Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Social Policy in a Christian Frame of Meaning

A World-View, Ethic and Theoretical Framework for the Analysis, Choice, & Design of Social Policy

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts
in
Social Policy

School of Sociology, Social Policy and Social Work
Massey University, Palmerston North,
New Zealand

Gerald John Warner
2001
ABSTRACT

This thesis is about how one might think, read, and approach, the analysis, choice, and design of social policy from a Christian world-view, ethic, and theoretical framework.

This theoretical, normative, and explorative study is based on the propositions that all polities operate within some kind of frame of meaning, and that all social judgement is ultimately influenced by the presuppositions contained in one's broader world-view. In response, the thesis examines the Christian Realist, the Reformed/neo-Calvinist, and the Catholic social teaching traditions as contributors to the development of a Christian communitarian theoretical framework.

Upon the exploration of the social, political, and moral theory, and the theological underpinnings of these three Christian traditions, this thesis approaches the theory eclectically focusing primarily on their mutually supportive aspects. The study finds a triangular relationship between the three traditions, such that each tradition supplements, informs, and complements the other. The Realist tradition maintains a consistent account of human nature and vitality, explicating human self-interest and power in social life, and thus appends both the Reformed and Catholic traditions. The Reformed tradition complements the Realist and substitutes Catholic social theory with a systematic theory of the structure of society. Moreover, the Catholic tradition provides the Reformed and Realist traditions with the systematic moral and ethical ends to which Christian social action ought to be orientated.

The study also develops an approach to social policy indicative of the major ethos and orientation that characterises each tradition. The study therefore approaches the analysis of social policy from a responsible and realist frame of mind, recognising the plural nature of distinct spheres and jurisdictions within society, whilst maintaining a compassion for, and the centrality of, the human person.

After orchestrating the theory into the construction of a Christian theoretical and normative frame, the study seeks to apply and utilise the Christian frame for
the analysis, choice, and design of social policy. In response, the investigation examines a method for the inquiry of political frames of meaning (frame-critical policy analysis), employing the normative Christian communitarian frame as a counter-system. This policy analysis method dialectically critiques contesting policy viewpoints as grounded in their wider ideological social choice.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work is dedicated to my lovely wife, Karen, who has patiently endured the longevity and intensity of my focus. Coping with such an encumbrance in the first year of our marriage has not been easy. She has probably given more to this thesis than I could ever know.

Sincere thanks must also go to my supervisors Dr. Martin Sullivan and Richard Shaw, who as good supervisors have provided significant encouragement and critical comment. Specifically, Martin has provided timely encouragement, particularly at the outset, to pursue a topic that facilitated considerable personal growth. Richard has specialised in substantial critical comment and feedback. It has been an enjoyable working relationship.

I would also like to especially acknowledge my indebtedness, to the team of the Upper Hutt Christian Fellowship who coordinate Strategic Christian Services (Pacific) and the "School of Christian World-View and Strategic Life Training." This programme has been the most significant influence in the formative years of my adult life and has been instrumental in leading me to embark on the subject matter of this thesis.

Equally, of special acknowledgement, is my indebtedness to the Christian Community Church (Palmerston North). The experiences, relationships, wisdom, encouragement, and freedom to attempt to outwork many of my ideas, has all culminated in an immense time of personal growth. There are numerous people who warrant mention, but I restrict myself to offering special thanks to the community and the leadership of the Christian Community Church.

Also special recognition must be given to my wonderful sister Monique Warner for her many hours of helpful computer expertise, and presentational assistance.

