

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Aspects of Selection
for Economic Merit
in Dairy Cattle**

A thesis
presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy
in Animal Breeding at
Massey University

Gisela Ahlborn

~~1994~~ 1995
H. D. B.

636.2142

Ah1

X20

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I gratefully acknowledge the guidance and support of my Chief Supervisor Professor Robert Anderson in my endeavours in mathematical and animal breeding statistics.

I would like to thank Professor Hugh Blair for the guidance of my work, his valuable comments on the manuscript and his friendly messages.

In particular, I would like to express my gratitude to Dr Brian Wickham of Livestock Improvement. His encouragement and support in many different ways made this study possible.

I would like to thank my supervisors Professor Al Rae and Dr Dorian Garrick for their help and advise.

I am grateful to my former colleagues at Livestock Improvement, Dr Pat Shannon, Rob Jackson and Dr John Rendel for sharing their ideas and knowledge with me.

I would like to thank Professor Bill Hohenboken, Professor Leo Dempfle and the late Dr Reuven Bar-Anan for their support and inspirations in matters animal breeding. I am indebted to Dr Bernhard Breier for his encouragement and practical advice and our stimulating academic discussions.

I am most grateful to Livestock Improvement to have provided me with this opportunity to further my education and contribute to dairy cattle breeding in New Zealand.

I am indebted to my parents who encouraged me to search for answers and taught me not to give up.

Finally, I would like to thank my husband Karl Matthys for his valuable comments on the manuscript of this thesis and his patience, encouragement and understanding during the final phase of my studies.

ABSTRACT

Economic merit of dairy cattle is an important consideration in dairy cattle breeding. In this thesis, genetic and economic aspects were combined to quantitatively derive an aggregate genotype with the aim to improve the economic merit of New Zealand dairy cattle.

Relative economic values for production traits, liveweight and survival rate were estimated. A profit function was defined for a pasture based milk production system. The effects of changes in several genetic, biological and economic parameters on various components of farm profit were simulated with a bioeconomic computer model.

The economic value for protein yield was \$ 4.64/kg and \$ 4.58/kg for Holstein-Friesian and Jersey cows, followed by \$ 1.84/kg and \$ 1.75/kg, respectively, for milkfat yield. Liveweight had a negative economic value of \$ 0.49/kg and \$ 0.53/kg for Holstein-Friesian and Jersey cows. An increase in survival rate by 1% had a positive economic value of \$ 9.25 and \$ 9.29 for Holstein-Friesian and Jersey cows. A sensitivity analysis showed that declining returns for milk reduced economic values for all milk components and simultaneously increased economic values for liveweight.

The effects of several traits on survival rate were quantified. An increase in survival rate increases a cow's profitability as cows contribute to net farm income only during their lactation years and constitute a cost during the rearing period. After production traits, the farmer's overall opinion of the cow and the traits udder support and udder overall had the greatest impact on survival rate. These traits were used as selection criteria for survival rate in the selection indexes.

Variance and covariance components were estimated with multitrait REML procedures for all production, management and conformation traits used in the current selection index. Heritabilities were 0.25 for protein yield and 0.21 for milkfat yield for Holstein-Friesians and 0.17 for both traits in Jerseys. Generally, parameter estimates did not differ substantially from other populations.

An aggregate genotype as well as selection indexes for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys were constructed and weighting factors calculated based on the economic values and genetic parameters estimates.

The aggregate genotype included the traits protein yield, milkfat yield, volume, liveweight and survival rate.

The selection index for Holstein-Friesians included the traits protein yield, milkfat yield, volume, liveweight, udder overall, overall opinion, temperament, milking speed and udder support.

The selection index for Jerseys included the traits protein yield, milkfat yield, volume, liveweight, udder overall, overall opinion, temperament, milking speed and fore udder.

