Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

# DEVELOPING PRAXIS FOR A FEW NON-ENGLISH SPEAKING BACKGROUND STUDENTS IN THE CLASS

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Education at Massey University

Penelope Anne Haworth

2004



### ABSTRACT

This thesis explores how teachers develop working theories and practices for small numbers of non-English speaking background (NESB) students in mainstream classes. The investigation included eight class teachers and four different school settings. A pilot phase was conducted in one school at the end of 2000. The major phase of the study was carried out in 2002. In each of the four terms that year, a different school became the context for the study and the focus was placed on a year 1-2 class teacher and a year 5-6 class teacher in that school.

The study employed a qualitative ethnographic approach. Information was collected about each class teacher's experience, knowledge, confidence, teaching strategies, the degree of stress experienced when teaching NESB students in various class groupings, and the way in which individual and class needs were balanced. An initial intensive interview with each class teacher was followed by in-class observations. These observations were interspersed by two reflective discussions which took place in the middle and at the end of the school term. Discussions took a reflective problem-solving approach that made use of a write-down, think-aloud technique, and focused on critical learning and teaching episodes from the class. In addition, a reflective journal was kept, and semi-structured interviews were carried out with teachers responsible for the English for Speakers of Other Languages programme in the school.

The results of the inquiry led to the development of a theoretical model which illustrated how the evolution of teachers' praxis was influenced by dynamic interactions within and across three contextual layers: the educational community, the classroom, and the reflective practitioner. Each teacher's professional knowledge was informed by a unique background of experience and the nature of the collaboration that occurred with colleagues and parents. In turn, these factors impacted on the formation of pedagogic beliefs, perceived efficacy, and the evolution, selection and implementation of particular teaching roles and strategies.

The study culminated with a number of recommendations being made for the enhancement of professional development initiatives, as well as for school and educational policies. In particular, these recommendations highlight the need for taking a broad ecological approach to addressing the professional needs of class teachers working with small numbers of NESB students.



### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Like much of human knowledge, this report is not just mine to hold, although the unfolding story within it has been my privilege to discover and to tell. The gradual, sometimes painful, but always exhilarating emergence of this thesis from an ill-formed chrysalis state has been made possible by the support of many who I can but briefly acknowledge here.

Most importantly, this thesis has been shaped by the voices of class teachers. The many stories that have been shared over the course of this investigation have influenced my understanding and will forever impact on my reflections about the world of teachers who work daily with small numbers of NESB students. I have been immensely privileged to not only physically enter into classrooms, but also to be privy to teachers' thoughts and beliefs about their work. I am therefore deeply indebted to the generosity and commitment of teachers, schools, and NESB families who participated in this study.

I also want to thank my many colleagues at Massey University who have supported me with unfailing trust in my ability and the frequent injections of good humour that have helped to buoy me throughout this endeavour. Thanks are due too to Massey University for supporting my endeavours with a number of study awards, and to Roseanne MacGillivray and the many markers who have helped with my undergraduate students over the last few years. This strong support has allowed me to maintain links to the two important worlds in which I work, as a researcher and a teacher.

In particular, I want to acknowledge the very special and wise guidance of my supervisors, Dr Ali St George and Dr Cynthia White. Their unique and carefully inter-woven contributions have provided me with not only valued encouragement, but also timely challenges, prompts and searching questions that have provoked me to find my own voice as a researcher and to evolve these skills to a higher level – a prized and priceless gift!

My special thanks also to my daughter Jillaine, my mother, and most especially to my truly wonderful husband Geoff, without whose support I could not have begun nor continued. Although I did not honour my promise to stop after the Masters' thesis you have all unselfishly tolerated my obsession with my topic and my resulting limited engagement in your endeavours. Thanks for another opportunity to fly to new realms!

So, now this journey ends and another new dawn begins.

vi

### **CONTENTS**

| Abstract         | iii          |
|------------------|--------------|
| Acknowledgements | $\mathbf{v}$ |
| Contents         | vii          |
| Appendices       | x            |
| List of Tables   | xi           |
| List of Figures  | xii          |

# PART ONE: Rationale and Design

| Introduction to Part One |  | 1 |
|--------------------------|--|---|
|--------------------------|--|---|

#### **CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION**

| 1.1 | Background to the Numbers of NESB Students  | 4  |
|-----|---|----|
| 1.2 | Current Professional Tensions               | 5  |
| 1.3 | The Regular Class Context for NESB Students | 9  |
| 1.4 | Identifying a Way Forward                   | 11 |

