

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

The Evolution of Multicellularity

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

PhD

in

Evolutionary Biology

at Massey University, Albany, New Zealand

Caroline J Rose

2014

Abstract

Major evolutionary transitions in Darwinian individuality are central to the emergence of biological complexity. The key to understanding the evolutionary transition to multicellularity is to explain how a collective becomes a single entity capable of self-reproduction – a Darwinian individual. During the transition from single cells to multicellular life, populations of cells acquire the capacity for collective reproduction; however, the selective causes and underlying mechanisms are unclear. This thesis presents long-term evolution experiments using a single-celled model system to address fundamental questions arising during the evolution of multicellularity. Populations of the cooperating bacterium *Pseudomonas fluorescens* were subjected to experimental regimes that directly selected on the capacity for collectives to differentially reproduce – an essential requirement for the evolution of collectives by natural selection.

A crucial stage during an evolutionary transition to multicellularity occurs when the fitness of the multicellular collective becomes ‘decoupled’ from the fitness of its constituent cells. Before this stage, any differences in collective fitness are due to selection at the cellular level. In the present study, collectives that competed to reproduce via a cooperative propagule cell attained high levels of cooperation and also reached high levels of collective fitness. However, these improvements were shown to be a consequence of selection acting at the cell-level. In contrast, Darwinian individuality emerged in collectives that reproduced via a primitive life cycle that was fueled by conflict between cooperating cells and cheating cells that did not bear the cost

of cooperation. Cheats were analogous to a germ line, acting as propagules to seed new collectives. Enhanced fitness of evolved collectives was attributable to a property selected at the collective-level, namely, the capacity to transition through phases of the life cycle, and was not explained by improvement in individual cell fitness. Indeed, the fitness of individual cells declined.

In addition to providing the first experimental evidence of a major evolutionary transition in individuality, the work presented in this thesis highlights the possibility that the prevalence of complex life cycles among extant multicellular organisms reflects the fact that such cycles, on first emergence, had the greatest propensity to participate in Darwinian evolution.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisor, Distinguished Professor Paul Rainey for the fantastic project and for guidance and discussion throughout this research. I am grateful to have had the opportunity to present this research at the European Meeting of PhD Students in Evolutionary Biology (Portugal, 2011), the European Society for Evolutionary Biology meeting (Germany, 2011), Australian National University (Canberra, Australia, 2012) and to attend the Philosophy of Biology meeting at Dolphin Beach (Australia, 2012).

I am grateful for financial support from the Massey University Doctoral Scholarship and the New Zealand Institute for Advanced Study.

To my brilliant partner in crime, Dr Katrin Hammerschmidt, thank you for teaching me how to design and implement large-scale experiments and how to analyse large-scale data. Thank you for all the moral, intellectual and culinary support – this project would not have been possible without you.

To Dr Christian Kost, thank you for patiently showing me the ways of the lab and teaching me everything I know about wrinkly spreaders. Thank you to other past and present members of the Rainey lab for the stimulating discussions – especially Dr Eric Libby and Yuriy Pichugin.

Special thanks for tremendous technical assistance from Keiko Oda, Kelsey Nichols, Natasha le Roux and Yunhao Liu, who so cheerfully prepared media and washed the never-ending pile of microcosms.

To my parents, Dennis and Merryn, thank you for your enduring wisdom, generosity and support, and for being the best proofreaders in the world.

To Harriet, thank you for being a wonderful distraction and for finally sleeping through the night.

To Richard, thank you for all the effort and sacrifices you have made. This would never have been possible without your unfailing support. You rock.

Table of Contents

ABSTRACT	II
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	IV
LIST OF FIGURES	IX
LIST OF TABLES	XI
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1. UNITS OF SELECTION	1
1.2. LEVELS OF SELECTION	2
1.3. THE MAJOR TRANSITIONS IN EVOLUTION	4
1.4. THE EVOLUTION OF MULTICELLULARITY	6
1.4.1. <i>Multicellular Semantics</i>	6
1.4.2. <i>The Transition to Multicellularity: Three Stages</i>	8
1.5. STAGE ONE – THE EVOLUTION OF COOPERATION	10
1.5.1. <i>Benefits of Multicellular Cooperation</i>	13
1.5.2. <i>Cooperation and Conflict</i>	15
1.5.3. <i>Explanations for Cooperation</i>	16
1.5.4. <i>Multilevel Selection Theory</i>	25
1.6. STAGE TWO – THE EVOLUTION OF INDIVIDUALITY	29
1.6.1. <i>Collective Reproduction</i>	30
1.6.2. <i>The Origin of Life Cycles</i>	31
1.6.3. <i>A Novel Hypothesis for the Evolution of Life Cycles</i>	39
1.7. STAGE THREE – THE EVOLUTION OF COMPLEXITY	43
1.8. RESEARCH OBJECTIVES	46
1.8.1. <i>Experimental Approach</i>	46
1.8.2. <i>Thesis Structure and Key Findings</i>	51
CHAPTER 2. MATERIALS AND METHODS	53
2.1. STRAINS AND MEDIUM	53

