An ecological perspective on the motivational trajectories of high school students learning English in rural areas in Vietnam

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy in Applied Linguistics

at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand.

Pham Huy Cuong

2016
Abstract

This study explores the motivational trajectories of four students learning English at a rural high school in Southern Vietnam. It draws on a person-in-context relational view of motivation (Ushioda, 2009) as the overarching theoretical framework and uses ecological systems theory (Bronfenbrenner, 1993) as an analytical tool to develop insights into the ways motivation is implicated in a multiplicity of settings and social relationships. Specifically, it aims to identify motivational affordances for these students, the synergistic effects across settings on their language learning motivation, and their motivational trajectories within and across settings and relationships.

The study utilises a qualitative case study design, relying primarily on interviews from social practice perspectives and observations. The data collection, spanning approximately one and a half years, comprised two main phases, one on-site and one off-site. In the first phase, data were gathered in different settings, including the school, the participants’ homes as a site for private tuition, and other more informal public spaces such as food stores. In the second phase, Skype interviews and Facebook exchanges were the main means of data collection.

The findings suggest that while language affordances were evident in both formal and informal learning settings, students developed diverse individual motivational trajectories. Their motivational constructions resulted from a synergy of environmental and idiosyncratic elements pertinent to their own language learning conditions, social relationships, and personal appraisals of such affordances and learning opportunities. These relationships and students’ agentive use of resources were shaped and reshaped by their interactions with significant others within and across settings. Sociocultural features related to the school systems, local and national education policies, family traditions, cultural values, and future prospects also have synergistic impacts on their L2 motivation.

The present study illustrates the value of interpreting the situated and dynamic nature of L2 motivation using an ecological paradigm. It also points to the need to adopt a set of data collection methods, tools, and data sources that diverge from more conventional means to explore L2 motivation. The study offers a fresh theoretical and methodological approach for future research geared towards lifewide adaptive perspectives on English language teaching and learning.
Acknowledgements

I am deeply indebted to a number of people who have made my research journey a rewarding experience, academically and emotionally. Words are not enough to describe my appreciation of their support and enthusiasm.

My heartfelt gratitude goes to my supervisors, Professor Cynthia White and Dr Arianna Berardi-Wiltshire, for their expertise, encouragement, subtle guidance, dedication, and complete faith in my ability. Both of them not only shaped my research skills but also spent hours meticulously and patiently reading my drafts and gave me invaluable constructive feedback. Professor White has ceaselessly added value to my career within and beyond the PhD.

I would like to express my great appreciation to the New Zealand Aid Programme for funding my study. I wish to thank Sylvia Hooker, Jamie Hooper, and the ISS team at Massey University for their enthusiastic support.

I wish to acknowledge the academic assistance from the staff at the School of Humanities, especially Dr Gillian Skyrme, Dr Hilary Smith, and Dr Jim Henman, who kindly gave me the opportunity to join their insightful lectures. I would also like to thank Prue Fry, Anne McCarthy, and Rosalind Austin in the postgrad student office who taught me Kiwi English and offered me generous help.

Thanks are due to the teachers, the students, and their parents who volunteered to participate in my study. I would also like to thank my colleagues and friends who shared my life stories and continuously cheered me up: Anh Thu, Cao Nguyen, Tra Van Trung, Cong Bang, Zhiqing Qian, Jana Muller, and Linh Richard.

Finally, I am grateful to my parents, brothers, sister-in-law, and all my extended family who have always followed every one of my steps. Their continued support, encouragement, and expectations were the main impetus for me to overcome the ups and downs in my study and life overseas.
Table of Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................................. i
Acknowledgements ........................................................................................................... iii
Table of Contents ............................................................................................................... v
List of Tables ....................................................................................................................... xv
List of Figures ..................................................................................................................... xvii
List of Images ..................................................................................................................... xix
List of Appendices ............................................................................................................. xxi

Chapter One: Introduction ............................................................................................... 1
  1.1 A personal perspective ................................................................................................. 1
  1.2 The research problem ................................................................................................. 2
  1.3 Purpose of the study and research questions ............................................................. 4
  1.4 Significance of the study ........................................................................................... 5
  1.5 Thesis structure ........................................................................................................... 6

