

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Lessons Learnt from United Nations
Peacekeeping Operations:
A Peacekeeping Model for creating and
sustaining peace in war torn countries

A Thesis presented in partial fulfilment
of the requirements for

Masters of Philosophy
In
Defence and Strategic Studies

At Massey University, Palmerston North
New Zealand

Vanessa R. Houghton

2008

Copyright is owned by the author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. Permission is also given for the Massey University Library to hold copies of the thesis for research purposes. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the author.

Copyright by Vanessa R Houghton 2008

All Rights Reserved

Abstract

This thesis studies the lessons learnt from United Nations Peacekeeping Operations focusing on four specific case studies, those being Somalia, Haiti, Bosnia-Herzegovina and East Timor. What this study attempts to do is draw together the lessons learnt that are operation or geographically specific, and those that are common across each of the four case studies. This is done with a view to developing a Peacekeeping Model that can be utilised over a wide range of United Nations operations and interventions, regardless of the geographical location of the conflict.

In order to explore whether or not a peacekeeping model for creating and sustaining peace in war torn countries can be developed, this thesis draws on the lessons learnt of not only the United Nations, but also the contributing service women and men and coalition partners involved. This thesis is divided into four parts. The Introduction, Chapter 1 and Chapter 2, are written to provide the reader with an overview of the creation of the United Nations, its Charter and mandate, and to introduce some of the key terminology used throughout the thesis.

Chapters 3 – 6 focus on the four individual case studies chosen for this research and provide an overview of the history, a breakdown of the United Nations operations, and then flows through the key military considerations identified under each case study. The structure of each of the case studies is focused around the United Nations operational mandate, command and control, intelligence and communications, logistics, pre-deployment training and preparations / deployment / post-deployment.

Chapter 7 provides an analytical overview of the lessons learnt that are specific to each of the case studies and discusses in detail the lessons learnt that can be applied across two or more case studies. Chapter 8 discusses the recommended United Nations blueprint or peacekeeping model. It argues that a successful peacekeeping model can be developed and clearly identifies what steps need to be taken for that model to succeed.

Chapter 9 provides a conclusion to the study and comments on the way ahead for United Nations peacekeeping operations based on the recommended blueprint or model. Chapter 9 also discusses the future of the United Nations and whether or not the organisation has a viable role to play in the maintenance of international peace and security.

Acknowledgements

I would first like to thank and acknowledge the efforts of all of those involved with supporting me throughout the completion of this thesis. In particular, I am indebted to Laura Garrod who played a vital role in assisting with shaping this thesis, providing valuable feedback and keeping me true to the thesis topic. I would like to specifically thank Sheryl Ramsay, Frances Blake and Michael Houghton for the roles that they played in assisting with the editing process of this thesis. Finally, I would like to thank the men and women from the New Zealand Defence Force who contributed to this study. The views expressed in this thesis are those of the author, or respective quoted authors, and are in no way designed to be a reflection of the current views, attitude or policy of the New Zealand Defence Force nor any other military or government organisation.

Table of Contents

1.	Cover Page.	
2.	Abstract	ii
3.	Acknowledgements	iii
4.	Table of Contents.	iv
5.	List of Abbreviations.	v-vi
6.	List of Tables/Maps.	vii
7.	Introduction.	1-5
8.	Chapter 1: Background.	6-14
9.	Chapter 2: Role of the UN in International Security and Humanitarian Intervention Operations.	15-28
10.	Chapter 3: Case Study 1 – Somalia.	29-51
11.	Chapter 4: Case Study 2 – Haiti.	52-74
12.	Chapter 5: Case Study 3 – Bosnia Herzegovina.	75-99
13.	Chapter 6: Case Study 4 – East Timor.	100-123
14.	Chapter 7: Analysis of Case Studies.	124-137
15.	Chapter 8: Can a successful UN Peacekeeping Model be developed? Peacekeeping Model Blueprint.	138-153
16.	Chapter 9: Likely future of the UN and roles that it will have to play in international security in the future.	154-169
17.	Appendices:	
	1. United Nations Charter.	170-186
	2. Mandate Somalia.	187-188
	3. Mandate Haiti.	189-190
	4. Mandate Bosnia-Herzegovina.	191-192
	5. Mandate East Timor.	193-194
	6. Copy of thesis questionnaire.	195-199
18.	Bibliography	200-205

