

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

SOCIAL FORESTRY FOR ECONOMIC AND ECOLOGICAL SUSTAINABILITY

by

Josimar B. Sobrevinas

A thesis

submitted to Massey University
in partial fulfillment of
the requirements for the Degree of
Master of Philosophy
in Development Studies

Massey University
1993

ABSTRACT

This study looked into the prospects of state and other agency-sponsored social forestry project in addressing poverty and abating environmental degradation in the uplands. Forest destruction is rooted both on poverty condition of the swiddeners and their traditional farming practices. The social forestry's participatory component, scientific cropping modules and incentive schemes are viewed as effective measures to these problems.

The social forestry project which is jointly implemented by the New Zealand government and the Philippine National Oil Company (PNOC) in the three geothermal reservations managed by PNOC was chosen as the study areas due to the presence of the above-mentioned social forestry components in the project.

The research findings supported the strength of the monetary incentive scheme in eliciting farmers' participation in development projects which subsequently controlled their destructive *kaingin*-making practices. This, however, must be coupled with extensive social, economic and environmental training of the *kaingineros*. The attractiveness of the project scheme to both project and non-project beneficiaries was also established. This study also demonstrates some successes of participation in terms of the development of the farmers' potentials and capabilities in self-management and realization of individual rights.

The financial analysis in the study determined the economy of scale of the combination of cropping modules while the economic analysis has established the project's beneficial effects on the environment. It justifies financial allocation to projects of this nature.

The natural and social problems in the implementation of the social forestry project could be addressed locally through the joint effort of project staff and the farmers-participants. The donor and proponent agencies, on the other hand, showed their sincere intention to minimize the occurrence of administrative problems.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

It is very worthy to mention the number of people whom I owe a sense of gratitude for completing this piece of work. These people, regardless of the magnitude of their contribution are part of this accomplishment.

I must give a deep sense of gratitude to my supervisor, Professor A. C. Walsh, Director of the Institute of Development Studies, Massey University for his personal guidance and helpful suggestions in the development of this work. Also his array of academic colleagues gave me an opportunity to obtain ideas in this study from John McKinnon, Professor in Geography, Victoria University of Wellington, who likewise gave me an encouragement to pursue this research. My sincere thanks to Tony Banks, Lecturer in Agricultural Economics, Massey University, for his helpful comments and suggestions on financial and economic analyses in this study.

My personal thanks must go to Ms. Agnes C. de Jesus, Manager of Environmental Management Division, Philippine National Oil Company for giving me the opportunity to undertake this academic pursuit and for her moral support in the course of my study.

A lot of people helped me during my fieldwork and data gathering activities in the Philippines. Mar L. Gecolea lent me a hand in compiling project documents and other secondary information in Manila. My able field assistants in the different project areas, though their names are not mentioned here, helped me facilitate gathering of primary information. My million thanks go these people.

The social forestry project participants in Baslay, Bediao, Tongonan and Tublizon deserve my wholehearted thanks for their cooperation and unquestionable willingness in providing primary information in this study. In my belief, these people had tried disclosing flawless information.

A sincere thanks to all my fellow Filipino students in the university whose companionship and camaraderie had lessen the pressure in my study. The Carambas Family deserves a compliment for providing us the Philippine atmosphere during special occasions. Likewise, I am very grateful to the Baker Family for providing me an accommodation and a home atmosphere during the writing of this manuscript.

My must apology to my family whom I abandoned in pursuit of this academic advancement. Nevertheless, they served as my inspiration in the timely completion of this undertaking. I dedicate this work to them.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	ii
ACKNOWLEDGMENT	iii
TABLES	x
FIGURES	xii
GLOSSARY	xiii
CHAPTER I - INTRODUCTION	1
Statement of the Problem	1
Purpose of the Research	5
Specific Objectives	5
Research Hypotheses	6
Initial Participation and Enlistment in Development Projects	6
Demographic Factors Affecting Initial Participation	9
Household Income Level	10
Age	11
Sex	12
Educational Level and Training Background	12
People's Participation in Development Projects	13
Project Design, Monitoring and Evaluation	14
Organization of Farmers' Associations	17
Participation in the Decision-making Processes	18
Project Benefits	19
Project Impact Indicators	20
Improvement of Economic Condition	20
Increased Environmental Awareness Among Upland Farmers	21
Decreasing Environmental Degradation	22
Project Replicability	22
Significance of the Study	23
Researcher's Stance	27
CHAPTER II - RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	29
Research Design	29
Selection and Description of the Study Area	30
Selection of Study Area	30
Description of the Study Area Before the Implementation of the Project	31