And to the most encouraging and loyal of friends: Tim Soong, Peter Bardsley, and Nick Scott.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Title Page</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Diagrams</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter One: Introduction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Nature Of A “Frame Of Meaning” In Social Policy</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Three Fundamental Ideas Underpinning the Study</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #1: The Idea of Perspective</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #2: Social Policy is Conceived in Terms of One's Political Ideology</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #3: All Social Judgement (Scientific or Political) is Ultimately Influenced by One’s Presuppositions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Research Purpose, Objectives and Questions</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Nature of the Study</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Research Method</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Structure of the Thesis</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PART ONE: CHRISTIAN THEORETICAL FRAMEWORKS</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Two: The Christian Realist Tradition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Moral and Political Philosophy of Reinhold Niebuhr</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction: Human Nature as the Central Reference Point</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Origin and Nature of Christian Realism</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Political Philosophy of Reinhold Niebuhr</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niebuhr’s Treatise on Human Nature</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme #1: Humanity Made in the Image of God - The Ideas of Self-Transcendence and the Dignity of Human Nature</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme #2: Humanity as a Unity of Nature and Free Spirit</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme #3: The Corruption of Human Nature by Sin</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Necessity and Basis of Community</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Selfhood Contains Both Self-Regarding and Self-Giving Inclinations</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immanence Philosophy</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Pretended Autonomy of Theoretical Thought</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Christian Ground-Motive</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contribution of the Philosophy of the Cosmonomic Idea to a Theory of Society</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Cosmonomic Idea</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Christian Cosmonomic Idea</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Religious Basis of Dooyeweerd's Social Theory</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Tasks of Social Theory</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The General Theory of Modal Spheres</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theory of the Structure of Society</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dooyeweerd’s Classification of Social Institutions</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Typical Structures of a Differentiated Society</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sphere Sovereignty: The Typical Institutional Forms as Sovereign Within its Own Sphere</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intertwinements Between the Spheres: Encaptic and Part-to-Whole Relations</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continual Historical Development of the Spheres</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sphere Sovereignty Rejects Individualist and Collectivist Views of Social Organisation</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Response Required to Positivise the Structural Norms</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theory of the State: The Inner Normative Structure of the State</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Qualifying Function of the State</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Meaning of the Justitial Aspect</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not the Only Institution Operating in the Justitial Function</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Tasks of the State</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Role of the State in Fostering Other Institutional Spheres</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Inner Normative Limit of the State According to the Principle of Sphere Sovereignty</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Essential Characteristics of the Reformed View of the State</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The Implications of Sphere Sovereignty for Social Policy</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sphere Sovereignty and the Welfare State</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilising Non-State Spheres for Government Purposes</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sphere Sovereignty and the Mutual Irreducibility of Social Ethics</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sphere Sovereignty and the Goals of Social Well-Being</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6. A Brief Critique and Assessment .......................................................... 92
7. Conclusion .......................................................................................... 95

Chapter Four: The Catholic Social Teaching Tradition
The Official Papal Encyclicals ................................................................. 98

1. Introduction: A Christian Social Ethic .............................................. 98
2. The Origin and Nature of the "Catholic Social Teaching" Tradition ...... 99
   The Development of Catholic Social Teaching ..................................... 101
3. Traditional Catholic Social Theory ...................................................... 107
   The Catholic View of Human Nature .................................................. 108
   The Catholic View of Society .............................................................. 110
   The Catholic View of the State ............................................................ 110
4. Principles for Social and Institutional Organisation ............................ 112
   The State and the Common Good ....................................................... 112
   The Common Good and Intermediary Bodies ..................................... 113
   Subsidiarity ....................................................................................... 114
   Solidarity ......................................................................................... 117
   Subsidiarity, Solidarity and the Activities of the State .......................... 118
   Conclusion: A Catholic Pluralist Communitarian Perspective ............ 120
5. The Ethic and Themes of Catholic Social Teaching ............................ 121
   The Dignity of the Human Person ...................................................... 122
   Commutative, Distributive and Social Justice ....................................... 123
   A Call to Family, Community, and Participation .................................. 125
   Promotion of the Common Good ....................................................... 126
   Rights and Responsibilities ................................................................. 127
   The Dignity of Work and the Rights of Workers .................................. 128
   The Preferential Option for the Poor and Vulnerable .......................... 131
   Solidarity ......................................................................................... 131
   Stewardship of Creation ................................................................. 132
   Private Property and the Universal Destination of Material Goods ......... 132
6. A Brief Critique and Assessment .......................................................... 133
   Critique of Catholic Social Theory ...................................................... 133
   Critique of the Ethic and Themes of Catholic Social Teaching ............. 137
7. Conclusion .......................................................................................... 140
PART TWO: ORCHESTRATION AND APPLICATION OF A CHRISTIAN THEORETICAL FRAME ......................................................... 142

