

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

# **Exploring the evolvability of resistance determinants in bacteria**

*A dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment for the degree of*

**Doctor of Philosophy**

**In Biochemistry**

*At Massey University, Albany New Zealand*

**Paulina Hanson-Manful**

**-2013-**



## **ABSTRACT**

Antibiotic resistance poses a major risk to human and animal health. It has impacted on morbidity and mortality rates and has increased hospitalisation costs worldwide. To stand a fighting chance in this losing battle, it is important to understand the biochemical and evolutionary pathways that give rise to resistance. The goals of this thesis were to gain mechanistic insights into new resistance pathways and to explore whether protein functions associated with resistance could be evolved artificially.

In the first part of this thesis, I report that many pre-existing gene products in a non-pathogenic bacterium (*E. coli*) are able to impart resistance towards different classes of antibiotics. Investigating the relationship between fitness and resistance revealed that it was complex and as a result, it was difficult to predict how resistance would impact on bacterial fitness. It is apparent that the reservoir of resistance elements in non-pathogenic bacteria is much larger than previously appreciated, and may provide a rich source of resistance genes that could be co-opted by pathogenic bacteria.

In the second part of the thesis, specific examples were selected to explore the evolvability of resistance functions. Weak resistance activities of carbonic anhydrase and three proteins of unknown native function (YeaD, YdfW and YejG) could not be improved by directed evolution experiments in this study. Nonetheless, a novel multi-step route to high level tobramycin resistance involving YejG was discovered. Over-expression of YejG in the presence of a chromosomal mutation in the *fusA* gene (G1478T) endowed the bacterium with maximal resistance to tobramycin. In addition, a function of YejG in mediating an early entry into the log phase of growth has been uncovered.

Overall, the results in this thesis have revealed that there are even more pathways to resistance than previously appreciated. Weak resistance functions may not necessarily be easily evolvable, however, they may facilitate the emergence of mutations that confer higher levels of resistance. Ultimately, it is hoped that gaining a deeper insight into resistance pathways and how they evolve will help in the development of the new drugs that we so desperately need.

[Blank page]

*Dedicated to my Father, Mr Alex Hanson-Manful, thank you for being my source of inspiration and for giving me the opportunity and investing in me all these years.*

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

First and foremost, I would like to thank my Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ, without whom none of this would have been possible. Secondly I would like to thank my lovely, kind and patient husband, Danny, for his tremendous help and for always putting a smile on my face and making this journey as smooth and stress free as it was. I also extend my gratitude to my lovely parents, Alex and Helena, for their support (both emotional and financial) and to my siblings, Richard, Erasmus and Albert for always reminding me to laugh. I also thank my extended family (the Mwiinga's, Josephine, Emmanuel and El Shaddai) for their love and support.

I thank my awesome supervisor, Dr. Wayne Patrick, for helping me pursue my passion in science and for making this experience enjoyable. His kindness (always buying us meals), constructive feedback and willingness to help his students excel have taught me more than just science. His incredible skill of recognising and selecting interesting, talented but insane students to join our lab massively contributed to this fun and exciting journey. I would also like to thank his wife Dr. Monica Gerth for always being willing to help me whenever I needed her. I thank all of the Patrick lab members (both current and old: Ilana, Ankita, Hayden, Susan, Danni, Mack, Matteo and Matilda) for allowing me to forget that I was doing a PhD because we had so much fun in the lab. I can honestly say that there was not one dull moment during my studies. My experience in New Zealand would have simply not been the same without their friendship, advice and help. I would also like to thank Laura Nigon and Natasha Le Roux for their kindness, support and friendship and Dr. Valerie Soo for her time and help during my PhD research.

I thank my secondary supervisor, Prof. Paul Rainey, and my adopted supervisor, Dr. Austen Ganley, for making time when I needed their help and for their contribution. I also thank Prof. Greg Cook (University of Otago), Dr. Andrew Cridge (University of Otago) and Dr. Heather Hendrickson (Massey University) for helping me with the membrane potential, ribosome interaction and phage transduction experiments, respectively. I am grateful to Laura Nigon, Ilana Gerber and Susan Morton for providing technical assistance for the fitness experiments.

