Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
CLINICAL DECISION MAKING

BY REGISTERED NURSES IN RESIDENTIAL AGED CARE:

A CRITICAL REALIST CASE STUDY

A thesis presented in fulfilment of requirements
for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy
in
Nursing

at Massey University, Albany,
New Zealand

Kaye Milligan
2016
ABSTRACT

Increasing numbers of people are living longer and projections indicate that a greater number of frail elders will require support from the residential aged care sector. Registered nurses are the principal health care professional with sustained oversight of residents and make many of the clinical decisions that affect the health and outcomes of care of the residents. This thesis explains the clinical decisions that registered nurses make in the New Zealand residential aged care sector.

The study was undertaken using a critical realist case study framework. This case study describes the clinical decisions the registered nurses make and explains the social structures through causative factors that intersect to cause, redirect, or block the clinical decisions. The data collection methods were participant observation, interview, and document analysis in three residential care facilities. Fourteen registered nurses participated in the study. Data analysis included reasoning processes whereby patterns from the data were reviewed within current knowledge, and explanations developed.

The clinical decisions represent the comprehensive nature of nursing practice in this sector. Physical and mental health, and the management of behavioural issues in the context of gerontology are significant foci of nursing frail elders. Three causative factors inherent to the social structure of residential aged care were identified that generate, redirect, or block the clinical decisions. These causative factors are: the relationships the registered nurses develop with the resident, their family, and the general practitioner, which are embedded within the registered nurse role; the specific context of the residential aged care sector in which risk aversion, financial constraints, and limited support for the development of the registered nurses prevails; and the individuality of each registered nurse whose knowledge and agency affects their concern for, and management of, the residents.
This thesis presents a comprehensive explanation of the complexity of the registered nurses’ clinical decisions. It identifies that some clinical decisions reside within a zone of certainty, as the registered nurse makes the decision to act or to not act. Other clinical decisions reside within the zone of uncertainty, as the registered nurse experiences indecision, and may ‘wait and watch’ or seek advice. Recommendations for practice focus on the clinical decisions within the zone of uncertainty, the subsequent ongoing professional development requirements, and the need for clinical support and clinical leadership.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis has been developed over a considerable number of years. Thank you to each registered nurse who agreed to be interviewed and/or observed. The stories from your nursing practice, and commitment to the residents, effectively illustrate the challenges and the rewards available in this complex sector of nursing. Thank you also to the nurses who work as managers, who facilitated access to the registered nurses and encouraged them to participate when it would have been easier not to.

I would like to acknowledge and thank my supervisors. Dr Jean Gilmour has been present throughout the entire process and consistently contributed constructive critique. Dr Annette Huntington joined the process during the later stages and has been influential in the final shaping of the thesis. Dr Stephen Neville has spent many years engaged and contributed to the earlier development of the thesis. Thank you for your support and encouragement.

I wish to acknowledge the residential aged care companies who allowed me access to the registered nurses and the residents at their facilities. The research would not have been able to be conducted without their agreement to my presence. Also I would like to acknowledge the residents who allowed me to be present thereby contributing to data collection in the ‘real environment’.

My employer, Christchurch Polytechnic Institute of Technology, has supported me throughout this process and in particular thanks to Dr Cathy Andrew for her specific support. Grateful thanks also to all my colleagues and friends who have not only asked questions about how the process has been going, but who have also stopped and listened to my answers.

Kaye Milligan

January 2016
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## ABSTRACT

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

## LIST OF TABLES

## LIST OF FIGURES

## CHAPTER ONE

### Introducing the study

#### Introduction: Clinical decision making

#### Background and rationale of the study
- Residential aged care in New Zealand
- Residential aged care homes
- General practice and residential aged care
- The residents
- The registered nurse

#### Unforeseen circumstances - effects of a natural disaster on this research

#### Effects on the residential aged care sector

#### Research aims and questions

#### Research design

#### Terminology
- Clinical decision and clinical judgement
- Clinical reasoning
- Diagnostic reasoning
- Definition of clinical decision making applicable to this study

#### Thesis structure

### Summary of chapter one

## CHAPTER TWO

### Literature review: A process with a purpose

#### Introduction

#### Structure of literature review chapter

#### Section one: Process utilised to obtain literature

#### Section two: Decision making theory
- Introduction
- Cognitive continuum theory
- General theory of three continua
- Recognition primed decision making
- Novices and experts
- Theorising error and recovery
Section three: Relevance to nursing practice ................................................................. 34
    Complexity of cognitive tasks in nursing ................................................................. 36
    Decision tasks: What clinical decisions are made by RNs? ................................. 37
    Factors that affect nurses’ clinical decisions ......................................................... 38
    How nurses make decisions (descriptive theory) ................................................... 41
    How nurses should make decisions (normative theory) ........................................ 50

Section four: Relevance to the care of elders ............................................................... 54
    Acute and community settings ........................................................................... 54
    Residential aged care ......................................................................................... 55

Gap in the literature .................................................................................................... 59

Summary of chapter two ............................................................................................ 59

CHAPTER THREE ........................................................................................................... 61

Theoretical underpinnings: The reality of critical realism ........................................... 61

Introduction ................................................................................................................ 61

Introduction to critical realism .................................................................................. 62
    Development of critical realism ........................................................................... 62
    Ongoing development of critical realism ........................................................... 64
    Core components of critical realism ................................................................... 65
    Causality and power ............................................................................................ 68
    A brief summary ................................................................................................... 69

