

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

We Made This Song.

**The Group Song Writing Processes
of Three Adolescent Rock Bands**

by Vicki Thorpe

A thesis
submitted to the New Zealand School of Music
in the fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree of
Master of Music
in History and Literature of Music

New Zealand School of Music

2007

Abstract

In garages, practice rooms and classrooms, young people are composing music in rock and pop bands; engaged in working together in the shared enterprise of group music making. This study aims to contribute to scholarly knowledge through describing, analysing and interpreting the collaborative compositional processes (song writing) of three teenage rock bands. A theoretical model was developed and is applied to an analysis of the compositional processes of each group. Communication within each of the bands is analysed in terms of musical, non-verbal and verbal communication. The teaching and cooperative learning that occurred within each of the bands is presented, and each band is described in terms of a *community of practice*. An analysis of the compositional processes reveals that the three bands employed similar methods to generate ideas and construct their songs. However, when the data are viewed from a number of other theoretical perspectives, it is clear that two of the bands composed collaboratively, working together within mutually supportive, highly focussed and respectful communities; and that the third band's songs were the work of a single composer, achieved through the cooperation and participation of the other band members. The young people in all three bands were highly engaged in self-directed music learning, finding meaning and identity in the process.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Dr Richard Hardie, my thesis supervisor, for his expertise, patience and enthusiastic support of this project. I am grateful to Professor Janice Wearmouth for assisting me in exploring theoretical perspectives, and for very timely advice and feedback. Thanks to Dorothy Buchanan, Merryn Dunmill, Mark Stone, Julian Ward and Susan Kaiser for their time, advice and expertise. I am grateful to the VUW College of Education for awarding me the grants that helped make the writing of this work possible, and to Warren Butcher for his invaluable advice and technical support in managing the video data. I would also like to thank the principals and teachers of the schools I worked in during this research for their willingness to allow me access to their students and their classrooms.

I am grateful to Julie Crosland and Karen Coulton for their encouragement, proof reading skills, access to their libraries and for their wonderful, warm hospitality, and also to Andrea Milligan, Kathryn Smith and my parents. Special thanks go to my partner Philip Aitken for his encouragement, support, tolerance and love while writing this work.

Finally, I would like to thank the young musicians who participated in this project. They are at its heart, and I am very grateful for their openness, friendliness, and tolerance of my presence while they were working.

To my friend Kathryn Smith

Table of Contents

Abstract	i
Acknowledgements	ii
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
1.1 Playing and composing in a band.....	1
1.2 Formulation of the research questions	2
1.3 Theoretical Perspectives.....	3
1.3.1 The Creative Process and Models of Composing	3
1.3.2 Other theoretical perspectives	4
1.4 Method of enquiry	5
1.5 A brief history of the teaching and assessment of composition at senior level in New Zealand secondary schools	6
1.5.1 Composition and assessment in New Zealand schools 1904 to 1993 ...	6
1.5.2 Standards-based assessment 1995 – 2007	9
1.5.3 Popular and contemporary music making outside of the classroom....	12
1.6 Summary	15
Chapter 2 Review of Literature	16
2.1 Introduction	16
2.2 The individual compositional processes of children and adolescents at school.....	17
2.2.1 Early studies (1986 – 1989)	17
2.2.2 More recent studies (1998 – 2004).....	21
2.3 Group Composing by Children and Adolescents at School	26
2.4 Adolescents Playing and Composing Popular Music Outside of School....	35
2.5 Formal and informal music learning.....	40
2.6 Theories of social learning	42
2.6.1 Socio-cultural Learning Theories and <i>Communities of Practice</i>	43
2.6.2 Cooperative Learning Theory and <i>Positive Interdependence</i>	45
2.7 Summary	48
Chapter 3 Research Methodology.....	49
3.1 Introduction	49
3.2 Qualitative Research.....	49
3.3 Case Study Research methodology.....	51
3.4 Size and scope of the study	53
3.5 My stance as a researcher.....	55
3.6 Method of Enquiry	57
3.6.1 Data.....	57
3.6.2 Collecting the data and ethical considerations	58
3.6.3 Timeframe	62
3.6.4 Summary of data collected.....	64
3.6.5 Limitations of the data	64
3.7 Data Analysis Methodology.....	66
3.7.1 Formulation of the theoretical model of collaborative composition	66
3.7.2 Creating the theoretical model	67
3.7.3 Modification of the theoretical model during analysis.....	71
3.7.4 Coding and graphing the data.....	74
3.7.5 Other Kinds of Data Analysis	76
3.7.6 Validity	77
3.8 Summary	78