I thank everyone in Building 9 and 11 for their friendship and especially to all those who sacrificed their time to read my thesis (you know who you are), I really appreciate it. A big thank you to Dr. Peter Lind for the time he spent with me discussing my thesis. I also thank the Institute Administrators Muharram, Vesna and Colleen for helping me out with various paper works.

Financial support for my PhD is from the Royal Society of New Zealand's Marsden Fund/Maurice & Phyllis Paykel Trust/Lottery Health Research Committee. Travel grants were from the NZ Society for Biochemistry and Molecular Biology, the Ministry of Science and Innovation and JSPS (Japan Society for the Promotion of Science). I am grateful to these institutions/societies for funding me.

Finally, I would like to thank all of my friends (all over the world) for their support and encouragement. I know that this journey would not have been the same without any one of you.



# Contents

<b><i>ABSTRACT</i></b>	<b><i>i</i></b>
<b><i>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</i></b>	<b><i>iv</i></b>
<b><i>LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS</i></b>	<b><i>xi</i></b>
<b><i>LIST OF TABLES</i></b>	<b><i>xii</i></b>
<b><i>CHAPTER 1</i></b>	<b><i>1</i></b>
<b>BACKGROUND</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>1.1 ANTIBIOTICS</b>	<b>3</b>
1.1.1 THE DISCOVERY AND USAGE OF ANTIBIOTICS WORLDWIDE	3
<b>1.2 ANTIBIOTIC RESISTANCE</b>	<b>5</b>
1.2.1 EMERGENCE AND DISSEMINATION OF ANTIBIOTIC RESISTANCE	5
1.2.2 THE ORIGIN OF ANTIBIOTIC RESISTANCE	7
1.2.3 ANTIBIOTIC RESISTANCE VIA ACQUISITION AND MUTATION	9
<b>1.3 FITNESS COST OF ANTIBIOTIC RESISTANCE</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>1.4 PROMISCUITY AND ORIGINS OF NEW FUNCTIONS</b>	<b>12</b>
1.4.1 PROMISCUITY	12
1.4.2 EVOLUTION OF NEW GENES	15
<b>1.5 INVESTIGATING PROMISCUITY</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>1.6 AIMS OF THIS THESIS</b>	<b>19</b>
1.6.1 THE ORIGIN OF THIS PROJECT	19
1.6.2 SPECIFIC AIMS	19
<b><i>CHAPTER 2</i></b>	<b><i>21</i></b>
<b>2.1 MINIMUM INHIBITORY CONCENTRATION AND FITNESS ASSAYS</b>	<b>22</b>
<b>2.2 FOCUS OF THIS CHAPTER</b>	<b>22</b>
<b>2.3 RESULTS</b>	<b>24</b>
2.3.1 DETERMINING THE MIC VALUES OF THE ASKA STRAINS	24
2.3.2 RELATIVE FITNESS OF THE ASKA STRAINS IN THE ABSENCE OF ANTIBIOTIC	28
<b>2.4 DISCUSSION</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>2.5 MATERIALS AND METHODS</b>	<b>35</b>
2.5.1 ANTIBIOTIC SUSCEPTIBILITY TESTING	35
2.5.1.1 MIC E-Test method	36
2.5.1.2 MIC microdilution method	36
2.5.2 FITNESS EXPERIMENT	37
2.5.2.1 Creating lacZ-marked control strain	37
2.5.2.2 Fitness assays	38