Chapter Five: A Christian Normative Frame for Social Policy Analysis
A Theoretical Framwork and Methodology for the Analysis of Social Policy ................................................................. 143

1. Introduction ........................................................................................................................................................................ 143

   A Christian View of Human Nature ........................................................................................................................................... 144
   The Principle of Humanity as Created in the Likeness of God ........................................................................................................ 144
   The Principle of Coherent Unity (Nature and Spirit) ................................................................................................................ 145
   The Principle of the Mind as Servant of the Self .......................................................................................................................... 145
   The Principle of Corruption by Sin .............................................................................................................................................. 146
   Humanity as a Social and Interdependent Being ...................................................................................................................... 146

Critical Reflections on the Nature of Human Behaviour, Interaction and Vitality ................................................................. 146
   The Self is Both Self-Seeking and Self-Giving ............................................................................................................................ 147
   The Relation of the Individual to the Community .................................................................................................................... 147
   The Perennial Struggle for Power .............................................................................................................................................. 147
   Principle of the "Moral Individual and Immoral Society" ........................................................................................................ 148
   The Predominance of Power to Ethics in Group Relations ...................................................................................................... 148
   The Collective Social Responsibility of Groups ........................................................................................................................ 148

Principles for the Technical Arrangements of Social, Economic, and Political Life ........................................................................ 149
   Sphere Sovereignty: The Typical Structures of Society ............................................................................................................. 149
   Sphere Sovereignty and the State ................................................................................................................................................ 151
   Subsidiarity and the State .............................................................................................................................................................. 151
   Solidarity (Public Cooperation) .................................................................................................................................................. 152
   The Balance of Power and the Peril of Anarchy .......................................................................................................................... 153
   The Organisation of Power and the Peril of Tyranny .................................................................................................................. 153

The Values and Social Ethic of a Christian Frame .................................................................................................................. 154
   The Transcendent Norm of Love ................................................................................................................................................ 154
   The Rules and Principles of Justice ........................................................................................................................................... 154
   Types of Justice: Commutative, Distributive, and Social Justice ............................................................................................ 155
   Human Dignity ............................................................................................................................................................................. 155
   Family, Community and Participation ........................................................................................................................................ 156
The Common Good ............................................. 156
Rights and Responsibilities ................................ 156
The Dignity of Work ......................................... 157
Preferential Option for the Poor ............................. 157
Stewardship of Creation ...................................... 158
Conclusion ....................................................... 158

3. An Overview of a Style of Policy Analysis: A Frame and Value
Critical Approach ............................................ 159
A Frame of Reference as the Starting Point and Object of Analysis:
Frame-Critical Policy Analysis ............................ 160
A Normative, Value-Inclusive Approach to Policy Analysis .......... 161
The Christian Communitarian Frame as a Counter-System .......... 162
An Analysis of Social/Political Choice ........................ 163
Policy Analysis as Applied Political and Moral
Philosophy/Theology ......................................... 164
Conclusion ....................................................... 165

Step #1: Profile the Historical Context of the Policy ............... 166
Step #2: Frame the Contending Perspectives .................... 166
Step #3: Dialectically Critique Each Frame Against a Christian
Communitarian Frame of Reference ........................ 167
Stage 1: The Choice and View of Political Ideology/Human
Nature for Interpreting Social And Political Reality ............. 168
Stage 2: The Choice of Technical Institutional Arrangements ........ 168
Stage 3: The Choice of Social Values .......................... 169
Step #4: Frame the Choice and Design of Policy .................. 169

5. Conclusion ................................................... 170

Chapter Six: The Political Frames Contending Employment Relations
Policy

A Christian Communitarian Frame-Critical Analysis of the
Contending Debating the Employment Relations Act 2000 ........ 173

