

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Appraisal of Collaborative Problem Solving (CPS) within a Context of Current
Waikato Principles and Practices**

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of
Educational Psychology

Massey University, Albany
New Zealand.

Carol Ann Dickinson

2013

Abstract

This research evaluated the Collaborative Problem Solving (CPS) model, an established evidence-based practice from the United States (Greene, 1998), within a Waikato context in New Zealand. Special education practitioners employed at the Ministry of Education (MOE) drew from MOE principles and practices, as well as their professional expertise as they reviewed and critiqued the CPS model. The study identified aspects of the CPS programme that could contribute to current Ministry practices and aspects which are incongruent with New Zealand MOE practice guidelines and/or the cultural context of Waikato. Outcomes of the project included a summary of existing evidence supporting the CPS model, a critique of its cultural relevance to the New Zealand context as well as, recommendations for how CPS practices might inform or strengthen the Ministry of Education's (MOE) current model of collaborative problem solving practice.

Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge and thank the many people who made this thesis possible.

My first acknowledgment of thanks goes to my partner Jason Lucke as he has been my companion and continual source of strength and support on this journey. His ability to be there for me in the moment when words were of little comfort was the reassurance and encouragement I needed to keep moving forward. I want to thank him for his commitment, and patience and for putting his life on hold so that I could achieve my goals. My journey was a shared journey and one in which I was grateful to be sharing with him.

I want to thank my work colleagues who participated in this study. They were devoted to supporting me and generous with their time and contributions. I was appreciative of their openness to share their views and their commitment to their work with children and families in need. I feel blessed to be working with such deeply committed, intelligent, experienced and supportive team of people.

I especially want to thank my supervisors, Dr Hal Jackson and Jayne Jackson for their continued warm and generous support, and for guiding me through this journey with their in-depth knowledge and experience in this field of research. I am profoundly appreciative of their contributions and privileged to have worked with them both.

I would also like to thank Dr Jean Annan who was my supervisor at the start of my journey. She has continued to support me from afar and has been my role model and a huge source of inspiration. I have valued her intelligible input into this research and for her friendship.

I am grateful for the support of the New Zealand Ministry of Education and the Ethics Advisory Board in undertaking this thesis and in particular my District Manager Bruce McIntosh and Service Manager Vicky Sayer. Their support in enabling me to conduct my research at the Ministry has been gratefully appreciated.

I would like to acknowledge the love and support of my friends and family, and especially my grandsons Jai, Van and Dylan whom have given me a purpose for embarking on this journey. Thanks for your gift of time, your encouraging words and your confidence in my ability to accomplish my dreams.

Contents

Abstract	i
Acknowledgements	ii
Table of contents	iv
Chapter One: Introduction to the Study	1
Background	1
Rationale for Evaluating CPS within a Waikato Context	3
Thesis Overview	4
Chapter Two: Literature Review	5
Collaborative Problem Solving Model	5
Greene’s espoused theory	5
CPS intervention approach	6
Home school partnership	9
Evidence-Based Practice: Overview and Definitions	10
EBP in the New Zealand Context – Three Dimensions	12
Practitioner knowledge	13
Child / young person / family / whanau	14
Research	15
International Perspectives on High Quality Research: Quality and Quantity.....	16
Criteria for measuring quality of research	18
<i>Limitations of the hierarchy</i>	19
<i>Limitations of RCTs in the field of educational psychology</i>	21
<i>Criteria for determining EBP in other professions</i>	22
<i>Critiques of criteria processes</i>	23
Educational Research	24
Descriptive and experimental research.....	26
Quasi-experimental research.....	27
Evidence-based practice summary.....	27
New Zealand Ministry of Education Principles and Practices	28