The Baslay and Bediao Project Areas	31
Physical Features	31
Socio-economic Condition	32
The Tongonan Project Area	34
Physical Features	34
Socio-economic Condition	36
The Azupre Project Area	37
Physical Features	37
Socio-economic Condition	39
PNOC Social Forestry Project Background	40
Major Elements	41
Description of Physical Interventions	43
The Baslay and Bediao Agroforestry Projects' Modules	43
The Tongonan Rattan Plantation Project Module	46
The Azupre Agroforestry Project Module	46
Funding Components	48
Selection of Sample Respondents	50
Data Collection Methods	51
Instruments	51
Orientation of Research Assistants	52
Data Collection Schedule	53
Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA)	53
Non-participant Observation	54
Secondary Data	55
Inventory of <i>Ayanguile</i> trees	55
Approaches of Analyses	56
Logical Framework Approach (LFA)	56
Data Encoding and Summarization	58
Statistical Tools	59
Financial Analysis	60
Economic Analysis	61
CHAPTER III - RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	62
Chapter Organization	62
Demographic and Social Characteristics of the Sample Respondents	63
Distribution of Sample Respondents by Project Area	63
Distribution of Sample Respondents by Sex	64
Distribution of Sample Respondents by Age	65
Distribution of Sample Respondents by Educational Level	67
Distribution of Sample Respondents by Training Background	67
Distribution of Sample Respondents by Household Size	69
Distribution of Sample Respondents by Sex of Household Members	70
Distribution of Respondents' Households by Number of Children in School Before Joining the Project	72

Economic Characteristics of Sample Respondents	74
Distribution of Respondents' Households	
According to Primary Sources of Income	74
Distribution of Respondents' Households	
According to Secondary Sources of Income	76
Respondents' Household Income from Different	
Sources Before and After Project	
Implementation	76
Household Income from <i>Kaingin</i> -making	77
Household Income from Farming of	
Private Land	78
Household Income from Livestock Production	80
Household Income from Other Sources	82
Household Income from Original Sources and	
Social Forestry Project	84
Test of Research Hypotheses	85
Hypothesis 1	85
Hypothesis 2	89
Hypothesis 3	90
Hypothesis 4	92
Hypothesis 5	93
Hypothesis 6	94
Hypothesis 7	96
Hypothesis 8	98
Hypothesis 9	103
Hypothesis 10	106
Hypothesis 11	107
Hypothesis 12	109
Economic Analyses of the Social	
Forestry Project	109
Farmers' Involvement in the Different Phases	
of project Cycle	115
Planning, Formulation and Design	115
Implementation	118
Monitoring	118
Evaluation	121
CHAPTER IV - PROBLEMS IN PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION	122
Problems in the Implementation	
of the Social Forestry Project	122
Administrative Problems	122
Administrative System	122
Project Staff Assignment	125
Inter-agency Problems	126
Social Problems	127
Cynicism and Filipino Values Affecting	
Participation to the Project	127
Factionalism	128
Discipline of Association Officers	128
Natural Problems	129
Crop Infestation	130
Long Dry Season	130
Typhoons	131

