

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**AN EVALUATIVE CASE STUDY OF
A BASIC EDUCATION AND TRAINING PROGRAMME
IN INDONESIA**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of
the requirements for the degree of

Master of Educational Administration

at Massey University, Palmerston North,
New Zealand

Enni Iriani

2002

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study was to evaluate the effectiveness of the basic education and training programme (the DIKLAT ADUM) for Indonesian civil servants. This evaluative case study was based on the nature of formative evaluation that aims at providing feedback for the programme's improvement and development.

This research used the methods of survey questionnaire and telephone interview. A purposive-random sampling was carried out for the interview. Using the Likert attitude scale and open-ended questions, the questionnaire asked the participants about their expectation of the programme, the programme's content and the perceived effects of the programme. The telephone interview enquired about participants' insights regarding some themes that had emerged from the questionnaire.

The responses to the survey questionnaire and interview showed that the programme was reasonably effective in improving the participants' skills and knowledge of public administration and management as well as their attitude towards their job as civil servants. However, it was found that two main aspects of the programme, curriculum and its delivery, needed special attention from the stakeholders in order for the programme to be more effective.

The study concludes with some recommended action plans for both the organisational and individual stakeholders. It also recommends a model for evaluating future DIKLAT ADUM programmes aimed at their improvement and development.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Firstly, I would like to acknowledge Associate Professor Wayne Edwards, my first supervisor, for his constant encouragement, constructive suggestions and invaluable guidance throughout the course of this work. My heart-felt appreciation is addressed to Dr. Wilhelmina Drummond, my second supervisor, whose intellectual advice and joyful feedback has been invaluable. Their support in the most critical parts of the course has been priceless.

This study would not have been possible without the opportunity and cooperation from the official Government of Indonesia, the National Institute of Public Administration and the Education and Training Agency of West Java Province. To all those people who supported the study, I am deeply grateful. I am also thankful to NZODA for providing me with the scholarship. I would also to express my gratitude to the International Student Office staff for providing the necessary support and for making day-to-day life more pleasant.

A special thankfulness is extended to Lina Yuliana in Bandung who has given her invaluable time to assist me in collecting the research data. Also to my friends of the Indonesian Student Association of Palmerston North, especially to Pak Edie, who provided comments on the earlier drafts of this thesis and to Mbak Emy, who helped me go through difficult times during the last year of the study. To my colleague, Martin Vickerman, who has shared his knowledge and skills of operating the Word Processor and the SPSS as well as to Brian Payne, who has given his priceless time to proofread the language of the work.

Lastly and so very importantly, my gratefulness is directed to my husband, Didin Syahrudin, for his patience and prayer as well as for all the time he gave so that I could complete this Master of Educational Administration degree. To my mother and parents-in-law who always supply me with endless hope and prayer. Special thanks to my children, Disyantani Lavi Muhammad and Rinetadisya Aulia Rachmah who are and have been wonderful in coping with pressures associated with the production of this work. To you, I would like to dedicate this thesis.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
	Candidate's Statement	ii
	Abstract	lii
	Acknowledgements	lv
	Table of Contents	v
Chapter I	INTRODUCTION	1
	A. BACKGROUND	
	B. OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY	1
	C. SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY	4
	D. LIMITATION OF THE STUDY	5
	E. DEFINITION OF KEY TERMS.....	6
	F. ORGANIZATION OF THE THESIS	6
		7
Chapter II	LITERATURE REVIEW	9
	A. INTRODUCTION	
	B. STAFF DEVELOPMENT	9
	Concepts and Definition	10
	Approaches and Model	10
	Management and Leadership Education, Training and Development	12
	C. EVALUATION OF TRAINING PROGRAMME EFFECTIVENESS	19
	Concepts and Definition of Evaluation.....	25
	Alternative Models for Evaluating Programme Effectiveness	26
	A Practical Framework for Evaluating Management and Leadership Education and Training Programme ...	28
	D. SUMMARY	33
		36
Chapter III	METHODOLOGY AND RESEARCH DESIGN	38
	A. THEORETICAL ASPECTS	38
	Qualitative-Quantitative Dispute and Resolution.....	38
	Case Study	43
	Evaluative Case Study	45
	Data Collection Techniques in Evaluative Case Study.....	47
	B. PRACTICALITIES OF METHODOLOGY	49
	Gaining Permission for Study	50
	Population and Sample, and Research Processes.....	51
	The Practicalities of Data Collection Techniques.....	53
	Data Analysis	55
	C. ETHICAL ISSUES IN UNDERTAKING THE STUDY...	57
	D. SUMMARY	57
Chapter IV	DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS	58
	A. INTRODUCTION	58
	B. BRIEF OVERVIEW OF STAFF DEVELOPMENT POLICY FOR INDONESIAN CIVIL SERVICE	59

