

**Contestability in the Resource Consent Process under the  
Resource Management Act 1991.**

**A study of opportunities for Maori within a contestable  
consent process.**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts in Social Policy

at Massey University, Palmerston North,  
New Zealand.

**Catherine P. Dowman**

**1999**

## Acknowledgements

Although my name is acknowledged on the cover as the author of this thesis, it has by no means been a sole journey. Throughout the development of this thesis I have encountered the help and advice of many who helped me on my journey towards completion.

I especially want to thank my supervisors Dr Christine Cheyne and Ms Wendy Parker for their utmost patience and guidance of my thesis. Their drive and highly professional approach to the research helped me through even those 'difficult times' we all seem to strike at some stage of the research process. I am also deeply grateful for having carried out my studies in a department that is committed to their students at all levels of study.

Thanks to Ginny McLean for proofreading and comments and for the support and help given to me throughout the year particularly in the completion stages of my thesis. I owe you. I cannot forget all my friends and family who were there along the way especially 'Sid' for reassuring me that all those mixed emotions I had were part of completing a thesis.

Finally, this thesis would not have been made possible without the support and participation of the local authorities and staff involved in the research, their interests in this research and wealth of information given freely has been appreciated: Thank you.

## Table of Contents

<b>Abstract.....</b>	<b>ii</b>
<b>Acknowledgements.....</b>	<b>iv</b>
<b>Table of Contents.....</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>List of Tables.....</b>	<b>ix</b>
<b>List of Abbreviations.....</b>	<b>xi</b>
<b>Glossary.....</b>	<b>xii</b>
<b>Chapter One: Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1.1. Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1.1. Tino rangatiratanga.....	1
1.1.2. Maori interests in resource management legislation.....	2
1.1.3. Introducing contestability as an aspect of the RMA .....	5
<b>1.2. Research questions and aims.....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>1.3. Organisation of the thesis.....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>Chapter Two: Literature Review.....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>2.1. Introduction.....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>2.2. Overview of contestability.....</b>	<b>10</b>
2.2.1. Forms of contestability.....	11
<b>2.3. Origins of the 1998 RMA review.....</b>	<b>14</b>
2.3.1. Business concerns.....	16
2.3.2. Comments on the review.....	17
2.3.3. Tangata whenua perspective.....	19
2.3.4. The RMA Amendment Bill 1999.....	20
2.3.5. The resource consent process: the (non-) notification provisions.....	21
<b>2.4. Research on Maori Participation in the consent process.....</b>	<b>22</b>
2.4.1. Consultation.....	24
<b>2.5. The principles of the Treaty of Waitangi.....</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>2.6. Section 8 and consultation.....</b>	<b>29</b>
2.6.1. Judicial opinion on Section 8.....	30
2.6.1.1. <u>Consultation by consent authority or council officer</u> .....	32
2.6.1.2. <u>Consultation by consent applicant</u> .....	33

<b>2.7. Conclusion.....</b>	<b>34</b>
<b>Chapter Three: Research Design.....</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>3.1. Introduction.....</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>3.2. Cross-cultural research.....</b>	<b>36</b>
3.2.1. Who should do the research?.....	38
<b>3.3. Ethical and Political issues.....</b>	<b>39</b>
<b>3.4. Empirical research.....</b>	<b>40</b>
3.4.1. Phase One: Documentary analysis.....	40
3.4.1.1. <u>Document selection</u> .....	40
3.4.1.2. <u>Regional Policy Statements and District Plans</u> .....	41
3.4.1.3. <u>Iwi Management Plans</u> .....	42
3.4.1.4. <u>Data collection</u> .....	42
3.4.2. Phase Two: Survey questionnaire.....	43
3.4.2.1. <u>Selection of participants</u> .....	43
3.4.2.2. <u>Selection of local authorities</u> .....	43
3.4.2.3. <u>Data collection</u> .....	43
<b>3.5. Data analysis.....</b>	<b>44</b>
<b>3.6. Ethical issues.....</b>	<b>44</b>
<b>3.7. Conclusion.....</b>	<b>45</b>
<b>Chapter Four: Analysis of Local Authority Plans and Policy Statements...46</b>	
<b>4.1. Introduction.....</b>	<b>46</b>
<b>4.2. Regional Policy Statements.....</b>	<b>46</b>
<b>4.3. Findings from the Regional Councils.....</b>	<b>48</b>
<b>4.4. Discussion of the Regional Council Policy Statements.....</b>	<b>49</b>
<b>4.5. Findings from the Unitary Authorities.....</b>	<b>54</b>
<b>4.6. Discussion of the Unitary Authority Regional Policy Statements.....</b>	<b>54</b>
<b>4.7. District Plans.....</b>	<b>56</b>
<b>4.8. Findings from the Territorial Authorities District Plans.....</b>	<b>58</b>
<b>4.9. Discussion of the District Plans.....</b>	<b>59</b>
<b>4.10.Iwi Management Plans.....</b>	<b>62</b>
<b>4.11.Findings from the Iwi Management Plans.....</b>	<b>63</b>

