Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

# Toxigenic Fungi and Mycotoxin Production in Maldive Fish (Smoked Dried Tuna Fish)

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

in

**Food Technology** 

Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand



**Shazla Mohamed** 

January 2013

#### **Abstract**

This is the first study on the mycological safety of "Maldive fish", a smoked dried tuna product that is both economically and nutritionally important to the Maldives. The most obvious concern with this product is the effect of fungal contamination. The initial aim of the current study was therefore to determine if Maldive fish supports the growth of toxigenic fungi and production of mycotoxins.

The uncontrolled mycoflora on the product were characterised and related to the physiological parameters of the Maldive fish. Ninety six percent of the samples (n=25) were contaminated with one or more mycotoxigenic fungi with Asperqillus flavus (92%), A. tamarii (96%), A. niger (40%), A. ochraceus (12%) and Penicillium citrinum (60%) identified as the significant species. Subsequently, the potentially toxigenic isolates were screened for their corresponding mycotoxins aflatoxins, ochratoxin A (OTA), cyclopiazonic acid (CPA) and citrinin. A high proportion (72%) of isolates was able to produce toxic metabolites in vitro indicating possible contamination of the product with mycotoxins. Almost half (46%) of the A. flavus isolates were able to produce the potent carcinogen, aflatoxin B. All species on the surface were also found invading the product. The huge variability in a<sub>w</sub> levels (0.951 to 0.720) of the samples would support growth of a wide range of species. Furthermore, the slightly acidic pH (5.65 to 6.68) and low salt content (1.48 to 4.29%) together with the high ambient temperatures of the Maldives were eminently suitable for fungal growth and mycotoxin production. Quantification of aflatoxins from the product revealed two of the 25 samples to be contaminated above the legal limits and confirms potential exposure to significant levels of this toxin from Maldive fish infected with fungi.

These results led to a new question: can fungal growth and mycotoxin production in Maldive fish be eliminated or reduced to safe levels? The most practical approach would be to reduce the  $a_w$  to sufficiently low levels that inhibit fungal growth and mycotoxin production. The limiting  $a_w$  levels for the most important species were therefore evaluated. The limiting  $a_w$  for growth of *A. tamarii* was between 0.82 and 0.85 on NaCl media and between 0.79 and 0.75, on media containing sugars at

ambient storage temperatures (25 to  $35^{\circ}$ C). The  $a_{w}$  of Maldive fish should be maintained below 0.75 to prevent the growth of *A. tamarii*. The physiology of *A. flavus* has been extensively studied previously but the limiting values are dependent on the food matrix. A smoked fish agar was used to simulate Maldive fish for fungal growth (*A. flavus*) and mycotoxin production (aflatoxin and CPA) under varying conditions. No growth occurred at an  $a_{w}$  of 0.75 while the toxin production was limited at an  $a_{w}$  0.80 under all incubation conditions ( $25^{\circ}$ C to  $40^{\circ}$ C). Hence, control of *A. flavus* can be achieved by rapid drying of Maldive fish to an  $a_{w}$  of 0.75 or below.

This study has provided scientific evidence that the mycoflora on Maldive fish produce aflatoxins and other mycotoxins that are a food safety risk. Hence, control of toxigenic fungi is imperative and can be achieved through adequate drying. This information is crucial for the Maldives as well as other developing countries that consume hot smoked dried fish while it potentially has a broader application for other food products.

### Acknowledgements

I am sincerely grateful to the contributions of many different people, in different ways without which this journey would not have been a rewarding one. Thank you to all my supervisors for their scientific insight and constructive criticism, throughout the studies. I am indebted to Professor Steve Flint, my principal supervisor for his motivation, facilitation of the services, prompt responses and continuous support and guidance at all times; Dr. Jon Palmer for his enthusiasm, support and intriguing discussions; and Mr. Graham Fletcher for his professional advice and detailed constructive comments. It has been a great privilege to have Dr. John Pitt on the supervisory panel, to whom I am truly grateful for sharing his expert knowledge on food fungi and mycotoxins.

