

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**An environmentally-based systems approach to
sustainability analyses of organic fruit production
systems in New Zealand**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

in

Sustainable Agricultural Systems

at Massey University, Palmerston North,
New Zealand



Massey University

Girija Page

2009

ABSTRACT

An environmentally-based systems approach to sustainability analyses of organic fruit production systems in New Zealand

This research introduces an approach for the assessment of the sustainability of farming systems. It is based on the premises that sustainability has an environmental bottom line and that there is very limited substitutability between natural capital and other forms of capital. Sustainability assessment is undertaken through analyses of energy and material flows of the system and their impacts on the environment. The proposed sustainability assessment approach is based on two high level criteria for sustainability: efficient use of energy and non-degradation of the environment from energy and material use.

Sustainability assessment of organic orchard systems in New Zealand was undertaken to demonstrate this approach. Five indicators which address the two criteria for the sustainability of the orchard systems are the energy ratio, the CO₂ ratio, changes in the soil carbon level, nutrient balances, and the leaching of nitrogen. Organic kiwifruit and organic apple systems are modelled based on their key energy and material flows and their interactions with the natural environment. The energy and material flows are converted into appropriate energy and matter equivalents based on coefficients taken from the published literature. Sustainability indicators are estimated over one growing season using two computer modelling tools, Overseer® and Stella®, in a life cycle approach.

Sustainability assessment of the organic orchard systems suggests that the approach is useful for evaluating energy use and key environmental impacts that occur in soil, water and atmosphere. The results indicate that the model organic orchard systems are sustainable in terms of energy use and are a net sink of CO₂-equivalent emissions. The implication of this result is that organic orchard systems potentially could trade carbon credits under the Kyoto Protocol. The findings also suggest that the sustainability assessment approach is capable of identifying the trade-offs within the sustainability indicators associated with particular management practices. Further research to improve and validate the proposed approach is essential, before it can be practically used for decision making at the orchard level and for policy making at the national level.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It is a pleasure to thank the many who made completion of this thesis possible:

- Massey University Doctoral Scholarship, Cecil Elliot Trust Grant, Helen E Akers PhD scholarship and Janet Murray scholarship for supporting me financially for the period of my PhD research.
- Terry Kelly, Maria Minor and Ewen Cameron, who constituted my ‘supervisory system’, and together offered a synergistic experience for me throughout my research period. Thanks, Terry, for giving me all the room to manoeuvre myself, helping me shape my raw ideas into a PhD topic and keeping the ship of my research always on course. Maria, thanks for helping me hone my concepts and contributing significantly towards addressing the possible loopholes to make my research water-tight. Ewen, you have always been very encouraging right from day one of my contact with Massey and later as my co-supervisor. It was great to learn about the organic kiwifruit and apple systems as I walked with you in Massey orchards.
- Growers, who always provided more information than I had requested, and helped me understand the organic kiwifruit and apple systems in New Zealand.
- Staff of Massey University and other institutions, who spared their time to discuss my naïve ideas during the initial stages of my research. This has greatly helped in developing my personality in general and shaping my research in particular. Thanks are due to Nigel Jollands, Anton Meister, Ed Minot, Dave Horne, John Holland, Brent Clothier, Nicola Shadbolt, Janet Reid, Tessa Mills, Anthony Cole, Troy Baisden, Allan Morton, David Gray, Russell Tillman, Alec Mackay, Steven Ray, ARGOS team and Zespri Innovation. Denise, thanks to you for making my office environment happy!
- Staff of Massey library for their help in making available the literature around the world. Thanks are also due to Massey IT, who did try our patience initially, but finally, succumbed to attending to our IT-related requests!
- Friends and colleagues, who comforted me with their friendship in this otherwise lonely PhD journey. Your presence meant a lot during those ‘lows’ when I was working not fulltime, nor part-time, but not at all! Also, Massey Recreation centre for its facilities to give vent to the stress and maintain a fit body!
- My mother, Ushaprabha, brother Navendu, and family in India for their love and support. I am awed at the freedom you have allowed me, and the faith you have shown in me that have encouraged me to fly higher and higher.
- Dipti, words are yet to be invented to describe the beauty of how wonderful a person you are. I owe my life to you.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---|------------|
| ABSTRACT | I |
| ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS..... | III |
| TABLE OF CONTENTS..... | V |
| LIST OF FIGURES | X |
| LIST OF TABLES | XI |
| CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| 1.1 INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| 1.2 BACKGROUND..... | 1 |
| 1.3 RESEARCH CONTEXT | 4 |
| 1.4 THESIS ORGANISATION..... | 6 |
| CHAPTER 2 UNDERSTANDING SUSTAINABILITY | 9 |
| 2.1 INTRODUCTION | 9 |
| 2.2 SUSTAINABILITY CONCEPTS | 10 |
| 2.2.1 <i>Predominantly economy-oriented perspective</i> | 10 |
| 2.2.2 <i>Predominantly society-oriented perspective</i> | 11 |
| 2.2.3 <i>Predominantly environment-oriented perspective</i> | 12 |
| 2.3 WORLDVIEWS OF SUSTAINABILITY | 13 |
| 2.3.1 <i>Weak sustainability</i> | 13 |
| 2.3.2 <i>Strong sustainability</i> | 15 |
| 2.4 THERMODYNAMICS AND SUSTAINABILITY | 16 |
| 2.4.1 <i>Energy and material flows</i> | 19 |
| 2.4.2 <i>Impacts on the environment</i> | 20 |
| 2.4.3 <i>Systems and thermodynamics</i> | 22 |
| 2.4.4 <i>Worldviews and thermodynamics</i> | 23 |
| 2.4.5 <i>Theoretical principles for strong sustainability</i> | 23 |
| 2.5 SUMMARY | 25 |
| CHAPTER 3 AGRICULTURAL SUSTAINABILITY ASSESSMENT | 27 |
| 3.1 INTRODUCTION | 27 |
| 3.2 APPROACHES TO SUSTAINABILITY ASSESSMENT | 27 |
| 3.2.1 <i>Indicators and indices approaches to sustainability assessment</i> | 28 |
| 3.2.1.1 Non-integrated indicators | 28 |
| 3.2.1.2 Integrated indicators | 34 |