These selection indexes improve the economically important trait survival rate included in the aggregate genotype through indirect selection using traits which can be measured in the first lactation. This allows the current generation interval to be maintained when selection for survival rate is incorporated in the aggregate genotype.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Abstract	i
Table of Contents	iii
List of Figures	viii
List of Tables	x
1. INTRODUCTION	1
2. SELECTION FOR MULTIPLE TRAITS - A REVIEW	4
2.1. Methods of selection for multiple traits	5
2.1.1. Tandem selection	5
2.1.2. Independent culling levels	6
2.1.3. Selection of extremes	8
2.1.4. Selection index methods	8
2.1.4.1. Optimum selection index	11
2.1.4.2. Best Linear Unbiased Prediction	14
2.1.4.3. Definition of aggregate genotype	16
2.1.4.4. Multiple-stage selection	17
2.1.4.5. Efficiency of selection index	19
2.1.4.6. Estimated selection index	20
2.1.4.7. Substitution index	21
2.1.4.8. Indices based on phenotypes	22
2.1.4.9. Selection indices with constraints	24
2.1.4.10. Alternatives to index selection	26
2.2. Estimation of relative economic values	27
2.2.1. Discount rates	29
2.2.2. Profit function - objective function	32
2.2.3. Methods of estimating rel. economic values	37
2.2.4. Use of economic indices	41
2.2.5. Non-linear economic values	41

2.3. Effects of errors in parameters on expected genetic gain	44
2.3.1. Errors in genetic parameters	44
2.3.2. Errors in economic values	48
2.4. The current breeding objective for New Zealand dairy cattle	48
2.4.1. Selection objective	48
2.4.2. Current selection criteria	51
3. A BIOECONOMIC MODEL	
3.1. Introduction	61
3.2. A bioeconomic model for a pasture based milk production system	62
3.3. Baseline parameters and variables	63
3.3.1. Dairy farm production system parameters	64
3.3.2. Metabolisable energy available	65
3.3.3. Utilization/requirements of metabolisable energy	65
a) Maintenance	67
b) Lactation	69
c) Prenatal growth	74
d) Postnatal growth and weight gain	75
3.3.4. Biological animal variables	76
a) Milk production	76
b) Liveweight	77
c) Replacement rate	78
d) Age distribution of herd	78
da) Estimation of age distribution	79
db) Estimation of age-production factor	82
dc) Effect on energy requirement for milk	83
dd) Effect on revenue from cull cows	84
e) Survival rate of cows	85
f) Survival rate of calves (0 - 4 days)	86
g) Survival rate of replacements (4 days - 2 years)	86
h) Dressing percentage	86
i) Ratio of calf weight at birth to cow liveweight	88

3.3.5. Economic variables	89
a) Price for milkfat, protein and volume	89
b) Price for carcass of mature cow	90
c) Price for carcass of calf	91
d) Price of calf sold for rearing	92
e) Variable costs	92
f) Fixed costs	96
g) Discount rate	99
3.3.6. Objective variables	101
3.4. Validation of bioeconomic model	101
3.4.1. Validation of conceptual model	102
3.4.2. Verification of computerized model	102
3.4.3. Operational validity	103
4. RELATIVE ECONOMIC VALUES ESTIMATED WITH THE BIOECONOMIC MODEL	107
4.1. Introduction	107
4.2. Material and methods	108
4.3. Milk production	111
4.3.1. Protein	111
4.3.2. Milkfat	118
4.3.3. Lactose	126
4.3.4. Volume	132
4.4. Liveweight	133
4.4.1. Effects of liveweight changes	133
4.4.2. Economic value of liveweight	135
4.5. Replacement rate	141
4.6. Comparison of economic values	145
5. SENSITIVITY ANALYSIS	149
5.1. Economic variables	150
5.1.1. Returns for milk components	150

a) Protein	153
b) Milkfat	158
c) Lactose	162
d) Volume	164
5.1.2. Returns for carcass of mature cow	166
5.1.3. Returns for carcass of calf	168
5.1.4. Costs of inputs	170
5.2. Biological variables	172
5.2.1. Metabolisable energy available	173
5.2.2. Biological animal parameters	175
5.3. Comparison of variables for sensitivity impact	180
6. EFFECTS OF TRAITS OTHER THAN PRODUCTION ON SURVIVAL RATES	182
6.1. Introduction	182
6.2. Material and methods	182
6.3. Results	184
6.4. Conclusion	194
7. AN AGGREGATE GENOTYPE AND SELECTION INDEXES FOR NEW ZEALAND DAIRY CATTLE ESTIMATION OF GENETIC PARAMETERS FOR THEIR IMPLEMENTATION	195
7.1. An aggregate genotype for New Zealand dairy cattle	195
7.2. Selection indexes for New Zealand dairy cattle	197
7.2.1. Holstein-Friesians	197
7.2.2. Jerseys	198
7.3. Genetic parameters for selection objectives and selection criteria	199
7.3.1. Introduction	199
7.3.2. Material and methods	200
7.3.3. Results and discussion	200

