

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**FROM JOB CREATION TO TRAINING,
1840-1990: A DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSIS
OF THE DEVELOPMENT AND DEMISE OF
JOB CREATION POLICY AS THE
MAINSTAY OF STATE RESPONSES TO
UNEMPLOYMENT IN NEW ZEALAND**

**A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Social Policy at Massey
University, Palmerston North, New Zealand**

ANDREW PUNABANTU MULENGU

July 1994

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
ABSTRACT	v
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	vi
GLOSSARY OF MAORI AND NEW ZEALAND TERMS	vii
ABBREVIATIONS	viii
INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER ONE: COMPETING PERSPECTIVES ON WORK AND THE CAPITALIST STATE	
Introduction.....	11
From Ancient Greece to the Protestant Reformation	12
The Protestant Reformation And Work	15
From the Protestant Work Ethic to Capitalist Work Ethic	18
Maori Attitudes Towards Work	22
Utopian Socialists and Marxists and Their Views on Work.....	24
Unemployment	27
The Capitalist State and Unemployment	29
British State Responses to Unemployment.....	34
The New Zealand State's Responses to Unemployment	36
Conclusion.....	39
CHAPTER TWO: FROM THE NEW ZEALAND COMPANY TO NEW ZEALAND STATEHOOD AND EARLY RESPONSES TO UNEMPLOYMENT, 1840-70	
Introduction.....	41
Background to the Colonisation of New Zealand	42
The Treaty of Waitangi	45
The New Zealand Company's 'Employment Policy'.....	46
The New Zealand Company's Settlements.....	49
Wellington Settlement.....	49
New Plymouth Settlement	51
Nelson Settlement.....	52
The Otago Settlement	57
The Canterbury Settlement	58
The Auckland Settlement.....	60
The Birth of New Zealand Statehood.....	61
Conclusion.....	64
CHAPTER THREE: THE IMMIGRATION AND PUBLIC WORKS ACT AND THE RISE OF EMPLOYMENT/UNEMPLOYMENT POLICY, 1870-90	
Introduction.....	66
State Responses to Unemployment	67
Unemployment in the 1880s	70
The Growth of Job Creation.....	71
The 'Right to Work' and State Response.....	75

The 'Deserving' and 'undeserving' Unemployed	78
Public Works and Rural Unemployment	80
Policy Makers' Conflicting Views Over Relief Works	82
The Dilemma of the State	87
Conclusion.....	89

CHAPTER FOUR: THE DEPARTMENT OF LABOUR AND THE COOPERATIVE WORKS SCHEME AND UNEMPLOYMENT, 1891-1912

Introduction.....	90
The 1890 General Election and its Results	91
The Department of Labour and Unemployment Relief	93
The Cooperative Works Scheme	98
Conditions of Employment.....	113
The Parliamentary Opposition's Position on Unemployment Relief	114
The Decline of the Liberal Party	116
Conclusion.....	118

CHAPTER FIVE: THE "NO WORK, NO PAY" POLICY, 1926-35

Introduction.....	120
Unemployment Relief Prior to the Unemployment Act 1930	121
The Unemployment Act 1930 and Unemployment Relief	127
Reaction to the Board's Work Schemes.....	131
The Policy of 'No Work, No Pay' and its Consequences	142
Conclusion.....	146

CHAPTER SIX: FROM UNEMPLOYMENT RELIEF TO FULL EMPLOYMENT POLICY, 1935-49

Introduction.....	147
The Labour Party and the 1935 General Election.....	148
Labour's Legislative Measures	150
The Social Security Scheme	152
Labour's Responses to Unemployment and Trends up to September 1939	154
Unemployment and the War	164
The Labour Government and the Immediate Postwar Years	166
Conclusion.....	169

CHAPTER SEVEN: THE RE-EMERGENCE OF UNEMPLOYMENT AND THE DECLINE OF STATE COMMITMENT TO FULL EMPLOYMENT POLICY, 1977-84

Introduction.....	171
Public Reaction and State Responses to Unemployment	172
Duration of Employment on Job Creation Schemes.....	179
Summary of Phase One	180
Phase Two of State Responses to Unemployment 1981-84	180
Blame the System Not the Victim	181
Conflicting Views on Unemployment	188
Summary of Phase Two	194
Conclusion.....	194

CHAPTER EIGHT: THE SHIFT IN STATE POLICY EMPHASIS FROM JOB CREATION TO TRAINING AND UNEMPLOYMENT BENEFITS AS THE MAINSTAY OF STATE RESPONSES TO UNEMPLOYMENT, 1984-90

Introduction.....	196
Background to the Fourth Labour Government's Economic and Social Policies	197
The Social and Economic Policies of the Fourth Labour Government and the Role of Treasury and the Private Sector	198
The Labour Government and its View of Unemployment	202
The Economic Summit Conferences 1984	204
The Employment Promotion Conference	206
From Job Creation to Training	206
Administration and Implementation of ACCESS Schemes	217
The Access Training Scheme and its Results	219
Implications of the Shift in Policy Emphasis	223
Conclusion.....	226

CONCLUSIONS

Introduction.....	228
The Influence of Ideas About Work.....	232
Continuities, Fluctuation and Change in Job Creation Policy.....	237
Continuities.....	237
Fluctuations and Changes	238
Comparisons and Contrasts.....	239
Conclusion.....	242

APPENDICES

Appendix I: Unemployment Act 1930.....	245
Appendix II: Social Security Act 1938	253
Appendix III: Summary of Job Creation Schemes Initiated by the Unemployment Board (1930-1935)	255
Appendix IV: Summary of the Main Features of Job Creation Schemes in Phase One (1977-1980)	262
Appendix V: Conditions Employment and Training on Schemes for the Unemployed, 1984-1990	269