| | | |
|-----------------------------------|---|-----------|
| 3.2.2 | <i>Product-related approaches to sustainability assessment</i> | 35 |
| 3.2.2.1 | Product-related life cycle assessment | 35 |
| 3.2.2.2 | Product-related energy flow analysis | 36 |
| 3.2.2.3 | Product-related material flow analysis..... | 36 |
| 3.2.3 | <i>Integrated assessment approaches</i> | 37 |
| 3.2.3.1 | Modelling as an approach to sustainability assessment | 37 |
| 3.2.3.2 | Environmental impact assessment | 40 |
| 3.2.4 | <i>Summary of sustainability assessment approaches</i> | 41 |
| 3.3 | AGRI-ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS AND INDICATORS..... | 42 |
| 3.3.1 | <i>Energy use</i> | 43 |
| 3.3.2 | <i>Impacts on soil</i> | 44 |
| 3.3.2.1 | Soil erosion..... | 44 |
| 3.3.2.2 | Soil quality..... | 44 |
| 3.3.3 | <i>Impacts on water</i> | 46 |
| 3.3.3.1 | Eutrophication | 46 |
| 3.3.3.2 | Contamination of water by pesticides..... | 46 |
| 3.3.4 | <i>Impacts on atmosphere</i> | 47 |
| 3.3.5 | <i>Impacts on biodiversity</i> | 48 |
| 3.4 | ORGANIC ORCHARD PRODUCTION SYSTEMS AND ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS | 49 |
| 3.4.1 | <i>Energy use</i> | 51 |
| 3.4.2 | <i>Impacts on soil</i> | 52 |
| 3.4.3 | <i>Impacts on water</i> | 53 |
| 3.4.4 | <i>Impacts on atmosphere</i> | 54 |
| 3.4.5 | <i>Impacts on biodiversity</i> | 54 |
| 3.5 | ANALYTICAL APPROACH FOR SUSTAINABILITY ASSESSMENT AT THE ORCHARD SYSTEMS LEVEL | 55 |
| 3.5.1 | <i>Criteria and indicators for sustainability assessment at the orchard systems level</i> | 56 |
| 3.5.1.1 | Energy ratio | 58 |
| 3.5.1.2 | CO ₂ ratio..... | 58 |
| 3.5.1.3 | Changes in the soil carbon level | 59 |
| 3.5.1.4 | Nutrient balances | 59 |
| 3.5.1.5 | Leaching of N | 59 |
| 3.5.2 | <i>Defining the organic orchard system</i> | 61 |
| 3.6 | SUMMARY | 63 |
| CHAPTER 4 METHODOLOGY..... | | 65 |
| 4.1 | INTRODUCTION | 65 |
| 4.2 | PRIMARY DATA COLLECTION | 65 |
| 4.3 | DATA FROM PUBLISHED LITERATURE | 68 |
| 4.3.1 | <i>Energy ratio</i> | 68 |