<b>3.1 INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>40</b>
3.1.1 DIRECTED EVOLUTION ON <i>CYN</i> T, <i>YEAD</i> AND <i>YDFW</i> GENES	40
3.1.2 DIRECTED EVOLUTION	40
3.1.3 CARBONIC ANHYDRASE	41
3.1.4 YEAD	43
3.1.5 YDFW	44
<b>3.2 RESULTS</b>	<b>46</b>
3.2.1 <i>CYN</i> T ERROR-PRONE PCR LIBRARY	46
3.2.1.1 Selecting cynT ‘winners’	48
3.2.1.2 DNA sequencing of cynT mutants	48
3.2.1.3 Retransformation tests and potential mutations in chromosomal genes	50
3.2.2 <i>YEAD</i> ERROR-PRONE PCR LIBRARY	53
3.2.2.1 Selecting and testing yeaD ‘winners’	55
3.2.3 <i>YDFW</i> ERROR-PRONE PCR LIBRARY	56
3.2.3.1 Selecting and testing ydfW ‘winners’	58
<b>3.3 DISCUSSION</b>	<b>60</b>
<b>3.4 MATERIALS AND METHODS</b>	<b>64</b>
3.4.1 REMOVING GFP TAG	64
3.4.2 CREATING A MUTANT LIBRARY	65
3.4.2.1 Error-prone PCR	65
3.4.2.2 Vector and Insert preparation	67
3.4.2.3 Preparation of a test library	67
3.4.2.4 Construction of a full-size library	68
3.4.3 ANALYSING THE LIBRARY COMPOSITION	69
3.4.4 DETERMINING MIC VALUES USING AGAR DILUTION METHOD	70
3.4.5 SELECTION OF ‘WINNERS’ FROM LIBRARY	71
3.4.6 ANALYSING SEQUENCES OF ‘WINNERS’	72
3.4.7 RETRANSFORMATION TESTS	73
3.4.8 CURING EXPERIMENT	73

<b>4.1 INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>76</b>
4.1.1 DIRECTED EVOLUTION ON <i>YEJG</i>	76
4.1.2 YEJG	76
<b>4.2 RESULTS</b>	<b>78</b>
4.2.1 <i>YEJG</i> ERROR-PRONE PCR LIBRARY	78
4.2.2 SELECTING <i>YEJG</i> ‘WINNERS’ (TOBRAMYCIN)	80
4.2.3 DNA SEQUENCING OF <i>YEJG</i> MUTANTS	80
4.2.4 RETRANSFORMATION TESTS AND ENRICHMENT EXPERIMENTS	81
4.2.5 SELECTION OF <i>YEJG</i> ‘WINNERS’ (APRAMYCIN)	83
4.2.6 RETRANSFORMATION TESTS AND INVESTIGATION OF CHROMOSOMAL <i>YEJG</i> GENE	84
<b>4.3 INVESTIGATING YEJG IN <i>E. COLI</i> MDS42 CELLS</b>	<b>85</b>
4.3.1 TOBRAMYCIN AND APRAMYCIN RESISTANCE OF YEJG-EXPRESSING <i>E. COLI</i> MDS42 STRAIN	85

4.3.2	SELECTION OF <i>E. COLI</i> MDS42 <i>yejG</i> 'WINNERS'	86
4.3.3	INVESTIGATING THE IMPORTANCE OF YejG IN TOBRAMYCIN RESISTANT MUTANTS	87
4.3.4	DNA SEQUENCING OF <i>yejG</i> INSERT FROM CLONES A AND B	89
4.3.5	<i>FUSA</i> GENE MUTATION IN <i>E. COLI</i> MDS42 <i>yejG</i> (HTD) CLONE	90
4.3.6	RESISTANCE OF <i>E. COLI</i> MDS42 <i>yejG</i> (HTD) TO OTHER AMINOGLYCOSIDE ANTIBIOTICS	92
<b>4.4</b>	<b>DISCUSSION</b>	<b>94</b>
<b>4.5</b>	<b>MATERIALS AND METHODS</b>	<b>99</b>
4.5.1	REMOVING GFP	99
4.5.2	CREATING A MUTANT LIBRARY	99
4.5.2.1	Error-prone PCR	99
4.5.2.2	Vector and Insert preparation	100
4.5.2.3	Preparation of a test library	100
4.5.2.4	Construction of a full-size library	100
4.5.3	ANALYSING THE LIBRARY COMPOSITION	100
4.5.4	DETERMINING MIC VALUES USING AGAR DILUTION METHOD	100
4.5.5	SELECTION OF 'WINNERS' FROM LIBRARY	101
4.5.6	ANALYSING SEQUENCES OF 'WINNERS'	101
4.5.7	RETRANSFORMATION TESTS	101
4.5.8	TRANSFORMING <i>E. COLI</i> MDS42 CELLS WITH <i>yejG</i> LIBRARY	101
4.5.9	RECOVERING <i>E. COLI</i> MDS42 CELLS OFF LIBRARY PLATES	102
4.5.10	EXPERIMENTS INVOLVING THE <i>E. COLI</i> MDS42 <i>yejG</i> LIBRARY	102
4.5.11	REPLACING PCA24N WITH PBLUESCRIPT PLASMIDS	102
4.5.12	PREPARING DNA FOR WHOLE GENOME SEQUENCING	103