Soil Condition	131
CHAPTER V - CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	132
Conclusion	132
Recommendation	137
Administrative Recommendations	137
Technical Recommendations	138
Socio-economic Recommendations	140
General Recommendation	141
APPENDICES	142 -226
1 : Project Social Development Training Programme for Farmers-Beneficiaries	142
2 : Registration Certificates of the Beneficiary Associations	145
3 : Original Target Plantation Area by Project Area	149
4 : Target Plantation Area After 1990 Mission Review	150
5 : Target Plantation Area After 1991 Project Review	151
6 : Breakdown of Project Funding Between the Philippine National Oil Company and the New Zealand Government	152
7 : Questionnaire for NZ-PNOC Social Forestry Project Beneficiaries	157
8 : Questionnaire for Non-project Beneficiaries	166
9 : Questionnaire for NZ-PNOC Social Forestry Project in <i>Tagalog</i> Dialect	167
10 : Participatory Rural Assessment Result by Tublijon Farmers' Association	174
11 : <i>Ayanguile</i> Stand Inventory	176
12 : Logical Framework Chart	177
13 : Summary of Codes Used in Data Encoding and Summarization	179
14 : Crop Yield Data	184
15 : Crop Prices Data	185
16 : Financial Analysis for Baslay Agroforestry Project	188
17 : Financial Analysis for Baslay Agroforestry Project	191
18 : Financial Analysis for Baslay Agroforestry Project	194
19 : Financial Analysis for Baslay Agroforestry Project	197
20 : Economic Analysis for Baslay Agroforestry Project (Without Project Situation)	198
21 : Economic Analysis for Bediao Agroforestry Project (Without Project Situation)	199
22 : Economic Analysis for Tongonan Agroforestry Project (Without Project Situation)	200

23	: Economic Analysis for Azupre Agroforestry Project (Without Project Situation)	201
24	: Economic Analysis for Baslay Agroforestry Project (With Project Situation)	202
25	: Economic Analysis for Bediao Agroforestry Project (With Project Situation)	204
26	: Economic Analysis for Tongonan Agroforestry Project (With Project Situation)	206
27	: Economic Analysis for Azupre Agroforestry Project (With Project Situation)	208
28	: Draft Memorandum of Agreement Between the Philippine National Oil Company and New Zealand Government on the Joint Implementation of the New Zealand - PNOC Social Forestry Project	210
29	: Waiver of PNOC's Accounting Procedures	214
30	: Delegation of Authority	221
31	: Increasing Trend in Membership in Beneficiary Associations	226
BIBLIOGRAPHY		227

TABLES

Table 1 :	Question-Hypothesis Summary Table	24
Table 2 :	Area of Plantations with Healthy Crops	48
Table 3 :	Distribution of Sample Respondents by Project Area	64
Table 4 :	Distribution of Sample Respondents by Sex	65
Table 5 :	Distribution of Sample Respondents by Age	66
Table 6 :	Distribution of Sample Respondents by Educational Level	68
Table 7 :	Distribution of Sample Respondents by Training Background	69
Table 8 :	Type of Training Attended by Sample Respondents	70
Table 9 :	Distribution of Respondents' Households by Household Size	71
Table 10:	Distribution of Respondents' Household by Sex of Household Members	72
Table 11:	Distribution of Respondents' Households by Number of Children in School Before Project Implementation	73
Table 12:	Distribution of Respondents' Households According to Primary Sources of Income	75
Table 13:	Distribution of Respondents' Households According to Secondary Sources of Income	77
Table 14:	Area of <i>Kaingin</i> Farmers in Each Project Area	78
Table 15:	Mean Annual Household Income from <i>Kaingin</i> - making Before and After Project Implementation	79
Table 16:	Reasons Cited by the Respondents' for the Decrease in their Mean Annual Income from <i>Kaingin</i> -making and Farming of Private Land	79
Table 17:	Mean Annual Household Income from Farming of Private Land Before and After Implementation of the PNOC Social Forestry Project	81
Table 18:	Mean Annual Household Income from Livestock Production Before and After Implementation of the PNOC Social Forestry Project	82
Table 19:	Reasons Cited by the Respondents for the Increase in Their Mean Annual Income from Livestock Raising	83
Table 20:	Mean Annual Household Income from Other Sources Before and After Project Implementation	83
Table 21:	Mean Annual Household Income From Original Sources After Project Implementation	84
Table 22:	Mean Annual Household Income from Original Sources and Project Income After Project Implementation	85

