Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
A qualitative study
of the ethical practice of newly
graduated nurses working in mental health

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Philosophy in Nursing
at
Massey University

Katheryn Janine Butters
2008
Despite nurses having legitimate ethical rights and responsibilities, they are often constrained in practice from acting in ways they believe to be morally correct. This thesis presents a qualitative exploration of factors that influenced eight newly graduated nurses as they endeavoured to practice ethical mental health nursing in New Zealand. Data was gathered from in depth interviews with the participants and analysed using a thematic analysis method. A critical lens was employed to view the data so as to make visible aspects of the social and political context within which the participants were situated.

The participants' moral practice was profoundly influenced by a number of relational experiences they had. These relationships were then determinants in their moral development, professional socialization and their ability to practice in accordance to their moral beliefs. Key aspects of these relationships were their experiences with nursing education and the influence of the organisations where they worked. Recommendations are made to both areas to enable and support moral nursing practice for new graduate mental health nurses.

New graduate nurses inherently desire to practice in a way that honours the client and is therefore inherently ethical. Moral nursing practice is an everyday occurrence that must be situated in a culture of respect and regard for both clients and nurses. New graduate nurses have much to offer the profession and the tangata whaiora of the mental health services. They must be valued and supported to act in accordance to their moral ideals.
Acknowledgements

Writing a thesis is like many of life’s most difficult challenges. No one really tells you how hard and life altering it is until you are too far in to turn back. I would have never succeeded in this significant achievement without the support of the many wonderful people present in my life. For their wisdom, commitment, generosity, faith and tolerance I am exceedingly grateful.

To my husband Jeff, for being a most wonderful partner and father. Thank you for your unwavering belief in me to do whatever I set out to do. To my beautiful clever daughters, Isabella and Lilli, who make me proud every day and constantly inspire me to be the best I can be. I love you all the way to the moon and back.

To my supervisor Stacey Wilson, who is without doubt a shining star for mental health nursing in this country. My work has benefited profoundly by your vision, understanding, investment, commitment and belief in the inherent worth and ability of mental health nurses. To my supervisor Dr Martin Woods, eminent nursing ethicist, wise philosopher, and inspiring teacher. It has been a privilege to work with you and I am thankful for your patience and guidance.

To the participants who generously gave your stories to me to tell. The future of mental health nursing is well entrusted to you. To my stunning, brilliant nursing friends who have worked this path with me, and are always there when I need them. I would be lost and lonely without you.

Tēna koto tēna koto tēna koto katoa.
# Table of Contents

## CHAPTER ONE

1. **Background to the study** ................................................................. 1
   1.0. Relevance to nursing ................................................................. 3
   1.0.2. Relevance to health ............................................................... 4
   1.0.3. Previous New Zealand research ............................................... 6

1.1. **Theoretical constructs of ethics** ............................................... 7
   1.1.1. Bio-ethics ............................................................................. 9

1.2. **Nursing ethics** ............................................................................ 9
   1.2.1. Moral issues for mental health nurses ....................................... 12
   1.2.2. The value of including nurses in ethical decision making ............ 14

1.3. **Research question and aims** ..................................................... 16
   1.3.1. A reference to terminology ....................................................... 16

1.4. **Organisation of the thesis** ........................................................ 17

1.5. **Summary** .................................................................................. 19

## CHAPTER TWO

2. **Introduction** .................................................................................. 20

2.1. **Moral development and nursing ethics education** ...................... 21
   2.1.1. Moral agency, ethical decision making and moral values ............. 24
   2.1.2. Nursing autonomy and oppression .......................................... 25
   2.1.3. Constraints on the ethical practice of nurses .............................. 27
   2.1.4. Moral distress ......................................................................... 30

2.2. **The mental health arena** ............................................................ 31

2.3. **Ethical issues in mental health** .................................................. 35

