

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**PRE-SERVICE PRIMARY TEACHER EDUCATION IN A
CLIMATE OF CHANGE: A QUALITATIVE CASE STUDY**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Education
at
Massey University
Palmerston North
New Zealand

Veronica Carmina Marks
1996

370.7122
Mar

ABSTRACT

This study investigated the provision of pre-service primary teacher education by Hilltop College of Education (pseudonym) in a rapidly changing environment. The researcher used a qualitative case study design and a modified grounded theory approach to data collection and analysis. Change theory provided the theoretical underpinnings and the conceptual framework guided the data collection. The in-depth semi-structured interview and document analysis were the two data collection techniques employed. A total of forty-one administrative and teaching staff [thirty-three from the College and eight from Belmont University (pseudonym)] and nine student teachers participated in the study.

The fieldwork spanned a period of fourteen months - October 1993 to December 1994. The data analysis revealed that pre-service primary teacher education, provided both intra- and inter- institutionally, was a rapidly changing entity in form, nature and orientation. Change was influenced mainly by external factors and the political factor was the most influential. The latest innovations - the B.Ed. degree programme and its delivery in affiliation with Belmont University - constituted a desperate effort by the College to ensure its survival. In keeping with the grounded theory approach, the researcher developed a substantive theory of survival.

The substantive theory of survival explicated the College's survival process. Survival necessitated change but it was change intended to ensure self preservation. The history of past negotiations, strong proactive leadership, the strategies employed and the ability to use the contextual factors to its advantage, ensured an affiliation agreement on more favourable terms for the College, compared with past negotiations.

The College maintained its autonomy, secured a partnership agreement based on equity: 'fifty-fifty' sharing of administration and programme delivery, and equal representation and voting rights in the joint Faculty of Education. However, in operational terms, the College did not have the power to get the University to honour the agreement. The University's attitude, in part, threatened the affiliation, the B.Ed. programme and, by extension, the College's survival. In the long term, the College's survival will depend on the developments associated with the B.Ed. degree programme, the affiliation with Belmont University and its ability to respond appropriately and effectively to the demands of a rapidly changing environment.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am indebted to a number of persons who, in very special but different ways, contributed to the completion of this thesis. First, sincere thanks are due to my two supervisors, Associate Professor Wayne Edwards (OBE), of the Department of Policy Studies in Education, and Dr Joy Cullen, of the Department of Human Development Studies, whose intellectually rigorous standards and excellent research capabilities provided the challenge, inspiration and motivation every step of the way.

To my advisor, Associate Professor Peter Ramsay, in the School of Education, Waikato University, for his valuable contribution in making my goal achievable, I am, indeed, grateful.

Thanks are due to the management, staff and students of Hilltop College of Education and the staff of Belmont University who participated in this study. Without their involvement and unwavering support, this study could not be completed.

Special thanks to my husband, Anthony, for his resolute support, tolerance, constructive criticism and confidence in my ability to persevere to the end.

Thanks are due to my sponsors, the New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee, for the opportunity to undertake this research as a New Zealand Commonwealth Scholar. Without their generosity, this thesis would not have begun.

Sincere thanks to Mrs Judith Nathan and the staff of the Training and Development Unit, Massey University, for their support, particularly in the area of physical resources.

Finally, to all my friends and well wishers who supported me throughout the entire process, thank you for helping me to "hang in there".

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Table of Contents	iv
List of Appendices	xii
List of Tables	xiv
List of Figures	xvii
Glossary	xviii

Chapter	Page
---------------	------

CHAPTER ONE: Introduction.....	1
Background to the Study	1
Delimiting the Study	4
Purpose	5
Objectives of the Research	5
Research Question	5
Rationale for a Conceptual Framework.....	6
Organisation of the Thesis	9
Summary	9

CHAPTER TWO: Literature Review	10
Introduction.....	10
Overview of Major Changes in Teacher Education	10
Global Issues and Problems in Teacher Education.....	14
The Content of Teacher Education Programmes	15
Education Policy	19
Research on Teacher Education	24
International Research on Teacher Education Programmes	28
Institutionalised Pre-service Primary Teacher Education in New Zealand	34
Research on Teacher Education Programmes in New Zealand.....	37