Implementation of critical realism ............................................................................ 70
    Critical realist research ....................................................................................... 70
    Evaluating the validity of data and accuracy of analysis ..................................... 74
    Critical realist research ....................................................................................... 75

Summary of chapter three .......................................................................................... 79

CHAPTER FOUR ............................................................................................................ 80

Research strategy: Case study and critical realist case study .................................... 80

Introduction .............................................................................................................. 80
    Defining case study .............................................................................................. 81
    Central features of case study ............................................................................. 82
    Strengths and weaknesses ................................................................................... 86
    Sources of evidence ............................................................................................... 88

Critical realism and case study ................................................................................ 91
    Compatibility of critical realism and case study ............................................... 91
    Critical realist case study research design ......................................................... 93

Summary of chapter four ........................................................................................... 97

CHAPTER FIVE ............................................................................................................... 98

Critical realist case study research design and methods ........................................... 98
    Introduction .......................................................................................................... 98
    Step one: The phenomena and boundaries ........................................................ 99
    Step two: The research question .......................................................................... 99
Step three: Abstraction of phenomena ................................................................. 100
Step four: Data sources ...................................................................................... 100
  Ethical considerations and processes .............................................................. 102
  Interviews ........................................................................................................ 109
  Participation and observation ......................................................................... 110
  Document analysis .......................................................................................... 111
  Triangulation of data ...................................................................................... 113
Step five: Data interpretation .............................................................................. 115
  Data analysis .................................................................................................. 115
Step six: Evaluation of explanations .................................................................. 117
Strategies to promote rigour in this study ........................................................ 118
Summary of chapter five .................................................................................... 119

CHAPTER SIX ..................................................................................................... 120
Nursing in residential aged care: Revealing the clinical decisions ................. 120
  Introduction ................................................................................................... 120
  The empirical and actual layers of clinical decision making ....................... 122
    First time frame: Resident enters residential care ...................................... 122
    Second time frame: Resident’s daily life .................................................... 133
    Third time frame: Towards end of life ....................................................... 151
  Summary of chapter six ............................................................................... 157

CHAPTER SEVEN .................................................................................................. 159
Nursing in residential aged care: The generation of clinical decisions ........ 159
  Introduction ................................................................................................... 159
  Generative mechanism one. Professional imperatives: Significant relationships .... 160
    Component one: The autonomy of the resident ........................................ 161
    Component two: The relationship with the family ................................... 165
    Component three: The interprofessional relationship with the GP ............. 169
  Generative mechanism two. Quality and fiscal constraints: Nursing in RAC ... 177
    Component one: Quality of care and fiscal restraints ................................ 177
    Component two: Direction and delegation of caregivers ....................... 188
    Component three: Access to knowledge resources .................................... 192
  Summary of chapter seven ........................................................................... 195

CHAPTER EIGHT .................................................................................................. 197
Specialist gerontology nursing: The generation of clinical decisions .......... 197
  Introduction ................................................................................................... 197
  Generative mechanism three. The specialist nature of gerontology nursing. .... 197
    Component one: Specialist nursing knowledge and skill ......................... 197
    Component two: Ethico-legal and professional deliberations .................... 211
    Component three: Registered nurses’ moral agency .................................. 221
  Interactions of three generative mechanisms: Actualising, blocking or redirecting .... 225
CHAPTER NINE ................................................................................................................................... 230

Residential gerontological nursing: Certainty and uncertainty in clinical decisions .................. 230

Introduction ......................................................................................................................................... 230

Discussion of the findings .................................................................................................................. 230
  Decisions tasks, thinking processes, and depth of assessments .................................................. 231
  Certainty and uncertainty ................................................................................................................. 233

Recommendations for clinical practice ............................................................................................ 242

Recommendations for further research ............................................................................................ 244

Limitations of the research ................................................................................................................. 246

Summary of the research .................................................................................................................... 248

Conclusions .......................................................................................................................................... 250

REFERENCES ....................................................................................................................................... 252

Appendix A: Upper South A Regional Ethics Committee approval letter ........................................ 272

Appendix B: Information sheet for registered nurses ........................................................................ 274

Appendix C: Consent form for registered nurses ............................................................................. 277

Appendix D: Transcriber confidentiality form .................................................................................... 279

Appendix E: Consent form for resident ............................................................................................. 280

Appendix F: Information sheet for resident ....................................................................................... 282

Appendix G: Semi-structured interview questions for registered nurses ........................................ 284
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Summary of Data Sources ........................................................................................................ 101

Table 2: Triangulation of Data .............................................................................................................. 114

Table 3: Interview Data Forms Categories .......................................................................................... 116

Table 4: Nine Patterns .......................................................................................................................... 116

Table 5: Example of Category, Pattern and Generative Mechanism ................................................. 117

Table 6: Registered Nurse Responsible for Residents ........................................................................ 184

Table 7: Interactions Between Generative Mechanisms ..................................................................... 226-227
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Layers of reality ................................................................. 66

Figure 2: Critical realist case study research design for this research ................. 96

Figure 3: Three generative mechanisms .............................................. 159

Figure 4: Components of the generative mechanisms .................................. 160

Figure 5: Zones of certainty and uncertainty in clinical decision making in residential aged care ................................................................. 234