Special appreciation is extended to the staff of SEAT Micro Lab Anne-Marie Jackson, Julia Stevenson, Judie Farrand-Collins, John Edward, John Sykes and Weiping Liu for their technical expertise and providing a friendly environment for experimental work. I would like to thank John Sykes for support with the operation of the HPLC. The assistance of financial, academic and technical support staff at IFNHH is greatly acknowledged. Thank you to Steve Glagow, Michelle Tamehana, John Warwick, Gary Radford, Peter Jeffrey and Felicity Jackson for technical assistance in their respective areas. Also to Associate Professor Nigel Grigg, SEAT for help with the statistics. I would like to acknowledge Gillian Norris and Trever Loo from IMBS for letting me use the HPLC at their department. Thanks also to Li Mo, Celia Aw and other student helpers for their involvement.

I am obliged to New Zealand Developmental Studies (Commonwealth Scholarship) for the financial support without which this study would not have been possible. Sylvia and the team at The International office, Massey University, for looking after the welfare of my family during our stay in New Zealand.

I am equally grateful to my friends from near and far for emotional and practical support, encouragement and prayer. Thank you to my office mates and fellow postgraduate students for being such good company and sharing valuable ideas and thoughts. Sinan and Shab for help with purchasing the fish samples from home; Mizu for sourcing Maldive fish recipes; Masko for assisting with the formatting of this document. I am most grateful to the Maldivian community in Palmerston North for their generosity and help in many different ways. Thank you Thuthu Didi, for being the inspiration for this study.

Finally, a mere expression of thanks is not suffice for the dedication, unconditional love and support from my family throughout my study and always. I cannot thank my beloved husband, Ali enough for his immense patience and understanding during difficult times and the sacrifices he made. My loving son Akif, and my little Kiwi daughter Azka for never failing to cheer me up. My siblings and the extended family, for keeping faith in me. Last but not least, my mom Ameena and Dad Mohamed who instilled the value of knowledge in me and to whom I dedicate this thesis.

## Contents

Abstract	iii
Acknowledgements	v
Contents	vii
List of Abreviations	xiii
List of Figures	xv
List of Tables	xix
List of Peer Reviewed Publications and Conference Proceedings	xxi
Chapter 1	
Introduction	
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Rationale for the study	
1.3 Thesis Hypotheses and Objectives	
1.4 Overview of the thesis	9
Chapter 2	13
A Review of Literature Relating to Toxigenic Fungi and Mycotoxins Associated Smoked and Dried Fish	iated with
2.1 Introduction	13
2.2 Range of products and their characteristics	13
2.3 The role of fungi	15
2.4 Analytical methods for fungi and mycotoxins	17
2.4.1 Methods for isolation of fungi	17
2.4.2 Methods for identification of fungi	18
2.4.3 Methods for analysis of mycotoxins from foods	19
2.5 Fungi associated with smoked and dried fish	21
2.6 Mycotoxigenic fungi and associated mycotoxins	25
2.7 Factors that affect fungal growth and toxin production	30
2.7.1 Strain	30

2.7.2 Water activity	32
2.7.3 Temperature	35
2.7.4 Nutrients	35
2.7.5 Smoking	35
2.7.6 Salt content	36
2.7.7 Other factors	37
2.8 Control of fungal growth and mycotoxin production	37
2.8.1 Hygiene controls	37
2.8.2 Adequate drying	38
2.8.3 Packaging	38
2.8.4 Biological control	39
2.9 Conclusion	40
Chapter 3	41
Isolation and Identification of Mycoflora and Toxigenic Fungi from Maldive Fish	
3.1 Introduction	42
3.2 Methodology	
3.2.1 Sample Collection and Preparation	
3.2.2 Media Preparation	43
3.2.3 Isolation of fungi	44
3.3 Identification of fungi	45
3.3.1 Confirmation of Species	47
3.3.2 Physiochemical Parameters	48
3.4 Results	50
3.5 Discussion	55
Chapter 4	67
A Simple Screening Method for Detection of Citrinin using Coconut Cream Agar	
4.1 Introduction	68
4.2 Methodology	
4.2.1 Fungi	
4.2.2 Media	
4.2.3 Inoculation and observation	69
4.2.4 Confirmation of fluorescence from citrinin	