International Literature on Institutional Amalgamations in Tertiary Education ..	41
Amalgamations in Tertiary Institutions in New Zealand	48
Summary	51
CHAPTER THREE: Conceptual Framework	52
Introduction	52
Change Theory	52
Implementation Theory	53
Pre-implementation	53
Overview of Factors Associated with Pre-implementation	55
Implementation	58
Key Factors in the Implementation Process	60
Key Themes in the Implementation Process	65
Change Process Theory	69
The Nature and Process of Change	70
Change and the Individual	72
Change Management Theory	74
The Role of Management	75
The Professional Development of Teachers	76
The Culture of the Organisation	78
Overview of Change Theory	81
Alternative Orientations in Teacher Education Programmes	82
The Feiman-Nemser Conceptual Orientations Framework	83
The Critical-Social Orientation	84
The Personal Orientation	85
The Technological Orientation	86
The Practical Orientation	86
The Academic Orientation	87
The Katz and Raths Framework for Research on Teacher Education Programmes	88
Goals	89
Characteristics of the Candidates	89
Characteristics of the Staff	89
Content	89
Methods	89
Time or Timing	89
Ethos	90

Regulations	90
Resources	90
Evaluation	90
Impacts of the Programme	90
Developing the Conceptual Framework	91
Summary	93
CHAPTER FOUR: Research Methodology	94
Introduction.....	94
Purpose	94
Objectives of the Research	94
Research Question	94
Overview of Approaches to Research in Education	95
Qualitative Research	96
Philosophical Assumptions of Qualitative Research	97
Interpretive Phenomenology	98
Characteristics of Qualitative Research	99
Context.....	100
Lived Experience	100
Patterns of Experience	101
Judging or Appraising.....	101
The Nature of Qualitative Data.....	102
The Case Study Approach	103
Classification of the Case Study.....	104
Characteristics of the Case Study	105
The Grounded Theory Approach	107
Theoretical Foundations of Grounded Theory	107
Theoretical Sampling	108
Constant Comparative Analysis	109
Coding in Grounded Theory	110
The Use of Memos in Grounded Theory	111
Using Grounded Theory	112
Modifications to the Grounded Theory Approach	114
The Macro-Micro Level Gaps and the Missing Elements in Social Research	114
History	117
Power	117

Reliability, Validity and Generalisability	121
Reliability	122
Validity	123
Triangulation.....	125
Generalisability	127
The Research Site	129
The Participants	130
Selection of Participants	130
Data Collection Techniques	131
The Interview	131
Document Analysis	133
Reflexivity	133
Summary	135
CHAPTER FIVE: Research Procedure and Data Analysis	136
Introduction	136
The Research Procedure	137
Approval and Entry into the Institution	137
Preliminary or Initial Data Collection Phase	137
Data Examination after the Preliminary or Initial Data Collection Phase	139
Phase 1	142
Phase 2	143
Phase 3	144
Overview of the Research Procedure.....	145
Data Analysis	146
Summary	150
CHAPTER SIX: Data Presentation: Part One	152
Rationale for Data Presentation	152
Data Presentation	152
Category One: Organisational Structure	153
1.1 Complexity	153
1.2 Operational	157
1.3 Accountability	161
1.4 Culture	162

Category Two: Mission	166
2.1 Vagueness	166
2.2 Clarity	168
2.3 Product	170
2.4 Uncertainty	172
2.5 Quality	174
Category Three: Involvement	176
3.1 Levels	176
3.2 Managerial	178
3.3 Departmental	178
Category Four: Programme	180
4.1 Types	181
4.2 Development	183
4.3 Congruence	186
4.4 Methods	187
4.5 Resources	188
Category Five: Evaluation	190
5.1 Levels	191
5.2 Types	197
Category Six: Selection	198
6.1 Complexity	198
6.2 Competitiveness	200
6.3 Flexibility	201
Category Seven: Support System	201
7.1 Hierarchical	201
7.2 Developmental	204
Category Eight: Relationship	206
8.1 Inter-institutional	206
8.2 Community	208
Summary	209

CHAPTER SEVEN: Data Presentation Part Two: The Substantive Theory

of Survival	210
Introduction	210
The Context	211
Education Policy	212
The Marketability of Graduates	212

