Figure 6.11: This establishment has policies in place to help understand why overnight guests do not return (Likert item 21) ......................... 124
Figure 6.12: If overnight guests are unhappy with the level of service they will not return to this establishment (Likert item 26) .................. 124
Figure 6.13: In this establishment only management staff are empowered to deal with overnight guests complaints (Likert item 14) ............. 125
Figure 6.14: In this establishment we understand the importance of recovering from a service failure (Likert item 17) ................................. 126
Figure 6.15: An overnight guests who has had a service problem resolved is more likely to be loyal to this establishment (Likert item 28) .......... 126
Figure 6.16: In this establishment we believe that loyal overnight guests are more easily satisfied than new overnight guests (Likert item 22) .......... 128
Figure 6.17: If you have a loyalty scheme in your establishment you need not be concerned about providing good service (Likert item 31) ....... 128
Figure 6.18: Loyalty schemes will not encourage overnight guests to return to this establishment (Likert item 35) ........................................ 129
Figure 6.19: Overnight guests who are satisfied are more likely to remain loyal to this establishments (Likert item 11) ................................. 130
Figure 6.20: Loyalty schemes are not successful in this business (Likert item 15) ....................................................................................... 131
Figure 6.21: The costs to this establishment of a loyalty scheme would outweigh the benefits (Likert item 27) .......................................... 133
Figure 6.22: Comments forms/cards from overnight guests are always dealt with according to stated establishment procedures (Likert item 16) ................................................................. 134
Figure 6.23: Position of respondent by number of rooms .................................................. 136
Figure 6.24: Percentage of return guests by numbers of international guests .......... 141

Figure 9.1: Customer relationship profit chain ......................................................... 209
List of Tables

Table 2.1: Number of publicans and accommodation licences issued 1919-1959........ 31
Table 2.2: Breakdown of grade of hotel in NZ - 1960............................................. 34
Table 2.3: Number of specific establishments in NZ – June 1997 to June 2005 ...... 38
Table 2.4: Traveller and tourist expenditure by product........................................... 39
Table 2.5: Expenditure on accommodation 2005..................................................... 40

Table 3.1: Dick & Basu – loyalty levels ................................................................... 65
Table 3.2: Jones & Sasser – links between satisfaction, loyalty, retention ................. 66

Table 4.1: Comparison between population and sample – mean and std. deviation... 100
Table 4.2: Questionnaire coding for spreadsheet...................................................... 102

Table 5.1: Categorisation of positions .................................................................... 107
Table 5.2: Average number of rooms available in January 2005......................... 108
Table 5.3: Importance of strategies ......................................................................... 113

Table 6.1: Categories based on number of rooms.................................................... 137
Table 6.2: Percentage of returning guests in establishments.................................... 140
Table 6.3: Percentage of international guests in establishments................................ 141
Table 6.4: Number of respondents to each strategy............................................... 142
Table 6.5: Mean scores for each strategy................................................................. 142
Table 6.6: Cross tabulations: % of return/new guests (Q7) and % of international/domestic guests (Q8) with question 37 and open ended comments 1, 2 and 3................................................................. 144
Table 6.7: Cross tabulations: Satisfied overnight guests are more likely to return to this establishment than unsatisfied guests (Q25) and if overnight guests are unhappy with the level of service they will not return to this establishment (Q26) with question 37 and open ended question................................................................. 145
Table 6.8: Cross tabulations: % of return/new guests (Q7) and % of international/domestic guests (Q8) with question 37 and open ended comments 7 and 8................................................................. 145
Table 6.9: Cross tabulations: % of return/new guests (Q7) and % of international/domestic guests (Q8) with question 37 and open ended comments 9 and 10................................................................. 146
Table 6.10: Cross tabulations: Question 37 with open ended comments 11, 12 and 13 ......................................................................................................................... 147
Table 6.11: Cross tabulations: ‘In this establishment we actively work to keep our overnight guests coming back (Q10), ‘This establishment has policies in place to help understand why overnight guests do not return’ (Q21), ‘This establishment spends more money marketing to new overnight guests than they spend trying to keep existing guests’ (Q29) and open ended comments 14 and 15................................................................................................................................. 148
Table 6.12: Summary of findings from research statements and related Likert Scale items ................................................................................................................................. 149
List of Tables Continued

Table 7.1: Accommodation establishments classified by size ......................... 160
Table 7.2: Final response rates to employee survey ........................................ 168
Table 9.1: Survey mean score and case study establishment ranking for each strategy ................................................................. 202

List of Maps

Map 2.1: New Zealand ....................................................................................... 30