## **CHAPTER 5**

**104**

<b>5.1</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>105</b>
<b>5.2</b>	<b>RESULTS</b>	<b>107</b>
5.2.1	TESTING THE INTERACTION BETWEEN YejG AND THE RIBOSOME	107
5.2.2	MEASURING TOBRAMYCIN RESISTANCE AT VARYING PH VALUES	109
5.2.3	MEASURING THE MEMBRANE POTENTIAL OF YejG-EXPRESSING CELLS.	112
<b>5.3</b>	<b>DISCUSSION</b>	<b>114</b>
<b>5.4</b>	<b>MATERIALS AND METHODS</b>	<b>117</b>
5.4.1	TESTING INTERACTION BETWEEN YejG AND THE RIBOSOME	117
5.4.1.1	Testing the anti-ribosomal antibody	117
5.4.1.2	Preparation of ribosomal fractions	118
5.4.1.3	Western blotting	118
5.4.1.4	Protein over-expression, purification and dialysis of YejG	119
5.4.2	PREPARING MINIMAL AGAR PLATES WITH VARYING PH.	120
5.4.2.1	Preparing buffers	120
5.4.2.2	Preparing minimal agar plates with different pHs	120
5.4.2.3	Determining MIC values at varying pHs	121
5.4.3	MEASURING MEMBRANE POTENTIALS	122

<b>6.1 INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>124</b>
6.1.1 RED RECOMBINASE SYSTEM AND GENERALIZED TRANSDUCTION	125
<b>6.2 RESULTS</b>	<b>127</b>
6.2.1 ATTEMPTS AT MUTAGENESIS USING THE RED RECOMBINASE SYSTEM	127
6.2.2 P1 GENERAL PHAGE TRANSDUCTION	133
6.2.3 FITNESS ASSAYS INVOLVING THE <i>FUS</i> A(G1478T) MUTATION AND YejG	135
6.2.4 GROWTH ASSAYS	139
<b>6.3 DISCUSSION</b>	<b>144</b>
<b>6.4 MATERIALS AND METHODS</b>	<b>150</b>
6.4.1 ATTEMPTS AT MUTAGENESIS	150
6.4.1.1 $\lambda$ Red recombinase system	150
6.4.1.2 Quick and Easy E. coli Gene deletion kit (Gene Bridges GmbH)	152
6.4.1.3 Phage transduction	154
6.4.1.3.1 Preparation of P1 lysates	154
6.4.1.3.2 Phage titration	154
6.4.1.3.3 Phage transduction	155
6.4.2 PCR DISCRIMINATION ASSAY	156
6.4.3 FITNESS EXPERIMENTS	157
6.4.3.1 Creating lacZ-marked strains	157
6.4.3.2 Creating the pWhite plasmid	157
6.4.3.3 Replacing pCA24N-yejG(HTD) with the pWhite plasmid	158
6.4.3.4 Fitness assays	158
6.4.4 GROWTH ASSAYS	159

<b>7.1 THE BACTERIAL RESISTOME</b>	<b>161</b>
<b>7.2 EVOLUTION OF ANTIBIOTIC RESISTANCE</b>	<b>162</b>
<b>7.3 CONCLUDING REMARKS</b>	<b>163</b>

