Implementation of Lean, Agile or Leagile in Consumer Electronic Retail Companies:

A comparative study between China and New Zealand

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Logistics and Supply Chain Management

At Massey University, Auckland,
New Zealand

Jun Xiao

2016
ABSTRACT

Since 1960s, a large number of researchers have focused on how organisations have made large investment to streamline their supply chain to improve customer satisfaction and increase their internal productivity, all with the aim of achieving a competitive advantage against competitors on the market. Much research has been conducted on lean management techniques, aiming to reduce the costs of supply chains by minimizing their length and agile management aiming to increasing the robustness and flexibility of supply chains. An emerging field of research combines the two principles indicating that an organisations success lies in the combination of both. This is the case in the consumer electronics industry. The consumer electronics industry generates an array of products and services increasingly used in nearly every human endeavour, now deeply entwined in our social fabric, electronic products and systems now support critical aspects of communication, education, finance, recreation, and government. In the past few years, China in particular have become increasingly important in the consumer electronics as well as other industries. As an importer to New Zealand, a market for consumer electronic goods has been rapidly amplified over the years introducing a market for more relevant companies to be established and the market competition to become more competitive. This research focused on the implementation of lean, agile and leagile strategies in four consumer electronic retail companies from China and New Zealand. It is aim of this research to better understand the inner supply chain management strategies and practices of these four companies, and analyse how these strategies improve their supply chain performance. Finally, the research will find out what New Zealand’s companies should learn from China’s successful companies by comparing these strategies and identifying the environments these four companies operate in. This research will aim to uncover characteristics associated with the success of Chinese consumer electronics companies, specific to lean, agile and leagile strategies and see whether New Zealand has the infrastructure to gain the same competitive advantage using these strategies.

Keywords: supply chain management, lean, agile, leagile, consumer electronic retail industry
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In conducting this study and preparing this thesis I have been helped significantly by many people, without their supports this research project could not be able to accomplish. Firstly, I would like to thank my parents, whose encouragement through the entire journey was vital.

I would like to thank my supervisor Alan Win and those co-supervisors from the Department of Logistics and Supply Chain Management, for their supervision through the entire study process. Alan, I am deeply grateful for your patience in coping with a foreign student and the great encouragement you have given to me. I am very much appreciative to all the efforts and time he has put in to supporting me with this study. Thank you!

I would like to acknowledge and thank to the participant companies from China and New Zealand. Thank you for receiving my questionnaires and sharing the useful information to my research, which provided the opportunity to improve my understanding of the consumer electronic retail industry in China and New Zealand.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT .................................................................................................................................................. I
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS ................................................................................................................................. II
TABLE OF CONTENTS ................................................................................................................................. III
LIST OF FIGURES ........................................................................................................................................ VI
LIST OF TABLES ......................................................................................................................................... VII
Chapter 1 Introduction ................................................................................................................................. 1
  1.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................................................... 1
  1.2 Research Objective ............................................................................................................................ 3
  1.3 Structure of Thesis .............................................................................................................................. 4
Chapter 2 Literature Review ....................................................................................................................... 6
  2.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................................................... 6
  2.2 Supply Chain Management ................................................................................................................ 6
  2.3 Retail Supply Chain ........................................................................................................................... 9
  2.4 Supply Chain in Consumer Electronic Industry ................................................................................ 10
  2.5 Supply Chain Strategies in the Consumer Electronic Industry ......................................................... 11
    2.5.1 Lean Strategy ................................................................................................................................. 11
    2.5.2 Agile Strategy ............................................................................................................................... 14
    2.5.3 Leagile Strategy ........................................................................................................................... 16
  2.6 Consumer Electronic Industry ........................................................................................................... 18
    2.6.1 China and the Consumer Electronic Industry ............................................................................. 19
    2.6.2 New Zealand and the Consumer Electronic Industry .................................................................. 20
  2.7 Value and the Value Chain in the Consumer Electronics Industry ................................................... 22
    2.7.1 The Value of Organisations/Firms ............................................................................................... 25
    2.7.2 The Value of Customers ............................................................................................................. 27
  2.8 Competitive Advantage ...................................................................................................................... 28
  2.9 Performance Assessment .................................................................................................................... 29
    2.9.1 SCOR ........................................................................................................................................... 30
    2.9.2 Balanced Scorecard ..................................................................................................................... 32
  2.10 Summary .......................................................................................................................................... 35
Chapter 3 Methodology ........................................................................................................ 37
  3.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 37
  3.2 Research Method ........................................................................................................ 37
  3.3 Research Design .......................................................................................................... 39
    3.3.1 Case Study Design ............................................................................................... 40
    3.3.2 Ensuring Quality of Case Study Research .......................................................... 41
    3.3.3 Selection of Case Studies .................................................................................... 43
  3.4 Data Collection ............................................................................................................ 43
    3.4.1 Survey Research .................................................................................................. 43
    3.4.2 Questionnaire Design ......................................................................................... 46
  3.4 Data Analysis ................................................................................................................ 48
  3.6 Research Ethics ........................................................................................................... 50
  3.7 Research Process ........................................................................................................ 51