4.2.5 Optimisation of the method	71
4.2.6 Comparison with other screening methods	71
4.3 Results	72
4.3.1 Type of fluorescence	72
4.3.2 Confirmation of fluorescence	73
4.3.3 Optimisation of the method	73
4.3.4 Comparison to other screening methods	76
4.4 Discussion	78
Chapter 5	81
Assessment of the Mycotoxin Producing Potential of Toxigenic Fungi Is Maldive Fish	solated From
5.1 Introduction	82
5.2 Methodology	83
5.2.1 Toxigenic Fungi	83
5.2.2 Chemicals and standards	84
5.2.3 Presumptive Screening of Isolates	84
5.2.4 Confirmation and quantification of mycotoxin production	87
5.2.5 Sclerotia formation by <i>A. flavus</i> isolates	89
5.3 Results	90
5.3.1 Aflatoxin production by A. flavus isolates	90
5.3.2 CPA production by <i>A. flavus</i> isolates	93
5.3.3 Identification of chemotypes in <i>A. flavus</i>	94
5.3.4 CPA production by <i>A. tamarii</i> isolates	95
5.3.5 OTA production by A. ochraceus and A. niger	96
5.3.6 Citrinin production by <i>P. citrinum</i>	98
5.4 Discussion	100
Chapter 6	109
Quantification of Aflatoxins and Ochratoxin A in Maldive fish	
6.1 Introduction	110
6.2 Methodology	111
6.2.1 Chemicals and standards	111
6.2.2 Quantification of Aflatoxins	111
6.2.3 Quantification of Ochratoxin A	114

6.3 Results	115
6.3.1 Aflatoxins	115
6.3.2 Ochratoxin A	120
6.4 Discussion	122
Chapter 7	127
Effect of Water Activity and Temperature on the Germination Aspergillus tamarii Isolated from Maldive Fish	and Growth of
7.1 Introduction	128
7.2 Methodology	129
7.2.1 Fungi	129
7.2.2 Media	129
7.2.3 Inoculation and examination	130
7.3 Results	131
7.3.1 Germination	131
7.3.2 Growth	133
7.4 Discussion	137
Chapter 8	141
Effect of Water Activity and Temperature on Growth and Mycotox Aspergillus flavus on a Smoked Fish Agar	kin Production by
8.1 Introduction	142
8.2 Methodology	143
8.2.1 Fungi	143
8.2.2 Preparation of smoked dried fish (Maldive fish)	143
8.2.3 Smoked fish agar	145
8.2.4 Inoculation and Incubation	145
8.2.5 Growth rate	146
8.2.6 Mycotoxin production	146
8.2.7 Statistical analysis	147
8.3 Results	148
8.3.1 Growth rate	148
8.3.2 Aflatoxin production	150
8.3.3 Production of Cyclopiazonic acid	153
8.4 Discussion	156

Chapter 9		163
General Disc	cussion and Conclusions	
9.1 Maj	jor Contributions and Findings	163
9.2 Fut	ure Directions	167
Appendix A	Location and Time of Sampling	171
Appendix B	Media Formulations	172
Appendix C	Fungal Isolates	175
Appendix D	HPLC Standard Curves	177
Appendix E	Mycotoxin Screening Results	182
Appendix F	Reference Data for Adjusting Water Activity	187
Appendix G	Publication	189
Appendix H	Supplementary Data Chapter 8	191
References		193

