Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

# Education Privatisation Policy Reforms in Tanzania and New Zealand Since the 1980s: A Comparative Critical Policy Analysis Study

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Education

Massey University
Palmerston North
New Zealand

Cornelia Koku Muganda

1999

# Abstract

This thesis is a comparative study of contemporary education policy reforms in Tanzania and New Zealand. It explains why and how Tanzania and New Zealand introduced and implemented education privatisation policy reforms in the 1980s and 1990s. The study analyses the socio-economic and discursive influences on national education policies and discusses the implications of current market-oriented education policies for the state's provision of education and for social justice in education.

Employing comparative education policy analysis (CEPA) approach, the thesis traces the genesis of contemporary education privatisation policy reforms in Tanzania and New Zealand within the contexts of wider transformations in the capitalist world system. It is argued, in the study, that national education policies have been changing according to the nature, functions and position of the state within the capitalist formation.

The thesis also underscores the critical importance of analysing policy documents. The researcher argues that the analysis of the education policy documents enables the policy analyst to deconstruct the policy discourse and reveal the policy implications to various groups of people in the society. Through critical discourse analysis, (CDA) this study explicates how the discourse of privatisation supports and legitimates the development and implementation of market oriented education policies in Tanzania and New Zealand.

The thesis further argues that the market panacea espoused in current education privatisation policy reforms has adverse implications for social justice in education and for the state provision of education, particularly in relation to "children at risk". Finally the thesis proffers suggestions for alternative policy interventions and identifies some of the areas that need further research.

# Acknowledgements

I would like to extend my sincere thanks and gratitude to all people who contributed in various ways towards the accomplishment of this thesis. Although it is not possible to name them all, I have singled out a few for particular mention.

I am grateful to my chief supervisor, Professor John Codd whose support, patience, guidance and encouragement have contributed greatly in shaping this thesis. I am equally grateful to my supervisor, Associate Professor Wayne Edwards, for his advice, encouragement and support in many ways.

My appreciation is extended to the New Zealand Vice Chancellors Committee for granting me a Commonwealth Scholarship Award that enabled me to pursue a PhD programme at Massey University and provided the opportunity to study the New Zealand education policy reforms. My gratitude for financial support is also extended to Massey University and the Clem Hill Memorial Fund that made it possible for me to fulfil my academic obligations; including participating in national and international conferences which have contributed to the refining of some ideas in this thesis.

I am indebted to the government of the United Republic of Tanzania that has granted me the study leave to undertake this programme of study. Thanks are also due to my colleagues and friends in Tanzania, particularly Leonida Mbelle and Martina Rwegelera, who secured and sent me the very much needed reading material from Tanzania.

My gratitude also to my relatives, friends and colleagues, who provided me with the warmth, support and inspiration that kept me going. I would like to single out my husband and friend, Ndibalema Alphonce, for understanding, inspiration, constructive criticism and unconditional support. Special thanks go to my children, Rwezaura, Mwemezi, Rweyemamu, Sophia and Kabyemela. In them, I gathered strength and enthusiasm to complete this task.

Thanks are also extended to two very important persons in my life, my mum and dad. This thesis is a product of the vision of education for a little girl that they set many years ago.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract....ii
Acknowledgements....iii
Table of Contents....iv
List of Figures....ix
List of Tables....x
List of Appendices....x
Glossary of Abbreviations....xi

PART I: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY....1
Chapter One: Introduction....1
Statement of the Problem....3
The Purpose Of the Study....4
Objectives of the Study....4
Research questions....5
Rationale for Theory....5
Studies on Education Policy Reforms....9
Organisation of the Thesis....14

PART II: CONCEPTUAL AND METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK....16
Chapter Two: Theoretical Considerations....17
Education Policy....17
The State and Education....24
Education and the Approaches to Socio-economic Development....34
The Liberal and Neo-Liberal Approach to Social Economic Development (The Capitalist Stance)....35
The Modernisation Theory Of Development....36
The Economic Growth Model....44
The Marxist and Neo-Marxist Approaches (The Socialist Stance)....46
The Underdevelopment School....48
The World System Model Of Development....50
The Socio-political Economy Approach to Development....51
Education Policy and Social Justice....55
Concluding Remarks....61

Chapter Three: Methodology....64
Comparative Education Analysis Approach....64
Comparative Education....64
Policy Analysis....74
Discourse Analysis Approach....78
Critical Discourse Analysis....82
Discourse Analysis of Education Documents....83
Methodological Framework....87