1. Introduction .................................................. 173

2. A Brief History of Employment Relations Policy in New Zealand 174

3. Framing the Contending Political Positions: The Ideological “Social
Choice” Frames Defining the Nature of the Employment Relationship .. 178
The Market-Liberal Frame of the Employment Relationship
(The Employment Contracts Act 1991) .......................... 179
The Market-Liberal View of Human Nature ...................... 179
The Employment Relationship: A Legal Contract ........................................... 180
The Significance and Priority of Unions ....................................................... 181
The Market-Liberal View of Bargaining Structure ......................................... 182
The Market-Liberal View of the State ............................................................. 183
Summary of the Market-Liberal Frame ........................................................... 184
The Social-Democratic Frame of the Employment Relationship
(The Employment Relations Act 2000) ......................................................... 184
Social-Democratic View of Human Nature ..................................................... 184
The Employment Relationship: A Collective and Cooperative Endeavour of Good Faith ................................................................. 185
The Significance and Priority of Unions .......................................................... 186
The Meaning and Priority of “Freedom of Association” .................................. 187
Social Democratic View of Bargaining Structures .......................................... 188
The Role of the State in Employment Relations .............................................. 189
Summary of the Social-Democratic Perspective ............................................. 190
Summary ........................................................................................................... 190

4. Critique of the Contesting Positions Against a Christian Communitarian Frame .......... 190
Stage #1: An Analysis of Key Assumptions and Presuppositions as Contained in Human Nature and Society ................................................................. 191
Critique of the Market-Liberal View of Human Nature in the Employment Contract ................................................................. 191
Critique of the Social-Democratic View of Human Nature and the Employment Relationship ................................................................. 193
A Christian Communitarian View of Human Nature and the Employment Relationship ................................................................. 195
Stage #2: An Institutional Analysis ................................................................. 197
Critique of the Market-Liberal View of Institutional Arrangements: ............... 197
Critique of the Social-Democratic View of Institutional Arrangements: ........... 198
A Christian Communitarian View of Institutional Arrangements ......... 203
Stage #3: A Social Ethics Analysis ................................................................. 208
The Market-Liberal Social Ethic: Justice, Equality and Freedom .................... 208
The Social-Democratic Social Ethic: Justice, Equality and Freedom .............. 210
Critique Against a Christian Communitarian Social Ethic ......................... 211
Summary ................................................................................................................. 215

5. Conclusion: Framing the Choice and Design of Employment Relations Policy .................................................................................................................. 216

Chapter Seven: Summary and Conclusions

Social Policy in a Christian Frame of Meaning ............................................ 218

1. Introduction ........................................................................................................ 218

2. Summary of the Thesis .................................................................................. 218

Three Fundamental Ideas and Two Research Questions ......................... 218

An Exploration of Three Christian Traditions for the Development of a Theoretical Framework .......................................................... 219

Critique of the Theory ...................................................................................... 221

The Development of an Approach to Social Policy .................................... 224

A Realist and Responsible Approach to Social Policy ............................. 224

An Approach that Recognises Distinct Jurisdictions of Society and Their Inter-Relationship .......................................................... 225

An Attitude that Approaches Social Policy in Compassion for and the Centrality of the Human Person ........................................... 226

The Development of a Method for Social Policy Analysis ....................... 227

Analysis of a Social Policy Issue: Employment Relations Policy .......... 228

3. Limitations of the Study ............................................................................... 228

4. Further Research .......................................................................................... 229

5. Closing Sentiment ...................................................................................... 231

Bibliography ..................................................................................................... 233
LIST OF DIAGRAMS

3.1 Modal Laws Governing Various Things .............................................. 67
3.2 The Typical Institutional Types as They Range Across the Modalities .... 72
3.3 An Individual's Functioning in the Normative Aspects that Correspond to the Social Sphere and the Qualifying Leading Functions of Various Communities ......................................................... 73

5.1 Summary of a Christian Communitarian Theoretical Frame ................ 159
5.2 A Method for the Analysis of Social Policy ........................................ 170
5.3 A Christian Communitarian Frame and Method for the Analysis of Social Policy ................................................................. 171