#### List of Abreviations

a<sub>w</sub> Water activity

AFPA Aspergillus Flavus and Parasiticus Agar

CCA Coconut Cream Agar

CPA Cyclopiazonic Acid

CYA Czapek Yeast Extract Agar

CY20S Czapek Yeast Extract Agar with 20% Sucrose

DG18 Dichloran 18% Glycerol Agar

DRBC Dichloran Rose Bengal Chloramphenicol Agar

G25N 25% Glycerol Nitrate Agar

HPLC High Performance Liquid Chromatography

HPLC-FLD High Performance Liquid Chromatography with Fluorescence Detection

MEA Malt Extract Agar

MY5-12 and MY10-12 Malt Extract Yeast Extract 5% (or 10%) Salt 12% Glucose Agar

OTA Ochratoxin A

SFA Smoked Fish Agar

TLC Thin Layer Chromatography

YES Yeast Extract Sucrose Agar



# List of Figures

Figure 1.1 Maldive Fish showing typical fungal growth on the surface2
Figure 1.2 Common processing technology for Maldive fish
Figure 1.3 Overview of the Thesis11
Figure 3.1 Protocol for isolation of fungi from Maldive fish44
Figure 3.2 Regimen for culturing fungal isolates for identification (Pitt and Hocking, 2009)
<b>Figure 3.3</b> a) Orange yellow reverse colouration of <i>A. flavus</i> and b) deep brown reverse colouration of <i>A. tamarii</i> , on AFPA agar
Figure 3.4 Species of fungi isolated from Maldive fish and their percentage frequency of isolation (25 samples)
<b>Figure 3.5</b> Aspergillus flavus a) on identification media at 25°C for 7 days, b) light microscopy of conidial heads on MEA, c) conidia showing finely roughened walls, and d) bright orange reverse colouration on AFPA agar
<b>Figure 3.6</b> Aspergillus tamarii a) on identification media at 25°C for 7 days, b) light microscopy of conidial heads on MEA, c) conidia showing characteristic thick and rough, spiny walls, and d) deep brown reverse colouration on AFPA agar53
<b>Figure 3.7</b> Comparison of the species of fungi isolated from Maldive fish (25 samples) before and after surface sanitisation
Figure 3.8 Comparison of the water activity of twenty five Maldive fish samples55
Figure 4.1 Yellow green fluorescence halo of <i>P. citrinum</i> culture H1C1 on CCA a) after 4
days at 25 °C b) after 7 days at 25 °C c) after HCl treatment and d) uninoculated CCA
control plate, viewed under long wavelength UV (366 nm)72

Figure 4.2 TLC of P. citrinum isolates after 7 days of incubation at 25°C with standard
and negative control, viewed under long wavelength UV (366 nm)73
Figure 4.3 Comparison of the fluorescence produced by <i>P. citrinum</i> isolates (n=15) on
CCA from day three to day ten after incubation at (a) 25°C and (b) 30°C. +, ++, +++
indicates increasing colour intensity on CCA plates under long wavelength UV (366
nm)75
Figure 5.1 Screening of <i>A. flavus</i> isolates for aflatoxin production a) positive isolate on
CCA showing the characteristic pastel blue fluorescence halo and uninoculated CCA
control plate b) typical TLC for aflatoxins with the standards (3000 ng/g), test isolates
and negative control, viewed under long wavelength UV90
Figure 5.2 HPLC chromatographs for aflatoxins a) mixed aflatoxin standard (B <sub>1</sub> , B <sub>2</sub> , G <sub>1</sub> ,
G <sub>2</sub> ) b) positive <i>A. flavus</i> isolate (G1E1)91
Figure 5.3 TLC for cyclopiazonic acid with the standards, test isolates (A. flavus) and
negative control, viewed under daylight93
Figure 5.4 HPLC chromatographs for cyclopiazonic acid a) CPA standard (100 ng/g) b)
positive A. flavus isolate (H1A3)94
Figure 5.5 TLC for cyclopiazonic acid screening, A. tamarii isolates and CPA standard
(1000 ng/g) viewed under daylight95
Figure 5.6 Screening of isolates for OTA production a) positive isolate on CCA
exhibiting green blue fluorescence on colony reverse b) uninoculated CCA contro
plate c) typical TLC plate for OTA with the standards, test isolates and negative
control, viewed under long wavelength UV (366 nm)96
Figure 5.7 HPLC chromatographs for ochratoxin A a) OTA standard 1000 ng/g b)
positive A. ochraceus isolate (N1D2)97
<b>Figue 5.8</b> Screening of <i>P. citrinum</i> isolates for citrinin production a) positive isolate on
CCA showing the characteristic vellowish green fluorescence on reverse b