	C. AN OVERVIEW OF THE DIKLAT ADUM PROGRAMME STAKEHOLDERS	60
	The National Institute of Public Administration.....	61
	The Regional Agency for Civil Service Training and Education of West Java Province	62
	D. THE NATURE OF THE DIKLAT ADUM PROGRAMM..	63
	E. DESCRIPTION AND ANALYSIS OF THE QUANTITATIVE DATA	67
	Profile of Respondents	67
	Participants' Attitudes Towards the Programme	69
	Perceptions on General Aspects	69
	Perceptions on Basic Knowledge on Indonesian.. Public Administration	74
	Perceptions on Management and Leadership Skills and Knowledge	76
	Perceptions on Work Ethic	79
	F. DESCRIPTION AND ANALYSIS OF THE QUALITATIVE DATA	82
	Responses to open-ended survey questionnaire	82
	Emergent Themes Explored	92
	Responses to Interviews	93
	G. SUMMARY	106
Chapter V	DETERMINANTS OF THE DIKLAT ADUM PROGRAMME EFFECTIVENESS	108
	A. INTRODUCTION	108
	B. DETERMINING FACTORS	109
	Work Culture.....	109
	Motivation	116
	Competency of Teachers	122
	Programme Organization	129
	Assessment or Evaluation	134
	C. SUMMARY	143
Chapter VI	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	145
	A. SUMMARY OF KEY FINDINGS	145
	B. REFLECTION AND IMPLICATION	147
	C. RECOMMENDED ACTION PLAN	148
	D. RECOMMENDED PROGRAMME EVALUATION MODEL	151
	E. SUGGESTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH	155
	Bibliography	156
	Appendices	165

LIST OF FIGURES

<u>Figure</u>		<u>Page</u>
2.1	Diagrammatic Representation of Gall's Staff Development Models	19
2.2	Diagrammatic Representation of Cacioppe's Leadership Development Programme	20
2.3	Robert Stake's Model of Programme Evaluation	34
2.4	Edwards' User-friendly Evaluation Model	36
5.1	Cheepen's Teacher Assessment Procedure	140
6.1	Recommended Model for Evaluating Future DIKLAT ADUM Programmes	154

LIST OF TABLES

<u>Table</u>		<u>Page</u>
4.1	Curriculum of the DIKLAT ADUM programme and time allocation	66
4.2	Participants' perceptions of clarity of the subject matters' objectives	72
4.3	Perceptions of the participants of the proportion of theoretical and practical aspects with respect to participants' structural positions	73
4.4	Participants' Perceptions of the proportion of theoretical and practical aspects with respect to participants' work tenure	74
5.1	Teachers' attitudes categorized by Burns	128

LIST OF GRAPHS

<u>Graph</u>		<u>Page</u>
IV-1	The worth of the programme perceived by participants holding structural and functional positions.	70
IV-2	Participants' opinion of 'No attendance if the programme had been optional'.	71

LIST OF APPENDICES

<u>Appendix</u>		<u>Page</u>
A	Map of Indonesia showing locations of DIKLATPROFs	164
B	Letter Acquiring Research Permission	165
C	Letter of Approval from West Java DIKLATPROF	166
D	Cover Letter from Researcher	167
E	Survey Questionnaires	168
F	Interview Schedule	172
G	Consent Form	173
H	Research Information Sheet	174
I	Profile of Respondents	177
J	General Aspects	180
K	Basic Knowledge Improvement	181
L	Management/Leadership Skills Improvement	183
M	Work Ethic Improvement	186
N	Percentages of Responses to Qs on Programme Content	188
O	Summary of Descriptive Statistics	189

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

A. BACKGROUND

Government institutions around the world are facing multifaceted challenges and problems in the current turbulent times. They are required to be able to not only solve the problems but also to find the best way of handling these difficulties. The organisational capability of overcoming these challenges largely depends upon the capability or the quality of the people working in these institutions. To improve the quality of their human resources, government organisations are required to facilitate staff development to improve and develop the knowledge and skills of their employees.

In traditional organisations, the focus of development activities involves knowledge acquisition, defined as the collection of new information useful in identifying, recalling, or recognising the basic component and steps of their jobs (Gilley & Maycunich: 2000). The acquisition process can effectively be achieved through the provision of opportunities for periodical offered education and training programmes within the organisations. Therefore, it is acknowledged that education and training can become a vehicle to improve the skills, knowledge and attitudes of employees, which leads to enhanced-organisational performance.