List of Abbreviations

ACC	United Nations Administrative Committee on Coordination
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
AU	African Union (formerly OAU)
BiH	Bosnia-Herzegovina
CICP	United Nations Centre for International Crime Prevention
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
CIVPOL	Civilian Policing
CTC	United Nations Counter Terrorism Committee
CW	Chemical Weapons
DDA	United Nations Department of Disarmament Affairs
DHA	United Nations Department of Humanitarian Affairs
DNGOs	Domestic Non-Governmental Organisations
DPA	United Nations Department of Political Affairs
DPKO	Department of Peacekeeping Operations
ECPS	United Nations Executive Committee on Peace and Security
EU	European Union
G-7	Group of Seven States: US, Canada, Britain, France, Germany, Italy, Japan.
G77	Group of 77.
G8	Group of 8.
HRW	Human Rights Watch
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTY	International Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
IGOs	Inter-Governmental Organisations
INTERFET	International Force in East Timor
LDCs	Least Developed Countries
MIPONUH	United Nations Civilian Police Mission in Haiti
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organisations
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organisations
OAS	Organisation of American States
ONUVEH	United Nations Observer Group for the Verification of Elections in Haiti.
OSCE	Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe
P3	The Western permanent members of the Security Council
P5	Existing five permanent member of the Security Council
PBSO	Peace building Support Office
PIWCs	Persons Indicted for War Crimes
SC	United Nations Security Council, see also UNSC
SFOR	Stabilisation Force in Bosnia (NATO led)
SG	United Nations Secretary General
SRSG	Special Representative of the Security General, see also SG
UN	United Nations
UNDG	United Nations Development Group
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNEF	United Nations Emergency Force

List of Abbreviations

UNGA	United Nations General Assembly, see also GA
UNICEF	United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund
UNAMET	United Nations Mission in East Timor (Timor Leste)
UNITAF	Unified Task Force, Somalia
UNMIH	United Nations Mission in Haiti
UNMIBH	United Nations Mission in Bosnia and Herzegovina
UNMISET	United Nations Mission in Support of East Timor
UNOSOM	United Nations Operations Somalia (UNOSOM I & II)
UNPROFOR	United Nations Protection Force
UNSMIH	United Nations Support Mission for Haiti
UNTAET	United Nations Transition Authority in East Timor
UNTMIH	United Nations Transition Mission in Haiti
WFP	World Food Programme
WHO	World Health Organisation
WTO	World Trade Organisation

List of Tables/Maps

Table

1.1	Comparison of Peacekeeping and Peace Enforcement Characteristics. Fleitz Jr, F.H, Peacekeeping Fiascoes of the 1990s: Causes, Solutions and U.S. Interests, Praeger, Westport, 2002.	23
-----	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----

Maps

2.1	Map Somalia. (encarta.msn.com/encnet/features/mapcenter/map)	29
3.1	Map Haiti. (encarta.msn.com/encnet/features/mapcenter/map)	52
4.1	Map Bosnia-Herzegovina. (encarta.msn.com/encnet/features/mapcenter/map)	75
5.1	Map East Timor. (encarta.msn.com/encnet/features/mapcenter/map)	100

Introduction

This thesis studies the lessons learnt from United Nations Peacekeeping Operations, with a view to defining and recommending a Peacekeeping Model for creating and sustaining peace in war torn countries. The aim of this study is to identify a sustainable Peacekeeping Model and way ahead for United Nations operational peacekeeping deployments. It will achieve this through the detailed analysis and comparison of four case studies, those being Somalia, Haiti, Bosnia-Herzegovina and East Timor.