International Trends in Teacher Education	214
Research in Teacher Education	214
Category 1: Initiation	216
1.1 Coercive	219
1.2 Instrumental	220
Conceptual Processing	225
Level 1: Awareness	225
Level 2: Interpretation	226
Level 3: Decision Making	226
Category 2: Preparation	226
2.1 Antecedents	226
2.2 Mobilisation.....	231
2.3 Planning.....	236
Conceptual Processing	239
Level 1: Awareness.....	239
Level 2: Planning.....	239
Level 3: Decision Making	241
Category 3: Negotiation	241
3.1 Systemic	241
3.2 Naturalistic	251
3.3 Problematic.....	255
Conceptual Processing	260
Level 1: Networking	260
Level 2: Securing	262
Summary.....	262

CHAPTER EIGHT: Data Presentation Part Three: The Substantive

Theory of Survival.....	265
Introduction	265
Category 4: Implementation	265
4.1 Disorganised	265
4.2 Deficient	284
4.3 Changing	293
4.4 Impacting	298
Conceptual Processing	311
Level 1: Awareness	312
Level 2: Miscalculation	312

Level 3: Interpretation	312
Level 4: Decision Making	313
The Survival Process	313
Summary	319
CHAPTER NINE: Discussion and Conclusion	320
Introduction	320
Discussion of the Findings	320
Programme Factors	321
Orientation	321
Goals or Objectives	323
Courses	325
Methods	329
Technical Assistance, Practice and Feedback Mechanism	330
Time or Timing	332
Resources	333
Evaluation	335
Factors Related to the Inter-institutional Provision of Teacher Education ...	337
Organisational Management	337
Power and Control	341
Culture	345
Identity	350
Factors Related to the Substantive Theory of Survival	352
The Survival Process	352
This Study's Contribution to Theory.....	356
The Major Key Learnings from the Survival Process	359
Nature	360
Leadership	361
Strategies	362
Guidelines	363
Conclusions	364
Pre-service Primary Teacher Education	365
The Survival Process	367
Methodology	370
Recommendations for Further Research	371
Afterword	373

Appendices 374

Documents 404

Bibliography 407

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendices	374
Appendix A: List of Guiding Questions	375
Appendix B: Sample Interview Schedules	377
B-1 Initial Semi- Structured Interview Schedule	378
B-2 Semi-Structured Interview Schedule - College Staff	380
B-3 Semi-Structured Interview Schedule - University Staff	381
B-4 Semi-Structured Interview Schedule - Student Teachers	382
Appendix C: Goodlad's Nineteen Postulates for Teacher Education Programmes	383
Appendix D: Letters to Participants	385
D-1 Sample Letter to College Staff.....	386
D-2 Form Attached to D-1: Sample Letter to College Staff	387
D-3 Sample Letter to University Staff	388
D-4 Sample Letter to Student Teachers	389
D-5 Letter to College Staff Acknowledging Response.....	390
Appendix E: Sample of Field Notes	391
Appendix F: College and University Staff Questionnaire, Demographic and Other Data	392
F-1 College and University Staff Questionnaire.....	393
F-2 Table F 1 College and University Staff Demographic Data.....	394
F-3 Table F 2 College and University Staff Academic Qualifications	394
F-4 Table F 3 College and University Staff Experience in Teacher Education	395

Appendix G: Student Teachers' Questionnaire and Demographic Data.....	396
G-1 Student Teachers' Questionnaire.....	397
G-2 Table G 1 Student Teachers' Demographic Data	398
Appendix H: Sample of Open Coded Transcript.....	399
Appendix I: Record of Expenditure in Time on Data Collection	400
Appendix J: Core Curriculum and Curriculum Extension Courses in Diploma of Teaching and B.Ed. Degree Programmes	401
Appendix K: Structure of the B.Ed. Degree Programme	402
Appendix L: The Faculty of Education's Management Structure	403