In the Indonesian government institutional context, the function of education and training illustrated above is reflected in the current established policies. The government has established the regulation that every civil servant, to be promoted to managerial (leadership) positions, has to attend and follow the training called "*pendidikan dan pelatihan administrasi umum*" (Education and Training on Basic Administration), commonly known as the DIKLAT ADUM

programme¹. The programme is designed for those at the base staff level who are about to be promoted to the lowest managerial position (e.g. heads of sub-units or sections) within government institutions throughout Indonesia. The programme is carried out in a five-week intensive course to provide participants with basic skills and knowledge of public administration and management.

Lowest level managers have very important roles in any organisation as they bridge the distance between policy makers and implementers/employees. Therefore, the designation of the education and training programme for the managers is assumed to be a significant act towards the achievement of an organisation's mission and vision (Bolman and Deal, 1997). With regard to this assumption, the Law No. 8 Year 1957, which was renewed lately by the Presidential Decree No. 8 Year 1999, assigns the National Institute of Public Administration (NIPA) to co-ordinate such a programme. In implementing the training, NIPA works closely with the Education and Training Agency of Provincial Government Office².

People attending the programme come from central, regional and local government institutions located in the service area of each training and education agency (see map in Appendix A). They are selected, sent and funded by their own institutions and most of them are going to be promoted from staff members to managerial positions. Normally, the participants have Bachelor Degrees in different field of studies, or otherwise, they have at least eight year of service and work experience³.

The DIKLAT ADUM programme has had positive effects on the civil servants' career paths; but the policy also created some dilemmas for those who did not complete this programme. One problem is the effect of its strict

¹ Government regulation number 101 year 2000 on civil service education and training (*Peraturan Pemerintah No. 101 Tahun 2000 Tentang Pendidikan dan Pelatihan Pegawai Negeri Sipil*)

² Government regulation number 101 year 2000 on civil service education and training (*Peraturan Pemerintah No. 101 Tahun 2000 Tentang Pendidikan dan Pelatihan Pegawai Negeri Sipil*)

implementation. Most government institutions tend to implement the policy strictly but others do not; consequently, many complaints arise from employees whose careers come to a deadlock because of not having attended the DIKLAT ADUM programme (*Suara Merdeka*: 12/September/2000). This issue also raises questions about the worth of the programme and about the difference it makes to civil servants' attitudes, skills and knowledge in their work.

A great amount of funds are spent annually on the planning and implementation of the DIKLAT ADUM programme. For example, at the National Institute of Public Administration West Java Regional Office alone, funding of 45 million rupiahs (around NZ\$12,500 in current rate) was set aside for one 300-hour DIKLAT ADUM programme in 1997⁴. It is, therefore, important, for this programme to achieve its objectives of preparing civil servants to sit in either leadership or a professional position in the government. In the process, it also has to consider internal and external environmental changes that influence the nature of participants' learning processes in order to provide participants with quality learning experiences (Lofthouse, 1994).

The present study will examine the worth of the DIKLAT ADUM Programme and find out to what extent it makes a difference to participants' attitudes, skills and knowledge in their work. In the absence of appropriate data to guide decisions about programme planning and improvement, programmes are built on tradition or on trial and error. Berney and Ayers (1990), for example, contend that the vision of preparing leaders in the 1950s is not adequate for the 21st century. Therefore, an evaluative case study of the DIKLAT ADUM Programme is important to provide information on the

³ The decree of the chief of NIPA number 357/IX/6/4/2000 on guidelines for the implementation of the DIKLAT ADUM programme (*Keputusan Kepala Lembaga Administrasi Negara Nomor 357/IX/6/4/2000 Tentang Pedoman Penyelenggaraan DIKLAT ADUM*)

⁴ Financial report of the DIKLAT ADUM programme implementation June-August 1997, NIPA West Java regional office (*Laporan Keuangan Penyelenggaraan DIKLAT ADUM Angkatan III Bulan Juni - Agustus 1997, LAN RI Perwakilan Jawa Barat*)

effectiveness of its current activities and, at the same time, to suggest future directions of programme improvement.

B. THE OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

A programme is perceived to be effective if it achieves its goals. In this case, a critical question may arise about who set the goals and whether the goals accommodate the needs of the people or groups of people involved in the programme. Consequently, opinions about the programme's effectiveness might vary among the groups of people, such as administrators, staff members, teachers, participants and parent institutions of the participants. As schools are service organisations whose success relies on the satisfaction of the market, then every decision must take perceptions of clients on programme's effectiveness into consideration.