Chapter 4 Case studies	79
4.1 Introduction	79
4.2 Case study: <i>Junior</i>	79
4.2.1 Set-up.....	80
4.2.2 Songs worked on during the observations	81
4.2.3 Applying compositional model to the data: Phase 1	82
4.2.4 Applying the compositional model: Phase 2	84
4.3 Case Study: <i>Senior</i>	86
4.3.1 Set-up.....	87
4.3.2 Songs worked on during the observations	88
4.3.3 Applying the compositional model to the data: Phase 1.....	89
4.3.4 Applying the compositional model to the data: Phase 2.....	91
4.4 Case Study: <i>Boys</i>	93
4.4.1 Background to the data	93
4.4.2 Set-up.....	94
4.5 Songs worked on during the observations	95
4.5.1 Applying the theoretical model to the data: Phase 1	95
4.6 Applying the theoretical model to the data: Phase 2	97
4.7 Analysis of Observation 2 data.....	98
4.8 The theoretical model of collaborative composition and <i>Boys</i>	100
4.9 Comparing the analysed data across the three cases	101
4.9.1 The early stages in the composition of a song	101
4.9.2 The middle stages of a song's composition	103
4.9.3 Comparing the end of a song's composition with how it began	104
4.9.4 Time spent in phases and the act of creativity	106
4.9.5 Lyrics and vocal lines.....	107
4.10 Summary	110
Chapter 5 Interpretative Findings.....	111
5.1 Introduction	111
5.2. Communication	111
5.2.1 Verbal communication	112
5.2.2 Musical and Gestural Communication	116
5.3 Teaching and Learning	119
5.3.1 <i>Senior</i>	119
5.3.2 Teaching and Learning: <i>Junior</i>	123
5.4 Teaching and Learning: <i>Boys</i>	128
5.5 Ownership of the compositions	130
5.6 Summary	131
Chapter 6 Conclusion.....	133
6.1. The compositional processes of <i>Senior</i> , <i>Junior</i> and <i>Boys</i>	133
6.2 Informal and formal music learning	137
6.2.1 Conditions needed to support collaborative rock bands	138
6.3 The formal assessment of collaborative composition.....	141
6.4 Discussion.....	144
Bibliography	146

Appendices

Appendix A: NCEA Music/ Arts Related Standards Levels 1-4	152
Appendix B: Graphed data of <i>Junior's</i> Composing Processes.....	157
Appendix C: Graphed data of <i>Senior's</i> Composing Processes	160
Appendix D: Graphed data of <i>Boys' Composing Processes</i>	163
Appendix E: Participant Questionnaire.....	165
Appendix F: Interview Questions	170
Appendix G: Letters of Introduction and Information	174
Appendix H: Consent Forms.....	177

List of Figures

Figure 2.1: Webster's model of creativity in music.....	19
Figure 2.2: Burnard and Younker's model of creative thinking in music	22
Figure 2.3: McGillen and McMillan's model of group composing.....	34
Figure 3.1: The theoretical model prior to data analysis	70
Figure 3.2 Example of the coding and analysis chart.....	71
Figure 3.3: The theoretical model modified in response to the data analysis ...	73
Figure 3.4: Graphing the coded data	75
Figure 3.5: Predicted movement through the stages over time	76
Figure 4.1: <i>Junior</i> positions when working together.....	81
Figure 4.2: <i>Junior</i> jamming to an idea by Reese, Observation 2	84
Figure 4.3: Phase 2 compositional stages of <i>Suicidal Love</i> , Observation 2.....	85
Figure 4.4: Set up-for <i>Senior</i>	87
Figure 4.5: Phase 1 compositional stages.....	89
Figure 4.6: The song is going nowhere	92
Figure 4.7: The set-up of <i>Boys</i> during Observation 1.....	94
Figure 4.8: Phase 1 stages of <i>Cross the Line</i>	96
Figure 4.9: The middle of Observation 2	99
Figure 4.10: Comparing the middle of a song's composition	104
Figure 4.11: Comparing early Phase 1 with late Phase 2 stages (<i>Senior</i>)	105

List of Tables

Table 1: Burnard and Younker's composing pathways	23
Table 2: Fautley's model of group composing	31
Table 3: Differences between formal and informal music learning.....	40
Table 4: Typology of Attributes for the selection of cases.....	55
Table 5: Ten group compositional stages.....	69
Table 6: <i>Junior's</i> songs	82
Table 7: <i>Senior's</i> songs	88
Table 8: <i>Boys' songs</i>	95