<b>I.1 REAGENTS</b>	<b>166</b>
<b>I.2 GROWTH MEDIA AND ANTIBIOTICS</b>	<b>166</b>
<b>I.3 BACTERIAL STRAINS</b>	<b>167</b>
<b>I.4 PLASMID</b>	<b>168</b>
<b>I.5 OLIGONUCLEOTIDES</b>	<b>169</b>
<b>I.6 DNA SEQUENCING</b>	<b>174</b>
<b>I.7 ANALYTICAL SOFTWARE</b>	<b>174</b>
<b>I.8 PCR SCREENING</b>	<b>174</b>
<b>I.9 AGAROSE GEL ELECTROPHORESIS</b>	<b>174</b>
<b>I.10 DNA EXTRACTION AND PURIFICATION</b>	<b>175</b>
<b>I.11 DNA QUANTIFICATION</b>	<b>175</b>
<b>I.12 RESTRICTION DIGEST AND LIGATION</b>	<b>175</b>

I.13 PREPARING ELECTROCOMPETENT CELLS	176
I.14 TRANSFORMATION	177
I.15 SDS-PAGE	178
 <i><u>APPENDIX II</u></i>	 <i><u>180</u></i>
 <i>STATEMENT OF CONTRIBUTIONS</i>	 <i>180</i>
 <i><u>APPENDIX III</u></i>	 <i><u>183</u></i>
 <i>PUBLICATIONS ARISING FROM THIS WORK</i>	 <i>183</i>
 <i><u>REFERENCES</u></i>	 <i><u>207</u></i>

## List of illustrations

<b>Figure 1.</b> The history of anti-microbial agents (redrawn from Wright, 2007) .....	3
<b>Figure 2.</b> Sites of action of anti-microbial agents (modified from Neu, 1992).....	4
<b>Figure 3.</b> Molecular mechanisms of antibiotic resistance (taken from Hawkey, 1998) ....	9
<b>Figure 4.</b> Divergence of modern enzymes from a multi-functional ancestral enzyme (modified from Khersonsky et al., 2006).....	13
<b>Figure 5.</b> Diagram shows innovation as an initial step before amplification (taken from Bergthorsson et al., 2007).....	16
<b>Figure 6.</b> Relative fitness, <i>W</i> , of <i>E. coli</i> DH5 $\alpha$ -E cells over-expressing ASKA genes in competition with a neutrally marked control ( <i>lacZ</i> -tagged).....	29
<b>Figure 7.</b> The function of carbonic anhydrase.....	42
<b>Figure 8.</b> Structure of YeaD from <i>Salmonella typhimurium</i> (PDB code: 2HTB).....	44
<b>Figure 9.</b> Approximate locations of primer pairs designed to amplify the <i>gyrA</i> gene .....	52
<b>Figure 10.</b> The effect of external pH on the membrane potential ( $\Delta\Psi$ ) and drug resistance .....	105
<b>Figure 11.</b> Testing the activity of the anti-ribosome antibody .....	107
<b>Figure 12.</b> Western blot of YejG and ribosomal proteins from <i>E. coli</i> DH5 $\alpha$ -E + and – IPTG cultures .....	109
<b>Figure 13.</b> Effect of external pH on tobramycin sensitivity of <i>E. coli</i> DH5 $\alpha$ -E YejG- and GFP-expressing strains.....	111
<b>Figure 14.</b> Growth curves of wild-type <i>E. coli</i> DH5 $\alpha$ -E and YejG- and GFP-expressing strains in the presence of IPTG .....	112
<b>Figure 15.</b> Membrane potential of wild-type <i>E. coli</i> DH5 $\alpha$ -E and YejG- and GFP- expressing strains.....	113
<b>Figure 16.</b> Successful recombination using the kanamycin resistance marker .....	128
<b>Figure 17.</b> Designing primers for PCR discrimination to detect the <i>fusA</i> (G1478T) mutation .....	129
<b>Figure 18.</b> Designing single-stranded oligonucleotides that correspond to the lagging strand.....	131
<b>Figure 19.</b> Gel of PCR discrimination assay .....	132
<b>Figure 20.</b> Successful P1 phage transduction of kanamycin marker .....	134
<b>Figure 21.</b> YejG-expressing cells show early entry into the log phase .....	140
<b>Figure 22.</b> Cells carrying the <i>fusA</i> (G1478T) mutation show slightly delayed entry into the log phase.....	141
<b>Figure 23.</b> Cells carrying the <i>fusA</i> (G1478T) mutation and over-expressing YejG also show early entry into the log phase.....	141
<b>Figure 24.</b> YejG over-expression allows cells carrying the <i>fusA</i> (G1478T) mutation an early growth compared to cells with the wild-type <i>fusA</i> over-expressing GFP .....	142
<b>Figure 25.</b> Effect of YejG variant in the presence of the <i>fusA</i> (G1478T) .....	143
<b>Figure 26.</b> Diagram showing qualitative outcomes of fitness experiments involving the <i>fusA</i> (G1478T) mutation and YejG over-expression.....	146