Aim

There are already considerable works on Somalia, Haiti, Bosnia-Herzegovina, and East Timor. Those concentrating on the pre-deployment and deployment of the United Nations into these destabilised states have been largely looked to in order to gain valuable information on the lessons learnt from each respective mission and geographical area. Information from studies written with a military perspective are also drawn on to assist in creating the frame work for this study. What this study attempts to do is draw together the lessons learnt and develop a Peacekeeping Model that could be utilised over a wide range of United Nations operations and interventions, regardless of the geographical location of the conflict.

Structure of the Thesis

In order to explore whether or not a peacekeeping model for creating and sustaining peace in war torn countries can be developed four case studies have been studied. This thesis draws heavily on the lessons learned of not only the United Nations, but also the contributing service women and men and coalition partners involved. The analysis of the case studies has been used to identify a Peacekeeping Model that implemented may provide a stable platform or start state for the United Nations when it deploys into war torn countries, whether they be in Africa, Europe or the Asia Pacific Regions.

The first two chapters of this study delve into some of the key decision making processes surrounding the creation of the United Nations which rose out of the ashes of the failed League of Nations on 26 April 1945. They provide an overview of the United Nations Charter and mandate and discusses the organisational breakdown of the United Nations in order to provide the reader with a basic overview of the United Nations and introduce some of the key terminology used throughout this study. All of which are key pieces of background historical information that if not understood correctly would mean that vital components to the United Nations and the way it is employed today would create confusion. D. A. Wells (2005), and J. S. Sutterlin (2003) provide a detailed breakdown of the establishment of the United Nations and their writings are also referred to in the conclusion of this study because of the emphasis that they place on options for the way forward of the United Nations.

Chapters 3 - 6 focus on the four individual case studies chosen for this research and provide an overview of the history, a breakdown of the United Nations operations that have been or are currently deployed to the conflict or war, and then flows through several key military considerations which are discussed under each case study. The structure of the chapters is focused around the United Nations operational mandate, command and control, intelligence and communications, Logistics, pre-deployment training and preparation / deployment / post-deployment. Each case study outlines the key lessons learnt from United Nations involvement in peacekeeping or peace enforcement operations and highlights recommendations on what actions the United Nations can take to avoid the issues confronted on future operations. Each case study concludes with a summary of the current situation on the ground as it sits today, a conclusion on United Nations efforts in the specific theatre and recommendations on what actions the United Nations can take in the future to avoid making the same errors.

Chapter 7 provides an analytical overview of the lessons learnt that are specific to each of the individual case studies, and discusses in detail the lessons learned that can be applied across two or more case studies.

Chapter 7 also aims to highlight the distinct differences or characteristics of each of the case studies through mission specific lessons learned.

Chapter 8 discusses the recommended United Nations blueprint or peacekeeping model. Shows that a successful United Nations peacekeeping model can be developed, and identifies what steps need to be taken for that model to succeed, based on the lessons learned identified across the four case studies. Chapter 8 also outlines some of the key differences faced by United Nations peacekeeping forces when they operate in diverse environmental and geographical locations, such as the difference in operating from conditions in Somalia to Bosnia-Herzegovina, and the impact that those conditions will have on the selection of lead-nation, troop contributing nations and preparation prior to deployment.

Chapter 9 discusses the future of the United Nations and whether or not the organisation has a viable role to play in the maintenance of international peace and security. It outlines some of the key personalities and members within the United Nations system and analyses the impact of regional organisations on the future role of the United Nations. Chapter 9 provides a conclusion to the study and comments on the way ahead for United Nations peacekeeping operations based on the recommended blueprint or model.