Evidence-based practice in special education.....	31
Criteria for evaluating EBP in a New Zealand context.....	32
<i>Ethical practice</i>	34
Summary of EBP in a New Zealand context	36
Critique of the CPS Model	36
Use of the term “collaborative.”	37
Labels.....	38
Greene’s philosophy.....	38
Assessment.....	39
CPS Plan B.....	41
Culturally appropriate practices for Maori	42
Relationships.....	43
Problem ownership.....	45
Theory of behaviour.....	46
Traditional and contemporary behavioural practices and theories.....	47
Psychosocial interventions.....	49
Family support.....	50
Teacher and parent support.....	50
Teacher stress.....	51
CPS Research: Context of the Studies	54
Efficacy of the model.....	55
CPS: Review of empirical studies.....	56
<i>Selective review: Study one</i>	59
<i>Selective review: Study two</i>	60
Unpublished school research.....	61
Chapter Three: Methodology	63
Aim and Research Questions	63
Research questions.....	64
Theoretical Approach and Methodological Justification.....	64
Role of the researcher.....	66

Focus group.....	66
Participants and setting.....	67
Recruitment of participants.....	68
Setting.....	69
Procedures and Sequence of Focus Group Activities.....	69
Session one – information session.....	69
Session two.....	70
Session three.....	71
Data Collection	71
Recording the data - <i>using pseudonyms</i>	72
Meeting minutes.....	72
Participant’s recorded notes.....	73
Artifacts emerging from the discussion	73
Participant’s visual representation	73
Recording tables – Session two and session three.....	74
Data Analysis	75
Session one	75
Session two	75
Session three	75
Transcribed data from digital recordings.....	75
Data table.....	76
Session one outline.....	76
Session two outline.....	76
Session two recording tables.....	76
Data table session three.....	77
Ethical considerations	77
Chapter Four: Findings and Discussion	79
Participants Conceptualisation	79
Efficacy	82

Congruent Practices	84
Theory of behaviour.....	85
Collaborative and coordinated.....	85
Assessment.....	86
MOE principles and service pathway.....	87
Inclusion.....	87
Relationships.....	88
Treatment integrity.....	88
Diagnosis.....	89
Incongruent with MOE Practices	89
Use of the term collaborative.....	89
Criteria for MOE Behaviour Service.....	90
Definition of Doing Well.....	91
Theory of behaviour.....	93
Referral and informed consent	94
Assessment.....	95
Cultural relevance.....	98
Relationships	100
Prescriptive Nature of Plan B	104
Adaptations and Recommendations	106
Opportunities to strengthen MOE practices.....	106
<i>Assessment</i>	107
Adapting the CPS process to reflect a New Zealand context.....	108
Use of the CPS model as a tool in a toolbox.....	109
Preference for restorative practice.....	109
Adapted version of the CPS model.....	110
Summary	111
Summary of congruent aspects of the CPS model with MOE principles and practices.....	111

Summary of incongruent aspects of the CPS model with MOE principles and practices.....	112
Recommendations.....	112
Chapter Five: Strengths, Limitations and Implications	114
Strengths of the Study.....	114
Evaluative process of the study.....	114
Varied cultural contributions.....	115
Communication with Greene.....	116
Limitations	116
The participants’ conceptualisation of the CPS model.....	116
Learning to facilitate.....	117
Methods of data collection.....	118
Communication ambiguity.....	119
Implications for Further Research.....	120
Child / Young Person and family EBP practice contributions.....	120
References	122
Appendices	152
Appendix A and B. District Manager and Service Manager Consent letters	
Appendix C. Participants Information Sheet	
Appendix D. Session One Agenda	
Appendix E. Information Session One	
Appendix F. Group Confidentiality	
Appendix G. Group Discussion Protocol	
Appendix H. Role and Responsibility of the Researcher	
Appendix I. Session Two Agenda	
Appendix J. Session Two	
Appendix K. Session Three Agenda	
Appendix L. Session Three	

Appendix M. Seating Plan
Appendix N. Session Questions
Appendix O. Participants Questions to Greene
Appendix P. Session Two Recording Table Three
Appendix Q. Session Two Recording Table Four
Appendix R. Session Three Recording Table Five
Appendix S. Session Two Recording Table Six
Appendix T. Session Two Venn Diagram
Appendix U. Session Three Recording Table Seven
Appendix V. Request for Ethics Advice Form
Appendix W. Massey University Human Ethics Committee Approval Letter.