Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Germination of psychrotolerant clostridia responsible for red meat spoilage

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Food Technology at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand

Katharine Helen Adam

ii

Abstract

Psychrotolerant clostridia are responsible for spoilage of fresh chilled vacuum-packed red meat (beef, lamb and venison). Red meat is one of New Zealand's primary exports, and spoilage results in financial loss. Spoilage by psychrotolerant clostridia is difficult to control due to the ability of these bacteria to grow at cold temperatures, down to - 1.5 °C. They can also form spores that have increased resistance to heat, chemicals, oxygen and desiccation compared to vegetative bacterial cells. As clostridia are strict anaerobes, it is considered highly likely that initial contamination of meat is primarily with spores. The main objective of this work was to determine the triggers of germination of spores, of those psychrophilic and psychrotrophic clostridia, associated with spoilage of New Zealand red meat.

Germination of psychrotolerant clostridia was studied using a range of techniques including molecular, in vitro, and on meat methods. In this study in vitro germinant systems were identified for *Clostridium frigidicarnis*, and a New Zealand species designated LA1, consisting of lactate in combination with an amino acid. Some of the amino acids identified, including valine and cysteine, are naturally present on the surface of red meat. Failure to chill to, or maintain meat at, the recommended temperature, of -1.5 °C and a pH of above 5.5 were identified as being important factors leading to spoilage by Cl. frigidicarnis. Germination in Clostridium estertheticum was extremely poor in media, compared with meat slurry or fresh meat, preventing the identification of a specific germinant system(s), and indicating a non-nutrient factor may be involved. Two distinct nonchemical interventions, hot water wash (HWW) and cold water wash (CWW), were found to reduce spoilage of vacuum-packed chilled lamb inoculated with spores of Cl. estertheticum. Vegetative cells of psychrotolerant clostridia survived exposure to air longer than expected, upwards of seven days in the case of *Cl. estertheticum* subsp. *estertheticum*, suggesting that they play a greater role in initial contamination of meat than originally thought. From an industry point of view the results highlight the importance of preventing initial contamination and proper chilling, as well as the need for further investigation of HWW and CWW interventions.

iii

iv

List of Publications

Adam, K.H., Flint, S.H. and Brightwell, G. (2010). Psychrophilic and psychrotrophic clostridia: sporulation and germination processes and their role in the spoilage of chilled, vacuum-packaged beef, lamb and venison. *International Journal of Food Science & Technology*. **45**:1539-1544.

Adam, K.H., Brunt, J., Brightwell, G., Flint, S.H. and Peck, M.W. (2011). Spore germination of the psychrotolerant, red meat spoiler, *Clostridium frigidicarnis*. *Letters in Applied Microbiology*. **53**:92-97

Adam, K.H., Flint, S.H. and Brightwell, G. (2012). Mechanisms and reduction of spoilage of chilled vacuum-packed lamb by psychrotolerant clostridia. *Meat Science*. In Press.

vi

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisors, Steve Flint, Gale Brightwell and Katja Rosenvold, for their guidance and direction.

For their ongoing support, I thank my colleagues and fellow students at AgResearch, especially John Mills, Mike North and Andrea Donnison. Thanks also to John Waller, for assistance with statistical analysis.

I would also like to thank Mike Peck, Jason Brunt and the Bacterial Foodborne Pathogens team, at the Institute of Food Research in Norwich, for access to their expertise and facilities.

The Ministry of Science and Innovation, the major funders of the project and the Competitive Strategic Grant of the BBSRC, funders of work carried out in the UK are gratefully acknowledged.

I would like to thank all my family members (those I was born with and those I gained along the way) and friends, for all their support and encouragement.

For nutritional, technological and moral support thank you Ross Buick, you are a great source of inspiration.

Table of Contents

Abstract			
List of Publ	icationsv		
Acknowledgementsvii			
Table of Co	ntentsix		
List of Figu	resxiv		
List of Abbr	eviationsxxi		
Chapter 1			
Introductio	n and project objectives1		
1.1 In	troduction1		
1.2 Pr	oject objectives2		
Chapter 2	5		
Literature	review5		
2.1 Sp	ooilage of vacuum-packed chilled red meat5		
2.1.1	Characteristics of spoilage of vacuum-packed chilled red meat5		
2.1.2 vacuu	Spore forming clostridia associated with spoilage of chilled m-packed red meat		
2.1.3 of vac	Prevalence of psychrotolerant clostridia associated with spoilage cuum-packed, chilled red meat9		
2.1.4 vacuu	Sources of psychrotolerant clostridia associated with spoilage of m-packed, chilled red meat9		
2.1.5 psych	Triggers of spoilage of vacuum-packed, chilled, red meat by rotolerant clostridia10		
2.1.6 packe	Current strategies for the prevention of spoilage of vacuum- ed chilled, red meat by psychrotolerant clostridia		
2.2 Sp	pores of meat spoilage bacteria11		
2.2.1	Clostridial spores role in red meat spoilage11		
2.2.2	Bacterial spore structure12		
2.3 Sp	porulation and germination15		
2.3.1	The process of sporulation15		
2.3.2	The process of germination16		
2.3.3	Germination specific proteins20		