Chapter Two: English Language Learning in Rural Southern Vietnam ....................... 7
  2.1 Recent changes in national English testing systems and their impacts ............... 7
    2.1.1 The removal of the secondary school graduation examination ....................... 8
    2.1.2 Two consecutive changes in the high school graduation examination .......... 9
    2.1.3 The university entrance examination ............................................................... 11
  2.2 English language education in rural Southern Vietnam ....................................... 12
    2.2.1 Language learning facilities and resources ....................................................... 12
    2.2.2 Students’ language learning attitudes ............................................................... 14
    2.2.3 Teachers’ professional development ................................................................. 15
    2.2.4 Parental involvement ......................................................................................... 16
  2.3 The rural high school in the present study .............................................................. 17
    2.3.1 The school background ..................................................................................... 17
Table of Contents

2.3.2 The English language teaching staff .................................................................. 19
2.3.3 The English language programme ..................................................................... 20
2.3.4 English language teaching and learning at Vision High .................................... 22
2.3.5 Placement of students at Vision High .............................................................. 23
2.4 Local private tuition ............................................................................................... 23
  2.4.1 Private classes at teachers’ homes ................................................................. 24
  2.4.2 English courses at foreign language centres ............................................... 25
2.5 Summary .................................................................................................................. 25

Chapter Three: Literature Review ................................................................................. 27

3.1 Socio-dynamic approaches to language learning motivation ............................... 27
  3.1.1 The “social turn” in language learning motivation research ............................ 28
  3.1.2 The temporal and dynamic dimensions of motivation .................................... 29
3.2 Person-in-context relational view of motivation ....................................................... 32
  3.2.1 The language learner as a person ................................................................. 33
  3.2.2 Person-in-context/situation views .................................................................. 35
  3.2.3 Relational approaches to motivation research ............................................ 37
3.3 Dimensions in language learning motivation ......................................................... 39
  3.3.1 Significant others ....................................................................................... 39
  3.3.2 Agency and resistance ................................................................................. 41
  3.3.3 The L2 Motivational Self System .................................................................. 43
  3.3.4 Language learning vision ............................................................................ 45
3.4 Ecological perspectives on language learning ......................................................... 46
  3.4.1 Overview of ecological perspectives on language learning .......................... 46
  3.4.2 The construct of affordance ....................................................................... 47
  3.4.3 Bronfenbrenner’s ecological systems theory ............................................. 49
  3.4.4 Language learning motivation from an ecological perspective .................. 52
3.5 Summary .................................................................................................................. 55
# Chapter Four: Methodology

4.1 Research design .................................................................................. 57

4.1.1 The longitudinal qualitative design ............................................. 57

4.1.2 The pilot test .................................................................................. 58

4.1.3 Case study design ......................................................................... 59

4.2 Data collection .................................................................................... 60

4.2.1 Overview of methods and instruments ........................................ 60

4.2.1.1 Primary methods ..................................................................... 61

4.2.1.2 Secondary and complementary tools and sources ................ 65

4.2.2 Preparing for the field trip .............................................................. 68

4.2.2.1 Exploratory questionnaire on best research practices in Vietnam .... 68

4.2.2.2 Ethical considerations ............................................................... 69

4.2.3 Gaining entry into Vision High ...................................................... 70

4.2.4 Meeting and recruiting participants .............................................. 72

4.2.5 Working with the participants ....................................................... 74

4.2.5.1 Working with the students ...................................................... 76

4.2.5.2 Working with significant others .............................................. 81

4.2.6 The researcher’s multiple roles: Advantages and challenges .... 84

4.2.6.1 Advantages ........................................................................... 85

4.2.6.2 Challenges ............................................................................ 87

4.3 Analysing and presenting the data .................................................... 90

4.3.1 Data analysis procedures ............................................................... 90

4.3.1.1 Analytical approach ............................................................... 90

4.3.1.2 Data transcription and translation ......................................... 91

4.3.1.3 Data coding ........................................................................... 92

4.3.2 Presenting the data ..................................................................... 95

4.3.3 Validity and reliability ................................................................. 96
# Table of Contents

4.4 Summary ....................................................................................................................... 99

Chapter Five: Diem .................................................................................................. 101

5.1 Diem as a late-coming participant .............................................................................. 101

5.2 Diem’s family background and her perception of education ............................................. 101
   5.2.1 Diem’s family background ...................................................................................... 102
   5.2.2 Higher education for life changes and fulfilment of filial duty ................................. 103

5.3 Diem’s intense love for learning foreign languages ......................................................... 105
   5.3.1 Diem’s passion for learning English ......................................................................... 105
   5.3.2 Diem’s interest in other languages .......................................................................... 109
   5.3.3 Diem’s language-associated visions ......................................................................... 110