uninoculated CCA control plate c) typical TLC plate for citrinin with the standards (100
ng/g), test isolates and negative control, viewed under long wavelength UV (366 nm).
98
Figure 5.9 HPLC chromatographs for citrinin a) citrinin standard 3000 ng/g b)
positive <i>P. citrinum</i> isolate (H1B1)99
Figure 6.1 Calibration curves for a) aflatoxin B <sub>1</sub> and b) aflatoxin B <sub>2</sub> 116
Figure 6.2 HPLC-FLD chromatograms of a) mixed aflatoxin standard 7 ng/ml (B <sub>1</sub> , G <sub>1</sub> )
and 2.1 ng/ml ( $B_2$ , $G_2$ ), b) blank sample spiked at 5 ng/ml ( $B_1$ , $G_1$ ) and 1.5 ng/ml ( $B_2$ ,
$G_2$ ), c) naturally contaminated Maldive fish sample A1 with positive aflatoxin $B_1$ and $B_2$
peaks and $d$ ) naturally contaminated Maldive fish sample R1 with positive aflatoxin $B_1$
peak118
Figure 6.3 Calibration curve for ochratoxin A
Figure 6.4 HPLC-FLD chromatograms of a) OTA standard 15 ng/ml b) blank sample
spiked at 5 ng/ml, and c) naturally contaminated Maldive fish sample K1 with positive
OTA peak (1.2 ng/g)
Figure 7.1 Effect of a <sub>w</sub> and temperature on germination time (days) of <i>A. tamarii</i> on (a)
NaCl and (b) glucose/ fructose media at 25°C, 30°C, 35°C and 40°C. The error bars
represent the standard deviation of the three isolates. No fill indicates germination
with no subsequent growth. Where no symbol is shown for a particular a <sub>w</sub> , no
germination had occurred by 100 days' incubation at that temperature131
6
Figure 7.2 Effect of $a_w$ and temperature on radial growth rate (mm/day) of $\emph{A. tamarii}$
on a) NaCl and b) glucose/ fructose media. The error bars represent the standard
deviation of the three isolates. Where no symbol is shown for a particular $a_{\mbox{\scriptsize W}}$ , no
growth had occurred by 100 days' incubation at that temperature134
Figure 7.3 Interaction between a <sub>w</sub> and temperature on the radial growth rate
(mm/day) of A. tamarii on a) NaCl and b) glucose/fructose media136

Figure 8.1 Process flow for the production of Maldive fish for use in the smoked fish
agar formulation144
Figure 8.2 Experimental design to determine the factors affecting growth and toxin
production of Aspergillus flavus isolates P1A2, O1A2 and A1E1 on smoked fish agar 147
Figure 8.3 Effect of $a_w$ and temperature on radial growth rate (mm/day) of three $A$ .
flavus strains a) P1A2, b) O1A2 and c) A1E1. The error bars represent the standard
deviation of three replicate measurements149
Figure 8.4 Effect of water activity and temperature on production of aflatoxin $B_1$ by
three Aspergillus flavus strains (P1A1, O1A1 and A1E1) on a smoked fish agar after
sampling at 7, 14, 21 and 60 days of incubation
Figure 8.5 Effect of water activity and temperature on production of cyclopiazonic acid
by three Aspergillus flavus strains (P1A1, O1A1 and A1E1) on a smoked fish agar after
sampling at 7, 14, 21 and 60 days of incubation

