Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
A Framework for Social Capital

A dissertation presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
at Massey University, Palmerton North, New Zealand.

Andrew Kibblewhite

2009
ABSTRACT

This dissertation is concerned with enhancing the utility of social capital by developing and testing a comprehensive and measurable framework as a tool for researchers, policy-makers, and development theorists and practitioners. A framework was developed for measuring the degree to which different forms of social capital reside in a community and for distinguishing community-to-community variations. The Framework was also designed to identify the accumulation of social capital in relation to structural characteristics within a community, and to identify what advantages might be associated with variants of social capital.

The pursuit of the understanding of social capital has been convened within narrow disciplinary fields and has reduced the notion in definition, purpose, and utility. Much of the literature and past research has focused on approximations to identify social capital that are field-specific and representative of, at best, markers of social capital, rather than social capital itself. For this reason, this dissertation is concerned with developing a robust framework that has the potential to embrace the nature and extent of social capital across these disciplinary fields, while providing insight into the forms, influences, and trajectories of social capital.

The utility of the Social Capital Framework that was developed for this dissertation was examined by transforming the Framework into a survey tool for administering in two communities to identify applicability and sensitivity for identifying the degree to which variants of social capital reside. The results showed that the
Framework was able to distinguish the degree to which different forms of social capital existed, and how the social capital accumulates in relations to structural variables, in particular, gender. The Framework’s utility was not universal across all forms of social capital and showed that further enhancements are required, particularly, if it is to enable social capital to be attributed to forms of advantage. The results also identified areas where future research would be of value, particularly, in examining the trajectory of people’s forms of social capital.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am dedicating this dissertation to my family whose belief in the importance of education, unwavering support, and continual encouragement ensured this dissertation was contemplated and completed.

My partner in life, Toni Hyde, was exceptionally tolerant of my absence and distracted presence during the journey. Dissertations are earned and achieved by partners, as much as authors.

I also want to acknowledge the positive and encouraging contributions of my supervisors. Professor John Overton was always enthusiastic and supportive of the author’s freedom of thought. Dr. Christine Cheyne always provided pertinent and incisive feedback. Both supervisors were very patient and understanding of the challenges of working full-time while undertaking a doctorate.

Finally, I would also like to thank Huey for considering my contemplation and, at times, anxiety with continual rhythm and enticement.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER ONE  
**INTRODUCTION**  ................................................................. 13

- **BACKGROUND**  ........................................................................................................ 13
- **THE CENTRAL PURPOSE OF THE DISSERTATION**  ........................................... 20
- **THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS**  .................................................................................. 21
- **STRUCTURE OF THE DISSERTATION**  .................................................................. 22

## CHAPTER TWO  
**SOCIAL RELATIONS AND DEVELOPMENT**  ................. 24

- **DEVELOPMENTALISM**  ....................................................................................... 26
- **EUROPEAN ORIGINS OF DEVELOPMENT THEORY**  ..................................... 35
- **HEGEMONIC PRODUCTION AND REPRODUCTION**  ....................................... 43
- **THE CURRENT PARADIGM**  ................................................................................ 47
- **SOCIOLOGY AND ECONOMICS**  ....................................................................... 49
- **DEVELOPMENT AND SOCIAL CAPITAL**  .......................................................... 60
- **SUMMARY**  ......................................................................................................... 63

## CHAPTER THREE  
**SOCIAL CAPITAL**  ............................................................................. 65

- **HISTORY OF A METAPHOR**  .............................................................................. 65
- **CONCEPTUALISATION OF SOCIAL CAPITAL**  .................................................. 69
  - Bourdieusian Theory and Practice ........................................................................ 69
  - The Bourdieusian Notion of Social Capital .......................................................... 73
  - The Americanisation of Social Capital ................................................................ 74
- **COMPONENTS OF SOCIAL CAPITAL**  .............................................................. 77
  - Trust ..................................................................................................................... 78
  - Social Norms ...................................................................................................... 82
- **FORMS OF SOCIAL CAPITAL**  ......................................................................... 88
  - Social Capital as ’Integration’ .............................................................................. 93
  - Social Capital as ’Linkage’ .................................................................................. 96
  - Social Capital as ’Synergy’ .................................................................................. 98
  - Social Capital as ’Integrity’ ................................................................................ 101
- **SUMMARY**  ....................................................................................................... 103

