Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Estimating the contribution of different sources to the burden of human campylobacteriosis and salmonellosis

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand,

by

Petra Müllner

2009

Preface

It was both odd and unjust, said Gauss, a real example of the pitiful arbitrariness of existence, that you were born into a particular time and held prisoner there whether you wanted it or not. It gave you an indecent advantage over the past and made you a clown vis-à-vis the future.

Measuring the World, Daniel Kehlmann 2005.

Seltsam sei es und ungerecht, sagte Gauss, so recht ein Beispiel für die erbärmliche Zuflligkeit der Existenz, da man in einer bestimmten Zeit geboren und ihr verhaftet sei, ob man wolle oder nicht. Es verschaffe einem einen unziemlichen Vorteil vor der Vergangenheit und mache einen zum Clown der Zukunft.

Die Vermessung der Welt, Daniel Kehlmann 2005.

Abstract

This thesis is concerned with the molecular epidemiology of Campylobacter jejuni and Salmonella in New Zealand and the development of source attribution tools for these pathogens. Although campylobacteriosis is the leading enteric zoonosis worldwide, the pathogen's complex epidemiology and difficulties with existing typing schemes, have posed challenges for the control of this disease.

The first study of this thesis gives an overview of existing approaches to microbial risk assessment and source attribution, with particular respect to campylobacteriosis, and describes their advantages and shortcomings. Further, the chapter discusses phenoand genotyping techniques for Campylobacter spp. and the value of including microbial typing data in risk assessments. In the second study, data from a sentinel surveillance site in the Manawatu region was used to investigate the molecular epidemiology of human campylobacteriosis cases. This analysis revealed the presence of a dominant C. jejuni clone, namely sequence type (ST) 474, which accounted for 30.7 % of human cases in the study and identified risk factors for infection with ruminant and poultry associated STs. The third study investigated the link between C. jejuni in human cases and samples taken from poultry. By applying epidemiological and population genetic techniques this part of the thesis provided further evidence that poultry is a major contributor to human infection. In the fourth study an existing Bayesian source attribution model was modified and consecutively applied to New Zealand's major foodborne zoonoses: campylobacteriosis and salmonellosis. The majority (80 %) of human campylobacteriosis cases attributable to C. jejuni were estimated to have been acquired from poultry sources, whereas wildlife source were estimated to contribute only a minor proportion of cases. In the fifth study the Salmonella dataset was descriptively analysed and a large proportion of human cases was found to be caused by 'exotic' Salmonella types. In the final study of this thesis four different genetic and epidemiological source attribution methodologies were applied to the same dataset in a comparative modelling framework.

The studies in this thesis show that epidemiological studies combined with molecular tools and modeling can provide valuable risk-based tools to inform the surveillance and control of zoonotic pathogens. Methods from these studies may be readily applied to the control of other (food borne) zoonoses and provide new opportunities for epidemiological investigations and source attribution modelling of major pathogens.

Acknowledgements

I learned many things while working on this thesis and greatly appreciate the excellent training I received at Massey University. But it feels the most valuable improvement has not come from the technical side of things but from a new appreciation I acquired for other disciplines and my colleagues. Clearly my mind has become a broader one in the process.

I owe a lot to my main supervisor Nigel French. You have taught me a great many things and moved me out of my comfort zone to reach peak performance. Thank you for your kindness and encouragement in difficult times, your contagious enthusiasm and guidance.

I would like to thank the New Zealand Food Safety Authority for funding this project as part of their postgraduate programme and for the help of all those I came to know in the process. You provided valuable input for my thesis and it was great to learn from your expertise. Special thanks to the Science Group for their support in the last four years, in particular Steve Hathaway for initiating the program and taking the time to supervise and guide me. To Donald Campbell, Terry Ryan and Roger Cook for their advice, Peter van der Logt for his help and kindness, Paul Dansted for the invaluable noise cancelling headphones, Bob Jackman for his helpfulness, David Tisdall for making me laugh when it was much needed and Audrey Taulalo for those hours of 'girls time' in and out of the office. Thanks all for your annual (failed) attempts to make me understand your sense of humour for the Christmas skit.