PART III: CONTEXT ANALYSIS....91
Education and the State in the Transformation of Capitalism....91
Chapter Four: Education Policy and the State Under Industrial Capitalism....92
External Context....92
Local Context: Tanzania....93
The Colonial State in Tanzania....93
Colonial Education Policies in Tanzania....97
Colonial Education and the Nationalist Movement in Tanzania....101
Local context: New Zealand....103
The Colonial State in New Zealand....103
Colonial Education Policies in New Zealand....107
Concluding Remarks....110
Chapter Five: Education and the Nation State Under International Finance Capitalism....112
External context....112
Assumptions About Education....115
Local context: Tanzania....118
The Post-Colonial State in Tanzania....118
Education and the Post-Colonial State in Tanzania....123
Education for Self-Reliance (ESR)....126
Provision Of Basic Education in Tanzania....128
Local Context: New Zealand....132
The Post-Colonial State in New Zealand....132
Compulsory Formal Post-Primary Education in New Zealand....134
Concluding Remarks....137
Chapter Six: Post-Colonial States and the Globalisation Process....141

External context....142
Capitalism and the Globalisation Process....142
Globalisation and the Nation State....147
Local Context Tanzania....150
State Welfarism and the Globalisation Process in Tanzania:
Socio-economic development issues....150
Increased Foreign Influence....152
Development Strategies Adopted by
the Post-Colonial Government....154
Problems of Implementing Education for
Self-Reliance (ESR)....160
The Context of the Privatisation Debate in Tanzania....163
Local Context: New Zealand....166
The New Zealand State and the Globalisation Process....166
Concluding Remarks....173

PART IV: POLICY DOCUMENT ANALYSIS....175
The Discourse of Privatisation in Contemporary Education Policy Documents in Tanzania and New Zealand....175
Chapter Seven: The Privatisation Discourse....177
The Meta-discourse of Privatisation....178
The Privatisation Discourse in Education....180
Chapter Eight: Analysis of Tanzania Education Policy Reform Documents....185
Text Production Process....185
Evidence of Privatisation Discourse in Tanzania's
Current Education Reform Documents....198
Interpretation of Educational Conditions....199
Concentration on the Observable....203
Marketisation of Education as a Panacea....205
Contradictions and Internal Inconsistencies....210

Chapter Nine: Analysis of New Zealand Education Policy Reform Documents....215
The Policy Documents Production Process....215
Evidence of Privatisation Discourse in New Zealand's Recent Education
Policy Reform Documents....221

De-Legitimisation of Education as a Public Good.....222
Management and Market-Place Metaphors.....229
Association of the Public System with Fiscal and Legitimation Crisis.....235
Market Forces as a Prescriptive Panacea.....240
Chapter Ten: Comparative Policy Document Analysis.....248
External Influences.....249
Preparation, Timing and Debate on the Green Papers.....255
Reform Texts and the Rationale for Privatisation of Education.....257
Reform Text and Market Place Solutions.....268
Educational Funding and the Reduction of State Support to Education.....269
Market Oriented Management and Control Policies.....274
Market Oriented Access Policies.....281
An Overview.....284

PART V: IMPLICATIONS OF CONTEMPORARY EDUCATION POLICY REFORMS: The Case of "Children at Risk".....286
Chapter Eleven: Market Oriented Education Policies and the "children at risk".....287
Problems of Terminology, Identification and Approaches To "Children at Risk".....287
Market Oriented Policies and Access to Education.....297
Implications of Individualism, Market competition and Outcome Oriented Education Policies.....297
Children at Risk and Market Choice Education Policies.....300
Policies Based on Budgetary Restraint and Market Efficiency.....305
Concluding Remarks.....310

PART VI: SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....312
Chapter Twelve.....312
Summary and Conclusions.....313
Education Policy Reforms and the Processes of Capital Accumulation and Legitimation.....313

Discursive Influences on Policy Reforms: Privatisation Discourse and Contemporary Education Reforms..... 319
Implications of Education Privatisation Policies.....322
Methodology.....323
The Pertinence of CEPA.....323
The Relevance of CDA.....325
Application of Theories in Policy Analysis.....326
General Conclusions.....328
Suggestions for Policy Interventions and Areas for Further Research.....330
Suggestions for Policy Interventions.....330
Suggestions for Further Studies.....337

Appendices.....338

Bibliography .....403

# List of Figures

Figure 2.1 Two types of Development .....54

Figure 3.1 A Framework for Comparative Education Analysis.....70

Figure 3.2 Three Dimensional Framework for Comparative Education Policy Analysis.....73