5.4 The pros and cons of being in the top class ................................................................. 112
   5.4.1 Pressure from school stakeholders .......................................................................... 112
   5.4.2 Pressure from the teachers across disciplines ......................................................... 113
   5.4.3 Peer competition and challenging learning conditions .............................................. 114
   5.4.4 Diem’s reflective moments ..................................................................................... 115

5.5 Diem’s frustration with learning English at school ....................................................... 116
   5.5.1 The routine teaching approaches .......................................................................... 117
   5.5.2 Diem’s desired English class .................................................................................. 118

5.6 Free private tuition as a source of motivation ............................................................... 120
   5.6.1 The class at Mr Hung’s home .................................................................................. 120
   5.6.2 Mr Hung’s generosity ............................................................................................. 121

5.7 Diem’s preparation for the university entrance examination ......................................... 123
   5.7.1 Expending more effort to learn English ................................................................... 123
   5.7.2 Diem’s pre-examination anxiety ............................................................................ 125

5.8 Diem’s successful admission to her desired university .................................................... 126

5.9 Diem’s overall motivational trajectory ......................................................................... 128

5.10 Summary ..................................................................................................................... 130
Chapter Six: Manh ........................................................................133

6.1 My first impression of Manh .....................................................133
   6.1.1 The visit to Manh’s class ...................................................133
   6.1.2 My personal interaction with Manh ....................................133

6.2 The home environment .............................................................134
   6.2.1 The lifelong dream of Manh’s father ...................................135
   6.2.2 Home interactions in English .............................................136
   6.2.3 Reliving his father’s dream ................................................138
   6.2.4 Empathetic parents ............................................................139

6.3 Manh’s frustrating experience with private tuition ...................141
   6.3.1 Prior to attending the private class .....................................141
   6.3.2 After a few class meetings ...............................................142
   6.3.3 Manh’s decision not to take private tuition .........................143

6.4 Manh’s English learning across settings ...................................144

6.5 Manh’s participation in my study ..............................................147
   6.5.1 The one-on-one private sessions at Manh’s home ...............147
   6.5.2 The Thursday English class at school ...............................150

6.6 The help from Manh’s Vietnamese Australian cousin ................152
   6.6.1 The cousin’s gift ...............................................................152
   6.6.2 Practising English on Skype with Duyen .........................153
   6.6.3 Duyen’s promise ..............................................................154
   6.6.4 Manh’s perspectives on Duyen’s offer ...............................154

6.7 The innovative English language teacher in Year Eleven ............155
   6.7.1 A more learner-centred teaching approach .......................155
   6.7.2 Becoming the apple of the English teacher’s eye ...............156

6.8 Manh’s overall motivational trajectory ....................................157

6.9 Summary .................................................................................160
# Table of Contents

**Chapter Seven: Phong** ........................................................................................................ 161

7.1 My initial exchange with Phong at school ................................................................. 161

7.2 Phong’s transition to high school ........................................................................... 162
   7.2.1 Phong’s English language studies at secondary school ........................................ 162
   7.2.2 The transition to high school ............................................................................. 163
   7.2.3 The high school English teacher ....................................................................... 165

7.3 Phong’s view of peer learning and his obstacles .................................................. 167
   7.3.1 His approach to peer learning .......................................................................... 167
   7.3.2 Local challenges ............................................................................................... 170

7.4 Kindling his sister’s love of learning English ......................................................... 171
   7.4.1 Their time together ......................................................................................... 171
   7.4.2 His sister going to secondary school ................................................................. 172

7.5 Learning affordances within Phong’s family ......................................................... 174
   7.5.1 Life and education in the local commune ......................................................... 174
   7.5.2 His parents’ background and their child education resolutions ....................... 176
   7.5.3 Phong’s dedicated grandmother ....................................................................... 177
   7.5.4 Phong’s attitudes towards his studies ............................................................... 179

7.6 Placement in the second top class in Year Eleven ............................................... 181
   7.6.1 Weighing the advantages and disadvantages ................................................... 181
   7.6.2 Preparing for the new semester in the new class .............................................. 183
   7.6.3 Facing reality .................................................................................................. 184
   7.6.4 Nostalgia for his previous class ...................................................................... 186

7.7 The final year at high school ................................................................................... 187
   7.7.1 Phong’s retrospections .................................................................................... 188
   7.7.2 Setting new goals for the final year ................................................................. 189