2.1.1. <i>Strain Storage</i>	53
2.2. SELECTION EXPERIMENTS	54
2.2.1. <i>Cheat-Embracing Regime</i>	54
2.2.2. <i>Cheat-Purging Regime</i>	54
2.2.3. <i>Between-Collective Selection</i>	54
2.2.4. <i>Selection of Representative WS Genotypes</i>	55
2.3. FITNESS ASSAYS	58
2.4. LIFE HISTORY ANALYSIS	60
2.5. SM GROWTH ASSAY	60
2.6. STATISTICAL ANALYSIS	61
CHAPTER 3. STAGE ONE: THE MAINTENANCE OF COOPERATION.....	63
3.1. INTRODUCTION	63
3.2. RESULTS	66
3.2.1. <i>Evolution of Increased Cooperation and Decreased Cheating</i>	67
3.2.2. <i>Collective-level Competition Improved Collective Fitness</i>	69
3.2.3. <i>Evolution of Reduced Transition Rate</i>	72
3.3. DISCUSSION	77
CHAPTER 4. STAGE TWO: THE EVOLUTION OF INDIVIDUALITY	80
4.1. ABSTRACT	81
4.2. INTRODUCTION	82
4.3. RESULTS	84
4.3.1. <i>Embracing Cheats</i>	84
4.3.2. <i>Adaptive Evolution and Fitness Decoupling</i>	87
4.3.3. <i>Traits Underpinning Collective Improvement</i>	90
4.3.4. <i>Purging cheats</i>	99
4.4. PERSPECTIVE	102
CHAPTER 5. STAGE THREE: THE EVOLUTION OF COMPLEXITY.....	104
5.1. THE LEVELS OF SELECTION PROBLEM.....	107
5.1.1. <i>Supervenience</i>	109
5.1.2. <i>The Godfrey-Smith Framework</i>	112
5.1.3. <i>Emergence</i>	122
5.1.4. <i>Additivity</i>	126

5.2. FITNESS DECOUPLING	131
5.2.1. Stochastic Events	132
5.2.2. Conflict Mediation	133
5.2.3. De-Darwinization	135
5.2.4. Ecological Constraint.....	136
5.3. GERM LINES REVISITED	138
5.3.1. Conflict and Individuality.....	138
CHAPTER 6. CONCLUDING DISCUSSION.....	140
6.1. SUMMARY OF MAIN RESULTS.....	140
6.1.1. Stage One: The Evolution and Maintenance of Cooperation.....	140
6.1.2. Stage Two: A Transition in Individuality	141
6.1.3. Stage Three: The Evolution of Complexity.....	142
6.2. THE EVOLUTION OF MULTICELLULARITY IN <i>P. FLUORESCENS</i>	145
6.3. FUTURE DIRECTIONS	150
CHAPTER 7. REFERENCES	152
CHAPTER 8. APPENDICES.....	166
8.1. CHAPTER 3 STATISTICS.....	166
8.2. CHAPTER 4 STATISTICS.....	167
8.2.1. Differences in Collective Fitness, Cell Fitness, and Life History Traits.....	167
8.2.2. Differences in Life History Traits Between Ancestral and Evolved CE Regimes Over Time.....	168
8.2.3. Relationships Between Fitness and Life History Parameters in (a) CE and (b) CP regimes.....	169
8.3. CHAPTER 5 STATISTICS.....	171
8.3.1. Model Comparisons.....	171

List of Figures

Figure 1.1 Two models of group selection	23
Figure 1.2 Comparisons of reproductive specialisation (G) and integration (I) in colonial green algae	39
Figure 1.3 A multicellular life cycle fuelled by within-collective conflict	40
Figure 1.4 <i>P. fluorescens</i> grown on solid and liquid media	49
Figure 1.5 Evidence for cooperation in <i>P. fluorescens</i> : population dynamics of WS and SM genotypes in the presence and absence of competition	50
Figure 1.6 Microcosms containing collapsed <i>P. fluorescens</i> WS mats.....	51
Figure 2.1 Selection of representative WS genotypes.....	57
Figure 2.2 Cell and collective fitness assays for the CE (left) and CP (right) selective regimes	59
Figure 3.1 Experimental Regime.....	67
Figure 3.2 Change in collective composition after ten generations of between-collective selection.....	68
Figure 3.3 Fitness of evolved and ancestral collectives and their single cell constituents	70
Figure 3.4 The effect of cooperation (a) and cheating (b) on collective fitness.....	71
Figure 3.5 Life history traits.....	73
Figure 3.6 Collective fitness of ancestral (a) and evolved (b) strains and relationship with rate of SM occurrence	74
Figure 3.7 Growth rate of SM	75
Figure 3.8 Colony diversity	76
Figure 4.1 Experimental regimes.	84
Figure 4.2 Cheat-embracing experimental regime	85
Figure 4.3 Persistence of collectives and extinction dynamics	86
Figure 4.4 Between-collective cheat-embracing experimental regime	88
Figure 4.5 Fitness of evolved collectives and their single cell constituents relative to ancestral (ANC) types	89

Figure 4.6 Life history traits under the cheat-embracing regime	92
Figure 4.7 Collective fitness and life cycle perpetuation	93
Figure 4.8 Growth rate of SM	94
Figure 4.9 Cycling through phases.....	96
Figure 4.10 Dimorphic colonies.....	96
Figure 4.11 Summary	98
Figure 4.12 Fitness of evolved CP collectives and their single cell constituents relative to ancestral types	100
Figure 4.13 Life history traits under the CP regime.....	101
Figure 5.1 The supervenience argument against collective-level selection	110
Figure 5.2 Correlation versus causal links between character and collective and particle fitness.....	112
Figure 5.3 A Darwinian space	116
Figure 5.4 Cases of collective reproduction	117
Figure 5.5 Collective reproduction in <i>P. fluorescens</i> collectives	120
Figure 5.6 Emergent Relations.....	124
Figure 5.7 Relationship between particle composition and collective fitness in the cheat-embracing (a) and cheat-purging (b) regimes.....	129

List of Tables

Table 1.1 The major transitions in evolution.....	5
Table 1.2 The three stages of a major evolutionary transition.	9
Table 1.3 Classification of social interactions.....	10
Table 1.4 Conceptual differences between MLS1 and MLS2.	27
Table 6.1 Properties contributing to the evolution of multicellularity in <i>P. fluorescens</i> collectives	146