Chapter 4 Survey Results .................................................................................................... 53
  4.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 53
  4.2 China Region ............................................................................................................... 54
    4.2.1 COMPANY A1 ................................................................................................... 54
    4.2.2 COMPANY A2 ................................................................................................... 60
  4.3 New Zealand Region .................................................................................................... 67
    4.3.1 COMPANY B1 ................................................................................................... 67
    4.3.2 COMPANY B2 ................................................................................................... 72

Chapter 5 Case Study and Discussion ................................................................................ 75
  5.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 75
  5.2 Company Overview ..................................................................................................... 75
  5.3 Strategies Implementation Comparison ....................................................................... 76
    5.3.1 Lean Improvement .............................................................................................. 78
    5.3.2 Agile Improvement ............................................................................................. 83
    5.3.3 Evaluation .......................................................................................................... 86
    5.3.4 COMPANY A1 versus COMPANY A2 ............................................................... 87
    5.3.5 COMPANY B1 versus COMPANY B2 ............................................................... 88
    5.3.6 Comparison between China and New Zealand companies .............................. 89
    5.3.7 The Lean Iceberg Model .................................................................................... 89
  5.4 Summary .................................................................................................................... 90

Chapter 6 Conclusion ......................................................................................................... 92
6.1 Research Conclusion ........................................................................................................92
6.2 Limitations of This Study .............................................................................................96
6.3 Directions for Future Research ...................................................................................96
APPENDIX 1 ..................................................................................................................98
REFERENCES ................................................................................................................100
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2-1 Supply Chain Stages and information, products flow .................................................. 7
Figure 2-2 Retail Supply Chain .................................................................................................... 10
Figure 2-3 Sustainable lean iceberg model (Adopted from Hines et al, 2010) .............................. 12
Figure 2-4 Block diagrams representing lean, agile, and leagile supply ..................................... 17
Figure 2-5 New Zealand Main Trading Partners ......................................................................... 21
Figure 2-6 Electonical and Electric Goods Sales Volume .............................................................. 22
Figure 2-7 The Generic Value Chain ........................................................................................... 24
Figure 2-8 SCOR Model Framework ........................................................................................... 31
Figure 2-9 Balance Scorecard Strategic Perspectives ................................................................... 33
Figure 3-1 Research Process ........................................................................................................ 41

Figure 4-1 Network of COMPANY A2 ......................................................................................... 61
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2- 1 Consumer Electronics Overview, 2010-2017, (US$mn) .............................................................. 20
Table 3- 1 Advantages and Disadvantages of Surveys ................................................................................. 44
Table 3- 2 Systematic Errors ......................................................................................................................... 45
Table 4- 1 SWOT analysis of COMPANY A1 ............................................................................................... 60
Table 4- 2 SWOT Analysis of COMPANY A2 ............................................................................................... 66
Table 4- 3 SWOT analysis of COMPANY B1 ............................................................................................... 71
Table 4- 4 SWOT Analysis of Company B .................................................................................................... 74
Table 5- 1 The Comparison of lean and agile implementation ..................................................................... 78