Thanks to my supervisor Cord Heuer for getting me over here and started, and always being there when I needed his advice. Thanks to all my fellow students at the Epicentre and Hopkirk Institute for sharing their experiences with me. Thanks to Colleen Blair, Julie Dunlop, Wendy Maharey, Chris Cunningham and Simon Verschaffelt from the EpiCentre for their administrative and computing support and Bruce White for his help with EndNote. Thanks to the many people who made my project possible: the Hopkirk Lab Team (in particular Julie Collins-Emerson, Ann Midwinter, Errol Kwan, Rhukshana Akhter, Rebecca Pattison, Sarah Moore, Isabel Li and Diane

Richardson), MedLab Central (in particular Lynn Rogers), and Tui Shadbolt and her colleagues from MidCentral Public Health. A special thanks to the team at ESR in Kenepuru, in particular Phil Carter, for their help with the project. I owe the Hopkirk Team and Tui some special words for all the hard work and extra hours they put into the project. We pushed through hard times until my German directness and your Kiwi ingenuity melted us into a great team. I will miss working with you.

Thanks to Simon Spencer, Geoff Jones and Alasdair Noble for guiding me through the ups and downs of applied statistics and being key to the success of this project. Thanks to Martin Hazelton for valuable input into the development of the modified Hald model and Jonathan Marshall for his help with the publications. For stimulating discussion and the honour to be part of their group I would like to thank all members of the Enteric Zoonoses Modelling Group.

Thanks to all the people who helped me through the final steps of this thesis in various ways such as providing templates, de-bugging IATEX and proof reading: Julie Collins-Emerson, Jonathan Marshall, Eve Pleydell, Deb Prattley, Daan Vink and Jacqui Benschop.

Thanks to my friends Jacqui Benschop (and her lovely family) and Eve Pleydell for giving me shelter and so many other things over the last years. Katie Owen for cheering me up over a coffee so many times. Petra Stübben, Jens Schwarz and Frederik for shared moments far away from the homeland and those early morning get-togethers watching the German soccer team play in championships. Thanks to all my other friends and family, most far away, for being there for me. To my parents-in-laws for all their support in our endeavours and visiting us in the final months of the thesis, providing me with time to fully immerse myself in those final steps. To my aunt and uncle Trude and Hartmut for caring so much about me, I couldn't wish for better god-parents to my children. To my cousin Ellen for the time we shared, with a promise to reply more often to my emails once this thesis is submitted. To my father, who did not live long enough, to meet my girls and share my happiness with me. Carina, Franzi, Kathrin, Soni, Brigitte, Susi, Kirsten and Janne it is great to have friends like you, even if we now live at different ends of this planet.

Most importantly thanks to my husband Uli for his support and love and keeping me from taking myself and life too seriously. You truly are the best thing that ever happened to me. And finally to my girls Lea and Stella, to the moon and back this is how much I love you!

Nomenclature

AFLP Amplified Fragment Length Polymorphism

AMOVA Analysis of molecular variance

BA Blood agar

BPW Buffered Petone Water

CAC Codex Alimentarius Commission

CI Confidence interval

CC Clonal complex

cfu colony forming unit

CrI (Bayesian) credible interval

CRISPR Clustered regularly interspaced short palindromic repeats

DNA Desoxyribonucleic acid

ELISA Enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay

ERL Enteric Reference Laboratory

ERIC Enterobacterial repetitive intergenic consensus

ESR Environmental Science and Research Ltd.

EU European Union

EZDRG Enteric Zoonosis Disease Research Group

FAO World Agricultural Organisation

FAME Fatty acid methyl ester

HACCP Hazard Analysis and Critical Control Points

HL Heat-labile (antigen)HS Heat-stable (antigen)

mCCDA Modified Cefoperazone Charcoal Desoxycholate agar

MCMC Markov Chain Monte Carlo

MEE Multi locus enzyme electrophoresis

MLST Multi locus sequence typing

MPRM Modular process risk model

MRA Microbial risk assessment
MST Microbial source tracking
MST Minimum spanning trees

NMD National Microbiological Database

NZ New Zealand

NZFSA New Zealand Food Safety Authority
OIE World Organisation for Animal Health

OR Odds ratio

PCR Polymerase chain reaction

PFGE Pulsed field gel electrophoresis

PHS Public Health Service

PSI Proportional similarity index

QRA Quantitative risk assessment

RA Risk assessment

RAPD Randomly amplified polymorphic DNA

rDNA Ribosomal DNA

RE Restriction enzyme

REA Restriction endonuclease analysis

RFLP Restriction fragment polymorphism

SD Standard deviation

spp. Species (multiple)

