

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

AN EVALUATION OF THE WELFARE
EFFECTS OF UNITED STATES
MEAT IMPORT QUOTAS USING
THE CONCEPT OF ECONOMIC SURPLUS

A Thesis presented in partial
fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree
of
Master of Agricultural Science
in
Agricultural Economics and Marketing
at
Massey University

L.I. BRYANT
December, 1974

ABSTRACT

The original objective of this study was to estimate the effect of United States Meat Import Quotas on economic welfare in the United States and New Zealand. Welfare was to be estimated as the changes in the economic rent of United States producers, in United States consumers' surplus, and in revenue of the New Zealand beef industry, resulting from a change in quotas.

An economic model was formulated expressing the relationship between the beef markets in the United States, New Zealand, and the rest of the world. The model was used to estimate the values of endogenous variables assuming the absence of United States meat import quotas. This was done by estimating the coefficients of the model based on those years in which quotas were not effective. It was expected that the projected values for endogenous variables, obtained by experimentation with the model, would provide a basis for the estimation of the welfare effects of quotas. However initial experimentation demonstrated that the estimated values for endogenous variables in the model were inconsistent with economic theory. As the New Zealand sector of the model required the use of inputs generated by the United States sector, experimentation with the New Zealand sector was abandoned.

The points of disagreement between economic theory and the estimated model on the effect of quotas were as follows;

- (i) The supply and demand for fed beef was expected to rise, but the model predicted a fall.
- (ii) Domestic supply of manufacturing beef was expected to rise, but the model predicted a fall.
- (iii) Demand for manufacturing beef was expected to fall, but the model predicted a rise.
- (iv) Import supply was expected to fall, but the model predicted a rise.

Disagreement (iv) is the most serious in terms of the objectives of this study as the restrictive effect of quotas on imports is the reason for their use.

It was concluded that the unsatisfactory results obtained in the analysis were due to deficiencies in the econometric model or the data used to estimate the coefficients of the model. Four types of error were considered in term of their possible relevance to the model estimated in the study; specification error; errors in variables; multicollinearity; and autocorrelation. The most important source of error is considered to be in the specification of the model however the other sources of error mentioned are also considered to have been present.

Although this study has not achieved the original objective it demonstrates a method whereby the welfare effects of restrictive trade practices can be assessed. For this reason it is considered that some contribution to applied economics has been made.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am indebted to the people who helped me in this study.

Special thanks are due to my supervisor, Professor R.W. Cartwright for his continued advice, constructive comment and encouragement throughout this study.

I gratefully acknowledge the financial assistance and co-operation of the Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries over the time spent on this thesis and the associated period of study.

Finally I wish to thank my wife, Robbie, for her understanding and co-operation throughout this period of study.

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
<u>CHAPTER 1.</u>	
<u>INTRODUCTION AND THESIS GUIDE</u>	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Objectives	2
1.3 Research Procedures	2
1.4 Review of the Literature	4
1.5 Thesis Guide	6
 <u>CHAPTER 2.</u>	
 <u>THE UNITED STATES BEEF INDUSTRY AND INTERNATIONAL TRADE</u>	
A. The United States Beef Industry	7
2.1 Introduction	7
2.2 Production Units	7
2.3 Fattening and Finishing	10
2.4 Slaughtering and Processing	12
2.5 The Retail Sector and Grading	13
 B. International Trade in Beef	 14
2.6 Production	14
2.7 Consumption	17
2.8 Trade	17
2.9 New Zealand Trade	21
2.9.1 Exports of Beef and Veal	21
2.10 United States Trade	23
2.10.1 Imports of Beef and Veal	24
2.10.2 Imports of Cattle	25
2.10.3 Exports of Beef and Veal	27
2.10.4 Exports of Cattle	27
2.11 Restrictions to Trade	27
2.11.1 Quantitative Controls	28
2.11.2 Tariffs and Variable Levies	30
2.11.3 Health Restrictions	30