Figure 3.3 Fairclough's Critical Discourse Analysis Framework.....85

Figure 3.4 Multi-methods Approach to Policy Analysis.....88

Figure 3.5 Application of CEPA and CDA in Education Policy Analysis.....88

Figure 5.1 Primary School Enrolments in Tanzania 1962 - 1991.....131

Figure 6.1 The Power Base of Globalisation.....144

Figure 10.1 Two Types of State Policy.....285

Figure 12.1 Education, the State And the Transformation of Capitalism.....314

# List of Tables

Table 4.1 Enrolment in the Education System in Tanzania in 1956.....100

Table 5.1: The Percentage of Illiteracy Rate in Tanzania.....129

Table 5.2 Export Destination for New Zealand Goods.....133

Table 8.1 Central Government Budget Allocation to the Ministry of Education and Culture - Tanzania .....186

Table 8.2 Tanzania Primary Education Leavers and Form One selection 1963 - 1994.....189

Table 8.3 Estimated Spending on education and debt servicing 1987/88 - 1990/91.....192

Table 10.1 Fees for Some Private Schools in Tanzania - 1998.....271

# List of Appendices

Appendix A: New Zealand's *Tomorrow's Schools* Policy.....338

Appendix B Education and Training Policy.....366

Appendix C List of Educational Issues in Tanzania (URT 1993:6-7).....401

Appendix D Implications of Privatisation Policies in Tanzania.....403

# Glossary of Abbreviations

| | |
|---|---|
| APEC | Asia Pacific Economic Co-operation |
| CAC | Comparative Administration Group (of the American Society for Public Administration). |
| CDA | Critical Discourse Analysis. |
| CER | Australia New Zealand Closer Economic Relations Trade Agreement. |
| CEPA | Comparative Education Policy Analysis approach |
| DED | District Executive Director (Tanzania). |
| DEO | District Education officer (Tanzania). |
| EEC | European Economic Community. |
| ERO | Education Review Office (New Zealand). |
| ERP | Economic Recovery Programme |
| ESR | Education for Self Reliance. |
| GATT | General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade |
| G-7 | The seven leading Industrial powers |
| GST | Goods and services tax |
| IBRD | International Bank for Reconstruction and development. (the World Bank). |
| IMF | International Monetary Fund |
| INSET | In-service Teacher Education Programme(Tanzania) |
| MNCs | Multi-National Corporations |
| MUCE | Massey University College of Education. |
| MUCHS | Muhimbili University College of Health Sciences (Tanzania) |
| NATO | North Atlantic Treaty Organisation |
| NDC | National Development Corporation (Tanzania) |
| NGOs | Non-government Organisations |
| NECTA | National Examination Council of Tanzania |
| NZ | New Zealand |
| NZME | New Zealand Ministry of education |
| NZQA | New Zealand Qualifications Authority |
| OECD | Organisation for economic co-operation and Development |
| OUT | Open University of Tanzania |
| PA | Policy Analysis approach |
| PSLE | Primary school Leaving Examination (Tanzania) |
| RDD | Regional Development Director |
| REO | Regional Education Officer |
| SAPs | Structural Adjustment Programmes. |
| SIDA | Swedish International development Agency |
| Std. | Standard or grade in Primary School (Tanzania). |
| SUA | Sokoine University of Agriculture. |
| TAA | Tanganyika African Association. |
| TANU | Tanzania African National Union. |
| TIE | Tanzania Institute of education. |
| TNCs | Transnational Corporations |
| TSC | Teachers Service Commission (Tanzania). |
| Tsh. | Tanzanian Shilling(s) |
| TZ | Tanzania |
| TZME | Tanzania Ministry of education |
| UN | United Nations |
| *UNDP* | *United nations Development Programmes* |
| UNICEF | United Nations International children and Education Fund. |
| *UNESCO* | *United Nations Education* |
| UPE | Universal Primary Education Scientific and Cultural Organisation. |
| URT | United Republic of Tanzania |

# Policy Documents

| | |
|---|---|
| NZ-Picot Report | NZ Task Force to Review Education Administration (1988) *Administering for Excellence,* Wellington, Government Printer. |
| NZ-TS Education | New Zealand *Tomorrow's Schools* policy document. NZ Ministry of (1988), *Tomorrow's Schools,* Wellington, Government Printer. |
| NZ-Treasury document | New Zealand Treasury (1987) *Government Management: Brief to the Incoming Government, Vol. II: Educational Issues*, Wellington, Government printer. |
| TZ-ETP | Tanzania's *Education and Training Policy* document. URT (1995) *Education and Training Policy* , Dar es Salaam, Ministry of Education and Culture. |
| TZ-Task Force Report | URT (1993) "Tanzania Education System for the 21st Century", *Report of the Task Force,* Dar-es Salaam, Ministry of education and culture & Ministry of Science Technology and Higher Education. |
| World Bank document | World Bank (1987), "Educational Policies for Sub-Saharan Africa: Adjustment, Revitalisation and Expansion," *Report No. 6934,* Washington DC, World Bank, September 15, 1987. |