<b>4.12. Discussion of the Iwi Management Plans.....</b>	<b>76</b>
<b>4.13. Conclusion.....</b>	<b>78</b>
<b>Chapter Five: Perceptions on contestability: findings from the survey research.....</b>	<b>79</b>
<b>5.1. Introduction.....</b>	<b>79</b>
<b>5.2. The survey.....</b>	<b>79</b>
<b>5.3. Part One: Local Authority Officers’ perceptions of contestability.....</b>	<b>81</b>
5.3.1. Awareness of the contestability proposal.....	81
5.3.2. Functions and roles.....	81
5.3.3. Education: skills and knowledge in iwi/Treaty issues.....	96
5.3.4. Opportunities.....	97
5.3.5. Potential negative aspects of contestability.....	99
5.3.5.1. <u>Common Themes</u> .....	100
<b>5.4. Part Two: Current consent provisions: comparing policy to practice..</b>	<b>105</b>
5.4.1. Contestability in the processing of consent applications.....	105
5.4.2. Contracting out the processing of consent applications.....	106
5.4.3. Transfer of power provisions.....	107
5.4.4. Delegation of power provisions.....	110
<b>5.5. Conclusion.....</b>	<b>111</b>
<b>Chapter Six: Conclusions.....</b>	<b>112</b>
<b>6.1. Introduction.....</b>	<b>112</b>
<b>6.2. Key findings.....</b>	<b>112</b>
6.2.1. Contestability, a way forward for Maori participation.....	114
6.2.2. Treaty of Waitangi obligations.....	115
<b>6.3. Recommendations for policy and practice.....</b>	<b>116</b>
6.3.1. Policy.....	116
6.3.2. Practice.....	117
6.3.3. Alternatives to contestability.....	117
<b>6.4. Reflections on the research.....</b>	<b>118</b>
<b>6.5. Future research.....</b>	<b>118</b>
<b>6.6. Conclusion.....</b>	<b>119</b>

<b>List of Appendices.....</b>	<b>121</b>
<b>Appendices.....</b>	<b>122</b>
<b>Bibliography.....</b>	<b>139</b>

<b>List of Tables</b>
-----------------------

<b>Table 4.1.</b>	Findings from the Regional Council Policy Statements.....	<b>48</b>
<b>Table 4.2.</b>	Findings from the Unitary Authority Policy Statements.....	<b>54</b>
<b>Table 4.3.</b>	Findings from the Manawatu-Wanganui Territorial Local Authority District Plans.....	<b>58</b>
<b>Table 4.4.</b>	Findings from the Hawkes Bay Territorial Local Authority District Plans.....	<b>58</b>
<b>Table 4.5.</b>	Findings from the Southland Territorial Local Authority District Plans.....	<b>59</b>
<b>Table 5.1.</b>	Local Authority Functions and Roles: Notification decisions under contestability of resource consent processing.....	<b>82</b>
<b>Table 5.2.</b>	Local Authority Functions and Roles: Type and level of information shared under contestability of resource consent processing.....	<b>83</b>
<b>Table 5.3.</b>	Local Authority Functions and Roles: Pre-application consultation under contestability of resource consent processing...	<b>85</b>
<b>Table 5.4.</b>	Local Authority Functions and Roles: Procedures identifying affected parties under contestability of resource consent processing.....	<b>86</b>
<b>Table 5.5.</b>	Local Authority Functions and Roles: Procedures checking environmental effects under contestability of resource consent processing.....	<b>87</b>
<b>Table 5.6.</b>	Local Authority Functions and Roles: Cost recovery to tangata whenua under contestability of resource consent processing.....	<b>88</b>
<b>Table 5.7.</b>	Local Authority Functions and Roles: Accountability to tangata whenua under contestability of resource consent processing.....	<b>89</b>