## CHAPTER FOUR  
**KNOWLEDGE AND PRACTICE**  ........................................... 105

- **A POSITION ON KNOWING**  ........................................................................... 105
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Epistemological Approaches</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beyond Epistemological Dichotomy</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEASURING SOCIAL CAPITAL</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Networks</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Nature of Networks</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Relations Norms</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Relations Trust</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRAXIS</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaire and Response Sheet</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Validity and Reliability</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sample Size and Selection</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coding and Data Entry</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethical Issues and the Practice of Reflexivity</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUMMARY</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER FIVE  CONFLICT AND RESEARCH TRANSPARENCY</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sites of Struggle</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Declaration of Independence and Te Tiriti o Waitangi</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Impact of Colonisation and Post-Colonisation</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Britain’s Entry into the European Economic Community</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Restructuring of Society: Public Policy 1984-1999</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Transparency</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frame of Reference</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUMMARY</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER SIX  RESULTS</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scoring Social Capital</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forms of Social Capital: Methodology</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forms of Social capital: results</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linking Social Capital to Structure: Methodology</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linking Social Capital to Structure: Results</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linking Social Capital to Advantage: Methodology and Results</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUMMARY</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER SEVEN  RESULTS DISCUSSED ................................................................. 247

SCORING SOCIAL CAPITAL .................................................................................. 247
FORMS OF SOCIAL CAPITAL: DISCUSSION ......................................................... 256
LINKING SOCIAL CAPITAL TO STRUCTURE: DISCUSSION ................................... 269
LINKING SOCIAL CAPITAL TO ADVANTAGE: DISCUSSION ..................................... 278
SUMMARY .............................................................................................................. 286

CHAPTER EIGHT  CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .................. 288

FRAMEWORK DEVELOPMENT .............................................................................. 288
LEVELS OF SOCIAL CAPITAL IN THE COMMUNITY ................................................. 294
SOCIAL CAPITAL-Poor and Rich Communities ...................................................... 296
SOCIAL CAPITAL’S LINK TO STRUCTURE ............................................................ 297
SOCIAL CAPITAL HAS ADVANTAGES .................................................................... 299
DISTINCT CONTRIBUTION TO KNOWLEDGE ......................................................... 300
FUTURE RESEARCH PROSPECTS ......................................................................... 302
SUMMARY .............................................................................................................. 304

APPENDIX ONE  QUESTIONNAIRE STRUCTURE ............................................ 305
APPENDIX TWO  QUESTIONNAIRE ................................................................. 307
APPENDIX THREE  RESPONSE SHEET ............................................................... 317
APPENDIX FOUR  INTRODUCTORY LETTER ....................................................... 321
APPENDIX FIVE  POPULATION AND SAMPLE COMPARISON .......................... 322
APPENDIX SIX  STATISTICALLY SIGNIFICANT COMPONENTS ...................... 326
APPENDIX SEVEN  STRUCTURAL VARIABLE ANALYSIS .................................... 328
APPENDIX EIGHT  SUMMARY OF THE DISSERTATION ..................................... 336
BIBLIOGRAPHY ................................................................................................. 337
# TABLE OF TABLES