#### **CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE**

| 2.1 | Introduction   | 13 |
|-----|--|----|
| 2.2 | A Whole-School Approach to Supporting NESB Students    | 14 |
| 2.3 | Teaching NESB Students in a Class Setting              | 26 |
| 2.4 | Influence of Teacher Experience, Knowledge and Beliefs | 40 |
| 2.5 | Summary  | 53 |

#### **CHAPTER 3: THE OVERALL RESEARCH DESIGN**

| 3.1 | Introduction                                 | 55 |
|-----|--|----|
| 3.2 | The Research Questions                       | 56 |
| 3.3 | The Selection of Qualitative Research Design | 58 |
| 3.4 | The Ethnographic Approach                    | 61 |

#### Page

| 3.5 | Balancing Understanding with Proof  | 66 |
|-----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 3.6 | Analysing and Interpreting the Data | 68 |
| 3.7 | Reporting on the Enquiry            | 69 |
| 3.8 | Summary                             | 70 |

#### **CHAPTER 4: THE RESEARCH PROCEDURE**

| 4.1 | Introduction                                 | 71  |
|-----|--|-----|
| 4.2 | The Preliminary Study                        | 71  |
| 4.3 | The Data Collection Schedule                 | 73  |
| 4.4 | The Research Tools and Techniques            | 75  |
| 4.5 | Procedures for the Selection of Participants | 88  |
| 4.6 | Ethical Principles Applied in the Study      | 90  |
| 4.7 | Researcher Positioning                       | 96  |
| 4.8 | Summary                                      | 105 |

# PART TWO: Reporting on the Findings

| Introduction to Part Two 10 |
|-----------------------------|
|-----------------------------|

### CHAPTER FIVE: CLASS TEACHERS AT EAST SCHOOL

| 5.1 | Introduction to East School            | 115 |
|-----|--|-----|
| 5.2 | East School Junior Class Teacher: Kate | 117 |
| 5.3 | East School Senior Class Teacher: Sita | 128 |

### CHAPTER SIX: CLASS TEACHERS AT NORTH SCHOOL

| 6.1 | Introduction to North School             | 139 |
|-----|--|-----|
| 6.2 | North School Junior Class Teacher: Trish | 141 |
| 6.3 | North School Senior Class Teacher: Kathy | 153 |

### CHAPTER SEVEN: CLASS TEACHERS AT WEST SCHOOL

| 7.1 | Introduction to West School |  | 167 |
|-----|-----------------------------|--|-----|
|-----|-----------------------------|--|-----|

viii

| 7.2 | West School Junior Class Teacher: Nina | ••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••• | 169 |
|-----|--|---|-----|
| 7.3 | West School Senior Class Teacher: Anna |   | 181 |

### CHAPTER EIGHT: CLASS TEACHERS AT SOUTH SCHOOL

| 8.1 | Introduction to South School                | 193 |
|-----|---|-----|
| 8.2 | South School Junior Class Teacher: Jennifer | 196 |
| 8.3 | South School Senior Class Teacher: Janette  | 208 |

# PART THREE: Reflecting on Praxis Evolution

| <b>Introduction to Part Three</b> |  | 221 |
|-----------------------------------|--|-----|
|-----------------------------------|--|-----|

#### **CHAPTER 9: DISCUSSION & CONCLUSIONS**

| 9.1 | Introduction  | 223 |
|-----|---|-----|
| 9.2 | The Teacher as a Participant in the Educational Community | 226 |
| 9.3 | The Teacher as an Interactive Agent of Learning           | 235 |
| 9.4 | The Class Teacher as a Reflective Practitioner            | 249 |
| 9.5 | Summary   | 264 |

### **CHAPTER TEN: IMPLICATIONS & RECOMMENDATIONS**

| 10.1 | Introduction                         | 267 |
|------|--------------------------------------|-----|
| 10.2 | Implications for Theory              | 267 |
| 10.3 | Implications for Research            | 270 |
| 10.4 | Implications for Practice and Policy | 272 |
| 10.5 | Practical Recommendations            | 280 |
| 10.6 | Summary                              | 282 |