2.3	.4 Triggers of bacterial spore germination
2.4	Conclusion
Chapter 3	3
Genera	I Materials and Methods33
3.1	Water
3.2	Culturing under anaerobic conditions
3.3	Strains
3.4	Recipes for media
3.5	Spore production
3.6	Cleaning spores
3.7	Measuring germination using microscopy
3.8	Measuring germination based on change in optical density40
3.9	Flow cytometry
3.10	Nucleic acid extraction (kit)40
3.11	16s and CI. estertheticum specific PCR41
3.12	Agarose gel electrophoresis41
3.14	Southern blot analysis42
3.1	4.1 Blot preparation
3.1	4.2 Probe synthesis
3.1	4.3 Hybridisation
3.1	4.4 Washing and detection
Chapter 4	45
Spore g	germination in psychrotolerant Cl. frigidicarnis45
4.1	Introduction45
4.2	Methods
4.2	.1 Preparation of germinant solutions48
4.2	Analysis of <i>Cl. frigidicarnis</i> cells with a flow cytometer
4.2	Assessment of spore germination49
4.2 of (2.4 Effect of NaCl concentration, pH and temperature on germination Cl. frigidicarnis

4.2.5 frigid	Effect of concentration of co-germinants on germination of <i>Cl.</i>	
4.3 R	esults	
431	Storage of prepared slides 51	
4.3.2	Bioscreen C validation 51	
4.3.3	Germination of <i>CL frigidicarnis</i> in complex media 52	
4.3.4	Analysis of <i>CL frigidicarnis</i> cells with a flow cytometer 53	
435	Germination of <i>CL frigidicarnis</i> in defined media 59	
4.3.6 of <i>Cl.</i>	Effect of NaCl concentration, pH and temperature on germination <i>frigidicarnis</i>	
4.3.7	Germination of <i>CI. frigidicarnis</i> in aerobic conditions	
4.3.8 germ	Concentration of L-valine and L-lactate necessary to induce nation in <i>Cl. frigidicarnis</i>	
4.5 C	onclusion72	
Chapter 5.		
Spore gei	mination in <i>Cl. estertheticum</i> and LA173	
5.1 lr	troduction73	
5.2 N	ethods75	
5.2.1	Spore production75	
5.2.2	Assessment of spore germination75	
5.2.3	Spore and cell counts using flow cytometry75	
5.2.4	Meat slurry production76	
5.2.5	<i>Cl. estertheticum</i> subsp. <i>estertheticum</i> germination in meat slurry 76	
5.3 R	esults78	
5.3.1	Germination of LA178	
5.3.2 strair	Germination of <i>Cl. estertheticum</i> and <i>Cl. estertheticum</i> like s 79	
5.3.3 cells	Analysis of <i>Cl. estertheticum</i> subsp. <i>estertheticum</i> vegetative and spores using a flow cytometer80	
5.3.4 slurry	Germination of <i>Cl. estertheticum</i> subsp. <i>estertheticum</i> in a meat model	
5.4 E	viscussion	
5.4 0	conclusion	
Chapter 691		
Inactivatir	g germinated spores91	