7.8 Phong’s overall motivational trajectory .................................................................. 190

7.9 Summary .................................................................................................................... 193
# Table of Contents

**Chapter Eight: Hanh**

8.1 Setting up the private class with Hanh ................................................................. 195
8.2 Hanh’s low level of interest in learning English .................................................. 196
8.3 Entering high school ............................................................................................... 197
  8.3.1 Hanh’s initial difficulties at high school ......................................................... 198
  8.3.2 Hanh’s newly graduated English teacher ....................................................... 199
8.4 Hanh’s private English class at her teacher’s home ............................................. 200
  8.4.1 Parental support for private tuition ................................................................. 200
  8.4.2 The private English class .................................................................................. 201
  8.4.3 Hanh’s reflections on taking private tuition ..................................................... 202
8.5 Hanh’s English language studies at a foreign language centre .......................... 204
  8.5.1 Her mother’s encouragement .......................................................................... 204
  8.5.2 The English class at the foreign language centre ............................................. 205
  8.5.3 A motivational surge ....................................................................................... 208
8.6 Local appreciation of educational attainment ..................................................... 210
  8.6.1 Hanh’s migrant community ............................................................................. 210
  8.6.2 Educational attainment as family honour ....................................................... 211
  8.6.3 Hanh’s trip back to her parents’ hometown ..................................................... 213
8.7 Hanh’s final year at high school .......................................................................... 215
  8.7.1 Her English learning plans for Year Twelve .................................................. 215
  8.7.2 Reviewing her initial plans .............................................................................. 216
8.8 Hanh’s overall motivational trajectory ................................................................... 219
8.9 Summary .................................................................................................................. 222

**Chapter Nine: Discussion** ......................................................................................... 225

9.1 Significant others as motivational affordances for rural Vietnamese students learning English ......................................................................................................................... 225
  9.1.1 English language teachers at school ............................................................... 226
    9.1.1.1 Teachers as the main source of English ................................................... 226
Table of Contents

9.1.1.2 Arousing and sustaining language learning motivation ................. 228
9.1.1.3 Building up students’ language learning confidence ..................... 230
9.1.2 Rural parents ............................................................................ 231
9.1.2.1 Parental support .................................................................... 231
9.1.2.2 Instillation of educational values ........................................... 232
9.1.2.3 Parental expectations and aspirations .................................... 233
9.1.3 Other family members ................................................................. 234
9.1.4 Private English language teachers ............................................. 236
9.1.5 English teachers at foreign language centres ............................... 237
9.1.6 Classmates, peers, and near peers ............................................. 237
9.1.7 Social others ............................................................................ 239
9.1.7.1 Teachers of other subjects .................................................. 239
9.1.7.2 School stakeholders ............................................................. 240

9.2 The synergistic effects of ecological systems on learners’ motivation..... 240
9.2.1 English as a compulsory school subject ...................................... 241
9.2.1.1 The cooperation between the school and the education department 241
9.2.1.2 School-parent communication ............................................. 242
9.2.1.3 Communication between parents and private English teachers .... 244
9.2.1.4 Students’ reflections ............................................................. 245
9.2.2 High school testing reforms ....................................................... 246
9.2.2.1 The first wave of change ..................................................... 246
9.2.2.2 The second wave of change ............................................... 247
9.2.3 Future prospects ....................................................................... 248
9.2.3.1 University entrance and studying at university ....................... 248
9.2.3.2 Occupational opportunities ............................................... 249
9.2.3.3 Communication in English ................................................. 250
9.2.4 Family pride ............................................................................ 251
9.2.5 Filial piety.................................................................252
9.2.6 Gratitude.................................................................254
9.3 Learners’ motivational trajectories within and across settings and relationships .................................................................254
  9.3.1 Students’ initial language learning experiences ..................255
  9.3.2 School transitions .....................................................256
  9.3.3 English teaching and learning at high school ..................258
    9.3.3.1 Teachers’ approaches ...........................................259
    9.3.3.2 Student-teacher rapport .......................................260
    9.3.3.3 The effects of test and exam results .........................262
    9.3.3.4 English learning during the semester and summer holidays .......263
    9.3.3.5 Student placement at high school .............................265
  9.3.4 Private English tuition .............................................265
  9.3.5 Final year at high school ...........................................267
  9.3.6 Critical incidents with significant others ........................269
9.4 Summary .............................................................................270