| REFERENCES |  | REFERENCES |
|------------|--|------------|
|------------|--|------------|

## APPENDICES

| 1.  | Semi-Structured Interview with ESOL Teachers                         | 309  |
|-----|--|------|
| 2.  | Semi-Structured Initial Interview with Class Teachers                | 310  |
| 3.  | Confidence Scale   | 311  |
| 4.  | Observation Record Sheet: Lesson Map                                 | 312  |
| 5.  | Sample Observation Transcript  | 313  |
| 6.  | Reflective Discussions   |      |
|     | A. Reflection on Critical Episodes with Class Teachers               | 320  |
|     | B. Sample Transcript   | 321  |
| 7.  | Ideal Teacher of NESB Students: Scale/Criteria Sheet                 | 348  |
| 0   | Class/Individual Optimization Scale                                  | 2.40 |
| 8.  | Class/Individual Orientation Scale                                   | 349  |
| 9.  | Stress Meter   | 350  |
| 10. | Documents Related to Ethical Requirements                            |      |
|     | A. Letter to Principal and Board of Trustees                         | 351  |
|     | B. School Information Sheet  | 352  |
|     | C. School Consent Form (Principal and Board of Trustees)             | 354  |
|     | D. Regular Teacher Information Sheet                                 | 355  |
|     | E. Regular Teacher's Consent Form                                    | 357  |
|     | F. Information Sheet for Staff with Responsibility for NESB Students | 358  |
|     | G. Consent Form Staff with Responsibility for NESB Students          | 360  |
|     | H. Family Information Sheet (Year 1-2 Children)                      | 361  |
|     | I. Family Information Sheet (Year 5-6 Children)                      | 363  |
|     | J. Parent/Guardian Consent Form                                      | 365  |
|     | K. Year 5-6 Children's Consent Form                                  | 366  |
|     | L. Confidentiality Agreement for Audio-Tape Transcribers             | 367  |

Page

| 2.1 | Approaches and Strategies for Teaching NESB Students in the |     |
|-----|---|-----|
|     | Mainstream Class  | 29  |
| 2.2 | Characteristics of Effective Teachers of NESB Students      | 32  |
| 4.1 | The Data Collection Schedule                                | 74  |
| 4.2 | Characteristics of the Participating Schools                | 109 |
| 4.3 | Teachers' Relevant Qualifications and Experience            | 112 |

Page

### LIST OF FIGURES

| 4.1 | Summary of Research Procedures Employed in the Study | 75  |
|-----|--|-----|
| 4.2 | Class Teachers General and NESB Teaching Experience  | 113 |
| 5.1 | Kate's Teaching Focus                                | 118 |
| 5.2 | Kate's Teaching Confidence                           | 123 |
| 5.3 | Kate's Stress Level in Different Class Groupings     | 124 |
| 5.4 | Sita's Teaching Focus                                | 129 |
| 5.5 | Sita's Teaching Confidence                           | 134 |
| 5.6 | Sita's Stress Level in Different Class Groupings     | 135 |
| 6.1 | Trish's Teaching Focus                               | 142 |
| 6.2 | Trish's Teaching Confidence                          | 148 |
| 6.3 | Trish's Stress Level in Different Class Groupings    | 150 |
| 6.4 | Kathy's Teaching Focus                               | 155 |
| 6.5 | Kathy's Teaching Confidence                          | 159 |
| 6.6 | Kathy's Stress Level in Different Class Groupings    | 162 |
| 7.1 | Nina's Teaching Focus                                | 171 |
| 7.2 | Nina's Teaching Confidence                           | 175 |
| 7.3 | Nina's Stress Level in Different Class Groupings     | 177 |
| 7.4 | Anna's Teaching Focus                                | 182 |
| 7.5 | Anna's Teaching Confidence                           | 189 |
| 7.6 | Anna's Stress Level in Different Class Groupings     | 190 |
| 8.1 | Jennifer's Teaching Focus                            | 197 |
| 8.2 | Jennifer's Teaching Confidence                       | 203 |
| 8.3 | Jennifer's Stress Level in Different Class Groupings | 205 |
| 8.4 | Janette's Teaching Focus                             | 209 |
| 8.5 | Janette's Teaching Confidence                        | 215 |
| 8.6 | Janette's Stress Level in Different Class Groupings  | 217 |
| 9.1 | The Three Contextual Layers of Teachers' Praxis      | 223 |
| 9.2 | Effects on Teachers' Cultural Efficacy               | 227 |
| 9.3 | Professional Development Pathways                    | 230 |

| 9.4  | Class Teachers' Shifting Focus                           | 239 |
|------|--|-----|
| 9.5  | Legitimizing Peripheral Participation to Enhance the ZPD | 243 |
| 9.6  | Roles Adopted by Class Teachers with NESB Students       | 244 |
| 9.7  | Low English Proficiency and Teachers' Views of Support   | 248 |
| 9.8  | Influences on Reflective Praxis                          | 250 |
| 9.9  | Perceptions of ESOL Support                              | 255 |
| 9.10 | Class Teachers' Perceptions of ESOL Expertise            | 263 |