6	.1	Intro	oduction	.91
6	.2	Met	hods	.93
	6.2	.1	Cultures	.93
	6.2	.2	Air exposure in vitro	.93
	6.2	.3	Ethanol treatment	.94
	6.2	.4	Enumeration of <i>in vitro</i> samples	.94
	6.2	.5	Lamb	.94
	6.2	.6	Air exposure on meat	.94
	6.2	.7	Hot water wash	.95
	6.2	.8	Treating meat to reduce spoilage	96
	6.2	.9	Monitoring of packs and chillers	97
	6.2	.10	Molecular detection of Cl. estertheticum	97
	6.2	.11	Statistical analysis	.98
6	.3	Res	sults	.99
	6.3 psv	.1 /chro	Exposure of freshly germinated and vegetative cells of otolerant clostridia <i>in vitro</i>	.99
	6.3	.2	Exposure of <i>Cl. estertheticum</i> subsp. <i>estertheticum</i> 1	03
	ino	cula	ted vacuum-packed red meat to air1	03
	6.3 sub	.3 osp.	Effect of hot water washing on spoilage by <i>CI. estertheticum</i>	07
	6.3 est	.4 erth	Effect of post packaging hot water washing on spoilage by <i>Cl.</i> eticum subsp. estertheticum1	08
6	.4	Disc	cussion1	11
6	.5	Cor	nclusion1	15
Chap	ter 7	7		7
Ger	mina	ant r	eceptor proteins and their sequences1	17
7	.1	Intro	oduction1	17
7	.2	Met	hods1	19
	7.2	.1	Screening for germinant receptor genes using PCR	19
	7.2	.2	Screening for germinant receptor genes by Southern Blotting, 1	20
7	.3	Res	sults1	23
	7.3	.2	Screening for germinant receptor genes by Southern blotting. 1	27
7	.4	Disc	cussion	32
7	.5	Cor	nclusions1	34

Chapter 8135		
Discus	135	
8.1	Final discussion	135
8.2	Recommendations for future work	139
8.3	Final conclusion	141
Bibliography14		143
Appendi	x 2	158
Appendix 31		
Appendix 416		
Appendix 5		162
Appendix 6		163
Appendix 7		
Appendix 8		

List of Figures

Figure 4.2 Validation of the Bioscreen C method to measure germination of spores of *Cl. frigidicarnis.* Germination was measured as the percentage of phase dark (germinated) spores by phase-contrast microscopy and the decrease in OD_{600} . A linear relationship between the decrease in OD_{600} and the percentage of phase dark (germinated) spores was demonstrated. Adapted from Adam et al. (2011).

Figure 4.3Cl. frigidicarnis cells, stained with propidium iodide and SYTO 16, viewed under 100xobjective. Vegetative cells from fresh culture, I3 filter set (A) spores, phase contrast (B).spores, I3 filterset (C) spores, N2.1 filter set (D). Bar = 10 μm

Figure 4.6 Effect of heat shock and amino acid additions on germination of spores of *Cl. frigidicarnis.* Treatments: unheated spores in sodium phosphate (a), heat shocked spores (60 °C for 10 min) in sodium phosphate (b), unheated spores in sodium phosphate, L-cysteine and NaHCO₃ (c), heat shocked spores in sodium phosphate, L-cysteine and NaHCO₃ (d). Potential germinants: L-valine/L-lactate (\blacktriangle), L-norvaline/L-lactate (\blacksquare), glycine/L-lactate (\blacklozenge), L-threonine/L-lactate (\diamondsuit), L-alanine/L-

Figure 4.7Germination of spores of *Cl. frigidicarnis,* incubated for 3 days at 10 °C, in the presenceof a range of NaCl concentrations in dCMM (A) and PYGS (B)63

Figure 4.10 Comparison of germination of *Cl. frigidicarnis* spores, in dCMM, at room temperature (21 °C), following exposure to PYGS at 0 °C for 3 hours (◆), 45 °C for 3 hours (▲) and without exposure (control, ■)

Figure 4.11 The effect of concentration of the co-germinant L-valine, in L-lactate (50 mmol I^{-1}) and sodium phosphate buffer (50 mmol I^{-1}), on germination of *Cl. frigidicarnis* after 72 h at 10 °C. L-Valine in L-lactate (50 mmol I^{-1}) and sodium phosphate buffer (50 mmol I^{-1} , \blacklozenge), L-lactate (50 mmol I^{-1}) and sodium phosphate buffer (50 mmol I^{-1} , \bigstar).

Figure 5.1Germination of LA1 in peptone, yeast, glucose, starch (PYGS) broth, filtered cookedmeat medium from dried pellets (CMM) and a selection of lactate/amino acid combinations, followingincubation for 3 days at 10 °C79

Figure 5.2Graphical representation of flow cytometry analysis of vegetative cells (A, 9.0×10^3 cells/ml) and spores (B, 6.3×10^3 cells/ml) of *Cl. estertheticum* subsp. *estertheticum* stained withpropidium iodide and SYTO 1681

Figure 5.3 Average level of gas production, by *Cl. estertheticum subsp. estertheticum*, in lamb meat homogenate. Tubes with no observable gas were recorded as 0. Scores of 1 (a few bubbles formed

