Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

# Exploring equality, justice and identity amongst host nationals and expatriates: Which human factors enable empowerment of Filipino aid workers?

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts in Psychology

At Massey University, Albany, New Zealand.

Nigel Vaughan Smith

2011

#### **Abstract**

Providing decent work has been emphasised by the United Nations as a key objective in its Millennium Development Goals for poverty reduction (United Nations, 2000). Decent work includes capacity building between expatriate and their host national aid workers. Optimizing empowerment to enable decent work amongst local aid workers may depend on human factors, alongside wider poverty reduction efforts, such as economic and political reform. This study sought to explore which of local:expatriate numerical ratio, expatriate social dominance, strength of Filipino identity and perceptions of workplace justice were predictive of different levels of subjective empowerment amongst aid workers in one particular lower-income, high-poverty country, the Philippines.

Responses to an online survey available in both English and Tagalog were obtained from N = 98 employees of diverse locally operating aid organisations in the Philippines during two months in early 2011 (29% male; 71% female; mean age = 35.5 years; all resident in the Philippines). The survey included measures of empowerment (Spreitzer, 1995), estimated local:expatriate numerical ratio, perceived social dominance (Pratto, Sidanius, Stallworth, & Malle, 1994), social identity (Ellemers, Kortekaas, & Ouwerkerk, 1999), justice (Niehoff & Moorman, 1993), social desirability (D. G. Fischer & Fick, 1993), estimated local:expatriate salary ratio and a number of demographic control measures (e.g., age, years of relevant work experience, level of education). Respondents chose to participate by clicking a link in an email sent by seven development sector practitioners who agreed to assist the researcher with distribution of invitations to their staff or contact lists. The link opened an online survey hosted by kwiksurveys.co.uk. Data was downloaded from the kwiksurveys.co.uk online database and analysed by the researcher using SPSS.

Controlling for age and other demographic variables, the best predictor of enabling empowerment was the fairness of personal interactions (interactional justice;  $\beta$  = .331). Interactional justice was also a significant predictor of the perceptions local employees had specifically about their impact in their workplace ( $\beta$  = .295), although this relationship was strongest when employees' sense of self respect was weaker, implying that a secure social identity may act as a buffer to consequences of injustice, all other things being equal (interaction effect  $\beta$  = -.233). Distributive justice predicted

each of four distinct facets of empowerment (competence; meaning; self-determination i.e., sense of control over one's work; and impact, i.e., sense of making a difference in one's work).

The overall pattern of results suggests that justice plays a more significant role than either dominance or identity in contributing to empowerment amongst Filipino aid employees. Strikingly, fair interpersonal treatment may matter more than distributive justice. Alongside the effects of justice, expatriate attitudes towards hierarchy and host nationals' sense of self respect are also significant factors, impacting empowerment in different ways. Given potential distortions arising from unknown response rate and a self-report methodology, further research, ideally with better control of sampling, is suggested. Possible avenues include exploring whether interpersonal treatment may matter more than distributive justice in collectivistic societies; whether self respect may act as a buffer against the effects of injustice; and how social dominance operates outside its traditional research contexts.

### Acknowledgments

I could not have completed this research project without the support of a wide range of people. My various employers (Kristin School, British School Manila and AUT University) and the Berys & Lovell Clark scholarship trust have provided valuable financial support. I am grateful to Professor Malcolm MacLachlan from Trinity College, Dublin, for providing guidance in the conceptualisation stage of the project. Approval for this research was granted by the Massey University Human Ethics Committee: Northern.

I owe a debt of gratitude to Ate Vylma, Evelyn Orpilla, Roselle Rasay and Udo Goebel in the Philippines, and Thelma Cruz and Yen Uera-Tesoro in New Zealand for assisting me with finding respondents, and Vivencio Talegon Jr. for doing such a timely and accurate job backtranslating the questionnaire. Judith Marasigan de Guzman from Ateneo de Manila University, Manila, assisted me in so many ways throughout the project as a cultural advisor. I can only say "Maraming salamat po!/Thank you so much!". Professor Stuart Carr has been a patient and encouraging supervisor throughout the project. His insights and suggestions spurred me on when much was unclear. It has been a great privilege to work with him over these last two years.