Sources

In completing this thesis a wide range of sources have been drawn from to provide as unbiased a view of the United Nations as possible. The authors personal experience working with the United Nations in Bosnia-Herzegovina and East Timor, as well as first hand accounts from New Zealand Defence Force (NZDF) officers and soldiers across the Navy, Army and Air force have been used as a base to this study. The experiences of a wide range of military specialists from the Intelligence, Logistics, Infantry, Signals, Engineer, Military Police, Public Relations and Medical Corps have been drawn on to provide analysis of the United Nations employment of these areas during the preparation and conduct of a peacekeeping operation.

The development and distribution of a questionnaire and the conduct of interviews with New Zealand military personnel have been used as primary sources of information for this study. Whilst the feedback the author received on the questionnaire was largely successful not all participants chose to answer the questionnaire directly. As a result this limited the amount of feedback that was available for this study. However, there was a significant amount of military personnel who chose to contribute and answer questions in an informal setting and on an informal basis without wishing to commit their answers to paper. Whilst the experiences and opinions of military personnel have been used to draw some of the conclusions in this study, the opinions expressed throughout this paper are supported by the author and are not intended to reflect current or future NZDF thought or policy.

Throughout this study the United Nations Resolutions, Security Council documents, Secretary General Reports and key documentation for each of the case studies has been drawn on for statistical information and facts and figures. The writings of Mingst and Karns (2007), Connaughton (2001), Fleitz (2002), Hillen (2000), Knight (2005) and Sutterlin (2003) have been drawn on to provide background information on the United Nations and key events that have shaped the organisation as it stands today. The writings of Knight (2005), Clark and Herbst (1997), Bellamy, Williams and Griffin (2004) and O'Neil and Rees (2005) were utilised for case study 1. Case study 2 focused around the works of Lahneman (2004), Zartman (2005), Malone (1998) and Murphy (1996). Case study 3 looked at the works of Donias (2005), Mockaitis (1999), Bose (2002) and Robbertson (2006). Case study 4 concentrated around the writings of Utley (2006), Caballero-Anthony and Acharya (2005), Martin (2001), FitzGerald, Stewart and Venugopal (2006) and Smillie and Minear (2004).

The firsthand accounts of Cain, Postlewait and Thompson (2004), as well as Zartman (2005) and Fleitz (2002) provide a cutting and harsh reality of civilian employment and perceptions within the United Nations on arguably some of the most difficult peacekeeping missions in its recent history. However, this is not necessarily the reality of all peacekeeping operations as is clearly shown

in the writings of Thakur (1998), Diehl (1994), Robbertson (2006), Sutterlin (2003) and Knight (2005).

There exists a significant amount of works on the United Nations. In particular its successes, and/or failures have been commented on in detail. However, it is difficult to find source material on the United Nations that does not provide a biased perspective either for or in most cases against the Organisation. What is also apparent is that there is very little written from a purely military perspective. Scholars such as Wells (2005), Thakur (1998), Azimi (1997), and Rittenberger (2001) – to name a few - have developed an art of writing on the United Nations, however, this thesis is not being written with necessarily the same perspective or vantage point. Due to military influences, training and experience on Operational Deployments as a Peacekeeper and Officer in the New Zealand Defence Force (NZDF) this study will be focused primarily on the United Nations from a military perspective, as opposed to a scholarly, humanitarian or political perspective. The writings of Bellamy, Williams and Griffin (2004), and Lahneman (2004), have a distinct military flavour and have provided key examples of lessons learnt in a variety of operational theatres.

Summary

The creation of a universal Peacekeeping Model that can be employed across a range of geographical theatres and United Nations coalition operations is the intended end state of this study. While it is identified that geographical climates and historical ethnic trends will impact significantly on the nationality of forces deployed into certain areas, this research aims to provide recommendations on the way ahead for the United Nations when it is preparing and training for peacekeeping operations, and for the physical deployment and sustainment of military peacekeeping forces on United Nations operations.