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1	<i>Characteristics of Change</i>	71
Table 2	<i>Factors Related to Change at the Individual Level</i>	73
Table 3	<i>Characteristics of Inappropriate Management</i>	76
Table 4	<i>Guidelines for Managing Change</i>	77
Table 5	<i>Conceptual Orientations in Teacher Education</i>	83
Table 6	<i>Category 1: Organisational Structure</i>	154
Table 7	<i>Category 2: Mission</i>	166
Table 8	<i>Category 3: Involvement</i>	177
Table 9	<i>Category 4: Programme</i>	181
Table 10	<i>Percentage of Course Development and Approval Criteria in Forty-two Course Outlines</i>	185
Table 11	<i>Category 5: Evaluation</i>	191
Table 12	<i>Category 6: Selection</i>	198
Table 13	<i>Category 7: Support System</i>	202
Table 14	<i>Category 8: Relationship</i>	206
Table 15	<i>Category 1: Initiation</i>	216
Table 16	<i>Property 1.1 Coercive - Key Learnings from the Survival Process</i>	219

Table 17	<i>Property 1.2 Instrumental - Key Learnings from the Survival</i>	
	<i>Process</i>	224
Table 18	<i>Category 2: Preparation</i>	227
Table 19	<i>Property 2.1 Antecedents - Key Learnings from the Survival</i>	
	<i>Process</i>	231
Table 20	<i>Property 2.2 Mobilisation - Key Learnings from the Survival</i>	
	<i>Process</i>	235
Table 21	<i>Property 2.3 Planning - Key Learnings from the Survival</i>	
	<i>Process</i>	238
Table 22	<i>Category 3: Negotiation</i>	241
Table 23	<i>Property 3.1 Systemic - Key Learnings from the Survival</i>	
	<i>Process</i>	251
Table 24	<i>Property 3.2 Naturalistic - Key Learnings from the Survival</i>	
	<i>Process</i>	255
Table 25	<i>Property 3.3 Problematic - Key Learnings from the Survival</i>	
	<i>Process</i>	260
Table 26	<i>Category 4: Implementation</i>	266
Table 27	<i>Property 4.1 Disorganised - Key Learnings from the Survival</i>	
	<i>Process</i>	283
Table 28	<i>Property 4.2 Deficient - Key Learnings from the Survival</i>	
	<i>Process</i>	293
Table 29	<i>Property 4.3 Changing - Key Learnings from the Survival</i>	
	<i>Process</i>	298

Table 30	<i>Property 4.4 Impacting - Key Learnings from the Survival</i>	
	<i>Process</i>	312

LIST OF FIGURES

<i>Figure 1</i>	The Researcher's Conceptualisation of Change Theory	54
<i>Figure 2</i>	The Conceptual Framework Developed by the Researcher	92
<i>Figure 3</i>	The Paradigm Model.....	111
<i>Figure 4</i>	Research Procedure from Preliminary Data Collection to Writing	138
<i>Figure 5</i>	The Formal Organisational Structure of Hilltop College of Education	155
<i>Figure 6</i>	The Hilltop College of Education Continuum of Functions	157
<i>Figure 7</i>	The Context of the Survival Process	215
<i>Figure 8</i>	Initiation: The First Step in the Survival Process	225
<i>Figure 9</i>	Preparation: The Second Step in the Survival Process	240
<i>Figure 10</i>	Negotiation: The Third Step in the Survival Process.....	261
<i>Figure 11</i>	Implementation: The Fourth Step in the Survival Process	314

GLOSSARY

Affiliation (educational): A type of amalgamation or merger in which two or more institutions or sub-unit(s) thereof, enter into an agreement for the purpose of shared academic programming, administrative efficiency, or shared resources and services. Participating institutions preserve their identities and governance structures (adapted from Samels, 1994).

Belmont University (BU): Pseudonym for the university in this investigation. The term is used interchangeably with the 'University'.

Hilltop College of Education (HCE): Pseudonym for the research site: the New Zealand college of education where the investigation was conducted. The term is used interchangeably with the 'College'.

Kaiarahi: Maori term used for Intake Supervisor, which when translated in English means 'care giver'. The Intake Supervisor is an academic advisor and support person for student teachers.

NZCTE: New Zealand Council for Teacher Education. The NZCTE is a national umbrella body with membership of institutions providing teacher education. It was established in 1991 to represent and voice the interest of 'member' institutions.

NZQA: New Zealand Qualifications Authority. This body is a Crown agency with powers of validation for all national qualifications. The body also has a regulatory function.

NZVCC: New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee. A committee of all Vice-Chancellors of New Zealand universities.

Pre-service primary teacher education: The initial deliberate preparation of prospective teaching personnel for primary schools.

Whanau: Maori term which when translated in English means family.