Figure 6.3 Viable vegetative cells of *Cl. algidixylanolyticum* (\blacklozenge), *Cl. algidicarnis* (\blacksquare) *Cl. estertheticum* subsp. *estertheticum* (\blacktriangle) and *Cl. estertheticum* subsp. *laramiense* (\bullet) exposed to air in dCMM supernatant at room temperature (21 °C), as determined by plate count on CBA. The limit of detection of the test was 10 CFU ml⁻¹ or 1 log. Values shown are the mean of three replicates 100

Figure 6.5 Viable vegetative cells of *Cl. frigidicarnis*, as determined by plate count on CBA, exposed to air, in dCMM supernatant, at 10 °C (\blacklozenge) and room temperature, 21 °C (\blacksquare). The limit of detection of the test was 10 CFU ml⁻¹ or 1 log. Values shown are the mean of three replicates 102

Figure 6.6 Viable vegetative cells of *Cl. estertheticum* subsp. *estertheticum* exposed to air in dCMM supernatant at 21 °C (\blacksquare), exposed to air in dCMM supernatant at 10 °C (\blacklozenge) and under anaerobic conditions in dCMM supernatant at 21 °C (\blacktriangle), as determined by plate count on CBA. The limit of detection of the test was 10 CFU ml⁻¹ or 1 log. Values shown are the mean of three replicates 102

Figure 6.8 Average level of gas production, by *Cl. estertheticum* subsp. *estertheticum*, in vacuumpacked lamb stored at -1.5 °C for 21 days, to simulate shipping, then opened and repackaged prior to being held at simulated display temperature for 10 days. 0: packs with no gas bubbles in the drip; 1: packs that had gas bubbles in the drip; 2: packs at the 'loss of vacuum' stage; 3: obviously 'blown', puffy packs; 4: fully distended packs without tightly stretched packaging; and 5: tightly stretched, 'overblown' packs. Unopened, 37 CFU ml⁻¹ inoculum (**■**); opened, 37 CFU ml⁻¹ inoculum (**■**); unopened, 3.7 CFU ml⁻¹ inoculum, (**■**) opened, 3.7 CFU ml⁻¹ inoculum (**■**). Values shown are the mean of five replicates

Figure 6.11Mean soil temperature for spring, summer, autumn and winter, at a depth of 10cm, inNew Zealand (https://secure.niwa.co.nz/climate-explorer/home.do, March 2012)113

Figure 7.2 PCR products from amplification of whole genome DNA using *gerK* primers. The expected band size was 170 bp. *B. cereus* (BC), *Cl. sporogenes* (S), *Cl. perfringens* Type B (PB), *Cl. perfringens* Type C (PC), *Cl. algidicarnis* (AC), *Cl. algidixylanolyticum* (AX), *Cl. estertheticum* subsp. *estertheticum* (EE), *Cl. estertheticum* subsp. *laramiense* (EL), *Cl. frigidicarnis* (F), *Cl. gasigenes* (G), LA1

List of Tables

Table 2.1Psychrotolerant clostridial strains associated with spoilage of chilled, vacuum-
packaged beef lamb and venison8

Table 2.2Summary of bacterial spore formers with known germinants. For optimal germinationpre-treatment (for example exposure to a short burst of heat), the presence of co-germinants, such assodium thioglycolate or bicarbonate, or pH buffers may be required. Effectiveness of germinants is oftenstrain dependent. AGFK is a combination of L-asparagine, D-fructose, D-glucose and potassium ions(usually from KCl). ARF* is a combination of L-alanine, L-phenylalanine, L-arginine and NaHCO3 23-26

Table 3.1Strains used in this study. Strains were obtained from NCFB the National Collection ofFood Bacteria (Reading, UK. CSIRO), DSMZ (Deutsche Sammlung von Mikroorganismen und Zellkulturen,Braunschweig, Germany), ATCC (American Type Culture Collection, Manassas, VI, USA), New ZealandReference Culture Collection (NZRM)35-36

Table 4.1Comparison of plate counts (CBA) and flow cytometry counts of *Cl. frigidicarnis* cellsstained with propidium iodide and SYTO 1656

Table 4.3Flow cytometer counts from vegetative and spore gates of a sample of clean Cl.frigidicarnis spores exposed to PYGS76

