

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Remembering and Belonging:
Colonial Settlers in New Zealand Museums

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
degree of

Master of Arts
in
Social Anthropology

at Massey University, Albany,
New Zealand.

Esther Lucia Wirick

2007

Abstract

This study approaches museums as socially constructed signifiers of group identities. Focusing specifically on museological representations of colonial settlers at museums and historical sites in New Zealand, I analyse how this group is constructed in terms of its association with colonialism, empire, and other historical and contemporary groups in New Zealand. In my results chapters, *Pride and Shame* and *Parts of a Whole*, I investigate different ways in which colonial settlers are represented in terms of their relationship to Empire, the nation, and other groups within New Zealand. Representations which position settlers within colonial discourses and portray them as heroic pioneers work to justify their presence in New Zealand on the basis that they earned their place through suffering and hard work. This assertion of place and belonging is then questioned by representations which situate colonial settlers within post-colonial discourses that highly criticise the actions of settlers and the institution of colonialism. Representations of colonial settlers can also construct them as related to a cultural group, usually referred to as 'Pakeha', and part of New Zealand's bicultural and multicultural identities. I examine how biculturalism is represented in different ways and use the concepts of separate biculturalism and blended biculturalism to explore these differences. These different political identities reflect a strong sense of ambiguity and ambivalence over New Zealand's political identity, and emphasise how stories from the past can be used in different ways to justify different perspectives of contemporary social and political relationships.

Acknowledgements

This thesis has been a labour of love, duty and frustration and I am certain that it would not be in existence if not for the support – intellectual, financial, and emotional – provided by the following individuals, departments and institutions:

First and foremost, I owe a huge debt of gratitude to my primary supervisor, Kathryn Rountree. Her enduring patience, remarkable insight, rigorous editing, and gentle criticisms went far beyond the duties required of a supervisor and I learned more from her than this thesis could ever represent.

Michael Belgrave, my secondary supervisor, helped me to understand key issues from different perspectives, drew my attention to concepts I had overlooked and assumptions I had made, and proved to be a valuable source of knowledge on my topic.

Bill Rodman, at McMaster University in Hamilton, Canada, was the first person to suggest I pursue postgraduate studies in anthropology. He also encouraged me to come to New Zealand and has been a strong source of support and encouragement since that time.

My partner, Jeremy, who undertook the journey to New Zealand with me, was an essential source of emotional support and saw me through the highs, and more importantly, the lows of the thesis writing process.

My coming to New Zealand to complete a master's degree would not have been financially possible were it not for the Massey University Masterate Scholarship. I also received financial support from the School of Social and Cultural Studies to subsidise the costs of my research, and from the Kakano Fund, to subsidise the costs of producing the thesis.

I would also like to thank those professionals at the museums and historical sites I visited who welcomed me to the museum, and patiently answered my often tedious questions.

Dedication

This thesis is dedicated in honour of the memory of my grandfather, Allen B. Crabtree, or 'Pappy' to me. He was always pleased to see his granddaughters excel in their academic lives and careers and he did all that he could to support and encourage us to this end. His belief in the capabilities of his granddaughters has enabled all of us, I believe, to pursue our passions in life, and this thesis is one small example of that.

Table of Contents

| | |
|---|------------|
| Abstract | i |
| Acknowledgements | ii |
| Dedication | iii |
| Table of Contents | iv |
| List of Figures | vi |
| CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW | 17 |
| The Emergence of Academic Critiques of Museums | 18 |
| The Emergence of Museums | 22 |
| Democratic Museums | 25 |
| Museums and Identity | 31 |
| CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY AND INTRODUCTION TO FIELD SITES | 37 |
| Research Design | 38 |
| Summary of Sites Included in Research | 46 |
| My Personal Positioning and Bias | 60 |
| CHAPTER FOUR: PRIDE AND SHAME | 64 |
| Colonial Pride | 65 |
| Colonial Shame | 78 |

| | |
|--------------------------------------|-----|
| Summary | 81 |
| CHAPTER FIVE: PARTS OF A WHOLE | 83 |
| Separate Bicultural..... | 85 |
| Blended Bicultural | 94 |
| Multicultural | 97 |
| Summary | 101 |
| CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSIONS | 103 |
| Appendices..... | 108 |

List of Figures

All photographs were taken by the author throughout the course of fieldwork.

| | |
|---|-----|
| 1. Te Papa Logo | 48 |
| 2. Auckland Museum | 49 |
| 3. The Bond Store, Museum of Wellington | 51 |
| 4. Pioneer Corner, Whangarei Museum | 53 |
| 5. Wax Mannequin, Kauri Museum | 55 |
| 6. Mural, Petone Settlers Museum | 56 |
| 7. Howick Historical Village..... | 58 |
| 8. Shantytown | 59 |
| 9. Wood Inlay, Kauri Museum | 66 |
| 10. "There", Petone Settlers Museum | 67 |
| 11. "Here", Petone Settlers Museum | 67 |
| 12. The Saxton Family, Te Papa | 69 |
| 13. Gum Digger, Kauri Museum | 70 |
| 14. Women Washing, Kauri Museum | 70 |
| 15. Saw Mill, Kauri Museum | 73 |
| 16. Photographs, Whangarei Museum | 74 |
| 17. Possess the Soil, Petone Settlers Museum | 75 |
| 18. Britain of the South Seas, Museum of Wellington | 77 |
| 19. Joy of Burning, Te Papa | 79 |
| 20. Separate and Blended Biculturalism | 84 |
| 21. Signs of a Nation, Te Papa | 85 |
| 22. Model of Cook's <i>Endeavour</i> | 90 |
| 23. Tangata Whenua, Wellington Museum | 91 |
| 24. Transition Gateway | 93 |
| 25. Gum Washing Machine, Dargaville Museum | 99 |
| 26. Gum Washing Murals, Dargaville Museum | 100 |
| 27. Chinatown, Shantytown | 101 |

There is fiction in the space between
The lines on your page of memories
Write it down but it doesn't mean
You're not just telling stories

There is fiction in the space between
You and reality
You will do and say anything
To make your everyday life
Seem less mundane
There is fiction in the space between
You and me

...

Leave the pity and the blame
For the ones who do not speak
You write the words to get respect and compassion
And for posterity
You write the words and make believe
There is truth in the space between

There is fiction in the space between
You and everybody
Give us all what we need
Give us one more sad sordid story
But in the fiction of the space between
Sometimes a lie is the best thing
Sometimes a lie is the best thing

- *Telling Stories*, Song by Tracy Chapman