Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Making politics go well down under:
Public journalism in New Zealand
daily newspapers

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for
the degree of

Master of Management
in
Communication Management

at Massey University, Wellington
New Zealand

David Venables

2008
Abstract

The literature on the use of public journalism suggests that it can lead to different news coverage than is traditionally provided by the news media. Specifically, these differences have been identified in story content, use of different sources and use of mobilising information. This thesis asks whether such differences can be identified in newspapers’ coverage of the 2001 Local Body Elections in New Zealand. The research involved content analysis of New Zealand’s six largest daily newspapers, three of them with experience of using public journalism and three with no such experience. Interviews were also conducted with two or three senior journalists involved in organising each paper’s election campaign in order to explore their goals for the election coverage and evaluation of it.

The results mirror those of previous research by showing significant differences in the coverage of the newspapers with public journalism experience in relation to some factors, but not others. The papers with a public journalism background consistently used more non-elite sources than the traditional papers, but did not consistently use more female sources. They also included mobilising information in stories more frequently and made greater use of story features, or “elements”, associated with public journalism. However, one of the papers with no experience of public journalism also ranked highly in relation to these two factors.

The interviews revealed some differences in goals among the journalists, but this was not a simple split between the journalists on papers with public journalism experience and the other journalists. For example, not all interviewees working for the papers experienced in using public journalism agreed that their goal should be to boost voter turnout. Nor was an overt commitment to supporting the democratic process expressed only by staff on the papers with public journalism experience. The interviews did, however, identify that only the three newspapers with a public journalism background used polling to identify the issues that were important to the public and proceeded to cover these issues during their election campaign.
Acknowledgements

This research was approved by the Massey University Human Ethics Committee, which had special regard for the conduct of interviews with representatives of the news media.

Special mention should be made of the 14 senior journalists who gave their time for this thesis: Tim Pankhurst, Anne-Marie Johnson and Mary-Jane Boland (of The Evening Post); Barrie Swift and Bernadette Courtney (of The Dominion); Jeremy Rees, Bryan Rudman and Bernard Orsman (of the New Zealand Herald); Venetia Sherson and Geoff Taylor (of the Waikato Times); Paul Thompson and Colin Espiner (of The Press); and Robin Charteris and Andrea Jones (of the Otago Daily Times). Thanks are particularly due to Warren Page (formerly Independent Newspapers Ltd’s training manager) and John Harvey (former editor of the Evening Standard), who shared their experiences of public journalism. Finally, Venetia Sherson (editor of the Waikato Times) and Tim Pankhurst (editor of The Evening Post) deserve extra thanks for allowing themselves to be interviewed at length twice.

Finally, heartfelt thanks are due to Margie Comrie, of Massey University’s Department of Communication and Journalism, who provided guidance and supervision for this research over a seven-year period.