<u>CHAPTER 3.</u>	<u>ECONOMIC SURPLUS</u>	
3.1	Introduction	31
3.2	Consumer Surplus	31
3.3	Producer Surplus	38
 <u>CHAPTER 4.</u>	 <u>THE MODELS AND ESTIMATES</u>	
4.1	Introduction	44
4.2	Economic Models	44
4.3	The Incorporation of a Quota Variable in an Economic Framework	45
4.4	Econometric Models	49
4.5	Estimation	57
4.5.1	The Data	57
4.5.2	Estimation Procedure	60
4.5.3	Presentation of Estimates	64
4.5.4	Discussion of the Estimates	67
4.5.5	The Price Elasticity of Demand for Fed Beef	68
 <u>CHAPTER 5.</u>	 <u>EXPERIMENTATION AND DISCUSSION</u>	
5.1	Introduction	70
5.2	The Results	70
5.3	Discussion of the Results	73
5.4	Suggested Changes in the Model	76
 <u>CHAPTER 6.</u>	 <u>SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS</u>	
6.1	Introduction	78
6.2	Summary	78
6.2.1	Original Objectives	78
6.2.2	Progress Made Towards Objectives	78
6.2.3	Reasons for Failure to Reach Objectives	79
6.3	Suggested Further Research	81
6.4	Conclusion	81
 BIBLIOGRAPHY		82
 APPENDIX	 THE DATA	87

LIST OF TABLES

<u>Table</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Page</u>
2.1	BEEF AND VEAL : PRODUCTION IN SPECIFIED COUNTRIES	15
2.2	BEEF AND VEAL : PER CAPITA CONSUMPTION IN SPECIFIED COUNTRIES	18
2.3	BEEF AND VEAL : PRINCIPLE EXPORTING AND IMPORTING COUNTRIES, QUANTITY AND PERCENT OF TOTAL	19
2.4	BOVINE CATTLE EXPORTS: SELECTED COUNTRIES	20
2.5	BOVINE CATTLE IMPORTS: SELECTED COUNTRIES	21
2.6	NEW ZEALAND BEEF AND VEAL EXPORTS BY COUNTRIES	22
2.7	U.S. IMPORTS, EXPORTS AND NET IMPORTS OF BEEF AND VEAL IN RELATION TO DOMESTIC PRODUCTION	23
2.8	U.S. IMPORTS OF CATTLE, BEEF AND VEAL	24
2.9	U.S. BEEF AND VEAL IMPORTS BY COUNTRIES	25
2.10	U.S. IMPORTS OF CATTLE FROM SPECIFIED COUNTRIES	26
2.11	U.S. IMPORTS OF CATTLE BY WEIGHT	26
2.12	U.S. EXPORTS OF CATTLE, BEEF AND VEAL	27
4.1	ESTIMATES OF THE REDUCED FORM COEFFICIENTS OF THE UNITED STATES MODEL	65
4.2	ESTIMATES OF THE PARAMETERS OF THE NEW ZEALAND MODEL	66
4.3	THE DURBIN-WATSON STATISTICS FOR THE UNITED STATES MODEL	66
4.4	INDEPENDENT ESTIMATES OF ELASTICITY OF DEMAND FOR BEEF.	69
5.1	RESULTS OF THE EXPERIMENTATION	71

LIST OF FIGURES

<u>Figure</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Page</u>
2.1	Schematic Diagram of Principle Distribution Channels for Livestock and Meat.	8
3.1	The Measurement of Compensating Variation for a Buyer Under a Trade/No Trade Situation.	33
3.2	The Measurement of Equivalent Variation for a Buyer Under a Trade/No Trade Situation.	34
3.3	The Measurement of Ordinary Surplus for a Buyer Under a Trade/No Trade Situation.	36
3.4	A Comparison Between Equivalent Variation Compensating Variation and Ordinary Surplus for a Buyer.	37
3.5	The Measurement of Compensating Variation for a Seller Under a Trade/No Trade Situation.	39
3.6	The Measurement of Equivalent Variation for a Seller Under a Trade/No Trade Situation.	41
3.7	The Measurement of Economic Rent for a Seller Under a Trade/No Trade Situation.	42
3.8	A Comparison Between Equivalent Variation Compensating Variation and Economic Rent for a Seller.	43
4.1	Non-Fed Beef Supply and Demand.	46
4.2	Fed Beef Supply and Demand.	47
4.3	Export Supply of Manufacturing Beef.	48
4.4.	Changes in Consumer Surplus and Economic Rent.	61
4.5	Changes in Consumer Surplus Resulting from a Shift in the Demand Curve.	62