And finally I want to thank my family; my three beautiful daughters and my lovely wife Joanna for their tolerance and support over several years. Much family time has been sacrificed in order to complete this project and I have greatly valued their encouragement when deadlines meant I was unavailable for things that were important to them.

## **Table of Contents**

Abstract	iii
Acknowledgments	v
Table of Contents	vii
List of Tables	xi
List of Figures	xi
Chapter 1 – These and Critical Literature Review	1
Local Employee Empowerment	3
Numerical Ratio	5
Perceived Social Dominance	6
Social Identity	8
Organisational Justice	8
Distributive Justice	8
Procedural Justice	9
Interactional Justice	10
How might Demographics affect Empowerment?	10
How might Numerical Ratio affect Empowerment?	11
How might Perceived Social Dominance affect Empowerment?	12
How might Social Identity affect Empowerment?	13
How might Justice affect Empowerment?	14
Possible Interaction Effects	15
Potential theoretical limitations in the present cultural context	16
Local Employee Empowerment	16
Perceived Social Dominance	18
Social Identity	
Organisational Justice	
Chapter 2 - Method	
Participants	23
Measures	23
Local Employee Empowerment	
Demographics	
Numerical Ratio	
Perceived Social Dominance Social Identity	
Organisational Justice	
Social Desirability	

Procedure	27
Chapter 3 - Results	31
Checking the properties of the measures	31
Numerical Ratio of Filipino:Expatriate workers	31
Salary Ratio between Filipino:Expatriate workers	31
Protocol for Factor Analyses	32
Empowerment	33
Perceived Social Dominance	34
Social Identity	36
Organisational Justice	
Social Desirability	
Descriptive statistics	39
Univariate correlations between the key constructs	40
Protocol for Regression Analyses	43
Issues with assumptions: Univariate normality and multicollinearity	44
What predicts employees' sense of Competence?	44
What predicts employees' sense of Self-Determination?	
What predicts employees' sense of Meaning?	
What predicts employees' sense of Impact?	
What predicts Empowerment as a whole?	
Post hoc analyses	49
Protocol for moderation exploration	
Does Distributive Justice moderate the relationship between Interactional Justic and Empowerment?	
Does Self Respect moderate the relationship between Interactional Justice and Empowerment?	50
Chapter 4 - Discussion	53
Graphic summary of key findings	53
Key findings	
The pervasive impact of Justice on Empowerment	
The significance of Age and Experience	
How Expatriate Attitudes affect Local Employee Empowerment	
How Social Identity contributes to Empowerment in the workplace	55
Is Employee Empowerment about Social Identity or Social Dominance?	56
How the Philippine context affected the constructs measured in this study	56
Theoretical implications	57
What contributes to Empowerment amongst local employees?	57
Does Dominance matter in the Philippine context?	59
The effects of the different types of Justice	60

Policy implications	61
Limitations and Improvements	62
Sampling	62
Design issues	62
Language issues	63
Analysis issues	64
Suggestions for further research	65
Conclusion	66
Appendices	69
Appendix A: Questionnaire (English)	69
Appendix B: Questionnaire (Tagalog)	74
Appendix C: Invitation to Participate (English)	83
Appendix D: Invitation to Participate (Tagalog)	86
References	91

## **List of Tables**

Table 1. Factor solution for Empowerment measure	33
Table 2. Factor Correlations for Empowerment measure	34
Table 3. Factor solution for Perceived Social Dominance measure	35
Table 4. Factor solution for Social Identity measure	36
Table 5. Factor solution for Organisational Justice measure	37
Table 6. Factor correlations for Organisational Justice measure	38
Table 7. Communalities for Social Desirability measure	38
Table 8: Descriptives of all variables	39
Table 9: Correlation matrix	42
Table 10. Significant predictors of facets of Empowerment (Competence, Meaning, Self-Determination & Impact) as well as EMPOWERMENT as a whole	45
List of Figures	
Figure 1. Possible antecedents of Local Employee Empowerment	2
Figure 2. Potential relationships between (components of) Justice and Empowerment .	9
Figure 3. Moderation of the relationship between Interactional Justice and Empowerment by Self Respect	51
Figure 4: Observed predictors of Empowerment and its components	53