| | | |
|--|---|-----------|
| 4.3.1.1 | Energy output | 68 |
| 4.3.1.2 | Energy input | 69 |
| 4.3.2 | <i>CO₂ ratio</i> | 77 |
| 4.3.2.1 | CO ₂ sequestration | 79 |
| 4.3.2.2 | CO ₂ emitted | 81 |
| 4.3.3 | <i>Changes in the soil carbon level</i> | 83 |
| 4.3.4 | <i>Nutrient balances</i> | 84 |
| 4.3.5 | <i>Leaching of N</i> | 85 |
| 4.4 | ANALYSING THE ORCHARD PRODUCTION SYSTEMS FOR SUSTAINABILITY | 85 |
| 4.4.1 | <i>Computerised modelling environment</i> | 86 |
| 4.4.2 | <i>Model responses to changes in model inputs</i> | 88 |
| 4.4.2.1 | Model responses to changes in key management practices | 88 |
| 4.4.2.2 | Model responses to changes in key model parameters | 89 |
| 4.5 | SUMMARY | 90 |
| CHAPTER 5 SUSTAINABILITY OF ORGANIC KIWIFRUIT SYSTEMS | | 93 |
| 5.1 | INTRODUCTION | 93 |
| 5.2 | GENERAL ORCHARD DESCRIPTION | 93 |
| 5.2.1 | <i>Orchard establishment</i> | 94 |
| 5.2.2 | <i>Annual production practices</i> | 94 |
| 5.2.2.1 | Pruning | 95 |
| 5.2.2.2 | Spraying | 96 |
| 5.2.2.3 | Understorey management | 96 |
| 5.2.2.4 | Fertiliser application | 97 |
| 5.2.2.5 | Thinning | 98 |
| 5.2.2.6 | Harvesting | 98 |
| 5.2.3 | <i>Miscellaneous information</i> | 98 |
| 5.3 | THE MODEL ORGANIC KIWIFRUIT SYSTEM | 100 |
| 5.4 | SUSTAINABILITY ANALYSIS OF THE MODEL ORGANIC KIWIFRUIT SYSTEM | 103 |
| 5.4.1 | <i>Energy ratio</i> | 104 |
| 5.4.2 | <i>CO₂ ratio</i> | 106 |
| 5.4.3 | <i>Changes in the soil carbon level</i> | 107 |
| 5.4.4 | <i>Nutrient balances</i> | 107 |
| 5.4.5 | <i>Leaching of N</i> | 108 |
| 5.5 | MODEL RESPONSES TO CHANGES IN KEY MODEL INPUTS | 108 |
| 5.5.1 | <i>Management scenario analysis of the model organic kiwifruit system</i> | 108 |
| 5.5.2 | <i>Sensitivity analysis of the model organic kiwifruit system</i> | 111 |
| 5.6 | SUMMARY | 113 |