a) Heritabilities	208
b) Phenotypic correlations	212
c) Genetic correlations	214
7.4. Conclusion	219
8. SELECTION INDEXES	220
8.1. Introduction	220
8.2. Selection index equations	220
8.3. Results and discussion	228
8.4. Conclusion	229
9. CONCLUSION	230
10. APPENDIX	234
10.1. APL-code of bioeconomic model	234
10.2. APL-code for calculating selection index coefficients	240
10.3. Tables of genetic parameters for Holstein-Friesians, Jerseys and Ayrshires	242
10.4. Publications	250
11. PUBLICATIONS ARISING FROM THESIS	289
12. BIBLIOGRAPHY	291

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Page
3.1. Flowchart of bioeconomic model.	63a
4.1. Revenue per ha from milk, sum of milk and bobby calves, sum of milk, bobby calves and cull cows and profit per ha defined as sum of revenue from milk, bobby calves and cull cows minus variable costs at different levels of protein yield per cow for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys.	116
4.2. Revenue per ha from milk, sum of milk and bobby calves, sum of milk, bobby calves and cull cows and profit per ha defined as sum of revenue from milk, bobby calves and cull cows minus variable costs at different levels of milkfat yield per cow for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys.	124
4.3. Revenue per ha from milk, sum of milk and bobby calves, sum of milk, bobby calves and cull cows and profit per ha defined as sum of revenue from milk, bobby calves and cull cows minus variable costs at different levels of lactose yield per cow for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys.	131
4.4. Revenue per ha from milk, sum of milk and bobby calves, sum of milk, bobby calves and cull cows and profit per ha defined as the sum of revenue from milk, bobby calves and cull cows minus variable costs at different levels of liveweight for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys.	140
4.5. Revenue per ha from milk, sum of milk and bobby calves, sum of milk, bobby calves and cull cows and profit per ha defined as the sum of revenue from milk, bobby calves and cull cows minus variable costs at different levels of replacement rate defined as the reciprocal of herd life for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys.	144

- 5.1. Real prices for milkfat and meat from cull cows and bobby calves during the last 20 years. 151
- 5.2. Changes in economic values for protein, milkfat, lactose and liveweight for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys with an increasing price for protein. 155
- 5.3. Changes in economic values for protein, milkfat, lactose and liveweight for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys with an increasing price for milkfat. 161
- 5.4. Changes in economic values for protein, milkfat, lactose and liveweight for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys due to changes in volume penalty. 165

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
Chapter 3	
3.1. Dairy farm production system parameters employed in the bioeconomic model.	64
3.2. Estimates for ME requirement for milk components.	74
3.2. Milk production statistics for 1990/91 season for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys.	77
3.3. Statistical parameters for production per cow by age for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys.	80
3.4. Proportion of cows in each age group for Holstein-Friesian and Jersey.	81
3.5. Age-production factors for Holstein-Friesian and Jersey for different replacement rates.	84
3.6. Expected dressing percentages for Holstein-Friesian and Jersey cows.	88
3.7. Variable costs per cow.	93
3.8. Total milking time estimates for Holstein-Friesian and Jersey cows.	94
3.9. Comparison of production parameters derived from an experiment and the bioeconomic model for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys.	10
Chapter 4	
4.1. Phenotypic and genetic parameters employed for Holstein Friesians and Jerseys.	11