Moreover, Scriven (1972: 80) states that, in order to attain reliable results of an educational evaluation, it is not very important to examine what a teacher says she/he is doing or what the students say they are doing. The most important thing is what the students say (do, believe, etc.) at the end of the course that they wouldn't have said at the beginning. Thus, the participants' perceptions of the delivery of the programme are critical to evaluate the effectiveness of the educational programmes.

Accordingly, the scope of this study intends to examine the participants' perceptions of the effectiveness of the DIKLAT ADUM Programme. Thus, the main overarching question of this study is:

How effective is the performance of the DIKLAT ADUM programme, with reference to participants' perceptions?

In accordance with the research question, this study entitled “An evaluative case study of a basic education and training programme in Indonesia,” poses the following research objectives:

- 1) To identify the participants' perceptions of the content of the DIKLAT ADUM programme.
- 2) To provide recommendations for future training programme improvement.
- 3) To generate a tentative model for evaluating the DIKLAT ADUM programme.

C. SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY

The nature of the study is formative evaluation in which further development of the DIKLAT ADUM programme is the goal. Besides, as the study will be trying to identify determinant factors that influence the programme and to attain appropriate ways to improve the programme, there are three expected benefits that the findings of this evaluation might provide:

- 1) Important information for stakeholders' decision-making about the programme. Programme administrators might find the findings useful to develop a better understanding of the dynamics of the programme and, hence, to help them to make better decisions. The decision-making involves, for example, the selection and recruitment of teachers, the adjustment of the programme goals and curriculum and the management of the programme.
- 2) Information needed for the development of the programme and the improvement of its service delivery. Administrators will be able to determine what programme components are to be developed and improved. Programme teachers may obtain benefits from the findings as they can identify what teaching skills they need to develop and improve.
- 3) A suitable and robust approach for continuous DIKLAT ADUM programme evaluation. The approach used in this study can be adapted for evaluating future DIKLAT ADUM programmes.

D. LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

In implementing this study, the researcher is aware that there are several limitations of this work. Some of them are:

- 1) This study is carried out in one organisation so that the findings cannot be generalised to any other organisations.
- 2) The ability of the researcher to generate data is limited by the time, funds and geographical distance. The researcher was not able to talk face to face with the participants due to geographical distance between Indonesia and New Zealand. She also had to limit the time for the telephone interviews due to the high cost of international calls.
- 3) The findings of this study are limited to the time of the study. They cannot be generalised to another times.
- 4) The evaluation study is limited to the DIKLAT ADUM programme and any attempt to use the approach for evaluating other programmes must be done with great caution.

E. DEFINITION OF KEY TERMS

- *Evaluation.* Evaluation in this study is defined as an appraisal of the quality and determination of the worth of education and training programmes.
- *The DIKLAT ADUM programme.* The programme is carried out by the NIPA and the Education and Training Agencies of Provincial Government Offices to educate civil servants promoted from staff to lower level managers.
- *Lower level managers.* Lower level managers in this study are those who have leadership positions within sections or sub-units in Indonesian government organisations.

F. ORGANISATION OF THE THESIS

Chapter 1 Introduction

Chapter 1 outlines the background, the objectives, significance, limitation of the study, definition of the key terms and organisation of the thesis.

Chapter 2 Literature Review

Chapter 2 discusses the theoretical background of the study. It elucidates staff development theory, evaluation theory, the DIKLAT ADUM programme as one of the staff development processes and models of evaluation. This chapter also proposes an evaluation model that is used for this study.

Chapter 3 Methodology

Chapter 3 explains the research design and methodology employed for this study. It is divided into two: theoretical and practical aspects. The first part focuses on the theory of case study and data collection techniques. The second part discusses the practicality of gathering the data.

Chapter 4 Data Presentation and Analysis

Chapter 4 describes data that has been collected from questionnaires and interviews. It attempts to describe the participants' perceptions of the content and outcome of the programme. The first part consists of an overview of the Indonesian civil service development policy and of the DIKLAT ADUM programme stakeholders. Meanwhile the second part comprises a thorough description of the participants' perceptions of the programme.

Chapter 5 Determinants of the Programme's Effectiveness

Chapter 5 discusses the main themes that resulted from participants' perception and attempts to create a practical and useful model for evaluating future DIKLAT ADUM programmes. It also discusses recommendations for the future direction of education and training programmes.

Chapter 6 Conclusions and Recommendations

Chapter 6 draws the main conclusions from the study and outlines some suggested action plans. It also delineates some recommendations for future research.