| | | |
|------------------|---|------------|
| CHAPTER 6 | SUSTAINABILITY OF ORGANIC APPLE SYSTEMS | 115 |
| 6.1 | INTRODUCTION | 115 |
| 6.2 | GENERAL ORCHARD DESCRIPTION | 115 |
| 6.2.1 | <i>Orchard establishment</i> | 115 |
| 6.2.2 | <i>Annual production practices</i> | 116 |
| 6.2.2.1 | Pruning | 117 |
| 6.2.2.2 | Spraying..... | 118 |
| 6.2.2.3 | Fertiliser application | 119 |
| 6.2.2.4 | Understorey management | 120 |
| 6.2.2.5 | Thinning | 120 |
| 6.2.2.6 | Harvesting..... | 121 |
| 6.2.2.7 | Irrigation..... | 121 |
| 6.2.3 | <i>Miscellaneous information</i> | 121 |
| 6.3 | TWO DIFFERENT ORGANIC APPLE SYSTEMS..... | 123 |
| 6.3.1 | <i>The model semi-intensive organic apple system</i> | 124 |
| 6.3.2 | <i>The model intensive organic apple system</i> | 128 |
| 6.4 | SUSTAINABILITY ANALYSES OF THE TWO MODEL ORGANIC APPLE SYSTEMS | 132 |
| 6.4.1 | <i>Sustainability indicators of the model semi-intensive organic apple system</i> | 132 |
| 6.4.1.1 | Energy ratio | 132 |
| 6.4.1.2 | CO ₂ ratio..... | 134 |
| 6.4.1.3 | Changes in the soil carbon level | 134 |
| 6.4.1.4 | Nutrient balances | 135 |
| 6.4.1.5 | Leaching of N | 135 |
| 6.4.2 | <i>Sustainability indicators of the model intensive organic apple system</i> | 136 |
| 6.4.2.1 | Energy ratio | 136 |
| 6.4.2.2 | CO ₂ ratio..... | 138 |
| 6.4.2.3 | Changes in the soil carbon level | 138 |
| 6.4.2.4 | Nutrient balances | 139 |
| 6.4.2.5 | Leaching of N | 139 |
| 6.5 | MODEL RESPONSES TO CHANGES IN KEY MODEL INPUTS | 139 |
| 6.5.1 | <i>Management scenario analyses of the organic apple systems</i> | 140 |
| 6.5.1.1 | Management scenario analysis of the semi-intensive organic apple system | 140 |
| 6.5.1.2 | Management scenario analysis of the model intensive organic apple system | 141 |
| 6.5.2 | <i>Sensitivity analyses of the organic apple systems</i> | 144 |
| 6.6 | SUMMARY | 147 |
| CHAPTER 7 | DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS | 149 |
| 7.1 | INTRODUCTION | 149 |
| 7.2 | THE SUSTAINABILITY ASSESSMENT APPROACH..... | 150 |
| 7.2.1 | <i>Sustainability assessment of the orchard systems</i> | 151 |
| 7.2.2 | <i>How well does the proposed approach work for assessing sustainability?</i> | 154 |
| 7.2.2.1 | Comparing the results with previously published studies | 155 |

| | | |
|---------------------|---|------------|
| 7.2.2.2 | Model responses to changes in management practices | 157 |
| 7.2.2.3 | Model responses to changes in model parameters | 158 |
| 7.2.3 | <i>Sustainability of organic kiwifruit and organic apple systems in New Zealand</i> | 162 |
| 7.2.3.1 | Guidance in the development of policy | 162 |
| 7.2.3.2 | Improvement in management to move towards more sustainable practices..... | 164 |
| 7.2.3.3 | Guidance for further research to improve sustainability of organic orchard systems | 166 |
| 7.3 | CONCLUSIONS | 167 |
| 7.4 | RECOMMENDATIONS | 169 |
| 7.5 | A FINAL WORD | 171 |
| REFERENCES | | 173 |
| APPENDIX I | INTERVIEW QUESTIONNAIRE (GUIDE QUESTIONS) | 197 |
| APPENDIX II | COMPOSITION OF FERTILISERS (%) | 203 |
| APPENDIX III | STELLA® MAP AND EQUATIONS FOR THE MODEL ORGANIC KIWIFRUIT SYSTEM | 205 |
| APPENDIX IV | STELLA® MAP AND EQUATIONS FOR THE MODEL ORGANIC SEMI-INTENSIVE APPLE SYSTEM | 213 |
| APPENDIX V | STELLA® MAP AND EQUATIONS FOR THE MODEL ORGANIC INTENSIVE APPLE SYSTEM | 219 |
| APPENDIX VI | EMBODIED ENERGY IN IRRIGATION/FROST PROTECTION SYSTEM | 227 |
| GLOSSARY | | 232 |