SPS Sanitary and phytosanitary (agreement)

ST Sequence type

SVR Short variable region

US-NAS United States National Academy of Science

WHO World Health Organisation

WTO World Trade Organisation

Publications

Mullner, P., Spencer S., Wilson D., Jones G., Noble A. D., Midwinter, A., Collins-Emerson, J., Carter, P., Hathaway, S., French, N. P. Assigning the source of human campylobacteriosis in New Zealand: A comparative genetic and epidemiological approach. *Infection, Genetics and Evolution* (9): 1311-1319 2009.

Mullner, P., G. Jones, A. Noble, S. Spencer, S. Hathaway, and N. French. Source Attribution of Food Borne Zoonoses in New Zealand: A Modified Hald Model. *Risk Analysis*(7): 970-984 Jul 2009.

Mullner P., Spencer S., Jones G., Noble A. D., Wilson D., Collins-Emerson, J., Midwinter, A., Carter, P., Hathaway, S., French, N. P. Attribution of campylobacteriosis in New Zealand: Approaches, results and outlook. *Proceedings of the 12th Symposium International Society for Veterinary Epidemiology and Economics*, Durban, South Africa: ISVEE 12, 432, 2009.

Mullner, P., Benschop, J. Interdisciplinary research at the human and animal health interface: A personal perspective. *Proceedings of the 12th Symposium International Society for Veterinary Epidemiology and Economics*, Durban, South Africa: ISVEE 12, 125, 2009.

Mullner, P., Collins-Emerson, J., Midwinter, A., Carter, P., Hathaway, S., French, N. P. Structured parallel stuides of the molecular epidemiology of *Campylobacter jejuni* in environmental and food sources reveal insight into the importance and interconnection of different reservoirs. *Proceedings of the 12th Symposium International Society for Veterinary Epidemiology and Economics*, Durban, South Africa: ISVEE 12, 431, 2009.

- Mullner, P., Shadbolt, T., Spencer, S., Jones, G., Noble, A. D., Collins-Emerson, J., Midwinter, A., Carter, P., Campbell, D. M., Van der Logt, P., Lee, J., Hathaway, S., French, N. P. Enhanced surveillance to identify the origin of human campylobacteriosis in New Zealand: Conclusions drawn from an interdisciplinary sentinell surveillance site. *Proceedings of the 12th Symposium International Society for Veterinary Epidemiology and Economics*, Durban, South Africa: ISVEE 12, 379, 2009.
- French, N.P., **Mullner P.**, Spencer S. Controlling campylobacteriosis in New Zealand: combining epidemiology and population genetics to trace the origin of human infections. *New Zealand Microbiological Society, Annual Conference 2008*, Christchurch, NZ.
- G. McBride, P. van der Logt, R. Lake, N. French, A. Ball, **P. Mullner**, A. Elliott, A. Hunt and L. Oakley. Modelling initiatives for campylobacteriosis. *New Zealand Microbiological Society, Annual Conference 2008*, Christchurch, NZ.
- French, N.P., **Mullner P**. Risk-based tools to inform decision making in food safety and public health applications in Europe and New Zealand. *FOOD FRENZ*, *Annual Conference 2008*, Budapest, Hungary.
- Mullner P., Collins-Emerson, J., Midwinter, A., Spencer, S., French, N. Molecular and Modelling tools for *Campylobacter Source Attribution*. *Proceedings of the Epidemiology & Animal Health Management Branch of the NZVA*, 2008, Wellington, NZ.
- Mullner P., Pleydell, E., Shadbolt, T., Collins-Emerson, J., Midwinter, A., Spencer, S., French, N. Working at the human and animal health interface a multidisciplinary team approach towards reducing New Zealand's campylobacteriosis problem.