Table 5.3Flow cytometry counts using both the *Cl. estertheticum* subsp. *estertheticum*vegetative gate and the *Cl. estertheticum* subsp. *estertheticum* spore gate on a vegetative culture and aclean spore preparation respectively82

xix

Table 5.4Initial inoculation levels of spores of *Cl. estertheticum* subsp. *estertheticum* and thenumber of meat homogenate tubes containing gas after 25 days of incubation84

Table 6.1Mean time until vacuum-packed lamb steaks inoculated with spores of *Cl.*estertheticum subsp. estertheticum reached level 2 gas accumulation (loss of vacuum) when opened andrepackaged at 0, 1, 3 and 6 days after initial packaging. * had not reached loss of vacuum stage following42 days of storage105

Table 6.3Mean time until pack distension reached or exceeded a score of two (loss of vacuum).A vacuum pack with a score of two would be deemed spoiled in a commercial situation. Analysis ofvariance gave a P value of < 0.001 and the least significant differences of means (5%) was 6.803. The</td>uninoculated packs did not reach or exceed a gas accumulation score of two during the incubationperiod (8 weeks)110

List of Abbreviations

APC	aerobic plate count
AFR*	L-alanine, L-phenylalanine, L-arginine and NaHCO ₃
AGFK	L-asparagine, D-fructose, D-glucose and potassium ions
bCMM	biphasic cooked meat medium (recipe section 3.4)
BHI	brain heart infusion
BLAST	basic logical alignment search tool
bp	base pair
°C	degrees Celsius
СВА	Columbia Blood Agar
CFU	colony forming units
CLEs	cortex lytic enzymes
dCMM	dried cooked meat medium
fCMM	fresh cooked meat medium (recipe section 3.4)
CWW	cold water wash
DIG-	dioxigenin-
DNA	deoxyribonucleic acid
dNTP	deoxynucleotide triphosphate
DPA	pyridine-2, 6-dicarboxylic acid (dipicolininc acid)
F	variance of the means
g	acceleration due to gravity
g	gram(s)
GR	germinant receptor
GMP	good management practice
h	hour
mH ₂ O	Milli-Q water
uH ₂ O	$Gibco^{TM}$ UltraPure TM distilled, DNAse and RNAse free water
HCI	hydrochloric acid
HWW	hot water wash
ITS	internal transcribed spacer
KH ₂ PO ₄	monobasic potassium phosphate

kmh⁻¹	kilometre per hour
L	litre
log	logarithm
MgCl ₂	magnesium chloride
mg	milligram
ml	millilitre
mM	millimolar
min	minute
mol	molar
NaCl	sodium chloride
NaHCO ₃	sodium bicarbonate
ng	nanogram
O ₂	oxygen
OD	optical density
PCR	polymerase chain reaction
ΡΟΑΑ	peroxyacetic acid
PYGS	peptone, yeast extract, glucose, starch medium (recipe section
	3.4)
rpm	revolutions per minute
S	second
SASP	small, acid-soluble, spore proteins
SDS	
	sodium dodecyl sulphate
SSC	sodium dodecyl sulphate saline-sodium citrate
SSC sp.	sodium dodecyl sulphate saline-sodium citrate species
SSC sp. subsp.	sodium dodecyl sulphate saline-sodium citrate species sub species
SSC sp. subsp. Tris	sodium dodecyl sulphate saline-sodium citrate species sub species tris(hydroxymethyl)aminomethane
SSC sp. subsp. Tris μg	sodium dodecyl sulphate saline-sodium citrate species sub species tris(hydroxymethyl)aminomethane microgram
SSC sp. subsp. Tris μg μl	sodium dodecyl sulphate saline-sodium citrate species sub species tris(hydroxymethyl)aminomethane microgram microliter
SSC sp. subsp. Tris μg μl μmol	sodium dodecyl sulphate saline-sodium citrate species sub species tris(hydroxymethyl)aminomethane microgram microliter micromolar
SSC sp. subsp. Tris μg μl μmol μm	sodium dodecyl sulphate saline-sodium citrate species sub species tris(hydroxymethyl)aminomethane microgram microliter micromolar micrometre
SSC sp. subsp. Tris μg μl μmol μm	sodium dodecyl sulphate saline-sodium citrate species sub species tris(hydroxymethyl)aminomethane microgram microliter micromolar micrometre ultraviolet

Nucleotides

A	adenine
С	cytidine
G	guanosine
т	thymadine

Bases in degenerate primers

R	A + G
Υ	C + T
Μ	A + C
К	G + T
S	G + C
W	A + T
Н	A + T + C
В	G + T + C
D	G + A + T
V	G + A + C
Ν	A + C + G +T