## List of Tables

Table 2.1 Fungi most commonly isolated from smoked dried fish or similar products.23
Table 2.2 Limiting aw values for microorganisms associated with smoked and dried fish
(Horner 1997)33
Table 2.3 Minimum water activity of some important fungi associated with foods (Pit
and Hocking, 2009)34
Table 3.1 Potentially toxigenic species of fungi isolated from Maldive fish together with
the mycotoxins they produce and the health risks66
Table 4.1 Detection of citrinin by CCA direct method (without HCl treatment) and by
the TLC agar plug method after incubation at 25°C for 5 days on CCA, YES and CYA. +
++, +++ indicate increasing colour intensity on CCA and of TLC bands under long
wavelength UV (366 nm)77
Table 5.1 Summary of the methods applied in screening and confirmation o
mycotoxins82
Table 5.2 Eluent systems for TLC of mycotoxins 86
Table 5.3 HPLC conditions for mycotoxin analysis
Table 5.4 Categorisation of A. flavus isolates based on the quantity of aflatoxin B
produced in culture
Table 5.5 Chemotypes of A. flavus isolates based on aflatoxin and cyclopiazonic acid
production95
Table 5.6 Summary of the screening results 100
Table 5.7 Aflatoxin and cyclopiazonic acid producing ability of Aspergillus flavus from
different sources

Table 6.1 Mean concentrations of aflatoxin B <sub>1</sub> , B <sub>2</sub> and total aflatoxins detected from
Maldive fish. Each batch is a composite sample comprising five individual samples119
Table 6.2 Mean concentrations of aflatoxin B <sub>1</sub> , B <sub>2</sub> and total aflatoxins detected from
individual Maldive fish samples in batch IV and V119
Table 7.1 Minimum a <sub>w</sub> for germination of <i>A. tamarii</i> at various incubation
temperatures on NaCl media and glucose/fructose media132
Table 7.2 Optimum and minimum aw for growth of A. tamarii at various incubation
temperatures on NaCl media and glucose/fructose media135
Table 8.1 Analysis of variance of the effects of water activity (a <sub>w</sub> ), temperature (t),
strain (s) and day of sampling (d) and their interactions on aflatoxin production on
smoked fish agar152
Table 8.2 Analysis of variance of the effects of water activity (a <sub>w</sub> ), temperature (t),
strain (s) and day of sampling (d) and their interactions on production of cyclopiazonic
acid on smoked fish agar155
Table 8.3 Optimum and Limiting aw values for the growth of Aspergillus flavus on a
range of substrates

# List of Peer Reviewed Publications and Conference Proceedings

#### **List of Publications**

Mohamed, S., Mo, L., Flint, S. Palmer, J., and Fletcher, G.C. (2012). Effect of water activity and temperature on the germination and growth of *Aspergillus tamarii* isolated from "Maldive fish". *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, *160* (2), 119-123. DOI:10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2012.09.022.

Mohamed, S., Flint, S., Palmer, J., Fletcher, G.C., and Pitt, J.I. (In Press). A simple screening method for detection of citrinin using coconut cream agar. *Letters in Applied Microbiology*.

Mohamed, S., Flint, S., Palmer, J., and Fletcher, G.C. (Submitted). Fungal toxins in Maldive fish, a smoked dried tuna fish. *New Zealand Food Technology*.

#### **List of Conference Proceedings**

Mohamed, S., Mo, L., Flint, S. Palmer, J., Fletcher, G.C. and Pitt, J.I. (2011). Effect of water activity and temperature on the germination and growth of *Aspergillus tamarii* isolated from smoked dried fish. New Zealand Microbiological Society Annual Conference, 23-25 November, Palmerston North, New Zealand.

Mohamed, S., Flint, S. Palmer, J., Fletcher, G.C. and Pitt, J.I. (2012). Assessment of the mycotoxin producing potential of toxigenic fungi isolated from smoked dried fish. New Zealand Institute of Food Science and Technology Annual Conference, 26-28 June, Hamilton, New Zealand.

Mohamed, S., Flint, S. Palmer, J., Fletcher, G.C. and Pitt, J.I. (2013). Isolation and Identification of Mycoflora and Toxigenic Fungi from "Maldive Fish". New Zealand

Institute of Food Science and Technology Annual Conference, 2-4 July, Hawke's Bay, New Zealand. Submitted.