<b>Table 5.8.</b>	Local Authority Functions and Roles: Funding tangata whenua consultation under contestability of resource consent processing...	<b>90</b>
<b>Table 5.9.</b>	Local Authority Functions and Roles: Application of s 8 in consent decisions under contestability of resource consent processing.....	<b>91</b>
<b>Table 5.10.</b>	Local Authority Functions and Roles: Policy and plan development under contestability of resource consent processing.....	<b>93</b>
<b>Table 5.11.</b>	Local Authority Functions and Roles: Interpretation and application of plan and policy provisions under contestability of resource consent processing.....	<b>95</b>
<b>Table 5.12.</b>	Skills of external processors under contestability of resource consent processing.....	<b>96</b>
<b>Table 5.13.</b>	Skills of internal processors under contestability of resource consent processing.....	<b>96</b>
<b>Table 5.14.</b>	Opportunities under contestability of resource consent processing..	<b>97</b>
<b>Table 5.15.</b>	Potential negative aspects under contestability of resource consent processing.....	<b>99</b>
<b>Table 5.16.</b>	Current practices: contesting the processing of consents.....	<b>105</b>
<b>Table 5.17.</b>	Current practices: contracting out the processing of consents.....	<b>106</b>
<b>Table 5.18.</b>	Current practices: use of the transfer of power provisions.....	<b>107</b>
<b>Table 5.19.</b>	Current practices: use of the delegation of power provisions.....	<b>110</b>



## List of Abbreviations

CA	Court of Appeal
DOC	Department of Conservation
DP	District Plan
IMP	Iwi Management Plan
LGNZ	Local Government New Zealand
MAF	Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries
MfE	Ministry for the Environment
MoC	Ministry of Commerce
NCPS	National Coastal Policy Statement
NZBRT	New Zealand Business Roundtable
PCE	Parliamentary Commissioner for the Environment
RC	Regional Council
RMA	Resource Management Act
RMLR	Resource Management Law Reform
RPS	Regional Policy Statement
TCPA	Town and Country Planning Act
TLA	Territorial Local Authority
TPK	Te Puni Kokiri
UA	Unitary Authority

## Glossary

<b>hapu</b>	family or district groups, communities
<b>hui</b>	gatherings, discussions, meetings usually on marae
<b>iwi</b>	tribal groups
<b>kaimoana</b>	food from the sea
<b>kaitiaki</b>	iwi, hapu or whanau group with the responsibilities of kaitiakitanga
<b>kaitiakitanga</b>	the responsibilities and kaupapa, passed down from the ancestors, for tangata whenua to take care of the places, natural resources and other taonga in their rohe, and the mauri of those places, resources and taonga
<b>kaumatua</b>	elders, decision-makers for the iwi or hapu
<b>kaupapa</b>	plan, strategy, tactics, methods, fundamental principles
<b>kawanatanga</b>	government, the right of the Crown under the Treaty of Waitangi to govern and make laws
<b>koiwi</b>	human remains, bones
<b>mahinga kai</b>	places where food and other resources are traditionally gathered, and the gathering and management of those resources
<b>mana</b>	respect, dignity, status, influence, power
<b>mana whenua</b>	traditional status, rights and responsibilities of hapu as residents in their rohe
<b>marae</b>	local community and its meeting-places and buildings
<b>matauranga</b>	traditional knowledge
<b>mauri</b>	essential life force, the spiritual power and distinctiveness that enables each thing to exist as itself
<b>mokopuna</b>	grandchildren
<b>pa</b>	occupation site, often in a strategic location such as a hilltop

<b>rangatiratanga</b>	rights of autonomous self-regulation, the authority of the iwi or hapu to make decisions and control resources
<b>rohe</b>	geographical territory of an iwi or hapu
<b>ropu</b>	organisation, group, team
<b>runanga</b>	committee of senior decision-makers of an iwi or hapu
<b>tangata whenua</b>	people of the land
<b>taonga</b>	valued resources, assets, prized possessions both material and non-material
<b>tapu</b>	sacredness, spiritual power or protective force
<b>tikanga</b>	customary way of doing things, traditions
<b>tupuna</b>	ancestors
<b>turangawaewae</b>	domicile, home, hometurf
<b>wahi tapu</b>	special and sacred places
<b>wairua</b>	spirit, soul
<b>wananga</b>	place of education
<b>whakapapa</b>	genealogy, ancestry, identify with place, hapu and iwi
<b>whanau</b>	family groups