- 4.2. Changes in energy requirements, revenue and cost per cow and per ha for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys for different levels of protein yield. 113
- 4.3. Production parameters, profit per ha and economic values at different levels of protein yield per cow for Holstein-Friesian and Jersey cows. 117
- 4.4. Changes in energy requirements, revenue and costs per cow and per ha for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys with different levels of milkfat yield. 120
- 4.5. Production parameters, profit per ha and economic values at different levels of milkfat yield per cow for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys. 125
- 4.6. Changes in energy requirements, revenue and costs per cow and per ha for Holstein-Friesian with different levels of lactose yield. 128
- 4.7. Production parameters, profit per ha and economic values at different levels of lactose yield per cow for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys. 132
- 4.8. Changes in energy requirements, revenue and costs per cow and per ha for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys for different levels of liveweight. 137
- 4.9. Production parameters, profit per ha and economic values at different levels of liveweight for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys. 141
- 4.10. Production parameters, profit per ha and economic values at different levels of replacement rates for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys. 143
- 4.11. Comparison of decrease in stocking rates per phenotypic standard deviation increase in various traits for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys. 146
- 4.12. Economic values per cow for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys. 149

Chapter 5

- 5.1. Prices for milkfat, cull cow carcass and bobby calves. 152
- 5.2. Changes in profit per ha and per cow with increasing protein prices for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys. 157
- 5.3. Changes in profit per ha and per cow and economic values for milk prices predicted for 2001 and 2011. 158
- 5.4. Changes in profit per ha and per cow resulting from increasing milkfat prices for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys. 162
- 5.5. Changes in profit per ha and per cow due to an increased value for lactose for Holstein-Friesian and Jersey. 164
- 5.6. Changes in profit per ha and per cow with increased costs for volume for Holstein-Friesian and Jersey. 166
- 5.7. Changes in profit per ha and per cow resulting from changes in returns for cow meat for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys. 168
- 5.8. Changes in profit per ha and per cow resulting from changes in returns for calf meat for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys. 169
- 5.9. Changes in profit per cow and per ha with a 10% increase in variable costs, a 10% increase in stock prices and a 2% increase in interest rate for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys. 171
- 5.10. Changes in economic values per ha due to changes in DM grown, utilisation and energy content of DM. 174
- 5.11. Changes in stocking rate, profit per ha and economic values per ha resulting from a 10% increase in biological variables for Holstein-Friesians and Jerseys. 178

Chapter 6

- 6.1. Number of cows with production, management and survival information at different lactations. 183
- 6.2. Means and standard deviations of production and non-production traits of primiparous cows included in the analysis. 185
- 6.3. Means and standard deviations for survival rates between subsequent lactations. 187
- 6.4. Partial regression coefficients for traits affecting survival rate from 1st to 2nd lactation. 188
- 6.5. Standardised partial regression coefficients for traits affecting survival rate from 1st to 2nd lactation. 190
- 6.6. Partial regression coefficients for traits affecting survival rate from 1st to 3rd lactation. 191
- 6.7. Partial regression coefficients for traits affecting survival rate from 1st to 4th lactation. 193

Chapter 7

- 7.1. Number of records for estimating variance and covariance components for production and non-production traits. 20
- 7.2. Heritabilities of selection objectives in the aggregate genotype and selection criteria in the selection indexes. 20
- 7.3. Phenotypic correlations between selection criteria included in the selection indexes. 21
- 7.4. Genetic correlations between traits in aggregate genotype and criteria in selection index. 21

Chapter 8

- 8.1. Phenotypic variances and covariances used for determining weighting factors for selection indexes. 224
- 8.2. Genetic variances and covariances used in determining weighting factors for selection indexes. 226
- 8.3. Weighting factors (\$/cow/annum) for selection criteria included in the selection indexes I_H (Holstein-Friesians) and I_J (Jerseys). 228

Chapter 10 - Appendix

- 10.1. Adjusted means, phenotypic and additive genetic variances and heritability estimates with their standard deviations and standard errors for production and non-production traits for primiparous Holstein-Friesian, Jersey and Ayrshire cows. 242
- 10.2. Heritability and phenotypic and genetic correlation estimates for primiparous Holstein-Friesian, Jersey and Ayrshire cows. 245
- 10.3. Standard errors for heritability and phenotypic and genetic correlation estimates for primiparous Holstein-Friesian, Jersey and Ayrshire cows. 248