 Proceedings of the Epidemiology & Animal Health Management Branch of the NZVA, 2008, Wellington, NZ.
- French, N.P., Carter P., Collins-Emerson J., Midwinter A., **Mullner P.**, Wilson, D. Comparing 'source attribution' models for human campylobacteriosis. *Society for Veterinary Epidemiology and Preventive Medicine, Annual Conference 2008*, Liverpool, UK.
- Lake, R., van der Logt, P., McBride, G., French, N., **Mullner, P.**, Andrew Elliott, Andrew Ball. Campylobacteriosis in New Zealand: modelling as a way forward. *NZ Science Review* 2007 Volume 64 (2) pp 37-41.

Mullner P. Source attribution of *C. jejuni* using molecular epidemiology. *New Zealand Institute of Food Science and Technology, Annual conference 2007*, Wellington, NZ.

Mullner P, Carter P, Midwinter A, Collins-Emerson J, Pattison R, French NP. Source attribution of Campylobacter jejuni using molecular epidemiology. Proceedings of the Epidemiology & Animal Health Management Branch of the NZVA, 69, 2007.

Mullner, P., Carter, P., Cook, R., Tebje-Kelly, J., French, N. P. Strain Typing As A Valuable Tool For Quantitative Microbial Risk Assessment. *Proceedings 11th International Symposium ISVEE*, August 6-11, 2006, Cairns, Australia.

Mullner, P., Carter, P., Midwinter, A., Collins-Emerson, J., French, N. P. Molecular epidemiology of *Campylobacter jejuni*: comparing Multilocus Sequence Types from humans and poultry. *Proceedings 11th International Symposium ISVEE*, August 6-11, 2006, Cairns, Australia.

Terry Ryan, Stuart MacDiarmid, Steve Hathaway, **Petra Mullner**, Neil Cox, Andrew Hill. A Quantitative Analysis of Foodborne Salmonellosis Exposure Pathways in New Zealand. *Proceedings of the International Conference on 'Priority Setting of Foodborne and Zoonotic Pathogens'*, MedVetNet and the US Food Safety Research Consortium, 19-21 July 2006, Berlin, Germany.

Contents

Pı	refac	e									ii
\mathbf{A}	bstra	ıct									iv
\mathbf{A}	ckno	wledge	ements								vi
N	omer	ıclatur	${f re}$								viii
Pι	ublic	ations									x
C	onter	$_{ m nts}$								x	viii
Li	st of	Table	s								xxi
Li	st of	Figur	es							x	xiii
1	Cha	pter 1									1
	1.1	Introd	$\operatorname{luction}$								1
	1.2	The M	Ianawatu Sentinel Surveillance Site								4
	1.3	The st	tructure of this thesis	•		•	•			•	6
2	Cha	pter 2									7
	2.1	Summ	nary								7
	2.2	Introd									8
	2.3	Revie	w of typing methods for Campylobacter spp								9
		2.3.1	Phenotyping								10
		2.3.2	Genotyping								12
		2.3.3	A comparison of phenotyping and genotyping .								21
	2.4	MRA	approaches								22
		2.4.1	Overview								22
		2.4.2	Different approaches to MRA								25
		2.4.3	Major $Campylobacter$ risk assessments to date								30
		2.4.4	Source attribution approaches								32
		2.4.5	Strain variation and MRA approaches								41

		2.4.6	Suitable typing methods for <i>Campylobacter</i> risk research	48
	2.5	Concl	usions	53
	2.6	Apper	ndices	54
3	Cha	apter 3	3	55
	3.1	Summ	nary	55
	3.2	Introd	luction	56
	3.3	Mater	rial and Methods	57
		3.3.1	Study population	57
		3.3.2	Case definition	58
		3.3.3	Case ascertainment	58
		3.3.4	Genotyping	58
		3.3.5	Epidemiological surveillance	58
		3.3.6	Data handling and statistical analysis	59
	3.4	Result	ts	60
		3.4.1	Description of cases	60
		3.4.2	Incidence	63
		3.4.3	Distribution and source association of genotypes	63
		3.4.4	Risk factor analysis	66
		3.4.5	Spatio - temporal analysis	67
	3.5	Discus	ssion	72
	3.6	Ackno	owledgements	75
	3.7		ndices	75
4	Cha	apter 4	1	77
	4.1	Abstra	act	77
	4.2	Introd	luction	78
	4.3	Mater	rial and Methods	79
		4.3.1	Campylobacter isolates	79
		4.3.2	Bacterial culture and identification	80
		4.3.3	Sequence typing	80
		4.3.4	Statistical analysis of Campylobacter count data	81
		4.3.5	Statistical Analysis of ST distributions	82
	4.4	Result	ts	83
	4.5	Discus	ssion	94
	4.6		owledgements	97
	<i>4</i> 7		ndices	97