TABLES

Table 1: Full-Time Labour Force: Historical Summary	272
Table 2A: Number of Unemployed Assisted to Employment by the Labour Department 1892-1930	274
Table 2B: Numbers in Receipt of Relief From the Employment Promotion Fund 1931-1939	274
Table 3: Registered Unemployed, Monthly Average 1947-1990	275
Table 4: Numbers of Males Registered as Unemployed and Numbers in Receipt of Relief From the Unemployment/Employment Fund, 1931-1938.....	276
Table 5: Average Minimum Weekly Adult Wage-Rates Between 1931-1935	277

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Documents of the Crown	281
Press Releases	282
British Act of Parliament	282
New Zealand Acts of Parliament.....	282
Appendices to the Journals of the House of Representatives	282
Miscellaneous Crown Documents	284
Newspapers of Magazines	285
Pamphlets.....	286
New Zealand History: A Select Bibliography	287
Articles	289
Unpublished Papers	292
Books.....	293

ABSTRACT

New Zealand, for much of the present century has been regarded by other English speaking nations as boldly experimenting in the development of social policy; but is currently taking the dismantling of the welfare state further than most western countries. This thesis provides a historical analysis of job creation for the unemployed, which was provided by the state on a relatively large scale (relative to the size of the New Zealand population), from the earliest days of colonisation in the 1840s until it was virtually phased out in the mid-1980s.

The thesis examines the competing ideas and interests which conditioned the adoption, growth, fluctuations in the eventual demise of job creation as the mainstay of the New Zealand state's responses to unemployment. In particular, it examines the impact of the various sets of ideas about work and human nature which were brought to New Zealand in the course of colonisation by the British; and the extent to which the colonisers were able to recreate patterns of work and dependency from Britain.

The study of job creation in New Zealand is a history of conflict based on class interests. One task of the thesis is to show how the state has responded in different periods to demands from working men for the 'right to work'. However, it is also a history of the reinforcing of ancient divisions of labour along lines of gender and ethnicity, and of the relative privileging of 'pakeha' (white, European) men in terms of their access to paid work provided by the state.

Job creation for the unemployed has been a site of both conflict and compromise between (mainly male) labour and capital throughout the post-colonisation period in New Zealand. This thesis provides an in-depth study of the ways in which such conflict and compromise contributed to the development, form and eventual demise of job creation in New Zealand.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study has been an extremely rewarding experience, although not without its debts. In particular I am indebted to Massey University Librarian in charge of the Official Publications, Jill Best and to the staff of the Interloan Section for securing data located in various institutions in New Zealand. I would also like to express my indebtedness to the staff of the National Archives and Turnbull Library in Wellington for their assistance in locating and suggesting material to me in the course of this study. Thanks go to my supervisors who have been endlessly patient: Dr Celia Briar as my chief supervisor and to Professor Ian Shirley and Chris Eichbaum for their valuable suggestions. Finally, but in no way the least thanks to Tracy Eagle for professionally setting the final version.

This thesis would not have been possible without the Commonwealth Scholarship awarded to me by the Vice Chancellors' Committee in 1990. I would also like to thank most sincerely Professor Ian Shirley for securing additional funding for me and my daughter Mukabantu after the expiry of the Commonwealth Scholarship to enable me complete my writing up. Finally I would like to express gratitude to Janet Milne for the support and love she gave to my daughter Mukabantu.

This thesis is dedicated to my late wife and best friend, Agness Mubitelela.

GLOSSARY OF MAORI AND NEW ZEALAND TERMS

Aotearoa:	The Land of the Long White Cloud (New Zealand)
Mana:	Influence, authority, social standing
Iwi:	Tribe
Maori:	The inhabitants of New Zealand prior to British colonisation in 1840.
Pakeha:	White person, European
Tapu:	Sacred, prohibited

New Zealand English Terms

Backblocks:	Remote rural districts.
'Criminally lazy poor':	Workers who were regularly unemployed, many of them casual workers.
'Helpful poor':	The unemployed whose unemployment was considered as not of their own making. These were workers who rarely sought state assistance and were prepared to accept whatever work was on offer.
'Red Fed':	Member of the New Zealand Federation of Labour.
Non-reproductive work:	Public works involving improvement of streets, roads, &c., improvement of domains, parks and reserves, improvement of schools and hospitals.
Reproductive work:	Public works involving land-drainage, general land development, erosion protection, improvement of backblocks roads, afforestation, reclamation, &c.
Section:	Portion of land.
'Swaggies':	Mobile landless labourers who met the seasonal labour requirements of the large pastoral landholdings in the nineteenth-century.

ABBREVIATIONS

AJHR	<u>Appendices to the Journals of the House of Representatives</u>
Census	<u>New Zealand Population Census</u>
CSE	Conference of Socialist Economists
EPC	<u>Employment Promotion Conference</u>
ESC	<u>Economic Summit Conference</u>
JALC	<u>Journal and Appendix of the Legislative Council</u>
JDL	<u>Journal of the Department of Labour</u>
MSC	Manpower Service Commission (UK)
MMP	Mixed Member Proportional Representation
NZC	New Zealand Company
NZDL	New Zealand Department of Labour
NZIHA	New Zealand Institute of International Affairs
NZLP	New Zealand Labour Party
NZOYB	<u>New Zealand Official Year Book</u>
NZPD	<u>New Zealand Parliamentary Debates</u>
NZS	<u>New Zealand Statutes</u>
OECD	<u>Organisation of Economic Co-operation and Development</u>
PEP	Project Employment Programme
PSA	Public Service Association
REACs	Regional Employment and ACCESS Councils
RCSP	<u>Royal Commission on Social Policy</u>
SNZ	<u>Statistics of New Zealand</u>