## List of Tables

<b>Table 1.</b> Drug resistance data for <i>E. coli</i> DH5 $\alpha$ -E cells over-expressing ASKA genes.....	26
<b>Table 2.</b> Products of the ASKA genes.....	27
<b>Table 3.</b> The mutational spectrum of the <i>cynT</i> mutant library.....	47
<b>Table 4.</b> Composition of the <i>cynT</i> mutant library as estimated by PEDEL-AA.....	47
<b>Table 5.</b> Mutations in five selected carbonic anhydrase variants .....	50
<b>Table 6.</b> The mutational spectrum of the <i>yeaD</i> mutant library .....	54
<b>Table 7.</b> Composition of the <i>yeaD</i> mutant library as estimated by PEDEL-AA.....	54
<b>Table 8.</b> The mutational spectrum of the <i>ydfW</i> mutant library.....	57
<b>Table 9.</b> Composition of the <i>ydfW</i> mutant library as estimated by PEDEL-AA.....	57
<b>Table 10.</b> The mutational spectrum of the <i>yejG</i> mutant library.....	79
<b>Table 11.</b> Composition of the <i>yejG</i> mutant library as estimated by PEDEL-AA.....	79
<b>Table 12.</b> Mutations in six YejG variants selected in the presence of tobramycin.....	81
<b>Table 13.</b> Mutations in six YejG variants selected in the presence of apramycin.....	84
<b>Table 14.</b> MICs of <i>E. coli</i> MDS42 cells over-expressing YejG .....	86
<b>Table 15.</b> MIC values of <i>E. coli</i> MDS42 cells harbouring either pBlueScript, pCA24N or without plasmids for tobramycin .....	88
<b>Table 16.</b> MIC values of clones A and B for tobramycin before and after displacing the pCA24N plasmid.....	89
<b>Table 17.</b> Mutations in the <i>yejG</i> inserts harboured by clones A and B.....	90
<b>Table 18.</b> MICs of the <i>E. coli</i> MDS42 <i>yejG</i> (HTD) clone and the YejG-expressing strain for kanamycin, sisomicin, apramycin and tobramycin .....	93
<b>Table 19.</b> Tobramycin resistance of YejG- and GFP-expressing strains at varying pH values.....	111
<b>Table 20.</b> Summary of fitness experiments involving <i>fusA</i> (G1478T) mutation and YejG over- expression.....	147

## Abbreviations

Abbreviation	Description
ASKA	A complete Set of <i>Escherichia coli</i> K-12 Open Reading Frame Archive
CA	Carbonic anhydrase
Cfu	Colony-forming unit
DMSO	Dimethyl sulfoxide
EDTA	Ethylenediaminetetraacetic acid
epPCR	Error-prone PCR
GFP	Green fluorescent protein
HGT	Horizontal gene transfer
His <sub>6</sub>	Hexa-histidine
IPTG	$\beta$ -D-1-thiogalactopyranoside
IS	Insertion sequences
<i>lacZ</i>	$\beta$ -galactosidase
LB	Lysogeny broth
<i>metC</i>	Cystathionine $\beta$ -lyase
MIC	Minimum Inhibitory Concentration
NoIns	pCA24N plasmid without any insert (negative control plasmid)
OD <sub>600</sub>	Optical density measured at 600 nm
SE	Standard Error
SOC	Super Optimal Broth with Catabolite repression
Tris	Tris(hydroxymethyl)aminomethane
<i>W</i>	Relative fitness
X-gal	5-bromo-4-chloro-3-indolyl- $\beta$ -D-galactopyranoside



[Blank page]