Chapter Ten: Conclusions ...............................................................273
10.1 The research questions revisited ...........................................273
  10.1.1 Research question one ...............................................273
    10.1.1.1 Significant others as motivational affordances ..............274
    10.1.1.2 Learners as motivational affordances for significant others .....277
  10.1.2 Research question two ...............................................277
  10.1.3 Research question three ...............................................279
10.2 Implications .................................................................281
  10.2.1 Theoretical implications ..............................................281
  10.2.2 Methodological implications ........................................284
  10.2.3 Implications for English language teaching ....................286
10.3 Limitations of the present study ...........................................289
Table of Contents

10.4 Recommendations for future research ........................................ 291
10.5 Closing words ........................................................................ 292
References ...................................................................................... 295
Appendices ...................................................................................... 337
List of Tables

Table 2.1: Recent testing changes in Vietnam’s education system .......................8
Table 2.2: Major groups in the national university entrance examination ..........11
Table 2.3: Class categorisation at Vision High in 2013-2014 ..........................18
Table 2.4: Profiles of the local English language teachers ..............................20
Table 4.1: Participants’ grouping for private tuition .......................................74
Table 4.2: Participants’ biodata and English learning backgrounds .................77
Table 4.3: The data coding process .................................................................92
Table 4.4: Abbreviations for the data sources and participants .....................94
Table 8.1: Hanh’s comparisons across the three English learning settings ......207
List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Structure of the thesis .................................................................6
Figure 2.1: Percentages of students passing the end-of-semester English examinations over two academic years 2011-2012 and 2012-2013 ......................22
Figure 3.1: Part of Beltman and Volet’s (2007) model of a case study participant’s trajectory of sustained motivation .................................................32
Figure 3.2: Visual representation of Bronfenbrenner’s (1993) ecological systems theory .........................................................................................50
Figure 4.1: Data collection methods and instruments ..................................61
Figure 4.2: Data collection timeline ...............................................................75
Figure 4.3: A scenario used in an interview with the students .................90
Figure 5.1: Diem's various sources of pressure and expectations ..........115
Figure 5.2: Diem’s ongoing appraisals of language learning affordances and her motivational trajectory .........................................................129
Figure 6.1: Manh's reflections on taking private tuition .........................144
Figure 6.2: Manh's English learning across settings ...............................145
Figure 6.3: Manh’s ongoing appraisals of language learning affordances and his motivational trajectory .........................................................158
Figure 7.1: The value of peer learning from Phong's perspectives ..........168
Figure 7.2: Phong’s ongoing appraisals of language learning affordances and his motivational trajectory .........................................................191
Figure 8.1: Affordances of private English tuition for Hanh ..................203
Figure 8.2: Hanh’s ongoing appraisals of language learning affordances and her motivational trajectory .........................................................220
Figure 10.1: Motivational affordances for the four case study participants...276
Figure 10.2: Motivational affordances for language learning relating to significant others within and across settings ..................................287
List of Images

Image 2.1: English lessons taking place in the same classroom as for other subjects, with fixed seating.................................................................13

Image 2.2: A snapshot of a school corner before class hours.................................17

Image 2.3: A rehearsal for an interschool English contest in the language lab....19

Image 4.1: My interaction with a participant on Facebook Messenger..........66

Image 4.2: The Thursday English class with my British friend’s participation...78

Image 4.3: Paired private tuition at one of the participants’ home.....................88

Image 5.1: Diem's language learning strategies and her ambitions...................107

Image 5.2: Diem's timetable for examination revision....................................123

Image 6.1: Manh’s reflective essay on the significance of English .................148

Image 7.1: Phong's activities for learning English ...........................................164

Image 7.2: A snapshot of duck farming in rural Southern Vietnam..................175

Image 8.1: The living-room wall with Hanh’s commendation letters..............211
List of Appendices

Appendix A: Pilot questionnaire on the language learning attitudes of students from rural areas in Vietnam ................................................................. 337

Appendix B: Sample guides for interviewing the students in the first interview round ................................................................. 342

Appendix C: Major points and questions in some follow-up interviews .......... 344

Appendix D: Sample guides for interviewing the parents ................................. 346

Appendix E: Pilot questionnaire on best research practices in Vietnam ............ 348

Appendix F: Massey University Human Ethics Committee Documentation ....... 350

Appendix G: Information sheet ...................................................................... 351

Appendix H: Cover letter to the school principal ........................................... 354

Appendix I: The school principal’s consent form ........................................... 355

Appendix J: Consent forms for students, local teachers, and parents ............. 356