5	Cha	pter 5	99
	5.1	Abstra	act
	5.2	Introd	uction
	5.3	The B	ayesian risk attribution model by Hald et al
	5.4	A moo	lified Hald model
		5.4.1	Modelling prevalence uncertainty
		5.4.2	Splitting data into different time periods
		5.4.3	Hierarchical model for bacterial parameters
		5.4.4	Exponential prior for source specific parameters
		5.4.5	Avoid food consumption weights
		5.4.6	Including potentially pathogenic subtypes
	5.5	Applic	eation of the modified Hald model
		5.5.1	Campylobacteriosis
		5.5.2	Salmonellosis
	5.6	Discus	sion
		5.6.1	Improving identifiability
		5.6.2	Choice of prior for q_i and a_j
		5.6.3	Introduction of uncertainty in prevalence matrix
		5.6.4	Novel approach to prevalence estimation
		5.6.5	Splitting data into different time periods
		5.6.6	Avoid food consumption weights
		5.6.7	Including potentially pathogenic subtypes
		5.6.8	Campylobacteriosis model
		5.6.9	Salmonellosis model
	5.7	Conclu	asions
	5.8	Ackno	wledgements
	5.9	Appen	ndices
6	Cha	pter 6	131
	6.1	Summ	ary
	6.2	Introd	uction
		6.2.1	Sources of data in New Zealand
	6.3	Mater	ial and Methods
		6.3.1	Human cases
		6.3.2	Animal food source prevalence
		6.3.3	Amount of food source consumed
		6.3.4	Analysis
	6.4	Descri	ptive analysis of data set: Human cases 2000 - 2004
		6.4.1	Overview
		6.4.2	Salmonella serotypes occurring in human cases

		6.4.3	Serotype and travel status	. 139
		6.4.4	Serotype and outbreak status	. 140
	6.5	Descri	iptive analysis of data set - animal food sources 2002-2004	. 141
		6.5.1	Overview	. 141
		6.5.2	Beef and veal	. 145
		6.5.3	Pork	. 146
		6.5.4	Lamb and mutton	. 147
		6.5.5	Chicken	. 148
		6.5.6	Eggs	. 149
	6.6	Descri	iptive analysis of data set - food consumption data	. 150
	6.7	Discus	ssion	. 151
	6.8	Concl	usions	. 154
	6.9	Ackno	owledgements	. 154
	6.10	Apper	ndices	. 154
7	Cha	pter 7	7	155
	7.1	Abstra	act	. 155
	7.2	Introd	luction	. 156
	7.3	Metho	ods	. 157
		7.3.1	Data	. 157
		7.3.2	Proportional similarity index	. 158
		7.3.3	Dutch model	. 158
		7.3.4	Modified Hald model	. 159
		7.3.5	Island model	. 159
	7.4	Result	ts	. 160
		7.4.1	Proportional similarity index	. 160
		7.4.2	Dutch model	. 160
		7.4.3	Modified Hald model	. 160
		7.4.4	Island model	. 160
		7.4.5	Comparing the results from different approaches	. 161
	7.5	Discus	ssion	. 164
	7.6	Ackno	owledgements	. 167
	7.7	Apper	ndices	. 168
8	Cha	pter 8	3	169
	8.1	Summ	nary	. 169
	8.2	Molec	cular epidemiology	. 170
	8.3	Source	e attribution modelling	. 171
	8.4	Interd	lisciplinarity	. 172
	8.5	Concl	usions	. 176