Table 1: Summary of Social Capital Framework .................................................. 104  
Table 2: Questionnaire Classifications: Social Capital Forms .............................. 124  
Table 3: Welfare Benefit Cuts ........................................................................... 168  
Table 4: Population and Sample Frame Comparison ............................................ 172  
Table 5: Retired/National Super Comparison ....................................................... 175  
Table 6: Property Ownership Comparison .......................................................... 177  
Table 7: Frame of Reference: Reflexive Components ........................................... 181  
Table 8: Frame of Reference: Deduced Biases .................................................... 182  
Table 9: Frame of Reference: Indicated Biases .................................................... 182  
Table 10: Response Rate .................................................................................... 183  
Table 11: Scorecard Category Bands ................................................................... 188  
Table 12: ‘Family Integration’ Scorecard ............................................................. 190  
Table 13: ‘Neighbourhood Integration’ Scorecard .............................................. 191  
Table 14: ‘Community Integration’ Scorecard ..................................................... 191  
Table 15: ‘Linkage’ Scorecard ............................................................................ 192  
Table 16: ‘Synergy’ Scorecard ............................................................................ 193  
Table 17: ‘Integrity’ Scorecard .......................................................................... 194  
Table 18: Social Capital Scorecard ..................................................................... 195  
Table 19: Variation in ‘Neighbourhood Contact’ ............................................... 202  
Table 20: Variation in the ‘Density of Neighbourhood Relations’ ........................ 203  
Table 21: Variation in ‘Seeking Community Trust’ .............................................. 204  
Table 22: Variation in ‘Coverage of Civic Engagement’ ..................................... 205  
Table 23: Variation in the ‘Density of Civic Engagement’ .................................... 206  
Table 24: Variation in the ‘Density of Local Civic Engagement’ .......................... 207  
Table 25: ‘Family Commonality’ ....................................................................... 218  
Table 26: ‘Seeking Family Trust’ ....................................................................... 219  
Table 27: ‘Shared Family Ideas and Goals’ ......................................................... 219  
Table 28: ‘Neighbourhood Contact’ .................................................................. 220  
Table 29: ‘Density of Neighbourhood Relations’ .............................................. 220
Table 92: ‘Expecting Community Trust’ - Gender .................................................. 330
Table 93: ‘Expecting Community Trust’ - Ethnicity ............................................. 330
Table 94: ‘Number of Civic Engagements’ - Age ................................................. 330
Table 95: ‘Number of Formal Civic Engagements’ - Age ..................................... 330
Table 96: ‘Number of Local Civic Engagements’ - Age and Gender .................... 331
Table 97: ‘Number of National Civic Engagements’ - Age .................................. 331
Table 98: ‘Number of Social Civic Engagements’ - Age ..................................... 331
Table 99: ‘Number of Sporting Civic Engagements’ - Age ................................. 331
Table 100: ‘Number of Cultural Civic Engagements’ - Ethnicity and Gender ....... 331
Table 101: ‘Number of Religious Civic Engagements’ - Age and Gender ............. 332
Table 102: ‘Number of Community Civic Engagements’ - Age ......................... 332
Table 103: ‘Number of Political Civic Engagements’ - Ethnicity .......................... 332
Table 104: ‘Range of Local Services’ - Gender .................................................. 332
Table 105: ‘Range of Local Services’ - Age ....................................................... 332
Table 106: ‘Provisioning of Local Services’ - Gender .......................................... 333
Table 107: ‘Shared Ideas/Goals with Local Officers’ - Ethnicity and Gender ........ 333
Table 108: ‘Local Officers Trusted’ - Age and Gender ....................................... 333
Table 109: ‘Provisioning of National Services’ - Ethnicity and Gender ............... 333
Table 110: ‘Shared Ideas/Goals with National Officers’ - Age, Ethnicity, Gender 334
Table 111: ‘National Officers Trusted’ - Gender .................................................. 334
Table 112: ‘Shared Ideas/Goals with Local Polity’ - Age, Ethnicity, Gender ....... 334
Table 113: ‘Local Polity Trusted’ - Gender ...................................................... 335
Table 114: ‘Local Polity Trusted’ - Age ............................................................ 335
Table 115: ‘Local Polity Trusted’ - Gender ...................................................... 335
**TABLE OF FIGURES**

Figure 1: Social capital quadrant analysis .......................................................... 92  
Figure 2: The Cycle of Reproduction .................................................................... 155  
Figure 3: Wellington (Map A) and Whakatane (Map B) ‘integration’ maps .......... 248  
Figure 4: Premier (Map A) and base (Map B) ‘integration’ disparity ...................... 250  
Figure 5: Wellington (Map A) and Whakatane (Map B) ‘linkage’ maps ............... 251  
Figure 6: Premier (Map A) and base (Map B) ‘linkage’ disparity ......................... 252  
Figure 7: Wellington (Map A) and Whakatane (Map B) ‘synergy’ maps ............. 253  
Figure 8: Premier (Map A) and base (Map B) ‘synergy’ disparity ....................... 254  
Figure 9: Wellington (Map A) and Whakatane (Map B) ‘integrity’ maps ............ 254  
Figure 10: Premier (Map A) and base (Map B) ‘integrity’ disparity ..................... 255  
Figure 11: Variation in ‘neighbourhood contact’ ................................................. 257  
Figure 12: Variation in the ‘density of neighbourhood relations’ ......................... 259  
Figure 13: Variation in ‘seeking community trust’ .............................................. 260  
Figure 14: ‘Coverage of civic engagement’ ......................................................... 262  
Figure 15: ‘Density of civic engagements’ ............................................................ 263  
Figure 16: ‘Density of local civic engagements’ ................................................. 265