LIST OF FIGURES

| | | |
|------------|--|-----|
| Figure 2.1 | Model of Weak sustainability..... | 14 |
| Figure 2.2 | Model of Strong sustainability | 16 |
| Figure 3.1 | Orchard system and the environment (Adapted from Ruth, 1993)..... | 56 |
| Figure 3.2 | Schematic diagram of an orchard system for sustainability assessment | 63 |
| Figure 4.1 | Study area | 67 |
| Figure 4.2 | Carbon cycle of an organic orchard system. | 78 |
| Figure 4.3 | Schematic of the orchard system sustainability assessment..... | 86 |
| Figure 5.1 | Calendar of key operations in an organic kiwifruit orchard in Bay of Plenty, New Zealand..... | 95 |
| Figure 5.2 | Energy use in the model organic kiwifruit system | 106 |
| Figure 6.1 | Calendar of key operations in an organic apple orchard in Hawke’s Bay, New Zealand | 117 |
| Figure 6.2 | Energy use in the model semi-intensive organic apple system | 134 |
| Figure 6.3 | Energy use in the model intensive organic apple system. | 138 |

LIST OF TABLES

| | | |
|------------|--|-----|
| Table 3.1 | Indicators of sustainability at the orchard systems level..... | 57 |
| Table 4.1 | Embodied energy coefficients in inputs..... | 73 |
| Table 4.2 | Active ingredients in spray inputs..... | 74 |
| Table 4.3 | Energy coefficients and working life of vehicles and implements | 75 |
| Table 4.4 | CO ₂ emission coefficient for embodied energy in inputs | 82 |
| Table 5.1 | Rate of spray material application in organic kiwifruit orchards..... | 96 |
| Table 5.2 | Rate of fertiliser application in organic kiwifruit orchards | 98 |
| Table 5.3 | List of machinery/equipment held at the organic kiwifruit orchards | 99 |
| Table 5.4 | Machinery and equipment held at the model organic kiwifruit system..... | 101 |
| Table 5.5 | Spraying programme for the model organic kiwifruit system | 102 |
| Table 5.6 | Fertiliser application programme for the model organic kiwifruit system..... | 102 |
| Table 5.7 | Fuel consumption of the model organic kiwifruit system..... | 103 |
| Table 5.8 | Energy use and CO ₂ emissions from individual operation/processes of the model organic kiwifruit system..... | 105 |
| Table 5.9 | Nutrient balances of the model organic kiwifruit system kg/ha/yr (from Overseer®) | 108 |
| Table 5.10 | Comparison between compost purchased and that prepared on- site in the model organic kiwifruit system | 110 |
| Table 5.11 | Model responses to variation in parameters in the model organic kiwifruit system..... | 113 |
| Table 6.1 | The range of spray materials and their rate of application in organic apple orchards | 119 |
| Table 6.2 | The range of fertilisers and their rate of application in organic apple orchards | 120 |
| Table 6.3 | List of machinery/equipment held at organic apple orchards | 123 |

| | | |
|------------|--|-----|
| Table 6.4 | Machinery/equipment held at the model semi-intensive organic apple system | 125 |
| Table 6.5 | Spraying programme of the model semi-intensive organic apple system | 126 |
| Table 6.6 | Fertiliser application programme of the model semi-intensive organic apple system | 127 |
| Table 6.7 | Fuel consumption of the model semi-intensive organic apple system..... | 127 |
| Table 6.8 | Machinery/equipment held at the model intensive organic apple system | 129 |
| Table 6.9 | Spraying programme of the model intensive organic apple system..... | 130 |
| Table 6.10 | Fertiliser application programme of the model intensive organic apple system | 130 |
| Table 6.11 | Fuel consumption of the model intensive organic apple system..... | 131 |
| Table 6.12 | Energy use and CO ₂ emissions from individual operation/processes of the model semi-intensive organic apple system..... | 133 |
| Table 6.13 | Nutrient balances of the model semi-intensive organic apple system kg/ha/yr (from Overseer®)..... | 135 |
| Table 6.14 | Energy use and CO ₂ emissions from individual operation/processes of the model intensive organic apple system..... | 137 |
| Table 6.15 | Nutrient balances of the model intensive organic apple system kg/ha/yr (from Overseer®)..... | 139 |
| Table 6.16 | Fuel consumption in individual operations with a 40 kW tractor in the model intensive organic apple system..... | 143 |
| Table 6.17 | Model responses to variation in parameters in both model organic apple systems..... | 146 |