Table 23:	Farmers' Purposes for Joining the Social Forestry Project	86
Table 24:	Respondents' Mean Annual Household Income and Percentage of Respondents That Selected Income Generation as Primary Purpose for Joining the project	88
Table 25:	Respondents by Income Level and Percentage of Respondents That Selected Income Generation as Primary Purpose for Joining the Project . .	89
Table 26:	1988 Poverty Levels at the Study Area	90
Table 27:	Respondents by Income Level and Date of Enlistment to the Project	91
Table 28:	Respondents by Age Level and Date of Enlistment to the Project	92
Table 29:	Respondents by Sex and Date of Enlistment . .	93
Table 30:	Helpfulness of the Project Training Programme to the Respondents	94
Table 31:	Association's Decision-making Processes Cited by the Respondents	95
Table 32:	Association's Sharing Scheme Cited by the Respondents	96
Table 33:	<i>Kainginero's</i> Attitude Towards Stopping <i>Kaingin</i> -making Practices	97
Table 34:	Respondents' Mean Annual Household Income Before and After Project Implementation . . .	99
Table 35:	Comparison Between Number of Children in School Before and After Project Implementation	99
Table 36:	Capital Stock of the Associations	100
Table 37:	Equipments Acquired by the Associations . . .	101
Table 38:	Summary of Project Net Present Values and Average Net Returns	103
Table 39:	Respondents' Means of Acquiring Knowledge About the Environment	104
Table 40:	List of Environmental Protection and Conservation Activities Initiated by the Respondents	105
Table 41:	<i>Kaingin</i> -making Incidence Before and After Project Implementation	107
Table 42:	Farming Scheme Preferred by Respondents . . .	108
Table 43:	List of Farmers groups Adopting the PNOC Pilot Social Forestry Project Scheme	110
Table 44:	Acknowledgment of Farmers from Other Communities That Their Projects was Patterned with the Pilot Social Forestry Project	111
Table 45:	Comparison Between Net Present Values "Without" and "With" Project Situations . . .	114

FIGURES

Figure 1 :	The Geothermal Energy Recharge Model	4
Figure 2 :	Location of the Four Social Forestry Project Areas.	33
Figure 3 :	Location of the Baslay and Bediao Social Forestry Project Areas	35
Figure 4 :	Location of the Tongonan Social Forestry Project Area	38
Figure 5 :	Location of the Azupre Social Forestry Project Area	41
Figure 6 :	Baslay and Bediao Agroforestry Projects Cropping Module 1	45
Figure 7 :	Baslay and Bediao Agroforestry Projects Cropping Module 2	45
Figure 8 :	Tongonan Rattan Plantation Project Cropping Module	47
Figure 9 :	Azupre Agroforestry Project Cropping Module	47
Figure 10:	Logical Framework Matrix	58

GLOSSARY

<i>Abaca</i>	A banana-like plant whose fibers are used in the manufacture of rope and handicrafts
<i>Ayanguile</i>	A leguminous tree primarily used for soil protection and watershed conservation
<i>Barangay</i>	Village
BAS	Bureau of Agricultural Statistics
<i>Bayanihan</i>	Free and voluntary group work
BPI	Bureau of Plant Industry
CBCR	Community-Based Contract Reforestation
CBU	Capital Build-Up
CSC	Certificate of Stewardship Contract
CTF	Communal Tree Farm
DA	Department of Agriculture
DBP	Development Bank of the Philippines
DENR	Department of Environment and Natural Resources
FAR	Family Approach to Reforestation
FIDA	Fiber Industry Development Authority
FMB	Forest Management Bureau
FOM	Forest Occupancy Management
<i>Gabi</i>	A variety of root crop
<i>Guiron</i>	Commonly called tiger grass whose flower stalks are used in making soft broom
ISFP	Integrated Social Forestry Programme
<i>Kaingin</i>	Area cleared through slash-and-burn shifting agriculture

<i>Kainginero</i>	Upland farmer engage in slash-and-burn shifting agriculture, swiddener
<i>Kakawate</i>	A deciduous leguminous tree
LFA	Logical Framework Approach
LFC	Logical Framework Chart
LOI	Letter of Instruction
MFAT	Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade
NGO's	Non-governmental Organizations
NPV	Net Present Value
<i>Palasan</i>	A species of rattan (<i>Calamus maximus</i>)
Peso	Philippine currency (approximately 29 pesos = US \$1 in 1993)
PNOC	Philippine National Oil Company
PRA	Participatory Rural Appraisal
Province	Political unit composed of towns and cities
<i>Sari-sari</i>	Variety
<i>Sitio</i>	Cluster of residential houses in a village
Town	Political unit composed of group of villages