David Venables
Wellington
12 June 2008
Table of Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................................. ii
Acknowledgements ................................................................................................................ iii
Table of Contents ..................................................................................................................... iv
List of Illustrations ................................................................................................................... vii
Chapter One: Introduction ....................................................................................................... 1
  1.1 Research questions ........................................................................................................... 5
  1.2 Structure of thesis by chapter ........................................................................................ 6
    1.2.1 Chapter One: Introduction ......................................................................................... 6
    1.2.2 Chapter Two: Public journalism, theory and practice ............................................. 6
    1.2.3 Chapter Three: Public journalism practice in the United States ......................... 6
    1.2.4 Chapter Four: Public journalism practice in New Zealand and Australia .......... 7
    1.2.5 Chapter Five: Methodology ..................................................................................... 7
    1.2.6 Chapter Six: Interviews with newsroom decision makers ................................... 7
    1.2.7 Chapter Seven: Results of content analysis ............................................................ 7
    1.2.8 Chapter Eight: Discussion ....................................................................................... 8
    1.2.9 Chapter Nine: Conclusion ....................................................................................... 8
  1.3 The context of the research: the 2001 New Zealand Local Body Elections ................ 8
Chapter Two: Public journalism, theory and practice ............................................................. 10
  2.1 Democratic decline: the United States experience ....................................................... 12
  2.2 Democratic decline: the world experience ................................................................... 18
  2.3 Media role: the United States experience ...................................................................... 23
  2.4 Media role: the world experience .................................................................................. 36
  2.5 The making of the news ................................................................................................. 48
  2.6 The sources of news ...................................................................................................... 51
  2.7 Conclusion ..................................................................................................................... 54
Chapter Three: Public journalism practice in the United States ............................................. 56
  3.1 The beginnings of public journalism .............................................................................. 56
  3.2 Rosen and Merritt – public journalism as changed media practice ............................ 61
  3.3 The spread of public journalism in the United States ................................................. 64
  3.4 Critics of public journalism ............................................................................................ 67
  3.5 Evaluation of public journalism experiments ............................................................... 70
  3.6 Defining public journalism ............................................................................................ 75
  3.7 Conclusion ..................................................................................................................... 77
Chapter Four: Public journalism practice in New Zealand and Australia ............................. 78
  4.1 Public journalism in Australia ....................................................................................... 78
  4.2 Public journalism in New Zealand ................................................................................. 83
  4.3 Evaluation of public journalism in New Zealand ............................................................ 86
Chapter Five: Methodology ..................................................................................................... 91
  5.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................... 91
  5.2 Interviews with editorial decision makers ................................................................. 94
    5.2.1 Interviews as a methodology ................................................................................... 94
    5.2.2 Purpose of the 2001 election interviews ............................................................... 95
    5.2.3 Selection of interviewees ....................................................................................... 96
    5.2.4 Conducting the interviews .................................................................................... 96
    5.2.5 Recording the interviews ..................................................................................... 97
    5.2.6 The interview questions ....................................................................................... 97
  5.3 Content analysis of the 2001 election stories ............................................................... 98
5.3.1 Content analysis as a methodology ............................................................. 99
5.3.2 Formulating the hypothesis ................................................................ 101
5.3.3 Selecting the sample ............................................................................ 101
5.3.4 Defining categories ............................................................................. 102
5.3.5 Outlining and implementing the coding process ................................. 103
5.3.6 Determining the reliability and validity of the research ......................... 104
5.4 Amount of election coverage .................................................................. 105
5.5 Geographical spread of coverage ............................................................. 105
5.6 Type and extent of mobilising information .............................................. 106
5.7 Public journalism “elements” .................................................................... 106
5.8 Coding of sources .................................................................................... 109
5.8.1 Sources by gender .............................................................................. 110
5.8.2 Elite versus non-elite sources ............................................................... 110
5.8.3 Sources by ethnicity ............................................................................ 111
5.9 Analysing the content analysis results ...................................................... 112
5.10 Conclusion ............................................................................................... 112
Chapter Six: Interviews with newsroom decision makers .............................. 114
6.1 Introduction .............................................................................................. 114
6.2 News selection processes ........................................................................ 115
6.2.1 New Zealand Herald ......................................................................... 115
6.2.2 Otago Daily Times .............................................................................. 117
6.2.3 The Dominion ...................................................................................... 118
6.2.4 Summary of news selection on newspapers without experience of public journalism ................................................................. 119
6.2.5 Waikato Times .................................................................................... 120
6.2.6 The Press .............................................................................................. 121
6.2.7 The Evening Post ............................................................................... 123
6.2.8 Summary of news selection on newspapers with experience of public journalism .................................................................................. 125
6.2.9 News selection on the six newspapers .................................................. 126
6.3 Aims of 2001 local body election coverage ............................................. 127
6.3.1 New Zealand Herald ......................................................................... 127
6.3.2 Otago Daily Times .............................................................................. 130
6.3.3 The Dominion ...................................................................................... 132
6.3.4 Summary of election coverage aims and approaches on newspapers without experience of public journalism ................................................................. 134
6.3.5 Waikato Times .................................................................................... 135
6.3.6 The Press .............................................................................................. 138
6.3.7 The Evening Post ............................................................................... 141
6.3.8 Summary of election coverage aims and approaches on newspapers with experience of public journalism ................................................................. 143
6.3.9 Election coverage aims and approaches on the six newspapers .......... 144
6.4 Editorial decision makers’ knowledge of public journalism .................... 146
6.4.1 New Zealand Herald ......................................................................... 146
6.4.2 Otago Daily Times .............................................................................. 147
6.4.3 The Dominion ...................................................................................... 147
6.4.4 Waikato Times .................................................................................... 147
6.4.5 The Press .............................................................................................. 150
6.4.6 The Evening Post ............................................................................... 151
6.4.7 Summary of knowledge about public journalism ................................. 153
## List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1</td>
<td>Coding of sources – categories</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2</td>
<td>Number of election stories and size of coverage for each newspaper</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3</td>
<td>Number and percentage of election stories containing mobilising information</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4</td>
<td>Number and percentage of election stories containing different types of mobilising information</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5</td>
<td>Use of public journalism elements in election stories</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6</td>
<td>Types of public journalism elements used in election stories Theme 1: Participation</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7</td>
<td>Types of public journalism elements used in election stories Theme 2: Views of ordinary people</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 8</td>
<td>Types of public journalism elements used in election stories Theme 3: Discussion topics</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 9</td>
<td>Types of public journalism elements used in election stories Theme 4: Newspaper statements</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 10</td>
<td>Types of public journalism elements used in election stories Theme 5: Candidate information</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 11</td>
<td>Occurrence of references to local authorities in election stories New Zealand Herald</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 12</td>
<td>Occurrence of references to local authorities in election stories Otago Daily Times</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 13</td>
<td>Occurrence of references to local authorities in election stories The Dominion</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 14</td>
<td>Occurrence of references to local authorities in election stories Waikato Times</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 15</td>
<td>Occurrence of references to local authorities in election stories The Press</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 16</td>
<td>Occurrence of references to local authorities in election stories The Evening Post</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 17</td>
<td>Number of sources in election stories</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 18</td>
<td>Occurrence of elite and non-elite sources in election coverage</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 19</td>
<td>Types of elite sources used in election coverage</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 20</td>
<td>Types of non-elite sources used in election coverage</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 21</td>
<td>Gender of sources used in election coverage</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>