\mathbf{A}	App	pendix A	177
	A.1	Summary	177
	A.2	Selected performance criteria for evaluation of typing systems	177
		A.2.1 Typeability	177
		A.2.2 Reproducibility	177
		A.2.3 Stability	178
		A.2.4 Discriminatory power	178
В	App	pendix B	179
	B.1	Summary	179
\mathbf{C}	App	pendix C	183
	C.1	Summary	183
	C.2	Material and methods	183
		C.2.1 Summary	183
		C.2.2 Detailed methods	183
	C.3	Genotypes detected in human cases and poultry samples	186
		C.3.1 Summary	186
D	App	pendix D	191
	D.1	Summary	191
	D.2	Bayesian statistics and simulation modelling	191
	D.3	Assignment of travel and outbreak association of cases	195
		D.3.1 Outbreak association	195
		D.3.2 Travel association	195
	D.4	'Other Salmonella types' detected in human cases from 2002-2004	196
\mathbf{E}	Арр	pendix E	201
	E.1	Summary	201
Bi	bliog	graphy	207

List of Tables

2.1	Classification of different approaches to MRA
2.2	Mean risk of infection for different strains of Campylobacter 46
2.3	Ranking of four typing methods for Campylobacter spp
3.1	Demographic characteristics of types and nontyped cases 61
3.2	Frequency and source association of human <i>C. jejuni</i> genotypes 64
3.3	Results of a multivariable case-case risk factor analysis 66
4.1	Proportion of poultry samples positive 85
4.2	Relative frequency of STs
4.3	Multiple typed samples
4.4	The proportional similarity index for each supplier
5.1	Description of parameters of Hald model
5.2	Description of different campylobacteriosis models
5.3	Estimates for a_j and q_i and tau in campylobacteriosis model 114
5.4	Data matrix for Salmonella prevalence estimation
5.5	Prevalence estimates for Salmonella in beef
6.1	Typing, outbreak and travel status of human salmonellosis cases 136
6.2	Number of cases of Salmonella subtypes
6.3	Percentage of cases of $Salmonella$ serotypes with a history of travel 139
6.4	Outbreak association of $Salmonella$ serotypes 2000 - 2004 140
6.5	Number of Salmonella serotypes isolated
6.6	Prevalence estimates for $Salmonella$ serotypes in beef and veal 145
6.7	Prevalence estimates for $Salmonella$ serotypes in pork
6.8	Prevalence estimates for $Salmonella$ serotypes in lamb and mutton 147
6.9	Prevalence estimates for $Salmonella$ serotypes in chicken
6.10	Prevalence estimates for Salmonella serotypes in eggs
6.11	Estimated food consumption in New Zealand 2002 - 2004
7.1	Overview of samples collected in the Manawatu
7.2	Comparison of proportional similarity indices

C.1	Genotypes isolated from human cases and poultry samples	187
D.1	Other Salmonella types	196
E.1	Relative frequency of sequence types (ST)	201

List of Figures

1.1	Campylobacteriosis rates in different countries (2004)	2
1.2	Number of notified campylobacteriosis cases in New Zealand 1997 - 2008.	5
2.1	The Risk Analysis Framework	23
2.2	Minimum spanning tree	37
2.3	Source attribution using STRUCTURE and the ISLAND model	38
2.4	Consensus tree of Campylobacter isolates	40
2.5	Framework for exposure assessment of Campylobacter spp	47
3.1	Human samples from the Manawatu surveillance site	62
3.2	The proportion of cases in each age category	67
3.3	Smoothed temporal trends in human campylobacteriosis cases	68
3.4	Relative risk surface for ST - 474	69
3.5	Relative risk surface for non-poultry poultry strains	70
3.6	Relative risk surface for other poultry strains	71
4.1	Probability of contamination of poultry carcasses	89
4.2	Level of contamination of poultry carcasses	90
4.3	Population structure of <i>C. jejuni</i> in different poultry suppliers	91
5.1	Plot of observed and expected campylobacteriosis cases	109
5.2	Attribution results campylobacteriosis	110
5.3	Sensitivity analysis for different campylobacteriosis models	
5.4	Attribution of salmonellosis cases	120
6.1	Notified cases of salmonellosis in New Zealand	133
6.2	Temporal trends of selected $Salmonella$ serotypes	138
6.3	Estimated median $Salmonella$ prevalence in different food sources	144
7.1	Comparison of attribution results	162
7.2	Results from island model	163
8.1	Framework of multidisciplinary approach	175

B.1	Comparison of case numbers with notification data	180
B.2	Relative frequency of human $C.$ $jejuni$ MLST genotypes	181