2.4. **Entering the system (mental health nursing)** .............................. 41
   2.4.1. Graduate mental health nurses ................................................ 44
   2.4.2. New graduate nurses and their ethical experiences .................... 45
   2.4.3. Summary ............................................................................... 47
CHAPTER THREE

3.0 Introduction ............................................................................................................. 48
  3.0.1. Methodology ........................................................................................................ 49
  3.0.2. Epistemological assumptions ............................................................................. 49
  3.0.3. Theoretical perspectives: qualitative methodology ........................................... 50
  3.0.4. Qualitative interpretation in nursing research .................................................. 52
  3.0.5. Using a critical lens ............................................................................................ 53
  3.0.6. Studying newly graduated nurses’ ethical experiences ..................................... 55

3.1. Thematic analysis method ....................................................................................... 56
  3.1.1. Using thematic analysis in nursing research ...................................................... 57

3.2. Method and procedure ............................................................................................ 58
  3.2.1. Sampling ............................................................................................................ 58
  3.2.2. The participants ................................................................................................. 59

3.3. Data collection ......................................................................................................... 59

3.4. Data analysis ........................................................................................................... 62

3.5. Ethical issues ........................................................................................................... 64

3.6. Soundness of the research ..................................................................................... 68

3.7. Summary ................................................................................................................ 71

CHAPTER FOUR ............................................................................................................. 72

4.0. Introduction ............................................................................................................. 72

4.1. Learning the rules .................................................................................................. 73
  4.1.1. Being prepared .................................................................................................. 74
  4.1.2. Being New ........................................................................................................ 82
  4.1.3. Learning in practice ......................................................................................... 88
  4.1.4. Fitting in ........................................................................................................... 92
  4.1.5. Recognising conflict with others ..................................................................... 96

4.2. Summary ................................................................................................................ 99
CHAPTER FIVE ........................................................................................................... 100

5.0. Introduction ...................................................................................................... 100

5.1. Justice and care .............................................................................................. 101
    5.1.1. Stigma and silence .................................................................................. 102
    5.1.2. In who’s best interest? ........................................................................... 106
    5.1.3. Cure versus care .................................................................................... 109
    5.1.4. Finding Allies ....................................................................................... 114

5.2. Summary .......................................................................................................... 122

CHAPTER SIX .......................................................................................................... 123

6.0. Introduction ...................................................................................................... 123

6.1. Socialisation during education and graduate clinical experiences ..................... 124
    6.1.1. Socialisation and preparation of ethical practice ..................................... 125
    6.1.2. Socialisation and preparation of mental health nursing ....................... 129

6.2. Organisational influences .............................................................................. 135
    6.2.1. Ethical issues for new graduate mental health nurses ....................... 136

6.3. Mentoring and support of new graduates .......................................................... 140

6.4. Safe staffing and developing a sustainable workforce ........................................ 142

6.5. Learning the skills to deal with conflict ............................................................. 144

6.6. Strengths and limitations of the study ............................................................... 148

6.7. Recommendations .......................................................................................... 150
    6.7.1. Nursing education: undergraduate programmes .................................... 150
    6.7.2. Nursing education: graduate mental health nursing ............................. 151
    6.7.3. Mental Health Services employing new graduate nurses: .................. 151

6.8. Recommendations for future research ............................................................. 152

6.9. Conclusion ....................................................................................................... 153

References .............................................................................................................. 154
Appendix I: Recruitment poster .................................................................................. 177
Appendix II: Information sheet .................................................................................. 178
Appendix III: Participants consent form ...................................................................... 180
Appendix IV: Semi structured interview guide ......................................................... 181
Appendix V: Release of tape transcripts .................................................................... 182
Appendix VI: Ethics approval ...................................................................................... 183
Appendix VII: Transcriber confidentiality form .......................................................... 184

Table of Figures

Table 1: Characteristics of the participants ................................................................. 59
Table 2: Ethical issues discussed by the participants .................................................. 106